



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, August 24, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 1:32 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Murray (until 3:43 p.m.), Orías, Shallanberger, Suding, and Veyna

Members absent: None

Staff present: Limón (until 2:50 p.m.), Eng, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest commented on the new draft zoning ordinance, stating that historic resources are not addressed sufficiently.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 10, 2016, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/3. (La Voie [Item 5], Murray [Item 5], and Shallenberger abstained.)
Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan.

Action: Murray/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following:

- a. Item 1, an archaeology report for 6100 Wallace Becknell Road, has been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.
- b. Commissioner Murray will leave early.

2. Commissioner Mahan announced that the new criminal courthouse project is not proceeding at this time because of budgetary problems.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Drury reported that the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) ad hoc subcommittee met on August 17 and 19; Commissioners Grumbine, Mahan, and Orías also attended.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 6100 WALLACE BECKNELL ROAD****A-I-1/SP-6 Zone**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065
 Application Number: MST2014-00619
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara - Airport Admin.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Applicant: Direct Relief
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to construct a new facility for Direct Relief, a nonprofit organization, including a new 127,706 square foot warehouse with an attached two-story 27,294 square foot administrative office building, a secure truck yard loading area, and 162 parking spaces on a 7.99 acre parcel to be purchased from the City of Santa Barbara Airport. The existing eight buildings totaling 12,937 square feet would be demolished. A new public road is proposed to be constructed immediately south of the project site, which is located in Sub-area 3 of the Airport Specific Plan [SP-6]. The project received a designation as a Community Benefit project and an allocation of 80,000 square feet [and reservation of 30,000 square feet] of non-residential floor area from the Community Benefit category by the City Council. Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission is required.)

(Review of Phase 3 Archeological Resources Research Design Addendum, prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Item postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Motion: To postpone the item indefinitely.
Action: Drury/Veyna, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEM**2. AVERAGE UNIT-SIZE DENSITY (AUD) INCENTIVE PROGRAM**

(1:50) Staff: Renee Brooke, City Planner, and Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
 (Discussion of the objectives of the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program and the role of the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

Actual time: 1:42 p.m.

Present: Renee Brooke, City Planner; and Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

Public comment opened at 2:08 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that he would like to see the jurisdiction of the HLC expanded so that it reviews any AUD projects that may impact historic resources.

Public comment closed at 2:10 p.m.

Discussion held.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission thanks the participants of the ad hoc subcommittee for their work, particularly Planning Commissioner Sheila Lodge.
2. The timing and momentum of the subcommittee's work is important; the Architectural Board of Review should be included, but after the formulation of HLC guidelines.
3. The Commission supports the preparation of infill design guidelines in the short-term and redrawing the AUD Map to ensure protection of historic resources in the long-term.
4. The Commission agrees that the ad hoc subcommittee has done good work so far and should continue to work on the following:
 - a. Infill design guidelines should address projects that block the views and sunlight of adjacent buildings.
 - b. Respecting adjoining neighborhood development patterns should be emphasized in the guidelines.
 - c. Sensitivity to historic resources outside of El Pueblo Viejo needs more emphasis.
 - d. Proposal to redraw the AUD Map.
 - e. Better integration of AUD projects into neighborhood character is essential.
5. The Commission requested the following revisions to project submittal requirements:
 - a. Identify the characteristics of a "livable" unit.
 - b. Consider a requirement for applicants to identify important views from significant portions of the City.
 - c. Applicants should provide 3-D modeling from aerial and pedestrian views.
6. The Commission had the following comments on the AUD Program in general:
 - a. If affordability is a goal of the program, there should be tools to ensure it.
 - b. Show goals and current status of meeting those goals.
7. The Commission should more actively utilize all available review tools, especially when the project appears incompatible.
8. Make sure applicants understand compatibility, perhaps by providing them with visual representations.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**3. 225 CALLE MANZANITA**

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-272-004

Owner: Mark & Maren Johnston

(Recommendation to consider adding the 1928 English Vernacular style house to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it was found to be eligible as a Structure of Merit by the HLC Designations Subcommittee.)

Actual time: 2:50 p.m.

Staff comments: Mr. Eng summarized the Urban Historian's memo recommending that the HLC place the house on the Potential Historic Resources List.

Public comment opened at 2:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To add the structure located at 225 Calle Manzanita to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it was found eligible for Structure of Merit designation.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 225 CALLE MANZANITA

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(2:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-272-004
 Application Number: MST2016-00321
 Owner: Mark & Maren Johnston
 Applicant: Dale Pekarek

(Proposal for 60 square feet of additions to an existing 1,218 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with a 324 square foot detached two-car garage. Proposed alterations include the relocation of an existing fireplace and chimney from the east elevation to the south elevation, a new oriel bay window and roof form at the east elevation, enclosure of a covered side porch off of the dining room, a new roof over a raised entry porch, and replacement of existing windows. The project includes a remodel and reconfiguration of interior spaces. The proposed total of 1,602 square feet on a 6,920 square foot lot is 53% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project will address a violation identified in Zoning Information Report #18732.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings.)

Actual time: 2:55 p.m.

Present: Dale Pekarek, Applicant

Public comment opened at 3:04 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that the relocation of the chimney would be a major alteration and would change the historic integrity of the house and the streetscape.

Public comment closed at 3:05 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would like the chimney to remain on the east elevation in some form? 8/1 Passed

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Study alternatives to moving the chimney to the south elevation, perhaps shifting it within the east elevation or rebuilding it in its existing location to meet current seismic standards and to retain the historic integrity of the building.
2. The chimney cap should be reused or re-created.
3. Retain all existing dormers.
4. The corbels on the new bay window should emulate the existing corbel end cuts, or should be eliminated, bringing the bay to the ground.
5. The new bay window should emulate the existing bay window, replicating the shed roof.
6. Mullions in windows need revision to be more consistent with English Vernacular style and the existing original windows.

7. The existing porch is exquisite and should not be modified.
8. Archival photos should be required and filed with the appropriate entity.
9. Drawings should show existing and proposed elevations side by side.
10. The Commission can support the south elevation porch infill.
11. The Commission appreciates the effort in replacing the non-original windows that are not historically appropriate for the building.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 3135 CALLE MARIPOSA

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(3:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-175-001
 Application Number: MST2016-00330
 Owner: Hauptert-Harris Family Revocable Living Trust
 Architect: Becker Henson Niksto Architects

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,096 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with a detached 315 square foot, two-car garage. The project includes a 272 square foot second-floor addition and four new roof dormers at an existing and expanded attic space, 110 square feet of ground-floor additions for a potting shed and outdoor storage, and permitting 159 square feet of "as-built" additions at the rear of the garage. The project also includes the demolition of an unpermitted 198 square foot patio cover, and construction of a new 192 square foot concrete patio, site walls, pedestrian gate, and new walkways steps. The proposed total of 1,952 square feet of development on a 10,890 square foot lot is 51% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The structure is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings.)

Actual time: 3:41 p.m.

Present: Tom Henson, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commended the proposed design.

Public comment closed at 3:50 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval, with final drawings to return to the Consent calendar, with findings and comment:

1. The Commission finds that the project is consistent with required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings: a) The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City, will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood, and poses no significant change; b) The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood; c) The proposed building is designed with quality architectural details, matching those of the existing building; d) The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved, along with the preservation and reuse of the resource; and e) The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting.
2. The Commission expresses appreciation to the owners for their stewardship and commends the architect for a job well done.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:55 P.M. ****