



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, July 15, 2013

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

- DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair*
- FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair*
- BERNI BERNSTEIN
- BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)
- LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
- JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
- JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)

- CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO
- PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** ADDISON THOMPSON
- PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE):** JOHN CAMPANELLA

- STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
- MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
- ROSA ROGERS O'REILLY, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDB and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Woolery.

ATTENDANCE:

- Members present: Woolery, Bernstein, Miller, James, and Pierce (at 3:01).
- Members absent: Sweeney.
- Staff present: Bedard, Riegle, and Rogers O'Reilly.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **July 1, 2013**, as amended.

Action: Bernstein/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent)

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 8, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: James/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 15, 2013**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

a. Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:

- 1) Board member Sweeney will be absent from the meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 1676 FRANCESCHI RD****A-1 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-102-004

Application Number: MST2012-00493

Owner: B & B SB Trust

Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to demolish an existing, 5,124 square foot, single-family residence and construct a new, 6,330 square foot, three-story, single-family residence, located on a two-acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes an attached 750 square foot three-car garage, two-uncovered parking spaces, a 200 square foot detached accessory building, new site walls and gates, new site landscaping, and a new pool. A total of 602 cubic yards of site grading is proposed, which includes 241 cubic yards of grading within the proposed building footprint and 361 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprint. The project is 114% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) and includes a 50% reduction of basement level square footage. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review of requested zoning modifications.)

(Project Design Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 029-13. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to Final Approval. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on March 25, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:06 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) Provide all final details, including windows, railings and garage door.

3) Consider having a more formal landscaping plan, to be more consistent with the architectural style of the home.

4) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program requirements.

Action: Zimmerman/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

2. 822 SOLEDAD AVE

R-1 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-060-028
 Application Number: MST2013-00249
 Owner: Shelley Hurst
 Agent: Charles Travis

(Proposal to construct a new, 792 square foot, one-story, addition to an existing, 1,466 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, and a new, 212 square foot, covered porch. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing storage shed and one-car garage and construction of a new, detached, 400 square foot, two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,658 square feet, located on a 13,915 square foot lot, is 63% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Referred from Consent. Project Design and Final Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on July 1, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:38 p.m.

Present: Charles Travis, Agent; Harmony Grogen Architect; and Bryan Jobe, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:48 p.m.

A letter of concern and prior public comment from Frederick W. Dahlquist and Mrs. Patricia Lambert was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:49 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

****THE BOARD TOOK A BRIEF RECESS AT 3:55 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 3:57 P.M.****

THIS ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF ORDER:**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)*******2:00 p.m. – Organized Board Site Visit to 745 Dolores Dr.*******3. 745 DOLORES DR****E-1 Zone****(4:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-103-011

Application Number: MST2012-00498

Designer: Russell Banko Design & Construction

Owner: Kenneth & Laura Haney

(Proposal to construct a new, 758 square foot, two-story addition, and a new, 243 square foot, one-story addition, to an existing 1,674 square foot one-story single-family residence and attached two-car garage. The proposal includes an interior remodel, façade alterations, a new upper level deck, replacement of the existing roof material, and new site retaining walls. The proposed total of 2,675 square feet, located on a 9,409 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District, is 76% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Third concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. The project was last reviewed on June 17, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:57 p.m.

Present: Russell Banko, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m.

- 1) Don Hay, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the height of the building and preservation of private views.

Public Comment closed at 4:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the progress of the design and finds the proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate, and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Design Guidelines.
- 2) Study the location, size, and configuration of the windows on the north elevation.
- 3) Study moving the wall back and adding a window on the west elevation, second level, so the walls are in the same plane.
- 4) Study alternate materials for the deck railing.
- 5) Indicate plate heights, lines, and materials on the elevations.
- 6) Correct the drafting on the elevations to indicate shingles on the west elevation.
- 7) Update the site and landscape plan to eliminate the "bench wall" and identify as a wall.
- 8) Study ground cover of landscape plan; reproduce the completed Landscape Compliance Statement on the landscape plans.

Action: Miller/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 828 SUMMIT RD****A-2 Zone**

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-172-023
Application Number: MST2013-00252
Owner: Maricel Hines
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal for a façade remodel, construction of a new, 1,557 square foot, one-story addition, and a new, 116 square foot, two-story addition, to an existing 1,388 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, located on a 40,510 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a new, 498 square foot, one-story, accessory building, a new, 232 square foot, roof-top deck, a new, 116 square foot, second-level deck, and demolition of 141 square feet of the existing 633 square foot main-level deck. A total of 532 cubic yards of site grading is proposed. The proposed total of 4,145 square feet is 84% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal will address violations identified in ENF2013-00164 and ZIR2013-00083.)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. The project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on July 1, 2013.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the front entry foyer, stairway, and pathway for a centered design; consider a fan shape stairway design, and study the pathway approach.
- 2) Thicken the walls in the open foyer to achieve an adobe design.
- 3) Study detailing and proportions on top of the open foyer.
- 4) Study the stairwell design, with the suggestion to make it circular.
- 5) Clarify the roof eave details.
- 6) Study the stairway and railing design, on the east elevation, of the second level exterior "dining" deck, for a more graceful and architecturally consistent design.
- 7) Study lowering the plate height of the accessory structure so that the proportions of the opening are more consistent with the height of the building.
- 8) Study the front entry design of the accessory structure; thicken the walls and provide a design that is consistent with, and to match, the design of the main residence.
- 9) Study eliminating the tile decor on the roof eave, or provide examples of a successful design.
- 10) Provide a landscape plan; provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP).
- 11) Provide all final details, including details of the roof, deck railings, and garage door. Provide a colors and materials board.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1727 SANTA BARBARA ST****E-1 Zone****(5:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-017
 Application Number: MST2013-00276
 Owner: Peter & Dorian Hirth
 Engineer: Windward Engineering
 Applicant: Ken Dickson

(This is a revised proposal to construct a new, two-story, 3,007 square foot, single-family residence, with a detached, 452 square foot, two-car garage, located on a 10,200 square foot lot. The proposed total of 3,459 square feet is 92% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This proposal replaces the original project approved in 2008. The original proposal involved the construction of a new, two-story, 3,731 square foot, single-family residence, including a detached, two-car garage. The original project obtained a Planning Commission approval for an FAR modification to allow the building height to exceed 25-feet in combination with an FAR greater than 85% of the maximum FAR. An FAR modification is no longer required as the revised project has been reduced to not exceed the maximum building height of 25-feet. The revised design also includes a revised architectural style and a net reduction of 272 square feet. The proposal includes the removal of approximately seven Pittosporum trees and one existing cedar tree.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. The previous project was approved by SFDB on February 19, 2008.)

Actual time: 5:11 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gordon, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m.

- 1) Annette Muse, opposition (submitted letter); expressed concerns regarding lack of proper permits and approval of the Single Family Design Board.
- 2) Paul Suding, opposition; expressed concerns regarding replacement of vegetation, overall footprint of the property and privacy.
- 3) Mary Suding, opposition (submitted letter); expressed concerns regarding the architectural style, and the removal of trees and historical brick pillars.
- 4) Philip Suding, opposition; expressed concerns regarding loss of vegetation and bio-mass replacement, the removal of the brick columns, overall footprint, site lines and neighborhood compatibility. Also requested that the architecture be of exemplary quality.

Letters of expressed concerns from Mary Suding, Annette Muse, and Doug Muse were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:37 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study neighborhood compatibility and conforms to guidelines.
- 2) Study reducing the FAR.
- 3) Address the removal of the trees.
- 4) Address the removal of the pillars.
- 5) Study creating a smaller footprint.
- 6) Study neighborhood compatibility in terms of the quality of the design.

Action: Bernstein/No seconder, Motion failed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the overall architectural style of the residence for neighborhood compatibility, specifically in consideration of the architectural styles of the two adjacent residences. Due to the sensitive historical neighborhood district the proposed design style must be exemplary and of the highest quality possible. If staying with Classic Spanish Colonial Architecture, study the works of Myron Hunt, Wallace Neff, George Washington Smith and Bertram Goodhue, architects who are noted for classic Spanish colonial architecture. Alternately, consider an alternate architectural style that is more compatible with the neighborhood, suggestions included a Monterey style architecture.
- 2) Be sensitive to the neighbors' concerns and improve communication with adjacent neighbors in particular.
- 3) Create a harmonious and cohesive design.
- 4) Restore the brick columns and wrought iron gate, that were removed, to the original height and look.
- 5) Replace the removed Cedar tree with another compatible, minimum 60-inch box tree specimen, and to match the biomass of the Cedar tree that was removed.
- 6) Study the possibility of the wall being not on the property line.
- 7) Study reducing the FAR.
- 8) The Board looks forward to reviewing a complete site landscape plan, and will carefully review the plan for an appropriate remediation for the Pittosporum trees that were removed.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 3627 CAMPANIL DR****A-1 Zone****(5:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-101-003
 Application Number: MST2013-00271
 Owner: Burke Living Trust
 Architect: Zehren And Associates

(Proposal for an interior remodel and one-story addition to an existing, 2,204 square foot, one-story, single family residence, with an attached, 632 square foot, three-car garage, located on a 1.29 acre lot in the Hillside Design District and in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes construction of 780 square feet of new, one-story, additions and to convert 146 square feet of the existing three-car garage into a habitable residential addition thereby converting the existing three-car garage into a new, 486 square foot, two-car garage. The proposal includes replacement of the existing roof, new site improvements and new uncovered guest parking spaces. The proposed total of 3,740 square feet is 73% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval.)

Actual time: 6:09 p.m.

Present: Stephanie Poole, Architect; and Robert Adams, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:24 p.m.

- 1) Bob Swanson; spoke in support of the project. Had questions regarding hours of construction work.

Public comment closed at 6:27 p.m.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency in appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and good neighbor guidelines. The proposed tree removal is compatible with the landscape plan.
- 2) Provide all final details.
- 3) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program requirements.

Action: Pierce/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney absent).

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

FINAL REVIEW

A. 539 OWEN RD

A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-015
Application Number: MST2013-00258
Owner: Bruce W. Wiechert
Applicant: Loge Design

(Proposal for a new, 16.5 square foot, covered front entry addition and to permit the 'as-built' 145.5 square feet of single-story additions, to an existing 1,618 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, with an existing, detached, 361 square foot, two-car garage. The proposed total on-site development of 2,141 square feet, located on a 19,166 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District, is 49% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. The project requires compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval.)

Final Approval with comments to consider replacing the existing sod joints in between the flagstone with gravel joints, adjacent to the garage.

NEW ITEM**B. 120 CAMINO ALTO****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-150-013
Application Number: MST2013-00243
Owner: Patrick A Thiele
Architect: Steve Hausz

(Proposal for a total of 87 square feet of one-story additions, including 68 square feet to the existing residence, and 19 square feet to the existing garage, located on a 28,745 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District developed with an existing, 2,533 square foot, two-story, single family residence and detached, 467 square foot, two-car garage. The proposed addition will connect the existing residence to the existing detached garage. The proposal also includes replacing the existing roof with a new two-piece clay tile roof, a change to the roof form on the existing garage, door and window alterations, and the removal of a small area of paving to create a new landscape area. The proposed total of 3,087 square feet is 65% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate, and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Design Guidelines.
- 2) Provide final details.
- 3) Provide a colors and materials board.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:31 P.M. ****