



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

**Monday, October 29, 2007**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

WILLIAM MAHAN, CHAIR  
 PAUL ZINK, VICE-CHAIR  
 BERNIE BERNSTEIN  
 ERIN CARROLL  
 GLEN DEISLER  
 GARY MOSEL  
 DENISE WOOLERY

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      GRANT HOUSE  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      STELLA LARSON

**STAFF:**      JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor  
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician  
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Single Family Design Board Submittal Checklist		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><b>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</b></p> <p><b>Photographs</b> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas &amp; neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also panoramic streetscape photos.</p> <p><b>Plans</b> - floor, roof, etc. drawn to scale, three sets of <u>folded</u> plans, minimum size 18" x 24", required <u>at time of submittal &amp; with each plan revision</u>.</p> <p><b>Vicinity Map and Project Statistics Forms/or Equivalent</b> - (Include on first sheet). If over 85% of max. FAR*, then also street elevation outlines.</p> <p><b>Site Plan</b> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing &amp; proposed structures, building &amp; area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading &amp; retaining walls, &amp; existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><b>Exterior elevations</b> - showing existing &amp; proposed grading where applicable. .</p> <p><b>Story Pole Plan</b> - if story poles are required for the project.</p> <p><b>Topographic Survey</b> - professional survey for sites averaging 15% or more.</p> <p><b>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation</b> - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p><b>Site Sections</b> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><b>Rough sketches</b> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete &amp; thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient project review.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><b>Site Sections</b> - showing the relationship of the proposed building &amp; grading where applicable.</p> <p><b>Preliminary Landscape Plans</b> - required for some single family projects, for example, where grading or new landscaped areas are proposed or for over 85% of max. FAR* projects. Proposed tree removal or planting and other proposed planting areas must be shown per SFDB Guidelines, Part 2: Landscape Design. At least 80% of landscaped areas must be allocated for water-wise plants. Paved areas must be shown and site statistics provided. Plans must include any street parkway strips.</p> <p><b>Perspective Drawing, Model or Computer Simulation</b> - if project proposal is over 85% of a maximum FAR*.</p>
	Suggested	<p><b>Color &amp; Material Samples</b> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" &amp; detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><b>Exterior Details</b> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings &amp; must be complete &amp; accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><b>Color &amp; Material Samples</b> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><b>Cut Sheets</b> - exterior light fixtures and accessories or noise generating equipment dBA CNEL levels at property line, where applicable.</p> <p><b>Exterior Details</b> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><b>Final Landscape Plans</b> - landscape construction documents including additional planting specifications, erosion control measures and irrigation plan.</p> <p><b>Consultant/Engineer Plans</b> - electrical, mechanical, structural, &amp; plumbing where applicable.</p>

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

- A. Call to order. The meeting was called order at 3:02 p.m.
- B. Roll call.  
 Present: Bernstein, Carroll, Deisler, Mahan, Mosel, Woolery (arrived at 3:12), Zink (arrived at 3:41).  
 Absent: None.  
 Staff present: Boughman, Shafer.
- C. Public Comment:  
 No public comment.
- D. Approval of the minutes.  
 Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of October 15, 2007, with corrections.  
 Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink and Woolery absent.)
- E. Consent Calendar.  
 Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of October 22, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink.  
 Action: Mosel/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink and Woolery absent.)  
 Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of October 29, 2007. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.  
 Action: Deisler/Bernstein, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent.)
- F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.  
 Mr. Boughman announced that Board member Zink will be late.  
 Board member Deisler announced that he will step down from Item #1, 2131 Red Rose Way.  
 Chair Mahan announced that he will step down from Item #3, 1221 Las Canoas.
- G. Subcommittee Reports.  
 No subcommittee reports.
- H. Possible Ordinance Violations.  
 No reported violations.

**FINAL REVIEW**

- 1. **2131 RED ROSE WAY** **E-3 Zone**  
 Assessor’s Parcel Number: 041-252-045  
 Application Number: MST2007-00332  
 Owner: Sylvio Cunha  
 Architect: Emilio Casanueva  
 (Proposal to construct a 1,777 square foot two-story single-family residence and an attached 400 square foot two-car garage. The existing 960 square foot house on the 5,500 square foot lot will be demolished. The proposed total of 2,177 is 85% of the maximum FAR.)  
 (3:11)  
 Present: Emilio Casanueva, Architect; Sylvio Cunha, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:**

- 1) Eliminate the light on the west side of the second floor wall and the light to the west of the kitchen sink.
- 2) The front door lights are to be switched separately from other front lights.
- 3) The deck lights are to be switched separately from the two lights at the dining room door.
- 4) Provide subdued color samples.
- 5) Eliminate the Mexican feathergrass; substitute with an ornamental grass lawn of a different species.

Action: Woolery/Carroll, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed, not compatible with the neighborhood. Deisler stepped down. Zink absent.)

**THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:39 P.M. UNTIL 3:48 P.M.**

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**2. 2102 GRAND AVE**

**R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-345-003  
 Application Number: MST2007-00242  
 Owner: Clarice E. Cornell  
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal for a 94 square foot first-floor addition, a 689 square foot second-story addition and interior remodeling for an existing 1,872 square foot one-story single-family residence on a 6,086 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District and the Mission Area Special Design District. Staff Hearing officer approval of modifications for encroachments into the required open yard area and the required front yard are requested. The proposed total of 2,655 square feet is 98% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF TWO MODIFICATIONS.)**

(3:48)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect; Clarice Cornell and Harlan Clark, Applicants.

Public comment opened at 4:06 p.m.

Susan Price: inconsistencies in plans, setbacks, privacy, solar intrusion; requested quarter section drawings and story poles; submitted photographs.

Allison Curtis: neighborhood incompatibility; loss of views; lighting; submitted photographs.

Marilyn Rickard Schafer: incompatible with neighborhood; loss of views.

Public comment closed at 4:17 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members would recommend approval of the front yard modification for the single-story sitting room addition? 3/4/0.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Reduce the proposed FAR.
- 2) Provide drawings indicating appropriate apparent heights.
- 3) Provide accurate site sections and elevations.
- 4) A majority of Board does not support the encroachment into the nonconforming open yard.
- 5) Consult with staff to verify solar ordinance compliance.
- 6) Consult with an engineer for retaining wall footings.

Action: Bernstein/Diesler, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**3. 1221 LAS CANOAS LN**

**A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-090-004

Application Number: MST2007-00488

Owner: Daniel Waldman

Architect: Bob Easton

(Proposal to construct a new swimming pool, a 1,200 square foot terrace, a 446 square foot unenclosed shade/storage structure, 150 linear feet of retaining walls, an outdoor shower, fire pit, barbeque, spa, and approximately 212 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The existing 3,495 square foot two-story single-family residence is located on a 2.6 acre lot in the Hillside Design District.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(4:45)

Present: Bob Easton and Charles Collins, Architects.

Public comment opened at 4:52 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project as the basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:**

- 1) Balance cut and fill grading on site.
- 2) Show oak trees and oak tree protection measures where applicable.
- 3) Show the pool fencing.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan addressing drainage.
- 5) Specify exterior lighting in compliance with City Outdoor Lighting Ordinance.
- 6) Confer with a Landscape Architect to incorporate natural features such as boulders or natural planting into the terraced area.
- 7) Provide a color board.
- 8) The plaster surface of the retaining wall is to be a muted earth tone with a sandstone boulder base. Incorporate boulders into the plaster wall where applicable.
- 9) The project provides consistency and appearance, quality materials, neighborhood compatibility, preserves trees.

Action: Mosel/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mahan stepped down.)

**IN-PROGRESS REVIEW****4. 3834 LA CUMBRE HILLS LN****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-009  
 Application Number: MST2007-00226  
 Owner: Deborah D. Hart  
 Owner: Matt Benwitt  
 Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal for a new two-story 3,356 square foot single-family residence including an attached 674 square foot three-car garage on a 12,454 square foot vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. A modification to allow a garage in excess of 500 square feet was approved by the Staff Hearing officer. The proposed total of 3,356 square feet is 83% of the maximum FAR.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(5:07)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect; David Black, Landscape Architect; Matt Benwitt, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:16 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar.**

- 1) Provide a color board.
- 2) Provide a revised landscape breakup plan for the "caved" area.
- 3) Break up the driveway with appropriate landscaping.
- 4) Provide details, including exterior light fixtures in compliance with City Outdoor Lighting Ordinance, and gutters.

Action: Carroll/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:28 P.M. UNTIL 5:55 P.M.\*\*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****5. 112 ONTARE HILLS**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-160-058  
 Application Number: MST2007-00430  
 Owner: Wade and Jil Crang  
 Architect: Bill Wolf

(Proposal to construct a 5,237 square foot two-story single-family residence which includes an attached 750 square foot three-car garage on a vacant 1.17 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a second-story balcony, covered veranda, swimming pool, spa, and 460 cubic yards total of cut and fill grading. The proposed total of 5,237 square feet is 103% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

**(SITE CONCEPT REVIEW WILL PRECEDE REVIEW OF ARCHITECTURE.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 032-05.)**

(5:55)

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect, Pacific Architects; Jil Crang, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:02 p.m.

Margie Sullivan, neighbor: concerned about cutting down of eucalyptus trees; loss of privacy; preservation of neighborhood ambiance.

Public comment closed at 6:08 p.m.

Chair Mahan directed staff to investigate the potential removal of the Eucalyptus trees for possible violation of Planning Commission’s Conditions of Approval.

Straw vote: To accept the site plan concept and proceed to a review of the architecture. 7/0/0.

Public comment reopened at 6:15 p.m.

Margie Sullivan, neighbor: concerned about proposed project height.

Public comment closed at 6:20 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members can support the square footage approximately as proposed? 5/2/0. (Bernstein and Deisler opposed.)

**Motion: Continued four weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Restudy reducing the plate heights.
- 2) Study simplifying the architecture.
- 3) Restudy the garage and motor court.
- 4) Restudy the corner entrance configuration.
- 5) Provide oak tree protection measures.

Action: Zink/Woolery, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed: sets a precedent of exceeding maximum FAR.)

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**6. 101 ONTARE HILLS LN**

**E-1 Zone**

**(6:30)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 055-160-062  
 Application Number: MST2007-00440  
 Owner: Joshua and Diane Lynn  
 Architect: Tony Xiques

(Proposal to construct a 2,746 square foot one-story single-family residence, a detached one-story 728 square foot garage and 483 square foot accessory space on a vacant 22,499 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. The project includes 531 cubic yards total of cut and fill grading outside the main building footprint. The proposed total of 3,957 square feet is 84% of the maximum guideline FAR.)

**(SITE CONCEPT REVIEW WILL PRECEDE REVIEW OF ARCHITECTURE.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 032-05.)**

(6:52)

Present: Tony Xiques, Architect; Joshua and Diane Lynn, Owners.

Mahan: staff directed to clarify whether locating the driveway outside the development envelope is permissible.

Public comment opened at 6:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment closed was closed.

Straw vote: To accept the site plan concept and proceed to a review of the architecture: 7/0/0.

Public comment opened at 7:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Restudy the proposal to conform to the topography.
- 2) Protection of existing trees is appreciated.
- 3) The Board likes the footprint location and the single-story concept.
- 4) Provide a preliminary grading plan resolving the 8 foot grade change.
- 5) Provide alternative exterior design ideas.

Action: Bernstein/Deisler, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

### **7. 1266 SAN MIGUEL AVE**

**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-050-023

Application Number: MST2007-00459

Owner: Jonni Collins

Applicant: Brian McAdams

Architect: Alliance Design Group

(Proposal to construct a 408 square foot second-story addition, a 116 square foot first-floor addition, and a 509 square foot second-story deck to an existing 1,051 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 228 square foot one-car garage located on a 6,000 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 1,803 square feet is 67% of the maximum FAR.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

(7:23)

Present: Brian McAdams, General Contractor; Larry Graves, Architect, Alliance Design Group.

Public comment opened at 7:28 p.m.

Hap DeSimone: supports the addition.

An e-mail from Kathy Sheffield requesting story poles was read into the record.

Public comment closed at 7:30 p.m.

**Motion: Continued four weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:**

- 1) Restudy the design to preserve the front entry porch and recess.
- 2) Study pushing back the proposed second floor addition.
- 3) Simplify the roof forms and clarify the roof drainage.
- 4) Provide a brick or stone chimney.
- 5) Provide roof material samples.

Action: Zink/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)****8. 111 BURTON CIR****R-4/SD-3 Zone****(7:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-063-007  
 Application Number: MST2007-00227  
 Owner: Paul and Jill Cook  
 Architect: Ted Meeder  
 Agent: Larry Carbone

(Proposal to convert a 1,714 square foot two-story duplex into a 1,647 square foot two-story single-family residence and attached 453 square foot two-car garage on a 3,405 square foot lot. The project consists of exterior alterations and additions of 42 square feet of living space and 386 square feet of garage space. The proposal includes the abatement of violations regarding as-built garage space converted to habitable space. The proposal would result in a FAR of 0.67.)

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)**

(7:56)

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect; Paul Cook, Owner.

Public comment opened at 8:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar with the following comments:**

- 1) Remove the red concrete parkway and replace with approved landscaping, in compliance with Public Works guidelines.
- 2) The Board accepts the applicant's reasons to keep the roof at the house and covered entry at the same plate height.
- 3) The project is ready for Preliminary Approval pending Environmental Assessment.

Action: Mosel/Bernstein, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Diesler opposed, high FAR.)

**FINAL REVIEW**

**9. 1512 PORTESUELLO AVE**

**E-1 Zone**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 049-262-005  
Application Number: MST2007-00051  
Owner: Mehran and Nahid Mobrem  
Agent: Eric Swenumson

(Proposal for remodeling and additions to an existing 1,993 square foot two-story single-family residence with attached 353 square foot two-car garage on a 23,780 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes first-floor additions of 311 square feet and a second-floor addition of 855 square feet. Modifications were approved for second-story remodeling in the front and interior setbacks.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 034-07.)**

(8:16)

Present: Eric Swenumson, Designer.

**Motion: Final Approval with the following conditions:**

- 1) Provide tan colored Belgard permeable pavers at the driveway.
- 2) Provide a flagstone walkway.
- 3) Exterior building color shall be “toasted” throughout.
- 4) Provide a two-piece mission tile roof.
- 5) Garage door is to be stained wood plank to match the front door.
- 6) Provide an antique copper finish on gutters and downspouts, and bronze for all decorative light fixtures.
- 7) The front door light is to be switched separately.

Action: Bernstein/Carroll, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

**I. FULL BOARD ADJOURNED AT 8:40 P.M.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

**FINAL REVIEW**

**A. 206 LOS ALAMOS AVE**

**E-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 045-196-007  
Application Number: MST2007-00347  
Owner: James Candy  
Designer: Joaquin Ornelas

(Proposal for a 781 square foot two-story addition, with two new decks totaling 338 square feet, and replacement of all windows for an existing 2,109 square foot one-story single-family residence on a 7,097 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. Zoning Modifications are not requested for the project. The proposed total 2,890 square feet results in a FAR of 0.41.)

Final Approval with the following conditions: a) provide light fixture cut-sheet; b) show lighting on elevations; c) provide colors, roof and stone veneer on plans.

**CONTINUED ITEM****B. 1318 KENWOOD RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-133-017  
Application Number: MST2005-00404  
Owner: Enrique Chavez  
Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal to replace the existing asphalt shingles with new shingles and new rafter tails, remove as-built portable spa and concrete pad, minimal grading along front for installation of new boulders at tow of slope, grading in side yard to create level yard area behind existing garage and an "as-built" replacement of a portion of a 6 foot high redwood fence on a property that contains an existing single-family residence in the Hillside Design District. A greenhouse structure was previously removed without a permit.)

**(Second Review.)**

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

**CONTINUED ITEM****C. 1 VIA ENCANTO****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-010-039  
Application Number: MST2007-00265  
Owner: Mark and Diana M. Vestal  
Agent: Louis Robinson

(Proposal to permit an "as-built" 305 square foot accessory building on a lot with an existing 3,500 single-family residence located in the Hillside Design District.)

**(Second Review. First review was at ABR Consent Calendar.)**

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the following conditions: 1) building shall be cut into hillside, screened with landscaping, and painted to blend into hillside; 2) concrete patio to match building color; 3) provide window section details; 4) windows and doors are to be a dark color.

**NEW ITEM**

**D. 817 ARBOLADO RD**

**E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-231-021

Application Number: MST2007-00516

Owner: Frederick M. and Jane Paulson Trustees

(Proposal to remove existing site stairs and retaining walls and build new retaining walls [maximum 8 feet high], and reconfigure the driveway to create an additional driveway area for parking and turnaround space.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the condition that retaining wall match color of house.

-----

Consent Calendar ended at 11:55 p.m. Consent Calendar was reviewed by Glen Deisler.