



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD

MINUTES

Monday, September 10, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

DENISE WOOLERY, *Chair* - PRESENT
FRED SWEENEY, *Vice-Chair* - PRESENT
BERNI BERNSTEIN – PRESENT UNTIL 6:52 P.M.
BRIAN MILLER (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT
LISA JAMES (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) - PRESENT
JAIME PIERCE (Consent Calendar Landscape Representative) - PRESENT
JIM ZIMMERMAN (Consent Calendar Architecture Representative) - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): JOHN CAMPANELLA - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT UNTIL 3:18 P.M.
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high-speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Woolery, Bernstein (left at 6:52 p.m.), James, Miller, Pierce, Sweeney, and Zimmerman.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Bedard, Limón (present until 3:18 p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **August 27, 2012.**

Motion: **Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of August 27, 2012, as submitted.**

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: **Ratify the Consent Calendar for September 4, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.**

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for September 10, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Brian Miller and Lisa James.

Action: Miller/Sweeney, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Mr. Limón made an announcement regarding the previously approved project at 306 Sherman Drive and shared a public comment email regarding the size of the project submitted by Ms. Hazel Anderson, adjacent property owner at 1985 Stanwood Drive. He clarified the Tea Fire policy for rebuilds was set by City Council and the Board's purview of duties and responsibilities. The board requested a future discussion item to review possible change for Tea Fire rebuilds.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 136 SAN RAFAEL AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-194-014

Application Number: MST2012-00213

Owner: Mairid Svensson, Revocable Trust

Designer: Robert Paul Design

(Proposal for a façade and interior remodel, and a 108 square foot first-story addition to an existing two-story 1,877 square foot single-family residence, and a 365 square foot attached two-car garage located on a 6,100 square foot lot in the Non-Appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes replacement of exterior siding, new roofing material, replacement of doors and windows, adding a new roof over the existing second-floor deck, a new ground level deck and site landscaping. The proposed total of 2,332 square feet is 86% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 026-12. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on July 2, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:18

Present: Robert Foley, Agent for Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The applicant's desired design approach is appreciated.
- 2) Return with two color schemes to soften the color palette.
- 3) Regulate the stucco and eaves, and canopies and posts provide details.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan to soften the appearance of the house.
- 5) Provide consistency the details and materials; including the balcony and deck railing details.
- 6) Provide a cut sheet, materials (including colors) and details of the proposed garage door.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 5/2/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Bernstein opposed.)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 734 SEA RANCH DR****A-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-104-005
Application Number: MST2012-00241
Owner: Graciela Carrasco-Montgomery Living Trust
Architect: Craig Burdick
Engineer: Paul Spieler, Engineers

(Proposal for alterations and additions to an existing one-story, 2,230 square foot, single-family residence with an attached 518 square foot two-car garage, located on a 1.36 acre lot in the Hillside Design District and in the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes construction of a new 255 square foot one-story, a new 265 square foot second-story addition, the conversion of 167 square feet of the existing 518 square foot two-car garage into habitable space, and the construction of a new 250 square foot carport. A total of 920 square feet of new decks are also proposed. The proposed total of 3,518 square feet is 68% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on July 2, 2012. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to granting Final Approval.)

Actual time: 4:01

Present: Craig and Hannah Burdick, Architects, Studio 10 Architects.

Public comment opened at 4:12 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and with the comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 2) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to getting final approval.
- 3) This approval is subject to compliance with the required construction conditions.
- 4) Provide a revised landscape plan and replace the invasive species plantings, as discussed.
- 5) Window colors will be at the discretion of the applicant.
- 6) Provide a colors and materials board.
- 7) Provide structural details. The steps and railings, and walls located in the required front yard are to be clearly indicated to not exceed the 42-inch maximum height allowance. Provide walls and railing elevations and details.
- 8) For the record, the Board acknowledged that they carefully reviewed and found the proposed parking configuration to be acceptable for this proposal.

Action: Bernstein/Zimmerman, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 18 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-172-006
Application Number: MST2012-00098
Owner: Susan Arcidiacono
Designer: Urbe & Orbe Enterprises
Applicant: Robert Mills

(Proposal to construct a new 525 square foot one-story addition and a new 733 square foot two-story addition to an existing one-story, 800 square foot, single-family residence located on a 7,650 square foot lot. Also proposed is a new 282 square foot detached two-car carport, and a 94 square foot second-floor deck. The proposed 2,342 square foot total is 76% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. The project was last reviewed by the SFDB on March 26, 2012.)

Actual time: 4:33

Present: Robert Mills, Applicant; and Susan Arcidiacono, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:42 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

- 1) The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 2) The proposed landscape plan is acceptable.
- 3) Provide better quality details of the carport design.
- 4) Provide details of the trellis and how it connects to the house. Provide details and elevations of the additional trellis over the spa; concern was expressed regarding the width of the proposed trellis materials.
- 5) The proposed stucco element around the front outdoor deck that engages the existing stucco element is acceptable.
- 6) Study using corbels and elements from the front of the house to augment the design.
- 7) Provide a color and materials board and include existing colors.
- 8) Include the location of attic vents on the elevations and provide details.
- 9) Provide gutter and downspout details.
- 10) Provide cut sheets and details of the proposed driveway grid system.

Action: Zimmerman/Sweeney, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 2296 LAS TUNAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-072-015

Application Number: MST2012-00314

Owner: Daniel Johnston

(Proposal for alterations and additions to an existing 2,308 square foot one-story single-family residence, located on a 35,699 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The alterations include the demolition of an existing 479 square foot two-car garage, construction of a new 750 square foot partial subterranean three-car garage, and a total of 700 square foot of residential additions, including a 394 square foot den, a 170 square foot bedroom addition, and a 136 square foot cellar. The proposal includes a new clerestory element above the living room, replacement of windows and doors, and replacement of the exterior stucco. The following site alterations include replacement of the existing pool and decks, construction of a new 42-inch tall stone wall, a new 6-foot tall wall, driveway gate and columns, and new site retaining walls. The existing driveway will be redesigned with two levels to provide access to the new subterranean garage and proposed uncovered parking spaces at grade. A total of 554 cubic yards of cut and fill grading is proposed, including 277 cubic yards of cut under the building footprint, 40 cubic yards of fill outside the building footprint, and 237 cubic yards of export. The proposed total of 3,758 square feet is 77% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 5:07

Present: Daniel Johnston, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:23 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, was closed.

A letter of support from Marshall Koval was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) The proposed general design approach is acceptable and compatible with the neighborhood.
- 2) Provide further details of the proposed clearstory element; details and resolution of the garage elements, stone wall, and lighting elements, etc.
- 3) Provide a sample and details of the proposed stone pattern (hash marks).
- 4) Provide elevations for and delineate on the plans the location of the new stone wall and the new gate off Las Tunas Road.
- 5) Provide landscaped details of the area between the new proposed stone wall and the new paving off Las Tunas Road.
- 6) Provide a landscape plan showing existing and proposed around the new driveway.
- 7) Provide pergola trellis details and photographic evidence of the existing stone wall along Tremonto Road.

Action: Sweeney/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1512 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-181-012
Application Number: MST2012-00328
Owner: William Russ
Designer: Robert Paul Design

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,360 square foot, two-story single-family residence, the 220 square foot garage, and accessory buildings; and construct a new 2,208 square foot two-story single-family residence, and a new 430 square foot two-car detached garage. The proposal includes 781 square feet of second-story decks and a 90 square foot roof deck, and an 8-foot tall site wall. One palm tree is proposed to be relocated; all other existing trees are proposed to remain. The proposed total of 2,638 square feet, located on a 7,864 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone, is 84% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal will address violations identified in ZIR2011-00414.)

(Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 5:43

Present: Robert Foley, Agent for Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:58 p.m.

Ingrid Scherbarth spoke in opposition and expressed various privacy concerns.

Public comment closed at 6:01 p.m.

An email submitted by Cynthia Price expressing concern with proposed roof height, amount and location of decks for privacy concerns, privacy screening and private views, story poles, and addition of landscape screening was read by staff.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) The general architecture and aesthetic approach is acceptable and compatible with the neighborhood, including the proposed height and the flat roof design.
- 2) The 90 square foot roof deck is acceptable. Study methods to minimize the exterior staircase.
- 3) The main level deck is acceptable; it is noted and appreciated by the Board that the proposed design protects the adjacent neighbor's privacy.
- 4) Clarify and provide accurate calculation of the green roof areas and the total square footage of the open deck areas.
- 5) The Board cannot support the proposed deck of the second floor bedroom towards the northern side of the property, as it was found to cause privacy impacts to the adjacent parcel, and is less than the minimum 15-foot guideline setback.
- 6) The bridge attachment to the main house to the garage is acceptable, and is supportable with an 8-foot width, if required by Zoning to meet the minimum connection between buildings; study providing landscaping across the bridge.
- 7) The deck over the garage is acceptable with the elimination of the exterior staircase; access should only be across the proposed bridge element.
- 8) Study providing acoustical barriers between the first-floor area and easterly neighboring living areas.
- 9) Provide a drivable material within the proposed turf solution, if the proposed driveway configuration is acceptable by the Transportation and Zoning Divisions.

- 10) Provide exterior wall finish material details for the proposed west side concrete wall; study providing greening plant material, such as wall vines.
- 11) Provide a detail and sample of a water proofing solution for the “wood window trim,” garage doors, front entry doors, and the east elevation exterior staircase.
- 12) The proposed landscape plan is acceptable, and the Board appreciates the preservation of existing mature landscaping, with comments to: a) consider adding privacy screening or vegetation screening for adjacent neighbors; b) provide materials of the proposed “green” roof; c) study adding plantings to the bridge element, and; d) specify the proposed pond element location and materials; note and observe the required setbacks and noise requirements for any proposed mechanical equipment.
- 13) The 8-foot high site wall in front of the residence is acceptable, as it is a significant distance from the public right-of-way.
- 14) Staff advised the applicant to review the proposed driveway and parking configuration with Transportation Planning Staff. Zoning will only allow the minimum amount of driveway area as required by Transportation for adequate ingress and egress.
- 15) For the record, the Board acknowledged the request from a member of the public for the necessity of story poles, and found that story poles are not necessary for this application, as the proposed height is not much greater than the height of the existing residence.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

6. 1314 HILLCREST RD

A-1 Zone

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 019-111-005
Application Number: MST2012-00340
Owner: Kimbrough Living Trust
Applicant: Russ Banko
Engineer: Mitch Perkins

(Proposal to construct a new detached 304 square foot accessory structure and add a new 97 square foot addition to the existing one-story, 1,981 square foot single-family residence, with an attached two-car garage, located on a 23,500 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes replacing the existing shake roof with a new Celotex Presidential Composition Shingle roof material. The proposed total of 2,453 square feet is 52% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 6:53

Present: Russ Banko, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 7:00 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, was closed.

Motion: **Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and the following comments:**

- 1) Positive comments were made regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 2) Provide complete elevations and details.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan for the area in front of the new building and areas that is not shown to be landscaped.

Action: Zimmerman/Sweeney, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 2105 ANACAPA ST

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-242-011
 Application Number: MST2008-00311
 Owner: Barbara Mathews, Revocable Trust
 Architect: Britt Jewett
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for the partial demolition of an existing 1,752 square foot single-family residence and detached 340 square foot garage and additions resulting in a new 4,137 square foot, two-story single-family residence, including an attached two-car garage and basement, located on a 9,372 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District. The project includes a total of 162 cubic yards of grading (142 cubic yards beneath the building footprint and 20 cubic yards elsewhere on the site). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer approval (Resolution No. 024-09) and Planning Commission approval (Resolution No. 021-09). The proposed total of 3,436 square feet, which includes a 50% reduction of the basement square footage area, is 97% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Review After Final for minor alterations to previously approved landscape species in order to comply with water conservation requirements.)

Approval of the Review After Final as submitted.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 309 CORDOVA DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-023-006
Application Number: MST2012-00333
Owner: Chris Kyle
Designer: Tony Xiques

(Proposal to construct two new trellises, add new shutters and planter boxes, install new window trim and change the exterior paint color of an existing 2,266 sq. ft. single family residence with an attached 424 square foot two-car garage.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the suggestion that alternative vines be used to grow on the proposed trellises, such as Pandorea Jaminiodes and/or Begonia Species.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

NEW ITEM**C. 50 RUBIO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-330-009
Application Number: MST2012-00326
Owner: Kenneth Tompetrini and Susan Allen
Architect: James Zimmerman

(Proposal to permit 100 linear feet of an "as-built" site wall varying from 6'-0" to 7'-6" in height, located on a 12,197 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is currently developed with an existing single-family residence to remain. Approximately 32 feet of the wall is located within less than five feet of an existing retaining wall, and the cumulative height will exceed the maximum allowable of eight feet. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. The project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2012-00252.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)

Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with comments:

- 1) The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 2) Project is ready for final approval with no further changes requested.

NEW ITEM**D. 805 RAMETTO LN****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-120-009
Application Number: MST2012-00342
Owner: Michael Barr
Agent: Mark Morando

(Proposal to permit the "as-built" facade alterations and interior remodeling of an existing 2,932 square foot, two-story, single-family residence located on a 1.62 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. Alterations include the replacement of all windows and doors, new stucco siding, and new wrought iron railing to enclose a new 198 square foot roof deck. Site alterations include a new 13 linear-foot and 9-foot tall free standing CMU wall at the entry, replacement of the existing concrete patio with a new black slate patio, and a new pebble finish concrete walkway from the existing detached 470 square foot carport to the entry of the residence. The existing residence is 64% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Proposal will address violations of ENF2012-00475.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and with the following comments:

- 1) Provide details of windows, doors, railings, and site wall.
- 2) Provide compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to final approval.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

NEW ITEM**E. 1550 CRESTLINE DR****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-234-009
Application Number: MST2012-00349
Owner: Roger Modjeski
Architect: Dan Weber

(Proposal to replace the existing grey composition shingle roof with a new Titan standing seam "storm grey" metal roof on an existing one-story single-family residence located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued one week to the Consent Calendar with comments:

- 1) Provide current elevations of the proposed residential remodel.
- 2) The proposed standing seam metal roof does not appear to be compatible with the neighborhood.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:03 P.M. ****