



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, February 10, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair* (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)
 BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
 BERNI BERNSTEIN
 LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
 JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
 DENISE WOOLERY
 JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
 GABRIELE COOK, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller, Bernstein, James, Pierce, Woolery and Zimmerman.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Boughman, Limón (4:48 to 5:39), Riegle (3:47 to 5:46) and Cook.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of January 27, 2014, as submitted.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 3, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Sweeney/Woolery.
- Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 10, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Sweeney/James.
- Action: James/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Board member Bernstein asked if the Board had a position on what to do if a member were to support an item and then change his or her mind before a subsequent hearing. Chair Sweeney answered that the Board member should give an explanation for the change.
- b. Board member James pointed out that Item #5's address may be incorrect in the Agenda.
- c. Chair Sweeney is stepping down from Item #5.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittees.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 1860 EUCALYPTUS HILL RD****A-2 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-161-052
 Application Number: MST2013-00432
 Owner: Frederick Graham
 Architect: Tai Yeh

(Proposal to convert the existing garage into new habitable area to the existing 2,525 square foot two-story, single-family residence, and to construct a new, 484 square foot, detached, two-car garage, with a second story, 394 square foot, accessory building and second story deck. The proposal includes minor exterior alterations to the existing residence. The proposed total of 3,913 square feet, located on a 38,333 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 80% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations identified within Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00426.)

(Project Design Approval requested. The project was last reviewed on November 4, 2013. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval.)

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: Mike Gones, Civil Engineer; Lauri Romano, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding NPO findings of consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, trees, and the good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Zimmerman/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**2. 1423 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-185-005
Application Number: MST2013-00527
Owner: Chesluk Family Trust
Designer: Bruce Alker
Contractor: Sean Pierce

(Proposal to construct a 440 square foot, second-story, addition to an existing, 2,950 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached, 575 square foot, three-car garage. The proposed total of 3,965 square feet, located on a 12,632 square foot lot within the Hillside Design District, is 98% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit. The project was last reviewed on February 3, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:26 p.m.

Present: Bruce Alker, Designer.

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission and return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board realizes that the house is not visible from the street; however there is concern about the precedent of a high FAR direction for reductions so that the size, scale, and aesthetic design is acceptable with reservations from some Board members.
- 2) The applicant followed Board direction for reductions in size, so that the aesthetic design meet the guidelines, with some reservations.

Action: Bernstein/ No one seconded the motion. Motion failed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission and return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The applicant followed Board direction for reductions in square footage and roof height so that the size, scale, and aesthetic design is acceptable.
- 2) Because the house is not visible from the street the Board is supportive of the high FAR.

Action: James/Pierce, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

****THE BOARD TOOK A BRIEF RECESS AT 3:43 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 3:47 P.M.****

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 1323 CLIFF DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-041-007

Application Number: MST2013-00500

Owner: Susan Aumack

Architect: Dylan Chappell Architects

(Proposal for a complete interior and façade remodel, a partial demolition, and one- and two-story additions to an existing, 1,383 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, including an attached, two-car garage. The proposal includes 612 square feet of demolition, a total of 408 square feet of one-story additions, and a new 580 square foot two-story addition, resulting in a 2,390 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, including the attached, two-car garage. The proposal includes an approximate 300 square foot second level deck. The proposed total of 2,390 square feet, located on a 6,607 square foot lot, is 84% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations identified within Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00260. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Third concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The project was last reviewed on January 27, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:47 p.m.

Present: Dylan Chappell, Architect; Susan Aumack, Owner; Suzanne Riegle, Planning Division

Public comment opened at 4:01 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members request story poles? 3/4/0 (failed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The modifications are aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modifications do not pose consistency issues with appearance, compatibility, quality architecture and materials.
- 2) The Board is supportive of the flat roof design option.
- 3) Study raising the first story roof for better proportions between the first and second stories.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan, possibly with trees, to soften the height and the contemporary look of the design.

Action: Woolery/Pierce, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 215 LA JOLLA DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(4:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-363-004

Application Number: MST2013-00528

Owner: Frank Bucy

Architect: David Van Hoy

(Proposal for a major façade and interior remodel to an existing, 1,533 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, including an attached, two-car garage, located on a 6,000 square foot lot within the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes 398 square feet of one-story additions, a new 379 square foot second-story addition, and an 86 square foot, second-level deck. The proposal includes demolition and re-construction of the existing garage to be located within the original building footprint. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. The proposed total of 2,291 square feet is 85% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: David Van Hoy, Architect; Derek Westen, Attorney; Frank and Marlene Bucy, Owners, Suzanne Riegle, Planning Division

Public comment opened at 5:05 p.m.

- 1) Rhonda Seiter, neighbor at 225 La Jolla Dr. (submitted letter), expressed opposition regarding the second story, obstructed views, and neighborhood incompatibility. Mrs. Seiter summarized the comments on a petition of neighbors who could not attend the meeting.
- 2) Tony Craddock, neighbor at 151 La Jolla Dr. (submitted letter), expressed support for the project.
- 3) Pat Craddock, neighbor at 151 La Jolla Dr. (submitted letter), expressed support for the project.
- 4) James Seiter, neighbor at 2517 Mesa School Ln. (submitted letter), expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility.
- 5) Mark Paul, neighbor, 221 La Jolla Dr., expressed concerns regarding the sandblasted privacy panels and requested screening landscaping.
- 6) Frank Wascoe, neighbor at 2540 Selrose Ln. (submitted letter), expressed support for the project design. Requested story poles.
- 7) Ed Tormio, neighbor at 2547 Medcliff Rd. (submitted letter), expressed support for the project design.

Letters of support from approximately 14 people, including Laurence Severance, Judith Long, Maria Richardson, Patricia Carddock, Erika Klemperer, Tony Craddock, Roger Dickson, Stephanie Sneddon, Frank and Jeri Wascoe, Nathan and Abigail Ziv, Robin and Scottie Brooks and Ed Tormio were received.

Letters and petitions of opposition from approximately 26 people, including Rhonda Seiter, Judith and Wayne Cottrell, Jane Ricketts, Paul Delaney, John and Mary Lou Williams, David Galene, Barbara Thorburn, Robyn Palmquist, Chris Kent, Susan Shank, and James Seiter were received.

Public comment closed at 5:22 p.m.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The modifications are aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modifications do not pose consistency issues with appearance, compatibility, quality architecture and materials.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan.
- 3) Study mitigation of the night glow that may emit from the second story windows.
- 4) Study the sandblasted panels for an alternative to provide privacy.
- 5) Provide Standard Level B story poles.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 2525 SANTA BARBARA ST

E-1 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-041-010

Application Number: MST2014-00032

Owner: Raymond Karam

Applicant: Brett Ettinger

(Proposal for partial demolition, addition and remodel of an existing, 4,030 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, with an attached, 341 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes a total of 820 square feet of one- and two-story additions to the existing residence, and a 279 square foot addition to the existing garage. The proposal will result in a 620 square foot, three-car garage, and a new, 129 square foot, carport (attached to the garage) for a total of four, on-site, covered-parking spaces. The proposal involves new site work including new terraces, alterations to the existing site stairs, a total of 300 cubic feet of cut and fill grading, and new site hardscape for expansion of the existing driveway. The proposed total of 5,599 square feet, located on a 36,600 square foot lot, is 115% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 5:46 p.m.

Present: Brett Ettinger, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:00 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of expressed concern from Glen Estabrook regarding maintaining FAR parameters was acknowledged.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials.
- 2) Study the front entry way to appear less dark.
- 3) Study mitigating the view of the car port from the street.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney stepped down).

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Fred Sweeney and Lisa James.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 1533 SHORELINE DR E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-182-014
Application Number: MST2012-00046
Owner: Anina Davenport Revocable Trust
Architect: James Zimmerman

(This project has been revised to reduce the overall second-story addition by 283 square feet, reducing the FAR from 85% to 79%, and elimination of the 700 square foot "as-built" bluff-side, circular tiled patio. The revised proposal involves the construction of a 946 square foot, second-story addition to an existing 2,419 square foot residence with an attached two-car garage. The project also includes a major façade remodel, a 92 square foot one-story addition and interior remodel. The proposed total of 3,457 square feet, located on a 19,166 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and in the Hillside Design District, is 79% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project received Planning Commission approval for a Coastal Development Permit and zoning modifications (Resolution No. 018-12). The proposal will address the violations in ZIR2011-00381.)

(Review After Final for roofing material/color changes.)

Review After Final approved with the condition to submit Golden Burma color swatch for records.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1191 LAS ALTURAS RD A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-113-025
Application Number: MST2013-00202
Owner: Frederick Newton Davis III
Architect: Lazaros Papademetropoulos

(Proposal to construct a total of 268 square feet of one-story additions to add a new half bath and a new master closet to an existing, one-story, 3,195 square foot single-family residence. The property is also developed with an existing 1,478 square foot guest house. The total onsite development of 4,941 square feet, located on a 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District, is 98% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Review After Final for the following changes: addition of two new exterior stair cases, a 35 square foot addition to the living room deck, a new garage door, a new site/sound wall around the A/C unit, and revised railing materials.)

Review After Final approved as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 1676 FRANCESCHI RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-102-004
Application Number: MST2012-00493
Owner: B & B SB Trust
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to demolish an existing, 5,124 square foot, single-family residence and construct a new, 6,415 square foot, three-story, single-family residence, located on a two-acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes an attached 750 square foot three-car garage, two-uncovered parking spaces, a 200 square foot detached accessory building, new site walls and gates, new site landscaping, and a new pool. A total of 2,910 cubic yards of site grading is proposed, which includes 350 cubic yards of grading within the proposed building footprint and 2,560 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprint. The project is 119% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) and includes a 50% reduction of basement level square footage. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review of requested zoning modifications.)

(Review After Final for detail changes to the residence.)

Review After Final approved with the condition to submit the wall/fence elevation details on Sheet A7.1 (1/30/2014) at the front transformer area.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**D. 1676 FRANCESCHI RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-102-004
Application Number: MST2013-00450
Owner: B & B SB Trust
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new pool cabana, trellis, pool storage structure and mechanical areas located on a two acre parcel in the Hillside Design District. An application (MST2012-00493) was approved on October 21, 2013, to construct a new, 6,415 square foot, three-story, single-family residence. The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Project Design and Final Approval requested. The project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 001-14.)

Project Design and Final Approval, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and with the following conditions:

- 1) Provide tile samples for the record.
- 2) Subject to fire department approval for vegetated roof at the garage.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

NEW ITEM**E. 1531 LIVE OAK LN****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-261-029
Application Number: MST2014-00038
Architect: Don Swann
Owner: Robert & Tammara Stockero

(Proposal for a total of 46 square feet of one-story additions and a 108 square foot interior remodel to an existing 1,687 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, with an attached, 428 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes requesting to permit a 259 square foot "as-built" deck and exterior stairs. The proposal will address violations listed in ZIR2013-00582. The proposed total of 2,161 square feet, located on an 11,760 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 55% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments:

- 1) The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines. .
- 2) Return to staff for administrative staff approval.
- 3) Submit door details.

NEW ITEM**F. 426 LAS ALTURAS RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-312-007
Application Number: MST2014-00041
Owner: David J. Slomiany
Applicant: Eric Knight

(Proposal for a 315 square foot deck addition to an existing 465 square foot second-story deck, located at the rear of the existing, 2,975 square foot, two-story, single-family residence. Alterations to the existing residence include changing an existing second-story window to new French doors, and to permit the 'as-built' air conditioning unit. The existing 2,975 square foot residence, located on a 7,308 square foot lot within the Hillside Design District, is 99% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued one week to Consent with comment to provide better railing design to match architecture.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:20 P.M. ****