



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, February 11, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

- DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair*
- FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair*
- BERNI BERNSTEIN
- BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)
- LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
- JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative)
- JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative)

- CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO
- PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** ADDISON THOMPSON
- PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE):** JOHN CAMPANELLA

- STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
- MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
- ROSA ROGERS O'REILLY, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDB and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:09 p.m. by Chair Woolery.

ATTENDANCE:

- Members present: Woolery, Sweeney, Bernstein, Miller (until 6:22), James, and Zimmerman.
- Members absent: Pierce.
- Staff present: Bedard, Limón (until 5:15), and Rogers O'Reilly.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of January 28, 2013.

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of January 28, 2013, as amended.
- Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. (Pierce absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for February 4, 2013. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: Miller/James, 5/0/1. (Bernstein abstained; Pierce absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for February 11, 2013. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: Sweeney/James, 6/0/0 (Pierce absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Sweeney attended the Urban Forest Workshop.
2. Mr. Sweeney asked staff questions about Public Comment.
3. Ms. Bedard announced that Jaime Pierce will be absent from today's hearing.
4. Ms. Bedard announced that City Council will hear the Update on Code of Conduct for Advisory Group Members and Adoption of Revised City Advisory Group Guidelines. This item is scheduled as item No. 5 on the Tuesday, February 12, 2013, Council agenda.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**1. 616 E VALERIO ST****R-2 Zone****(3:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-270-003

Application Number: MST2013-00030

Owner: Catherine Edwardson

Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal to convert an existing duplex into a new 3,454 square foot, three-story single-family residence with an attached 462 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes an interior remodel of the existing 552 square foot basement and converting 54 square feet of existing basement crawl space into a new habitable floor area. Exterior alterations include eliminating the gable roof element at the front elevation, demolish and rebuild the 68 square foot front porch, demolish the existing 225 square foot second story deck and replace with a new 455 square foot second story deck, adding Juliette balconies, and door and window alterations. The proposed development total of 3,916 square feet, located on a 10,704 square foot parcel, is 103% of the floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) guideline for an (R-2) two-family residentially zoned parcel.)

(Concept Review; action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:25 p.m.

Present: Adele Goggia, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two-weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Revise the deck and rear stairs.
- 2) Provide photographs to determine whether the size of the deck can be supported.
- 3) Provide photographs looking towards the adjacent neighbors' private yards.
- 4) Consider providing a section showing the topography of the site.
- 5) Provide color and materials board.
- 6) Consider a replacement of the existing gravel driveway.

Action: Zimmerman/Sweeney, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 1642 CALLE CANON****A-2 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-140-008

Application Number: MST2012-00205

Owner: Charles Mugler

Architect: Garcia Architects, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new split level 1,812 square foot residence with an attached 568 square foot garage, a 312 square foot workshop and a 922 square foot basement located on an approximately 5.9 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a new detached 1,291 square foot two story two-car garage/barn. Two single family residences and an accessory structure currently exist on the project site. The proposed total of 4,444 square feet of new construction in addition to the existing 2,121 square feet of the existing residences is 85% of the guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a Performance Standard Permit for three single family residences on one lot. The project will address violations in ENF2012-00027.)

(Project Design Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 005-13. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program is required prior to Final Approval.)

Actual time: 3:55 p.m.

Present: Charles Mugler and Karen McCulley, Owners; Ubaldo Diaz Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m.

1) Bill Boyd, neighbor; expressed concerns regarding how driveway access is being treated for the site.

Public comment closed at 4:16 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide wall heights, elevation, details, section.
- 2) The Board is supportive of the stucco finish.
- 3) Provide a more complete landscape plan.
- 4) Show application of residential addresses at the street, specifically house numbers and mailbox location details.
- 5) Provide a roof element over the entry door of the North elevation, Building C.
- 6) Provide chimney and brackets details.

Action: James/Sweeney, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 46 CAMINO ALTO****A-1 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-150-015

Application Number: MST2012-00490

Owner: Sunkist Investments, LLC

Applicant: Laura Bridley

(Proposal for 310 cubic yards of site grading, including 210 cubic yards of export, and development of a new 18-foot wide and approximately 180 linear foot vehicular access driveway and hammerhead turn-around, to an existing vacant 9.7 acre parcel located in the Hillside Design District. A portion of the new access driveway will be constructed on an access easement on the adjacent parcel at 50 Camino Alto.)

(Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 4:38 p.m.

Present: Laura Bridley, Agent; Dale Webber, Engineer.

Mr. Limon clarified for the Board that they should be trying to determine whether or not building the driveway in this location is feasible.

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m.

- 1) Jean Kennedy, opposition; expressed concern regarding driveway.
- 2) John Skidmore, opposition (submitted letter); expressed concern regarding easement work outside property lines and having access without a new house.
- 3) Wayne Smith, opposition; expressed concern regarding the driveway becoming a public nuisance and about the logistics and possible damage that could be caused by exporting 210 cubic yards of dirt.
- 4) Ron Mulder, opposition; expressed concern regarding unstable/unbuildable soil and the area becoming a public nuisance if no home is built.
- 5) Ezzy Pozzato, opposition; expressed concern regarding unstable soil, erosion potential, and the area becoming a public nuisance if no home is built.

Public comment closed at 4:57 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Board feels that there is insufficient information as to the long term use of the site.
- 2) Provide a Master Plan for the site.
- 3) Resolve conflict between the driveway design and the access easement; specifically that the location of the driveway is designed within the existing access easement, or the access easement is revised, as necessary.
- 4) Provide a site landscaping plan, including information for existing site vegetation, the existing oak tree and any grading information within the existing oak tree canopy.
- 5) Provide a complete site plan and clearly indicate all road access to the site, including any access from streets other than the access easement from Camino Alto.
- 6) Provide soils report.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**4. 2082 LAS CANOAS RD****A-1 Zone**

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-030-037
Application Number: MST2012-00262
Owner: Ron Petelski
Architect: James McClintock
Engineer: Victor Beck

(Proposal for site grading; construction of multiple retaining walls; to level, extend, and pave the driveway; and create a building pad for a future residence located on a 3-acre parcel in the Hillside Design District. The proposal involves 1,250 cubic yards of cut, 1,250 cubic yards of fill, and 1,000 cubic yards of recompaction to be balanced on site. Retaining walls include a new 120 linear foot retaining wall ranging in height from 6-inches to 12 feet, a new 200 linear foot retaining wall ranging in height from 4- to 5-feet, and a new 145 linear foot 6-foot tall site wall. The proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2012-00172.)

(Second Concept Review; project was last reviewed on November, 5, 2012.)

Actual time: 5:15 p.m.

Present: James McClintock, Architect; Ron Petelski, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:20 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued 2 weeks to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Consider a staining element on the proposed 12-inch board pattern of the portion of the concrete retaining wall.
- 2) Consider an alternate design of the stone planters at the bottom of the 12-foot wall.
- 3) Provide an alternate for higher tree or planting elements, particularly for the highest point of the 12-foot retaining wall.
- 4) Provide additional railing details, including colors and materials. Provide a colors and materials board, and a colors and materials schedule on the plans.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Miller opposed; Pierce absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 2430 CALLE ALMONTE****E-1 Zone****(4:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-412-012

Application Number: MST2013-00020

Owner: Farzeen & Venus Nasri Trust

(Proposal to construct a new 919 square foot second-story addition to an existing 1,839 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 408 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes a new 176 square foot second-story deck. The proposed total of 3,166 square feet, located on a 9,964 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 86% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Concept Review; comments only.)

Actual time: 5:38 p.m.

Present: Jason Grant, Designer; Farzeen and Venus Nasri, Owners.

Public comment opened at 5:43 p.m.

1. Steve Jordan, opposition (submitted letter); expressed concerns regarding privacy, preservation of private views, and interruption of hillside. Requested story poles.
2. Mike Munoz, opposition (submitted letter); expressed concerns regarding privacy.

A letter of expressed concern from Liz Sherman was acknowledged.

The following neighbors signed a petition in support of the project:

James Johnson, 3435 Calle Almonte

Ralph Fuquay, 2436 Calle Almonte

Rhoda Rosenthal, 3427 Calle Almonte

Carole Strehlow, 2419 Calle Galicia

Susan Saperstein, 3423 Calle Almonte

Julia Capps, 3439 Calle Almonte

Simon Pulver, 3423 Calle Almonte

Public comment closed at 5:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide a site plan that shows landscaping mitigation for privacy.
- 2) Eliminate exterior stair case.
- 3) Study reducing FAR.
- 4) Study rear elevation – reduce size and increase height of windows.
- 5) Study reconfiguration of window at office.
- 6) The Board has considered the Single Family Residential Design Guidelines, Good Neighbor Guidelines & Tips, and finds the proposed second story location is well placed on the existing residence to maximize views of the neighbors.
- 7) Study the roof pitch; consider a reduction.
- 8) Provide a colors and materials board.
- 9) The Board is ok with the size and location of the second level deck.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**6. 11 VIA ALICIA****E-1 Zone**

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-311-003
Application Number: MST2013-00052
Owner: Trent, Peter
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposed exterior alterations to an existing residence including the following: 1) replace the garage door, replace existing front deck; new 2nd story deck at the west elevation, replace and relocate doors and windows per plan, replace and enlarge existing 2nd & 3rd story balconies and decks. Replace and enlarge existing concrete patio on the south elevation, enlarge of existing deck at the south elevation, and propose a new pool on this existing residential lot.)

(Concept review; comments only.)

Actual time: 6:22 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Consider further detail on front door and entry way.
- 2) Provide a site landscaping plan.
- 3) Consider redesign of the mid-level deck (Juliette balcony, doors and windows).
- 4) Provide lighting details, and a colors and materials board.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce and Miller absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1218 E DE LA GUERRA ST****E-3 Zone**

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-132-003
Application Number: MST2013-00008
Owner: Ray S Goodner Revocable Trust
Architect: Gary Jensen

(Proposal to construct a new 405 square foot second story addition and a new 174 square foot ground level accessory building to an existing 1,491 square foot single-family residence and an attached 390 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes the removal of an existing palm tree and a new four-foot tall wrought iron gate across the driveway. The proposed total of 2,460 square feet, located on a 10,000 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 66% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 6:49 p.m.

Present: Joan Goodner, Owner; Gary Jensen, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:56 p.m.

A letter of support from Mike Augarten was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:56 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:**
- 1) The Board appreciates the design approach.
 - 2) Addition is compatible with house, neighbors and neighborhood.
 - 3) The Board is supportive of the design and location of the gate.
 - 5) Include gate remote details on plans.
- Action:** Sweeney/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce and Miller absent).

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:03PM

CONSENT CALENDAR – SEE SEPARATE AGENDA

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)**PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW****A. 1708 CHINO ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-183-020
Application Number: MST2008-00143
Owner: Manuel & Maria Elena Rodriguez
Architect: Garcia Architects

(Proposal to construct a new 545 square foot second-story addition to an existing 1,091 square foot one-story single-family residence with a detached 187 square foot one-car garage, located on a 3,800 square foot lot. The proposal includes the demolition of the "as-built" 173 square foot garage addition and demolition of an "as-built" carport. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification is requested to allow alterations to the existing porch located in the required front yard setback. The proposed total of 1,824 square feet is 83% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). A similar project was approved on December 12, 2008, and subsequently expired on December 12, 2010.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 029-12. Project Design and Final Approval is requested.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with conditions:

- 1) Relocate the rain barrels out of the required setbacks.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 163 LA JOLLA DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-362-004
Application Number: MST2008-00515
Owner: Chevy Lane Holdings, LLC
Architect: Peter Becker

(Revised project for alterations to the existing 1,265 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 411 square foot two-car garage located on a 23,522 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District and within the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The revised proposal eliminates the previously approved 914 square foot one-story addition. The proposed alterations include a 15 square foot one-story addition for a laundry closet, alterations to the roof forms which including adding dormer roofs at the dining and living rooms and raising the ceiling height in the living room, replace all doors and windows with new, and a new asphalt shake roof. Other site alterations include a new 6-foot tall wood fence along the front yard of the property, a new flagstone pedestrian pathway, landscaping alterations, and a change to the driveway configuration. A portion of the new driveway, the new 42-inch tall pillars, and landscaping alterations are proposed to be located on the adjacent vacant property at 157 La Jolla Dr., which is owned by the same owner as 163 La Jolla Dr.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Postponed one week at the applicant's request.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 157 LA JOLLA DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-362-005
Application Number: MST2013-00044
Owner: 157 La Jolla, LLC
Architect: Peter Becker Architect
Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.

(Proposal for a new driveway and turnaround, a new 42-inch single track gate and pillars, and landscaping on an existing vacant 25,000 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District and within the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposed driveway would provide access to the existing single-family residence at 163 La Jolla Drive.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Postponed one week at the applicant's request.

NEW ITEM**D. 1656 LAS CANOAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-072-010
Application Number: MST2013-00055
Owner: Jeff Frank Living Trust
Architect: Robert Pester

(Proposal to pave existing service driveway with permeable interlocking pavers and construct new wood driveway gate with stone pilasters and new CMU screen wall around the existing pool equipment area.)

Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued one week to Consent with comments:

- 1) Provide a section of the paver – confirming it is permeable.
- 2) Provide a cut sheet detail of the proposed power design.
- 3) Provide a color and materials board.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 464 YANKEE FARM RD****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-030-017
Application Number: MST2013-00028
Owner: Margaret & Robert Niehaus
Architect: Angie Huff

(Proposal to construct a 325 square foot one-story addition to an existing 3,175 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 612 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes a small interior remodel and minor exterior facade alterations to the existing residence. An existing detached 281 square foot accessory structure will remain. The proposal will result in a total project development of 4,393 square feet located on a 1.25 acre parcel in the Hillside Design District and in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal will address violations identified in ENF2012-00589.)

(Final Approval requested.)

Postponed one week at the applicant's request.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**F. 2224 GIBRALTAR RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-180-004
Application Number: MST2012-00187
Owner: Allison Armour
Architect: Blackbird Architects

(Proposal to convert the existing 575 square foot two-car garage into a residential office and art room, and construct a new 480 square foot ,attached two-car garage for an existing 3,714 square foot, two-story single-family residence. The proposed total of 4,769 square feet, located on an 11.46 acre lot in the Hillside Design District, is 44% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission review for an amendment to the conditions of approval of the original subdivision (Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-91) for alterations to the approved building envelope.)

(Second Concept Review. Project last reviewed on October 8, 2012. Project to comply with Reso 017-12, PC approved Amendment to Building Envelope, addendum to approved ND.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

FINAL REVIEW**G. 909 CALLE CORTITA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-176-015
Application Number: MST2011-00353
Owner: George & Deanna Gregg Living Trust

(Revised proposal for 999 square feet of one and two-story additions to an existing 2,080 square foot two-story single-family residence, with an attached 418 square foot two-car garage, located on a 9,727 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The 999 square foot addition involves a new 519 square foot addition to the existing second-level, and a new 480 square foot grade level addition. A total of 290 cubic yards of grading will be balanced on site. This project will result in a three-story, 3,497 square foot single-family residence, and is 99% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project received Planning Commission approval for a floor area modification on August 9, 2012 (Resolution No. 012-12).

(Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-12. The project received PDA by SFDB on August 27, 2012.)

Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) The design alterations are supported.
- 2) On the south elevation, provide architectural details of the covered deck (at street level) and column details.
- 3) Include architectural details of the new 'lean-two' roof/porch of the ground level (west elevation).
- 4) Include all gutter and downspouts details on the elevations.
- 5) Provide complete structural details.

Items on consent were reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.