



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, November 26, 2007 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

WILLIAM MAHAN, CHAIR
 PAUL ZINK, VICE-CHAIR
 BERNIE BERNSTEIN
 ERIN CARROLL
 GLEN DEISLER
 GARY MOSEL
 DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: GRANT HOUSE

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

Single Family Design Board Submittal Checklist		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p>Master Application & Submittal Fee</p> <p>Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also panoramic streetscape photos.</p> <p>Plans - floor, roof, etc. drawn to scale, three sets of <u>folded</u> plans, minimum size 18" x 24", required <u>at time of submittal & with each plan revision</u>.</p> <p>Vicinity Map and Project Statistics Forms/or Equivalent - (Include on first sheet). If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also street elevation outlines.</p> <p>Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p>Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable. .</p> <p>Story Pole Plan - if story poles are required for the project.</p> <p>Topographic Survey - professional survey for sites averaging 15% or more.</p> <p>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p>Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p>Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient project review.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p>Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p>Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for some single family projects, for example, where grading or new landscaped areas are proposed or for over 85% of max. FAR* projects. Proposed tree removal or planting and other proposed planting areas must be shown per SFDB Guidelines, Part 2: Landscape Design. At least 80% of landscaped areas must be allocated for water-wise plants. Paved areas must be shown and site statistics provided. Plans must include any street parkway strips.</p> <p>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p>Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p>Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p>Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p>Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories or noise generating equipment dBA CNEL levels at property line, where applicable.</p> <p>Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including additional planting specifications, erosion control measures and irrigation plan.</p> <p>Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. The meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Mahan.
- B. Roll call:
Members present: Bernstein, Carroll, Deisler, Mosel (arrived at 3:06), Mahan, Woolery, Zink.
Absent: None
Staff: Boughman, Baker (left at 3:15), Shafer.
- C. Public Comment:
No public comment
- D. Approval of the minutes.
Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of November 12, 2007, as amended.
Action: Zink/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mosel absent.)
- E. Consent Calendar. November 19, 2007 and November 26, 2007.
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of November 19, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.
Action: Deisler/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of November 26, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.
Action: Deisler/Carroll, 7/0/0. Motion carried.
- F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, and appeals.
Heather Baker, Project Planner, requested a subcommittee to review clarifications to the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Guidelines.
Board members Mahan, Mosel, and Bernstein volunteered to serve as the subcommittee.
- G. Subcommittee Reports.
Site Visit Subcommittee: One member of the subcommittee felt that both the Mt. Calvary and Ontare proposals could possibly have impacts to their surrounding neighborhoods. Another member felt that because the Mt. Calvary site is located in an estate home neighborhood surrounded by trees the site is an exception and mitigation of hedges will eliminate privacy concerns; however, the Ontare site might pose a visual impact due to the removed trees, and the potential finished floor height. The Subcommittee concluded that current guidelines are appropriate although a home might seem to be obscure.
Chair Mahan shared photos of an acceptable three-car garage facing a street and suggested compiling a scrap book of examples of good architectural elements.
Member Deisler questioned the Board about the acceptability of vinyl windows and whether they conform to the SFDB design guidelines. Member Deisler will provide information about new, higher-quality types of vinyl windows at the next meeting for the Board's consideration.
- H. Possible Ordinance Violations.
No violations reported.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**1. 1727 SANTA BARBARA ST****E-1 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-017

Application Number: MST2006-00529

Owner: Richard A. Suding and Mary Gougeon Trust

Architect: John Gougeon

(Proposal to construct a new single-family residence on a vacant lot. Proposed is a 3,265 square foot two-story residence and a 466 square foot detached two-car garage on the 10,200 square foot lot. The proposal has maximum building height of 29 feet, 6 inches and would result in a FAR of 0.32.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 040-07.)

(3:22)

Present: Philip Suding, Landscape Architect; Richard Suding, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m.

A letter submitted by Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment was closed at 3:33 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members feel that, given the age of the diagonal driveway, the proposed driveway design is appropriate? 6/1/0.

Straw vote: How many Members feel the double gate provides adequate pedestrian access to the sidewalk? 0/7/0.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the comment that the applicant is to study providing a pedestrian pathway access to the public sidewalk.

Action: Deisler/Zink, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**2. 1266 SAN MIGUEL AVE****E-3/SD-3 Zone****(3:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-050-023

Application Number: MST2007-00459

Owner: Jonni Collins

Applicant: Brian McAdams

Architect: Alliance Design Group

(Proposal to construct a 408 square foot second-story addition, a 116 square foot first-floor addition, and a 509 square foot second-story deck to an existing 1,051 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 228 square foot one-car garage located on a 6,000 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 1,803 square feet is 67% of the maximum FAR.)

(3:49)

Present: Larry Graves, Architect, Alliance Design Group; Jonni Collins, Owner; Brian McAdams, General Contractor.

Public comment opened at 3:55 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 3:55 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Specify a high-quality garage door.
- 2) Move the living room window three feet to the east.
- 3) Raise the east deck wall to six feet, connecting the chimney to the corner of the house.
- 4) Elevations and roof plans shall be consistent.
- 5) Provide a small window at the stairway landing.
- 6) Provide a vertical break up of the breakfast nook window.
- 7) Specify exterior light fixtures.
- 8) Provide a sample of the proposed stain.

Action: Woolery/Diesler, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 343 E MISSION ST

E-1 Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-010
 Application Number: MST2007-00547
 Architect: Michelle McToldridge
 Owner: Eva Barberi

(Proposal for the addition of a 456 square foot second-floor to an existing 998 square foot one-story single-family residence on a 5,020 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District. There is an existing 244 square foot one-car garage to remain unaltered. The proposed total of 1,698 square feet is 69% of the maximum FAR.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(4:15)

Present: Michelle McToldridge, Architect; Eva Barberi, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:22 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 4:23 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Study changing the height and termination of the chimney to be in character with the house.
- 2) Add columns under the west elevation balcony.
- 3) The Board suggests that the existing garage door be replaced.
- 4) Provide a color board; specify exterior light fixtures and details.

Action: Mosel/Diesler, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed to second story proportions.)

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 4:39 UNTIL 4:46 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONTINUED)

4. 3035 PASEO DEL DESCANSO

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-192-012
 Application Number: MST2007-00154
 Owner: Maria Del Carmen and Manuel De Alarcon
 Architect: Bill Poehler

(Proposal for a two-story 2,462 square foot single-family residence which includes an attached 480 square foot two-car garage. The existing one-story 781 square foot residence and 211 square foot, one-car garage on the 6,841 square foot lot will be demolished. Staff Hearing officer approval of a modification is requested to provide non-conforming open yard area.)

(Second Concept Review)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)

(THE PROPOSED TOTAL SQUARE FOOTAGE OF 2,462 IS 85% OF THE MAXIMUM FAR.)

(4:46)

Present: Bill Poehler, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:57 p.m.

- Wesley Brown: concerned with loss of views and about sound wall as a target for graffiti.
- Kathiann Brown: concerned with sound wall maintenance; prefers a walkway to the porch with screening.
- A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 5:05 p.m.

Straw vote: Is the 6 foot high wall setback 10 feet from the property line acceptable to the Board?
 4/3/0.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to the Full Board with the following comments:**
- 1) Provide a landscape plan for the area between the sound wall and Alamar Street.
 - 2) Break up the linearity of the sound wall.
 - 3) Revise the entry walk to be curved using permeable paving at the walk and driveway.
 - 4) The proposed open yard modification is acceptable.
 - 5) Restudy the chimney.
 - 6) Provide a roof plan showing the chimneys.
 - 7) Show the first and second floors superimposed.
- Action:** Zink/Woolery, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Mahan opposed to the sound wall along Alamar)

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:42 P.M. UNTIL 6:10 P.M. *****

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

5. 1422 SANTA ROSA AVE

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(5:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-132-014
 Application Number: MST2007-00313
 Owner: Santa Rosa Associates LLC
 Architect: Richard Thorne

(Proposal for a 2,413 square foot one-story residence with an attached 628 square foot two-car garage on a 9,239 square foot lot, which is the rear lot of a three lot subdivision. All three lots will be served by a 16 foot wide common driveway along the eastern property line. The project includes approximately 204 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprint. Planning Commission approved the Tentative Subdivision Map, Modifications, Public Street Waiver, and Coastal Development permit for the project under MST2006-00288. The proposal has a FAR of 0.26.)

(Second Concept Review)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 023-07.)

(6:10)

Present: Richard Thorne, Architect; Richard Ridgeway, Investec.

Public comment opened at 6:24 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 6:25 p.m.

- Motion:** **Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:**
- 1) Provide an appropriate street tree.

- 2) Study the fence planter for random selection of plants that are appropriate to the design and the neighboring property.

- 3) Provide connectivity from the sidewalk to the rear unit.
- 4) Provide a shade tree in the patio corner of Lot 2.
- 5) Specify the decorative concrete.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

6. 3035 HERMOSA RD

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-192-002
 Application Number: MST2007-00432
 Owner: Jessica L. Kolbe
 Designer: Clay Tedeschi

(Proposal to remodel and add an 828 square foot second-story to an existing 2,007 square foot single-family residence including 460 square foot two-car garage on a 8,712 square foot lot. The proposal includes demolition of 115 square feet on the first floor, an addition of 94 square feet to an existing first-floor deck, and a new 80 square foot deck on the second floor. The project will result in a 2,720 square foot two-story residence which is 80.5% of the maximum FAR.)

(6:41)

Present: Clay Tedeschi, Designer; Jessica Lolbe, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:49 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 6:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The rear chimney is to be veneered in brick to match front chimney.
- 2) Reconsider the landscaping plan for species more appropriate to the slope.
- 3) Provide final working drawings.
- 4) Provide a color board and specify exterior light fixtures.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

7. 2109 MOUNT CALVARY RD

A-1 Zone

(7:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-073-017
 Application Number: MST2007-00454
 Owner: Kurt H. and Carole Kinzel
 Architect: James LeCron

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,556 square foot house and 400 square foot attached garage and construct a new three-story single-family residence on the 1.1 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed 6,209 square foot residence includes an attached 732 square foot three-car garage, 92 square foot workshop, and 985 square foot unfinished basement. The proposal is 113% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

(Second Concept Review) (Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(7:01)

Present: James LeCron, Architect; Michelle Hochrein, Charles McClure Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:09 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 7:10 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Due to its location, the below-grade garage, and its compatibility with the neighborhood, exceeding 100% of the guideline FAR will not pose a negative impact to the neighborhood.
- 2) Study the proposed solar panel location for protection of the oak trees.
- 3) Step back the tower on the west elevation, and consider adding a small window.
- 4) Eliminate the proposed invasive Mexican feather grass.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed to high FAR.)

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 7:17 UNTIL 7:31 P.M.*****

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

8. 1394 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(7:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-193-021
 Application Number: MST2007-00344
 Owner: Kristiaan D`Haese
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a new two-story 2,980 square foot single-family residence and attached 500 square foot garage. The existing 1,109 square foot house and attached 400 square foot garage on the 9,781 square foot lot will be demolished. The project is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the coastal zone. The proposed total of 3,480 square feet is 95% of the maximum FAR.)

(THE PROPOSAL IS ABOVE 85% OF THE MAXIMUM FAR.)

(7:31)

Present: Paul Zink, Architect; Jaimie Pearce, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:42 p.m.

- Pete Shank: two-story home shown at the previous meeting is not located in the neighborhood; consistency of the 20 closest homes.
- A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 7:45 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of the project as submitted.
Action: Deisler/Carroll, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein, Woolery opposed, can not make NPO findings.)

I. THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:11 P.M.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

FINAL REVIEW

A. 32 E JUNIPERO ST E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-123-006
 Application Number: MST2007-00380
 Owner: John and Les White
 Applicant: Christophe De Rose

(Proposal to abate zoning violations per ZIR2006-00398. Proposal for a 24 square foot first-floor projecting window addition, new garden wall, enclose an existing arch, a small fountain, a roof for existing outdoor barbeque, and a gate and arch at front wall. The existing 3,739 square foot single-family residence is located on a 14,727 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District. Staff Hearing officer approval of a modification for the front gate and arch to exceed 3.5 feet in height is requested. The proposal would result in a FAR of 0.26 which is 87% of the maximum.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 093-07.)

Final Approval of the project as submitted with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code. The style of the arch is compatible with the neighborhood.

FINAL REVIEW

B. 1606 HILLSIDE RD R-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-092-053
 Application Number: MST2007-00460
 Owner: Kirkbride Christopher
 Architect: James LeCron

(Proposal to demolish an existing 793 square foot one-story single-family residence and construct a 793 square foot one-story single-family residence and a 256 square foot two-car carport. The 8,580 square foot lot is currently developed with another single-family residence facing Clearview Road.)

Continued one week back to Consent Calendar. Applicant to provide: 1) a color board; 2) window specifications; 3) siding detail; 4) fascia detail; 5) lighting specifications; 6) a landscape plan.

NEW ITEM**C. 121 N ONTARE RD****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-052
Application Number: MST2007-00567
Owner: Robert P. Sutton

(Proposal for a 925 square foot first-floor addition and a 694 square foot basement for an existing 1,240 square foot single-family residence. The project includes retaining walls alongside the below-grade basement entry, a new covered porch, re-roofing, and interior remodeling. The project is located on a 14,237 square foot lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with the condition that the plaster walls along the ramp are to match house.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 1318 KENWOOD RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-133-017
Application Number: MST2005-00404
Architect: Amy Taylor
Owner: Robert Lightfoot

(Proposal to replace the existing asphalt shingles with new shingles and new rafter tails, remove the as-built portable spa and concrete pad, minimal grading along front for installation of new boulders at tow of slope, grading in side yard to create a level yard area behind existing garage and an "as-built" replacement of a portion of a 6' high redwood fence on a property that contains an existing single-family residence in the Hillside Design District. A greenhouse structure was previously removed without a permit.)

Final Approval of the project as noted on the plans, with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

CONTINUED ITEM**E. 823 SUMMIT RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-173-015
Application Number: MST2007-00557
Owner: Harold W. Craig
Applicant: Mark Craig

(Proposal for new front and rear entrances, master closet addition, extended fence height to 8 feet, interior remodel, hardscape improvements, new front gate and site walls, and paint to match existing.)

(Third Concept Review.) (Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval of the project with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the following conditions: 1) the arbor is to be eliminated; 2) gate to be a maximum of 3.5 feet; 3) fence on the east side is not to exceed Zoning height requirement; 4) install lattice on both inside and outside of fence.

FINAL REVIEW

F. 937 CIMA LINDA LN

A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-009

Application Number: MST2007-00314

Owner: Montesano Family Trust

Architect: Lenvik and Minor

(Proposal to replace existing windows and doors, convert the existing three-car garage at the west elevation to habitable space, revise the east wing facade and balcony, revise and replace the south terrace and trellis, revise pool terrace and add spa, BBQ etc. Landscaping improvements including, terraced retaining walls, paths, and revegetate 2.2 acres on sloped hillside. Existing three-car garage at east wing proposed to remain.)

Final Approval of the architecture with the following conditions: 1) light fixtures to comply with Outdoor Lighting Ordinance and Guidelines; 2) landscaping to return on Consent Calendar with screening for pool terrace retaining walls.

All items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Glen Deisler. Consent Calendar ended at 1:00 p.m.