



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

TUESDAY, January 3, 2012

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT
DENISE WOOLERY, VICE-CHAIR - PRESENT
BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT
BRIAN MILLER - PRESENT
FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT
JIM ZIMMERMAN - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: MICHAEL JORDAN - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Deisler, Woolery, Bernstein, Miller, Sweeney, and Zimmerman.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes.

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **December 5, 2011.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **December 5, 2011**, as submitted.
Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **December 12, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Jim Zimmerman**.

Action: Zimmerman/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **January 3, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman**.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard recommended to the Board, and the Board concurred, that the Board postpone elections for Chair and Vice Chair until later in 2012 (July), when the Board should be fully staffed with at least 7 members.
2. Heather Baker, Project Planner, announced that the revised SFDB Design Guidelines and Meeting Procedures were formally adopted in December 2011. She thanked the Board for the participation in reviewing the draft revisions, prior to final adoption. She briefly outlined a few of the recent revisions, including changes to the landscape guidelines. She discussed the intention of the landscaping guidelines, specifically in regards to when the Board would like to see specific landscaping maintained as conditions of approval, and that the specific landscape feature shall be specified in the motion as a condition of approval to be permanently maintained. She also explained a new phrasing used in the Guidelines: "*substantially similar replacements*" referring specifically to minor requested changes.
3. Board member Zimmerman announced he would be stepping down as the applicant for agenda Item 2, 1607 Shoreline Drive.
4. Board member Bernstein announced she would absent from the Tuesday, January 17, 2012 meeting.
5. Ms. Goo took a poll of members who would be able to attend the TUESDAY, January 17, 2011, SFDB Full Board meeting after the Martin Luther King Holiday. The results were as follows:
 - a) Sweeney – will be present.
 - b) Deisler – will be present.
 - c) Bernstein – will be absent.
 - d) Miller – will be present.
 - e) Woolery – will be present.
 - f) Zimmerman – will be present.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 3:08 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 3:12 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.) *2:00 p.m. – Organized Site Visit to 1128 Harbor Hills Lane*

1. 1128 HARBOR HILLS LN

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-314-010
Application Number: MST2011-00389
Owner: Bruce R. Anderson
Applicant: Mark Morando

(Proposal to permit the following "as-built" construction: reconstruction of the front entryway; new retaining walls; stairs; split-level patio with an 857 square foot deck with a fire pit, barbeque and counter on the lower level and a 229 square foot deck on the upper level. A two-story, 3,151 square foot residence and 527 square foot attached garage currently exist on the 29,259 square foot site in the Hillside Design District. No additional square footage is proposed. The project includes the demolition of the "as-built" pergola and storage shed. The proposal addresses violations listed in ENF2011-00344. The project requires Staff Hearing officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing officer review for requested zoning modifications. The project was last reviewed on November 7, 2011.)

(3:12)

Present: Mark Morando, Applicant; and Bruce R. Anderson, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Three letters of support were acknowledged from Mike Richardson, Phyllis Hollems, and Avo Semerjian; and one letter of concern from C.L. Grant, Civil Engineer/Agent for neighboring property owner Nancy Engstrom, mentioned structural concerns.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer and return to Consent with positive comment that the proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate, and does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Design Guidelines.

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Deisler opposed).

Board comments: A majority of the Board preferred that the pergola be removed as noted on the plans. The Board acknowledged for the record that the support for this project is case specific and this action does not set precedent for any future projects or similar cases.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**2. 1607 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-042
Application Number: MST2010-00193
Owner: Chad Yonker
Architect: James Zimmerman

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 3,034 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, including an attached 533 square foot, two-car garage. The project involves the demolition of 288 square feet of existing floor area, the demolition of an existing 296 square foot, first-floor covered deck and a 140 square foot upper level uncovered deck. The proposal involves remodeling the existing residence, and new construction to include a 344 square foot first floor addition, an 886 square foot second floor addition, a new 265 square foot covered first floor deck, a new 140 square foot uncovered second story deck, and a new 500 square foot roof deck. Also proposed is an exterior stairwell, rooftop fireplace and pergola, approval of an "as-built" brick fountain in the back yard, alterations to the landscape plan, and alterations to an existing stucco wall at the front property line (not to exceed 42 inches in height). The proposed total of 3,976 square feet, located on a 20,066 square foot lot in the Coastal Zone, is 85% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit. The project was last reviewed on January 31, 2011.)

(3:40)

Present: James Zimmerman, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m.

Grace Dodson, opposition (submitted a letter); with expressed concerns regarding blocked natural sunlight by the proposed stairwell's proximity to her property.

Public comment closed at 3:55 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission and return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, good neighbor guidelines, and found the proposed landscaping to be appropriate.
- 2) Provide materials and a color board consistent with the elevations as drawn on the plans.
- 3) Study the roof connections between the roof forms and how they intersect (how the front parapet terminates against each gable, and how the back parapet turns the corner and intersects the hip roof); and provide additional details of the connections.
- 4) Specify materials of the exterior rear stairway.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman stepped down).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)**3. 3439 CAMPANIL DR****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-101-011
Application Number: MST2011-00416
Owner: Klinkon Family Trust
Architect: Dennis Thompson

(Revised project for a reduced concept proposal to construct a 310 square foot, one-story addition (rather than the previously proposed 1,139 square foot addition) to an existing 5,873 square foot two-story single-family residence located on a 44,431 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The existing residence includes a 1,896 square foot basement, third-story loft, and an attached 582 square foot garage. The project includes a net 99 square foot addition to an existing 415 square foot deck. A 371 square foot accessory structure exists on site and is proposed to remain. The revised proposal results in a total of 6,554 square feet and is 131% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Revised concept proposal. Comments only. The project was last reviewed on November 21, 2011.)

(4:18)

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect; and Ervin Klinkon, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m.

Bob Swanson (Chair person for the Campanil Hills Home Owners Association), support; with positive comments regarding the proposed reduced addition; made a request for story poles.

Public comment closed at 4:27 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the revised and reduced size, bulk, and scale of the proposed addition, and looks forward to further refinement of the plans to indicate the architecture, decks, windows, and related details.
- 2) Provide a color and materials board.
- 3) The Board finds that the proposed project is compatible with the neighborhood.

Action: Zimmerman/Sweeney, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Board comments: The Board discussed the use of a smooth plaster instead of the proposed stucco.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 4:35 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:45 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

4. 1121 WALNUT AVE

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-202-006
 Application Number: MST2011-00409
 Owner: Alamar II, LLC
 Architect: Murphy & Associates Architects
 Applicant: Dario Pini

(Proposal to demolish the existing 770 square foot one-story single-family residence and construct a new 1,485 square foot two-story single-family residence. The proposal includes a new 5-foot tall wood fence in the front yard. Parking will be provided by the existing non-conforming detached 220 square foot one-car garage proposed to remain and one new uncovered parking space. The proposed total of 1,705 square feet on a 6,750 square foot lot is 60% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project will address violations in ENF 2011-00778.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment. The project was last reviewed on December 5, 2011.)

(4:46)

Present: Bryan Murphy, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:58 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the existing non-conforming parking solution?
 1/5 (failed).

Straw vote: How many Board members could be supportive of the option to pursue a modification to maintain the existing garage in the same location with an addition to make it a two-car garage, to conform to the number of required covered parking spaces? 3/3 (tied).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support a two-car covered parking solution which observes the required setbacks? 6/0 (unanimous).

Motion: Continued four weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board prefers a two-car covered parking solution which observes the required setbacks.
- 2) The Board appreciates the revised architectural details as previously suggested.
- 3) Continue to study window styles, sizes, and locations.
- 4) Study using 4-by rafters rather than the proposed 2-by rafters.
- 5) The Board recommends not landscaping the public right-of-way, as currently proposed; and at least one member preferred paving this area, per Public Works standards, to increase availability of street parking for the neighborhood.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:37 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 289 EL CIELITO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-083-006
Application Number: MST2009-00515
Owner: JJC, LP
Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal to rebuild a house and garage destroyed in the Tea Fire. Proposed is a 2,555 square foot one-story, single-family residence with attached 496 square foot two-car garage, 231 square foot carport and a 138 square foot workshop. The proposed total of 3,525 square feet on the 1.77 net acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 65% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio guideline.)

(Review After Final to add 105 square feet of new living space by enclosing the covered porch and adding a new vestibule.)

Final Approval as submitted of Review After Final.

NEW ITEM**B. VACANT LOT ON SHORELINE DRIVE**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-043
Application Number: MST2011-00451
Owner: Chiarenza Survivor`s Trust
Applicant: Mark Morando

(Proposal to replace the existing "as-built" chain link fence with a new 80-foot long, 7-foot high, wrought iron fence along the front yard, located on an existing vacant 22,651 square foot coastal bluff lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) The proposed 8-foot high wrought iron fence is acceptable (the curved top style is *not* preferable).
- 2) The arrowhead detail on the top of the proposed fence is acceptable and permitted.
- 3) Applicant to provide a vine planting along the proposed fence to soften the look of the proposed 80 linear feet of fence.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman**.