



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, March 7, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JOSEPH MOTICHA
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 LETICIA I. MIGUEL, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (present until 7:03 pm), Moticha, Bernstein, Pierce, and Woolery (present until 5:30 pm).

Members absent: James.

Staff present: LaConte, Eng and Miguel.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **February 22, 2016.**

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **February 22, 2016**, as submitted.
- Action: Miller/Bernstein, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Pierce abstained, James absent).

C. Consent Review.

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Review for **March 7, 2016**. The Consent Review was reviewed by **Joseph Moticha** and **Jaime Pierce**.
- Action: Bernstein/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

There were no announcements at this time.

E. Subcommittee Reports: Chair Sweeney updated the Board on a planned spring tour of SFDB approved projects. Board member Bernstein and Chair Sweeney will be part of will meet with Mr. Limón to review a list of projects to visit.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

1. 1530 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

- (3:10)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-181-023
 Application Number: MST2016-00075
 Owner: Jeff Swaim
 Designer: KSD LLC

(Proposal to replace exterior doors and windows, and exterior finishes on an existing 1,977 square foot, two-story, single-family residence on a 6,969 square foot parcel in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. No new floor area is proposed. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00465.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Final Approval may be granted if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:05 p.m.

Present: Paul Newton, Project Designer.

Public comment opened at 3:14 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility and quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Provide color board.
- 3) Return with window details including a schedule and manufacturer information.
- 4) Note the existing lighting.
- 5) Call out colors and provide a cut sheet for the front door.
- 6) Note El Dorado stone on plans.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN & FINAL REVIEW**2. 969 ISLETA AVE****E-1 Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-253-019
Application Number: MST2015-00393
Owner: Crissman Trust
Architect: Patrick Marr

(Proposal for a 290 square foot first-floor addition, a 576 square foot second-story addition, a 48 square foot second-floor deck, a new entry deck and stairs, removal of an unpermitted shade structure and water heater, and interior remodel of an existing 1,262 square foot single-family residence with an attached 384 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes removal of two interior posts in the garage. The proposed total of 2,512 square feet on an 8,134 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 78% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The proposal addresses violations associated with Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00257. This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for modifications for additions in the front setback and for conforming additions that change the basic characteristics of a dwelling that is non-conforming to two interior setbacks.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 005-16. Project was last reviewed on September 21, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Patrick Marr, Architect; and Paul & Pat Crissman, Owners.

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's revision of the proposed project.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 612 SURF VIEW DR****E-1 Zone**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-112-009
Application Number: MST2016-00042
Owner: Bodhi Oser
Designer: Sarai Grenell

(Proposal to construct a new 553 square foot, one-story addition to the existing 1,821 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with 421 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposal includes a change to the roof form at the rear of the residence, a reroof of the whole house with a new metal roofing material, a new 335 square foot covered patio at the rear of the house, replacement of the garage door, new wood siding near the front entry, replacement of exterior light fixtures, and an interior remodel. The project includes new site walls, fences, and gates at the front yard, and new site landscaping. The proposed total of 2,374 square feet located on a 16,850 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 54% of the guideline floor-to-lot ratio [FAR]. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00099.)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on February 22, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:47 p.m.

Present: Sarai Grenell, Designer and Owner

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's consideration and incorporation of the Board's recommendations.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's size, bulk, and scale, consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.

Action: Moticha/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 1308 SANTA TERESITA DR****A-1 Zone**

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-141-019
Application Number: MST2015-00366
Owner: John C. Heine
Applicant: Steve Fort
Architect: Mary Andrulaitis

(Proposal for a 3,190 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 565 square foot attached two-car garage. The project includes a new driveway, swimming pool and spa, new patios, retaining walls, a trellis patio cover in the rear yard, and 420 cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The proposal of 3,755 square feet on a 1-acre, previously developed vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 75% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines §15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). Final Approval may be granted if the project demonstrates compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program. Project was last reviewed on August 24, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:22 p.m.

Present: Steve Fort, Applicant; and Mary Andrulaitis, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion 1: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Review Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the architect's revision of the proposed project.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials and applicant following good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

Motion 2: The Single Family Design Board finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under the CEQA Guidelines §15183 based on the City's staff analysis and the CEQA certificate of determination on file for this project.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (James absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 825 ROBLE LN****E-1 Zone**

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-252-008
 Application Number: MST2016-00048
 Owner: Bell Family Trust
 Architect: Kent Mixon

(Proposal for a Voluntary Lot Merger and to construct a new 793 square foot third-story to an existing 1,794 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an existing 388 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposal includes a 265 square foot covered patio, with an extended chimney. The proposed total of 2,975 square feet of development on a 10,580 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 78% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for zoning modifications to allow encroachments into the two front yard setbacks and one interior setback.)

(Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 4:53 p.m.

Present: Kent Mixon, Architect; and Marc Bell, Owner.

The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility; therefore, *private* view concerns of the public are not within the Board's purview.

Public comment opened at 5:19 p.m.

- 1) Cynthia E. Ziegler, opposition, expressed concerns regarding project not being compatible or consistent with neighbor compatibility.
- 2) Jeanne Palumbo, neighbor, submitted letter, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed third floor and suggested that additions occur on the lower floor.
- 3) Normah Abdul Halim, submitted letter, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed third floor and applicant following good neighbor guidelines.
- 4) Michael Palumbo, neighbor, submitted letter, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed third floor, potential impacts to the integrity of the D'Alfonso developed tract of homes, and a negative precedent for taller homes in this neighborhood

Letters and emails in opposition were acknowledged and received from; Ken Mineau, regarding errors on the plans submitted; Dr. James Block, served on the Riviera Association View Ordinance Advisory Task Force, regarding obstructing views; Neil Greenleaves and Chris Van de Walle, regarding the 78% FAR limit; Michael and Jeanne Palumbo and Normah Abdul Halim.

Public comment closed at 5:31 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Consider exploring other options to the third story. The Board may consider a proposed third story if guidelines are met with a minimal amount of visual impact.
- 2) The Board cannot support the modifications without further design development from the applicant in terms of reducing or completely eliminating the third story.
- 3) If the Board is satisfied that the applicant has addressed the other issues outlined in this motion, the board may find a way to support a lot line adjustment to merge the two lots in order to satisfy the lower FAR requirements.

Action: Miller/Moticha, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Pierce opposed.) (James/Woolery absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 1228 MANITOU LN****R-1 Zone****(5:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-010-014
 Application Number: MST2016-00052
 Designer: Don Swann
 Owner: Derek and Caroline White

(Proposal to convert an existing 360 square foot attached two-car garage, infill a 124 square foot breezeway, and construct 353 square feet of one-story additions to 1,945 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes the permitting and conversion of an unpermitted detached two-car carport into a new 490 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,909 square feet of development on a 19,165 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 66% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00472.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:20 p.m.

Present: Don Swann, Designer.

Public comment opened at 6:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan and color board.

Action: Bernstein/Pierce, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Woolery absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

***THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:39 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 7:03 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1531 SAN MIGUEL AVE****E-3/S-D-3 Zone****(6:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-131-031
 Application Number: MST2016-00062
 Applicant: Ken Dickson
 Owner: Peter and Dorian Hirth

(Proposal to construct a new 2,615 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 498 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes two uncovered guest parking spaces, a new driveway, new site walls, and perimeter fencing. The proposed total of 3,113 square feet of development on a 12,764 square foot vacant lot is 77% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The project is located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal review.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines §15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). Project must comply with Council Resolution No. 07-086.)

Actual time: 7:03 p.m.

Present: Misael Contreras, Applicant; and Scott Armstrong, General Contractor.

Public comment opened at 7:10 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The following finding was read into the record: “The SFDB finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.”
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding the project’s size, bulk, and scale, consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials.
- 3) Return with a different design for the garage door eliminating most glass.
- 4) The Board finds acceptable the beach designed theme.
- 5) The project size is appropriate at the 77% required maximum FAR.
- 6) Provide a full landscaping plan.

Action: Bernstein/Pierce, 4/0. Motion carried. (James/Miller/Woolery absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW

8. 1215 E COTA ST

R-2 Zone

(7:00) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-190-022
 Application Number: MST2014-00310
 Owner: Leslie Marie Colasse
 Architect: Leslie Marie Colasse

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-car garage, mud room, and split-level bedroom at an existing 1,398 square foot two-level residence, and construct a new master suite with additions in the same location above a covered driveway. The proposal also includes a new 650 square foot three-car garage with an attached 300 square foot accessory structure, a kitchen remodel, and exterior improvements. The proposed total of 2,318 square feet on an 11,285 square foot lot is 59% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for an interior setback modification.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 071-14. Project was last reviewed on March 23, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:27 p.m.

Present: Leslie Colasse, Architect and Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:37 p.m.

A letter in opposition was acknowledged and received from; Trevor Martinson.

Public comment closed at 7:42 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance to the scenic character of the City, compatibility with size bulk, and scale, quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Finalize the call outs on the plans.

Action: Pierce/Moticha, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Miller/Woolery absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:52 P.M. ****