



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, October 6, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY
 JIM ZIMMERMAN

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 GABRIELE COOK, Interim Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein (3:44 p.m.), Pierce (until 4:50 p.m.), and Woolery.
Members absent: James and Zimmerman.
Staff present: Eng, Limón, and Cook.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Jarrett Gorin of Vanguard Planning expressed concern regarding additional language that staff included in the transcribed motion for Item #4, 3626 San Remo, in a posted version the September 22, 2014 DRAFT Minutes. Staff explained that the additional language had since been removed from DRAFT Minutes prior to ratification.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of September 22, 2014.
Action: Miller/Peirce, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/James/Zimmerman absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **September 29, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by James/Sweeney.
- Action: Peirce/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/James/Zimmerman absent).
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **October 6, 2014**. Items A-C on the Consent Agenda were reviewed by Pierce and Sweeney. Item D was reviewed by Lisa James and Fred Sweeney.
- Action: Miller/Peirce, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/James/Zimmerman absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng made the following announcements:
 - a) Board member Bernstein is recusing herself from item #1 due to its proximity to property that she owns.
 - b) 3626 San Remo Drive, Lot #2 denial decision of September 22, 2014 was appealed to City Council.
2. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:
 - a) When making a motion for denial of a project, the Board should explain in the motion why it is being denied.
 - b) When abstaining or stepping down from review of a project, Board members need to state the reason why they are doing so.
 - c) Review of Agenda Item #3, 2405 State Street requires a licensed architect in the quorum. Chair Sweeney stepped down during the last review of this project as it is within 500 feet of his residence. However, due to Board member Zimmerman's absence, Chair Sweeney is the only licensed architect on the Board. There is a provision in the guidelines that states that Chair Sweeney can continue to be part of the quorum if the applicant does not object.
 - d) Mr. Limón announced that City Council voted unanimously to deny the appeal of 215 La Jolla. They generally agreed that the addition was modest and appropriate. However, Council suggested that the guidelines could be amended to clarify the definition of neighborhood and when the use of the 20 closest houses analysis is appropriate. If the guidelines are amended, the changes will be reviewed by the SFDB and presented to Council for adoption. The SFDB may ask staff to amend the guidelines if they are unclear.
3. Chair Sweeney made the following announcements:
 - a) Board members should state which way they will vote and in particular explain why a project is compatible or not with the neighborhood during the Board comments portion of the review.
 - b) Chair Sweeney and Vice-Chair Miller attended the bi-annual Chair and Commission Board for the City Manager last week.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Sweeney reported that the SFDB New Zoning Ordinance (NZO) subcommittee will be comprised of three instead of four Board members to comply with the Brown Act.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 2201 EDGEWATER WAY****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-350-016
 Application Number: MST2013-00185
 Owner: C. and M. Hofman
 Applicant: Permit Planners
 Architect: Sennikoff Architects

(Proposal for an 81 square foot first-floor addition and 38 square foot second-floor addition, including interior and exterior alterations, to an existing 3,243 square foot two-story, single-family residence with an attached 476 square foot two-car garage. A new pedestrian entry from the street, with stairway and landing, is also proposed. The proposed total of 3,838 square feet located on a 21,777 square foot bluff top lot in the Hillside Design District and the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 82% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. The project requires review by the Planning Commission for a requested Zoning Modification and Coastal Development Permit, and Public Works review for a Minor Encroachment Permit.)

(Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 023-14. Project was last reviewed on June 17, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Raymond Appleton, Applicant; Steven Sennikoff Architect; and Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; Craig and Mary Hofman, Owners; Kathy Kennedy, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:39 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, health, safety, and welfare, and good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/James/Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 1301 W MOUNTAIN DR****A-1 Zone**

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-050-038
 Application Number: MST2014-00306
 Owner: Don and Marilyn McCorkell
 Architect: Blackbird Architects
 Engineer: Mike Gones

(Proposal to construct a new 2,702 square foot, one-story residence to replace a residence destroyed by the Tea Fire and for 1,000 cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The proposal also includes one new uncovered parking space and a new detached 1056 square foot four-car garage that will serve both the existing 510 square foot secondary residence and the proposed one-story residence. The proposed total of 4,249 square feet of development on a 10.5 acre project site lot is 42% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area (FAR) ratio. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. The project includes a Substantial Conformance Determination for the previous application (MST2012-00005) that was reviewed and approved by the Staff Hearing Officer on April 4, 2012 for a Performance Standard Permit, to allow an additional dwelling unit at the property.)

(Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 049-14. Project was last reviewed on July 14, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:44 p.m.

Present: Adam Sharkey, Architect; and Joe McCorkell, representing Owners.

Public comment opened at 3:54 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and the landscape plan is appropriate to the drought and neighborhood.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 2405 STATE ST****E-3 Zone**

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-071-012
 Application Number: MST2014-00418
 Owner: Dan Underwood
 Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal to construct a 2,108 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached 505 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes a new driveway, walkways, curb cut, patios, site walls and fencing, an outdoor fireplace, and the removal of a front setback tree. The proposed total of 2,613 square feet on a vacant lot is 85% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment. Project was last reviewed on September 22, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect; Rob Fowler, Landscape Architect; and Dan Underwood, Owner.

Chair Sweeney announced that a licensed architect must be part of the quorum in order for the Board to review this project. As the sole licensed architect Board member present, he asked the owner and applicant if they were comfortable with him reviewing the proposal despite living in close proximity to the project. The owner and applicant welcomed Chair Sweeney's participation in the review of the project.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m.

- 1) Jim Arnesen, adjacent neighbor at 2401 State St., expressed concern regarding obstruction of sunlight, the mass of the second story, the location of the driveway and garage, and privacy issues. He implored the Board to review what grading and tree removals have been done on the property in the past two years.

Public comment closed at 4:21 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study flipping the second story plan after consulting with staff regarding solar access requirements.
- 2) Study the roof, possibly adding dormer windows to create undulation on the south elevation.
- 3) Study reduction of the second story plate height from 9 feet to 8 feet.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan with plant selections that comply with requirements for low water usage.
- 5) Study an alternative to the clumping bamboo.
- 6) Investigate the supportability of the setback tree removals from the Parks Department.
- 7) Leave the installed story poles in place for an additional two days.

Action: Peirce/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Zimmerman absent).

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

4. 1314 FERRELO RD

E-1 Zone

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-283-006
 Application Number: MST2014-00197
 Owner: Scott and Ro Black
 Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal to construct a new 2,514, two-story single-family residence with an attached 445 square foot two-car garage and a 692 square foot basement on a 10,890 square foot vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes 1,009 square feet of decks, new retaining walls, more than 500 cubic yards of grading, and a widened driveway on an easement on an adjacent property. The proposed total of 3,655 square feet, of which 692 square feet is below grade, is 77% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final approval action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on July 28, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:50 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; and Jack Buckley, General Contractor.

Public comment opened at 5:11 p.m.

- 1) Vijaya Jammalamadaka, neighbor at 1304 Ferrelo Rd., asked where the sewer connection was and suggested having more native plants in the landscape plan.

Public comment closed at 5:12 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the following comments:

- 1) The Board reiterated the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings for this project.
- 2) Study an alternative to the Mexican feather grass.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Pierce/Zimmerman absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 1118 INDIO MUERTO ST

R-3 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-291-003
Application Number: MST2014-00283
Owner: Edward St. George Revocable Trust
Applicant: Laura Weinstein
Architect: On Design Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 889 square foot single-family residence and construct a new two-story 1,539 square foot dwelling with a 413 square foot detached two-car garage on a 3,960 square foot lot. The proposal will result in an 89% guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00343. This project is proposed in conjunction with projects at 1120 and 1122 Indio Muerto Street, to be reviewed concurrently by the Architectural Board of Review.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 5:23 p.m.

Present: Laura Weinstein, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 5:33 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates and supports the style of architecture.
- 2) Provide fencing and security details for the main entry.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan.
- 4) Provide paving and exterior lighting details.
- 5) Provide clarification of the pathway from the garage to the front door of the house.
- 6) Use two-piece mission tile on the roof.
- 7) Stucco application should be smooth trowel finish.

8) Provide color and materials board.
Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Peirce/Zimmerman absent).

**** DINNER BREAK FROM 5:45 P.M. TO 6:09 P.M. ****

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

6. 1306 DOVER HILL RD

E-1 Zone

(6:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-103-014
Application Number: MST2014-00350
Owner: Erik Nickel
Designer: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal to convert an existing 367 square foot detached two-car garage to habitable accessory space, and construct a new 279 square foot attached one-car garage and 144 square foot one-car carport. The project includes 351 square feet of additions to the existing 1,973 square foot multi-story single-family residence. The proposed total of 3,614 square feet, located on an 18,740 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 82% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is required for requested zoning modifications.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on August 11, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:09 p.m.

Present: Amy Von Protz, Designer; Erik Nickel and Michael Loftus, Owners.

Public comment opened at 6:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the requested modifications for an accessory structure in the front yard and encroachments into the interior setbacks aesthetically appropriate and supportable.
- 2) The Board appreciates the changes made in the architecture and the applicant's hiring of a surveyor to study the steepness of the driveway.
- 3) The Board is supportive of the current design.
- 4) The Board appreciates the redesign of the single car garage, including the massing.
- 5) Provide a landscape plan.
- 6) Provide lighting details, including how the lighting goes from the street to the house, pedestrian lighting, and the lighting on the house.
- 7) Plaster and tile to match the existing.
- 8) Provide color board.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Peirce/Zimmerman absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 415 YANKEE FARM RD****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-030-024
Application Number: MST2014-00464
Owner: Franck Hanse
Architect: David Mendro
Engineer: Thom Hume Consulting Engineers
Contractor: Allen Construction

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,198 square foot single-family residence with an attached garage and carport and construct a new 2,622 square foot, one-story single-family residence with a 683 square foot, attached two-car garage with a bike storage area. The proposal includes a new 513 square foot pool and 100 square foot spa, patios, decks, landscaping, and 1,500 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The proposed total of 3,305 square feet of development on a 1 acre lot in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 65% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00453.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 6:27 p.m.

Present: David Mendro, Architect; John Kucharski, Neumann Mendro Andrulaitis Architects;
Scott Menzel, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:39 p.m.

- 1) Lori Rafferti, neighbor at 507 Yankee Farm Rd., (submitted letter) expressed concerns regarding tree heights in the proposed landscape plan.
- 2) Paul Weisman, neighbor at 465 Yankee Farm Rd., expressed concerns regarding privacy, drainage, and view obstruction from the proposed tree plantings.
- 3) Mark Davis, neighbor at 3350 Braemar Dr., expressed concerns regarding noise from the pool pump and the proposed tree plantings.

Letters of support from Bob and Margie Niehaus, Jana Young, and Sharyn Johnson were acknowledged. A letter from Lori Rafferti with concerns regarding drainage, and a metal roof was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:48 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the architecture compatible with the neighborhood.
- 2) Study the style of the proposed wood fencing.
- 3) Study the number and heights of the trees in the landscape plan.
- 4) Study a more organic alternative to the glass garage doors.
- 5) Provide lighting details, in particularly the entryway.
- 6) Indicate the location for trash containers.
- 7) The Board recommends a quiet pool pump.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (James/Peirce/Zimmerman absent).

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items A-C on the Consent Agenda were reviewed by Pierce and Sweeney. Item D was reviewed by Lisa James and Fred Sweeney.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 1517 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-182-007
Application Number: MST2013-00219
Owner: Leatherman Family Trust
Applicant: Amy Von Protz
Contractor: David De Lorie

(Proposal to expand an existing 95 square foot second-story deck by 97 square feet and add a new exterior spiral stair case. The proposed new 192 square foot second-story deck is located at the rear of the existing 1,588 square foot, two-story single-family residence, located on a 4,902 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District and within the appealable jurisdiction of the coastal zone. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(Review After Final is requested to remove a proposed exterior spiral staircase and to replace wooden picket railing with glass railing on the proposed upper-level deck addition at the south elevation. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 034-14.)

Project was continued indefinitely to the Full Board.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 20 LAS ALTURAS CIR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-122-001
Application Number: MST2012-00270
Owner: Charles Rudd & Inken Gerlach
Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a new 3,430 square foot two-story, single-family residence with an attached 515 square foot garage located on a 19,718 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous 3,475 square foot single-family residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposal includes new site walls, an existing pool to remain, new pool decking, removal and replacement of an existing 32 inch diameter trunk, redwood tree with three oak trees, and proposed grading of 100 cubic yards of cut, 70 cubic yards of fill and 30 cubic yards of export. The proposed total of 3,945 square feet of development is 89% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer approval for requested zoning modifications. The project requires a Public Works encroachment permit.)

(Review After Final is requested to change the material of the two chimneys from stone to vertical board and batten painted to match the residence, and to add additional stone veneer at the garage.)

Approval of Review after Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 4108 HIDDEN OAKS RD PUD 0.4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-440-002
Application Number: MST2014-00481
Owner: Steve Countryman
Applicant: Jim Gaskin

(Proposal for a new 15' x 20' pool in the rear yard of an existing single-family residence.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM**D. 1225 MANITOU LN R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-010-036
Application Number: MST2014-00463
Owner: Trent Baer
Applicant: Robert Dawson

(Proposal for a new 629 square foot pool and 38 square foot spa with associated pool equipment, fencing, and patio in the rear yard of a single-family residence in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program prior to Final Approval. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 054-01)

Project was continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Provide details showing the location and dimensions of the gates and fencing.
- 2) Indicate whether the pool equipment be housed in an enclosure. If so, provide details on plans.
- 3) Indicate whether any additional walkways are proposed between the residence and the pool area.
- 4) Indicate whether any additional landscaping is proposed.
- 5) Show the footprints of the homes on adjacent parcels.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:12 P.M. ****