



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, March 24, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES
 JAIME PIERCE
 DENISE WOOLERY
 JIM ZIMMERMAN

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
 AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (3:03p.m. to 6:55p.m.), James, Pierce, Woolery, and Zimmerman (3:03p.m. to 7:26 p.m.).
Members absent: Bernstein.
Staff present: Eng, Limón, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of March 10, 2014 as submitted.

Action: Pierce/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **March 17, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Sweeney/James.
- Action: Pierce/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **March 24, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by Sweeney/James.
- Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Mr. Eng made the following announcements:
- a) Board member Bernstein will be absent from the meeting.
 - b) Due to the upcoming holiday, the Consent calendar will be moved from Monday, March 31st to Tuesday, April 1st.
- b. Board member Woolery announced her attendance at the Planning Commission Hearing regarding Edgewater Lane's request for a Coastal Development permit. She reported that it was passed unanimously and would return to the Board.
- c. Chair Sweeney announced his attendance at the City Administrator's Annual Meeting where various Commissioners and Board members spoke about the many parcels from the Tea Fire that have yet to be remedied. It was suggested that the Planning Commission, Single Family Design Board, and Fire and Police Commissions join with the property owners to find out status and address the issue.
- d. Mr. Limon reported that the City Planner has approved a letter that should be sent out within the week to owners of properties damaged or destroyed by the 2008 Tea Fire. The letter is a status check for affected properties that have not been rebuilt and will help inform Planning Commission and Single Family Design Board efforts to facilitate reconstruction.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. 2111 STANWOOD DR****A-1 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-041-026
Application Number: MST2009-00173
Owner: Taylor Tatman
Engineer: Kevin Vandervort
Architect: Richard Redmond

(Proposal to rebuild a 2,878 square foot two-story, single-family residence and attached 525 square foot two-car garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. The project is located in the existing building footprint and includes the replacement of an 857 square foot first floor deck and a 152 square foot second floor deck. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification is requested to allow alterations within the setback. The proposed total of 3,280 square feet on the 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 64% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio.)

(Review After Final requested for as-built alterations to a two-story, single-family residence, including enclosure of a second-story porch, addition of a fireplace and chimney above the master bedroom, and changes to roof materials, all windows, exterior doors, exterior colors, and other finishes. The project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination for alterations within the setback. The project was referred from Consent Calendar on March 17, 2014).

Actual time: 3:13 p.m.

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect; Ben Chapman, General Contractor; and Taylor Tatman, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m.

- 1) Russell Collins, a next-door neighbor, expressed concern about the original approved plans, but now supports the project's new design.

Letters of support from B. Thompsen and Maria MacDuff were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:28 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the installation of the S-tile on the roof?
5/1 (passed).

How many Board members could support the study to change certain windows in the different elevations? 6/0 (passed).

How many Board members could support the style and type of the windows that have been installed? 5/1 (passed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board accepts the S-tile roof in accordance with the city guidelines.
- 2) The Board accepts the metal windows in accordance with the study of the design location.
- 3) The Board accepts enclosing the balcony.
- 4) Extend the scope of the plant materials where it slopes on the site.
- 5) Study of appropriate plants under the oaks.

6) Provide irrigation system.
 Action: Zimmerman/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 1930 EMERSON AVE

R-2 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-401-015
 Application Number: MST2014-00009
 Owner: Jonathan V. Leech
 Architect: Wade Davis Design

(Proposal for a 113 square foot one-story addition and a 397 square foot two-story addition to an existing 1,221 square foot one-story, single-family residence. Also proposed is an interior remodel, a 158 square foot second story deck, new windows and doors, change of use of 35 square feet of habitable space to utility room, an 18 square foot addition of storage space, a 41 square foot potting shed, and a new roof. There will be no site grading. This project will result in 1,731 square feet of development on a 5,280 square foot parcel, which is a 69% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). No alterations are proposed to the existing stone walls and garage which have been found to be historically significant.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval Requested. The project was last reviewed on February 24, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:12 p.m.

Present: Akiko Wade Davis, Architect; Jim Davis, Architect; and Jonathan Leech, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:20 p.m.

- 1) Brad Simon, a neighbor in close proximity, is in favor of the project. He supports the addition to the neighborhood, expressing the second-story as a modest addition to the style of the surrounding homes.
- 2) Michelle Politi, a neighbor behind the project, is concerned with the second-floor addition as well as the roof slant obstructing her view, suggesting a reduction of the project. She also submitted a letter in opposition regarding the cohesiveness of the project to the surrounding neighborhood.
- 3) Suvi Bayly, a neighbor next-door to the project, is concerned with the ceiling height, asking for a reduction in size to maintain the esthetics of her home.

Letters of support from Richard Eckert and Jesse Aldana were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:27 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent for Final Approval with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.

Action: Miller/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 958 GARCIA RD****E-1 Zone**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-261-013
Application Number: MST2013-00308
Owner: Schaeffer Family Trust U/T/D
Designer: Al Winsor

(Revised proposal to construct a 32 square foot first-floor addition to an existing 1,431 square foot single-family residence with a detached 561 square foot two-car garage with half-bath and laundry room. The proposal also includes remodeling the existing residence, construction of a 364 square foot detached accessory structure, new site paving, a new raised deck, new site and retaining walls, and the removal of storage and equipment structures. The proposed total of 2,392 square feet is located on a 17,234 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The revised proposal eliminates a previously proposed second-story addition above the garage and reorients the proposed detached accessory structure.)

(Revised project. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment. The project was last reviewed on August, 12, 2013.)

Actual time: 4:43 p.m.

Present: Al Winsor, Designer; and Tim Schaeffer, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:57 p.m.

- 1) Steve Hahn, a neighbor north of the project, is in favor of the new design.
- 2) Mary Miller, a neighbor in close proximity, presented a petition from the surrounding neighbors for the erection of story poles regarding the project, concerned with neighborhood compatibility.
- 3) Judith Franks, a neighbor in close proximity, expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility with the historic elements of Garcia Heights.
- 4) Kellem de Forest expressed concerns regarding the project's conformity to Santa Barbara's historic character.

Public comment closed at 5:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study lowering the accessory structure to settle into topography.
- 2) The Board had positive comments regarding good neighbor guidelines and quality materials.
- 3) Study posts for High Fire area compatibility.

Action: James/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 3626 SAN REMO DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2009-00325
Owner: Madsen Trust
Agent: Alexandra Cole
Applicant: Lisa Plowman

(Proposal to subdivide a 66,372 square foot property into four legal lots ranging in size from 14,166 square feet to 16,453 square feet. The proposal includes a view easement and preservation of the facade of the existing 3,137 square foot main residence. Also included is demolition of the remainder of the existing residence, the detached garage, studio apartment, shed, lath house, and driveway. The four proposed lots include development envelopes which provide a creek setback. The project also includes a new driveway to access the lots, drainage improvements, implementation of a creek restoration plan, and approximately 150 cubic yards total of cut and fill grading. Residential development of the lots is not a part of this application. The project requires Planning Commission approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map, and Modifications and Waivers for three lots to have no public street frontage.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review. The project was last reviewed on July 19, 2010.)

This item was reviewed out of order.

Actual time: 5:18 p.m.

Present: Kate Svensson, Designer; Robert Adams, Architect; Vince Amore, Builder; and Dan Gullett, Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:51 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:15 P.M. TO 6:19 P.M. ****

Public comment re-opened at 6:19 p.m. since the comments were lot-specific to the subdivided project.

- 1) Robert Jacobs, a neighbor in close proximity, expressed concerns with the hastiness of the project. He also submitted a letter addressing the conformity of the projects to the neighborhood.
- 2) Peter Edwards, a neighbor in close proximity, expressed concerns regarding the condensation of the housing structures as well as the fire access. He also submitted a letter along with his wife, Shirley, addressing the impact of their privacy due to the second-story additions.
- 3) Shirley Edwards, a neighbor in close proximity, expressed concerns regarding privacy and the scale of the projects to the surrounding neighbors.
- 4) Molly Steen, a co-owner north of Lot 1, expressed concerns regarding the second-floors' impact on her privacy. She suggested story poles as a way to better understand the structures' height. She also submitted a letter in opposition.
- 5) John Steen, a neighbor north of Lot 1, expressed concerns regarding the median size of Lot 1 and requested Lot 1, 2 and 4 be made into single-story homes. He also submitted a letter in opposition.

Letters of expressed concerns from Mary Esperti and Robert Westwick regarding the compatibility of the projects to the neighborhood were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:36 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

- 1) The Board supports the mitigating Oaks on Lot 4.
- 2) The Board has concerns regarding guest parking and potential conflicts with fire truck access.
- 3) Provide a bollard-type lighting approach to the driveway.
- 4) Consider alternating the ginkgo tree locations.
- 5) Add taller trees to promote privacy and to mitigate the height of the buildings to the west.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman/Miller/Bernstein absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

5. 3626 SAN REMO DR

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2013-00504
Owner: Nancy J. Madsen
Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 1: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 3,212 square foot, single-family residence and an attached two-car garage located on a vacant 14,191 square foot parcel (Lot 1). The proposal includes associated flat work, landscaping, and site walls. The proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposal of 3,212 square feet is 76% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review. The project was last reviewed on January 13, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:42 p.m.

Present: Kate Svensson, Designer; Robert Adams, Architect; Vince Amore, Builder; and Dan Gullett, Planner.

Public comment was presented on Item No. 4.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design changes and features.
- 2) Reduce the square footage.
- 3) Study placement of the second-story further to the south.
- 4) Provide story poles (Level B).

Action: Woolery/Zimmerman, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Bernstein absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**6. 3626 SAN REMO DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2013-00505
Owner: Nancy J. Madsen
Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 2: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 2,792 square foot, single-family residence and an attached 499 square foot two-car garage located on a vacant 14,094 square foot parcel (Lot 2). The proposal includes associated flatwork, landscaping, and site walls. This proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposed total of 3,292 square feet is 78% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review. The project was last reviewed on January 13, 2014.)

Actual time: 7:02 p.m.

Present: Kate Svensson, Designer; Robert Adams, Architect; Vince Amore, Builder; and Dan Gullett, Planner.

Public comment was presented on Item No. 4.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

- 1) Reduce the square footage.
- 2) Study of the second-story.
- 3) Consider reducing the roof height.
- 4) Create an arbor-type entrance to help mitigate the façade.
- 5) Study the sloped walls below the windows.
- 6) Provide story poles.
- 7) Consider Lot 4's design as the design for Lot 2.

Action: Woolery/Zimmerman, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Bernstein absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**7. 3626 SAN REMO DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

(6:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2013-00506
Owner: Nancy J. Madsen
Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 4: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 2,819 square foot, single-family residence and an attached 498 square foot two-car garage located on a vacant 17,351 square foot parcel (Lot 4). The proposal includes associated flat work, landscaping, and site walls. This proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposed total of 3,317 square feet is 76% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review. The project was last reviewed on January 13, 2014.)

Actual time: 7:10 p.m.

Present: Kate Svensson, Designer; Robert Adams, Architect; Vince Amore, Builder; and Dan Gullett, Planner.

Public comment was presented on Item No. 4.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

- 1) Provide story poles.
- 2) Minimize the second-story, deferring visual attention to the historic property on Lot 3.
- 3) Create a receptive entryway to the project.
- 4) Reduce the square footage.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman/Miller/Bernstein absent).

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by Fred Sweeney and Lisa James.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**A. 1860 EUCALYPTUS HILL RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-161-052
Application Number: MST2013-00432
Owner: Frederick Graham
Architect: Tai Yeh

(Proposal to convert the existing garage into new habitable area to the existing 2,525 square foot two-story, single-family residence, and to construct a new, 484 square foot, detached, two-car garage, with a second story, 394 square foot, accessory building and second story deck. The proposal includes minor exterior alterations to the existing residence. The proposed total of 3,913 square feet, located on a 38,333 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 80% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00426.)

(Final Approval requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 507 SAN ONOFRE RD****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-302-005
Application Number: MST2014-00087
Owner: Tobias Kruse
Architect: Dwight Gregory
Owner: Shannon & Gaston

(Proposal to permit as-built fences of up to six feet tall, and that exceed the three and one-half foot height limit for fences located within 10 feet of a front lot line. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow the fences to exceed this height limit. This proposal will abate violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-01114. The proposal also includes the addition of a new 180 square foot, second-story deck and exterior stairs to an existing 1,620 square foot, two-story, single-family residence on a 9,876 square foot lot.)

(Project Design Approval requested. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the deck and staircase, deck color, trellis, and fence height acceptable.
- 2) Provide details of the deck and railings, trellis, and landing at the foot of the stairs.
- 3) Provide color board.
- 4) Provide details for new lighting.
- 5) Show the existing storage shed to be relocated outside the front yard and required interior setbacks.

NEW ITEM**C. 2101 MOUNTAIN****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-280-030
Application Number: MST2014-00091
Owner: Sharon Landecker Living Trust
Applicant: Heidi Jones

(Proposal to construct a new two-car carport to serve a 497 square foot accessory building to be converted into a new secondary dwelling unit. The proposed carport and new dwelling unit are located on a 17,583 square foot lot with an existing 3,463 square foot single-family residence and two-car garage, of which the latter is attached to the proposed second unit. The proposal for the new carport and accessory dwelling unit requires a Performance Standard Permit and a lot merger with an adjacent 3.74 acre vacant lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board finds that the proposed carport's steel structure, brown and green roof colors, and asphalt paving appropriate.

NEW ITEM**D. 502 LAS ALTURAS RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-273-006
Application Number: MST2014-00108
Owner: Moler Patsy Wiser
Applicant: Leland Walmsley

(Proposal to remove and replace existing un-reinforced site retaining walls of up to three and one-half feet tall and to construct a new four foot tall wood fence. The proposal also includes removal and replacement of the existing concrete driveway and apron with reinforced concrete, removal of the existing flagstone steps and paving, and replacement of the paving with permeable gravel and flagstone at the entry to an existing single-family dwelling on a 6,534 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an encroachment permit for improvements located in the public right of way.)

Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Further study the storm water retention strategies at the lower portion of the driveway.
- 2) Research a drainage pipe under the driveway.

Public Comment received from:

- 1) Klaus Mund, neighbor, 504 Las Alturas Rd., expressed concern with an existing wall encroaching on their property, proposed fencing, and potential impacts during construction.
- 2) Michael Collin, neighbor, 20 Rincon Vista Rd., expressed concern with walls to be constructed in the public right of way, and expansion of the driveway further into a driveway easement.
- 3) Alex Ziegler, neighbor, 30 Rincon Vista Rd., opposed the project and expressed concern regarding construction noise and dust impacts.

NEW ITEM

E. 762 WESTMONT RD

R-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-103-001
Application Number: MST2014-00110
Owner: Timothy R Sulger
Architect: Broderson Associates

(Proposal for a 355 square foot swimming pool, 68 square foot spa, 61 square foot barbeque, and 1,091 square feet of new paved patio area to be added to the existing 491 square foot patio. There is no significant grading proposed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

+

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:40 P.M. ****