



# City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

## SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

**Monday, August 1, 2011**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT  
DENISE WOOLERY, VICE- CHAIR - PRESENT  
BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT  
BRIAN MILLER - PRESENT  
JIM ZIMMERMAN - ABSENT  
FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** MICHAEL JORDAN - ABSENT

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT  
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT  
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb) and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:07 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Bernstein, Deisler, Miller, Woolery, and Sweeney.  
Members absent: Zimmerman.  
Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

**B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of July 18, 2011.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **July 18, 2011**, as submitted.  
Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent)

**C. Consent Calendar.**

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **July 25, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Brian Miller** and **Denise Woolery**.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **August 1, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Brian Miller** and **Denise Woolery**.

Action: Woolery/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent)

**D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.**

Ms. Bedard announced Board member Zimmerman would absent from the meeting.

**E. Subcommittee Reports:**

No subcommittee reports.

**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****1. 1117 LAS ALTURAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-113-022

Application Number: MST2011-00142

Owner: Barbara Fasken Trust

Architect: Leonard Grant

(Proposal to construct a new 4,003 square foot two-story single-family residence and an attached 475 square foot two-car garage. The previous residence was destroyed in the Tea Fire. Site improvements include a driveway, auto courts, fountain, and approximately 1,270 cubic yards of total site grading, which includes 610 cubic yards of grading underneath the building footprint and 660 cubic yards of grading elsewhere on the site. The proposed total of 4,478 square feet, located on a 46,303 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 89% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Third concept review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on May 9, 2011. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval.)**

(3:13)

Present: Leonard Grant, Principal Architect; and Eddie Herrera, Designer.

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m.

The following public comment spoke either in support or in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Everett Woody and Gil Garcia, (submitted a subsection of the elevation and slope) in opposition; expressed concerns regarding the location of the patio, easement and sewer line.
- 2) Penny True, adjacent neighbor (submitted photos) in opposition; expressed concerns regarding proposed size of the project, and obstruction of her private views.

- 3) Carolyn Vogt, adjacent neighbor (submitted letter) in opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed “substantially” large size of the home and high roof line next to the road.
- 4) Don Vogt, adjacent neighbor (submitted letter) in opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed elevation and large façade next to road (Las Alturas) which is not compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

Letters expressing concerns from Don and Carolyn Vogt, and Penny True were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:44 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Lower the plate heights on the north elevation.
- 2) Remove development and the cantilevered portion of the building over the sewer easement. Or prior to returning to the Board provide written verification from Public Works staff to verify that the proposal proposed design is allowed by Public Works.
- 3) Given the site constraints of the lot the Board recommends the study of a further overall reduction of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR), 85% FAR was recommended.
- 4) Study using Santa Barbara stone instead of the proposed cultured stone.
- 5) Provide an Arborist Report and verify protection of the existing oak tree canopy and critical root zone.
- 6) The Board suggests the applicant meet with surrounding neighbors as suggested in the Single Family Residential Design Guidelines to discuss the project prior to returning to the Board.

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 4/1/0. Motion carried. [Sweeney opposed (proposed size), Zimmerman absent].

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**2. 2324 SANTA BARBARA ST**

**E-1 Zone**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-132-015  
 Application Number: MST2010-00030  
 Applicant: Hai Vu  
 Owner: Hai Vu

(Revised proposal to construct a new two-story 1,000 square foot detached garage/accessory structure, comprised of a 500 square foot two-car garage and 100 square feet of accessory space on the ground floor and 400 square feet of accessory space on the second floor. The project also includes permitting the "as-built" 313 square foot one-story addition and interior remodel, and a proposed 100 square foot deck addition, to the existing 2,027 square foot one-story single-family residence. The proposed garage will replace the previous two-car garage which was demolished without permits. The existing 170 square foot detached storage shed is proposed to be removed. The proposal will address zoning violations listed in ZIR2009-00271 and enforcement case ENF2009-00768. The proposed total of 3,340 square feet, on a 20,000 square foot lot, is 72% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(4:25)

Present: Hai Vu, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:29 p.m.

John T. Rickard spoke in support of the proposed project.

Public comment closed at 4:30 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with the findings that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent with conditions:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, landscaping, safety, good neighbor guidelines, and public views.
- 2) Provide quality architecture and materials.
- 3) Provide verification that the oak trees are protected.
- 4) Specify driveway materials and details.
- 5) Provide compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

Action: Bernstein/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **3. 1359 and 1383 SANTA TERESITA DR**

Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 055-141-053 and 055-141-045

Application Number: MST2011-00283

Applicant: Mark Lloyd

Agent: Greg Martin

Owner: Kenneth and Catherine Aiello Living Trust

Owner: Timothy and Debra Foley Family Trust

Easement Owner: Pacifcor, Inc.

(Proposal for slope erosion repair due to slope failure after a recent storm event. The proposal involves site work, including 2,500 cubic yards of grading (imported fill), to be located between two residential lots on Santa Teresita Drive (1359 & 1383), and within road and utility easements to access and serve the parcel at 1575 N. Ontare Dr.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)**

(4:46)

Present: Mark Lloyd, Applicant.

Staff announced that the Environmental Assessment has been completed and that action may be taken.

Public comment opened at 4:52 p.m.

The following public comment spoke either in support or in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Tim Foley, (adjacent property owner/provided photos) in opposition; expressed concerns regarding erosion of unstable soil, and displacement of water run-off/debris, and drainage off the slope at the bottom of the slope onto his property.

- 2) Ken Aiello, (adjacent westerly property owner) in opposition; expressed concerns regarding grading plans and unstable soil, environmental and traffic impacts, stability of the slope, and displacement of water run-off and drainage off the slope on the site onto his property.

Public comment closed at 4:58 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Grading findings have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent with conditions:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments and made findings for consistency in appearance, appropriate requirements for special design district grading natural to the topography, protection of the public health, safety, and welfare, and vegetation removal.
- 2) The Board deemed the project will have no adverse impact to the existing oak trees on the project site.
- 3) Indicate areas of existing road to remain, areas of road to be resurfaced, and existing and proposed surface materials.
- 4) Provide information to clarify species in of the proposed hydro seed-mix; verify compliance of seed mix with the Fire Department to confirm compliance with High Fire Landscaping requirements.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained, Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

The Applicant stated that he would make every effort to coordinate with neighborhood concerns.

#### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **4. 317 NORTHRIDGE RD**

**A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-131-009  
 Application Number: MST2011-00291  
 Owner: Victoria J. Trevillian  
 Designer: J Grant Design Studio

(Proposal to permit 550 linear feet of "as-built" stone retaining walls, 350 linear feet of new site and retaining walls, replace the existing retaining wall along the driveway with a new 106 linear foot retaining wall, and replacement of the existing 1,140 square foot driveway with new permeable paving. The site and retaining walls will vary in height from a minimum of two-feet to a maximum of eight feet tall. The project involves 822 cubic yards of grading, consisting of 195 cubic yards of excavation and 627 cubic yards of fill. All existing trees are proposed to remain. No changes are proposed to the existing one-story single-family residence. This proposal will address the violations listed in enforcement case ENF2010-01069.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires grading findings. Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) compliance required prior to granting Final Approval.)**

(5:17)

Present: Jason Grant, Designer/Agent; and Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:21 p.m.

James Olevsky spoke in support of the proposed project:

Public comment closed at 5:22 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to Consent with conditions:**

- 1) The Board had positive comments and made findings for appropriate mass, bulk, size and scale, consistency in appearance, appropriate for special design district grading and protection of natural topography, drainage, protection of the public health, safety, and welfare, and vegetation removal, which will not cause any negative impacts to existing oak woodland habitat.
- 2) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

Action: Miller/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

### **5. 108 ONTARE HILLS LN**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-160-056

Application Number: MST2011-00267

Owner: Casey Sulak

Architect: Benjamin Woodall

Owner: Security F One-Hundred and Forty-Seven, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new two-story 4,647 square foot single-family residence with a 677 square foot detached three-car garage and one uncovered parking space located on an existing vacant 40,946 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a total of 1,373 square feet of covered porches and 488 cubic yards of grading under the main building footprint (244 cubic yards of cut and 244 cubic yards of fill) to be balanced onsite. The proposed total of 5,324 square feet is 108% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)**

(5:41)

Present: Benjamin Woodall, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:49 p.m.

The following public comment spoke either in support or in opposition of the proposed project:

- 1) Edward Lamb, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed second-story blocking his private views.

- 2) Peter Shepard, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the height of the proposed detached garage and second-story, and supports the proposed eucalyptus tree removal for fire safety.
- 3) Steve Frenkel, opposition; expressed concerns regarding PC Resolution No. 032-05 conformance.

Public comment closed at 5:52 p.m.

Vice-Chair Woolery read into the record the Planning Commission Resolution No. 032-05.

Straw vote: How many Board members can support the proposed architectural style as designed in this neighborhood development? 2/3 (failed) (Noted one member absent.).

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Study the overall style and design; some Board members feel that the style should be more sensitive to the adobe style. Provide substantiation that supports the style is compatible with the neighborhood.
- 2) Reduce the size, bulk, and scale of the proposed project; significantly reducing the massing and proposed square footage and floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).
- 3) Provide an appropriate landscape plan.
- 4) Study lowering the roof line and incorporating view corridors.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**6. 638 SUTTON AVE**

**A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-060-015  
Application Number: MST2011-00287  
Owner: Homestrong USA, LLC  
Designer: Ideal Designs  
Applicant: Oscar Sanchez

(Proposal to demolish a 754 square foot, one-story single-family residence and detached 450 square foot storage structure and construct a new 1,143 square foot, one-story single-family residence and attached 494 square foot two-car garage. A 300 square foot raised deck is also proposed. No grading is proposed, and no existing trees will be removed. Access to the site from Sutton Avenue will be relocated to W. De La Guerra Street. The development on site will total 1,637 square feet, on a 8,992 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District, and is 48% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. This project addresses violations called out in ENF2011-00172.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)**

(6:17)

Present: Oscar Sanchez, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 6:21 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Provide a survey of the property with property lines and topography details.
- 2) Provide a well-delineated landscape plan to include materials, hardscape and softscape details, pedestrian walkways and gates on the plans.
- 3) Simplify the architecture.
- 4) Restudy the deck, deck levels and materials, study the skirting of the deck, study materials of the deck to match the existing house
- 5) Study adding more windows to the living room area to bring in more natural northern sunlight.
- 6) Study other architectural details that might simplify the design.
- 7) Show compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements and integrate into landscape plan.

Action: Woolery/Sweeney, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman absent).

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:45 P.M. \*\***

**CONSENT CALENDAR:****FINAL REVIEW****A. 628 FOXEN DR****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-022-004  
Application Number: MST2011-00160  
Owner: Michael R. Allison  
Designer: Joaquin Ornelas

(Proposal to construct a new 419 square foot one-story addition to an existing 1,383 square foot single-family residence with an attached 434 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes a restoration landscape plan to remove invasive plants and replace with native plants along stream bank. The proposed 2,236 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, located on a 10,750 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 60% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Project Design Approval was granted on July 25, 2011. Final Approval is requested.)**

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW****B. 1547 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-041  
Application Number: MST2009-00234  
Owner: DC Duncan Susan Duncan Trustees  
Applicant: Mark Sauter  
Applicant: Dan Morlan  
Agent: Mark Morando  
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal to remove a portion of an existing patio that has been undermined by erosion on the coastal bluff on a 20,300 square foot lot located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and developed with an existing 4,835 square foot single-family residence. The proposal includes the "as-built" removal of one eucalyptus tree from the coastal bluff area and a proposed new site landscape plan. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit. The project will address the violations listed in ENF2008-00430 and ENF2010-00829.)

**(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 013-11. Project Design Approval and Final Approval is requested.)**

**Project Design Approval, and Final Approval as noted on the plans, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.**

**NEW ITEM****C. 1534 SAN MIGUEL AVE E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-031-014  
Application Number: MST2011-00313  
Owner: Craig Alan Wuertz

(Proposal to remove and replace 3 doors and 16 existing aluminum frame, with dual glazed Milgard Tuscany Replacement Series Vinyl, windows.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Project Design Approval, and Final Approval as submitted, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.**

**NEW ITEM****D. 1204 DEL ORO E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-213-010  
Application Number: MST2011-00305  
Owner: Lori Smyth

(Proposal to construct a 51.5 linear foot, 5 foot 3.5 inch tall redwood fence and gate in the front yard of an existing one-story single-family residence.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Project Design Approval, and Final Approval as submitted, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and with positive comments that the Board appreciates the proposed stepped-back and horizontal slat designs, and finds the proposed height and design of the proposed project acceptable.**

**NEW ITEM****E. 42 ALSTON PL A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-161-053  
Application Number: MST2011-00308  
Owner: Anne Emmons Murphy Trust  
Agent: Dale Pekarek

(Proposal to construct a new 348 square foot one-story addition and partial interior remodel to an existing 1,674 square foot single-family residence with an attached 525 square foot two-car garage located on a 1.72 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The 2,547 square foot residence will be 48% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued one week to Consent with conditions:**

- 1) Provide a color board.
- 2) Provide final construction details.
- 3) Provide compliance with the Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

**NEW ITEM**

**F. 327 CONEJO RD**

**A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-050-026  
Application Number: MST2011-00285  
Owner: Richard Eric Williams  
Applicant: Richard Eric Williams  
Designer: Irontown Housing, Inc.  
Contractor: Irontown Housing, Inc.  
Engineer: Taylor & Syfan Consulting Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal to replace a 1,511 square foot one-story single-family residence destroyed in the Tea Fire. Proposed is a 2,238 square foot two-story single-family residence of modular construction and a 499 square foot attached two-car carport with an entry deck above the carport. The proposed total of 2,737 square feet on the 9,464 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 77% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio. Staff Hearing Officer review of modifications for front and interior setback encroachments is requested.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)**

**Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:**

- 1) Place shutters on the windows at the southeast and southwest elevations.
- 2) Soften the entry platform with timber-tech overlay decking.
- 3) Provide railing details.
- 4) Decks are to comply with the 15-foot interior setback guideline.
- 5) The Board understands the site constraints and found the proposed location of the carport acceptable.
- 6) The Board found the project to be sensitive to the reuse of the existing building footprint.
- 7) The Board found no negative aesthetic issues regarding privacy; adjacent lot is currently vacant.
- 8) Voluntary compliance with Tier 1 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements is encouraged.

**NEW ITEM****G. 20 ALISAL RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-312-009  
 Application Number: MST2011-00288  
 Owner: Embree-Englesberg Community Property Trust  
 Architect: James Macari  
 Applicant: MBJ Homes

(Proposal to construct a new 2,384 square foot two-story, single-family residence and a new 482 square foot attached two-car garage located on a 41,382 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The previous residence was destroyed by the Tea Fire. The current proposal will relocate the garage outside of the required public right-of-way. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to allow the new house and garage to encroach into the required front setback. The proposed total of 2,866 square feet is 58% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification.)**

**Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:**

- 1) The Board understands the site plan constraints regarding the proposed location of the garage.
- 2) Study the proposed roof height and roof pitch.
- 3) Replace the proposed turret roof design to match the two-piece mission tile (it is acceptable to be its own separate element). Study the height and pitch of the proposed roof.

**NEW ITEM****H. 1399 SYCAMORE CANYON RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-340-048  
 Application Number: MST2011-00290  
 Owner: Karen Malinowski  
 Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to address violations from ENF2010-00793 to permit an "as-built" 394 square foot second-story addition, an "as-built" 592 square foot one-story addition, and a new 196 square foot basement addition to an existing 706 square foot one-story single-family residence. The proposal includes replacement of doors and windows, a new trellis, reducing the "as-built" over height fence, gate, driveway columns, and hedges to a maximum of 42-inches in height, the demolition of the "as-built" carport, and demolition of the "as-built" illegal dwelling unit by returning it to the original detached 496 square foot two-car garage. The proposed development total results in 2,384 square feet on a 33,411 square foot lot, and is 45% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Project Design Approval, and Final Approval as noted on the plans, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the condition the new garage door is to match, and be sensitive to, the design and architecture.**

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Brian Miller** and **Denise Woolery**.