



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, June 29, 2016**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*  
MICHAEL DRURY  
ANTHONY GRUMBINE  
WILLIAM LA VOIE  
BILL MAHAN  
FERMINA MURRAY  
JUDY ORÍAS  
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

JASON DOMINGUEZ

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor  
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian  
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician  
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC) by clicking on Videos under Explore.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Grumbine (at 2:23 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Murray (at 2:32 p.m.), Orías, Suding, and Veyna

Members absent: Drury and Shallanberger

Staff present: Limón (until 2:22 p.m.), Hernandez (until 2:22 p.m.), Eng, and Sanchez

**SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:**

There will be an HLC Paseo Nuevo Subcommittee meeting on Thursday, June 30, 2016 at 9:30 a.m. at 630 Garden Street, Community Development 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Conference Room.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

## A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

## B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 15, 2016, as amended.**

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, Murray, and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

## C. Consent Calendar.

Public Comment:

Virginia Rehling sought clarification regarding Item C on the Consent calendar, 29 E. Victoria Street, asking if all gas piping is to be removed.

Commissioner Mahan responded that in a prior review, the HLC supported the location of exposed utilities behind the parapet.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Julio Veyna.**

Action: Orías/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, Murray, and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced that Commissioners Drury and Shallanberger will be absent; Commissioners Grumbine and Murray will be arriving late.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:

- a. She visited the project site at 203 Chapala Street and monitored the removal of the historic windows. The windows were safely transported to a storage facility.
- b. The painting of the Central Library is complete, and the scaffolding is coming down this week.

3. Mr. Limón announced the following:

- a. The Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) project at 1032 Santa Barbara Street, referred by the HLC to the Planning Commission, will be reviewed at the PC meeting of July 7.

Commissioner Mahan volunteered to attend as a representative of the HLC.

- b. The Ordinance Committee met on June 21 and reviewed a staff presentation that outlined past discussion in 2013 about historic districting and presented a timeline for creating a draft ordinance. At the next meeting, criteria for special design districts and historic districts will be discussed. The HLC will have the opportunity to review the draft ordinance.

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioners Mahan and La Voie reported a positive outcome for the Paseo Nuevo Subcommittee meeting of June 16. The designers have been responsive to feedback, and the design is progressing.
2. Chair Suding reported on the ad hoc Parks Signage Subcommittee meeting of June 23. The subcommittee reviewed sign types, focusing on detailing of colors and poles. Another meeting will occur next month for a final review.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****1. 6100 HOLLISTER AVE****A-I-1/SP-6 Zone****(1:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065  
 Application Number: MST2014-00619  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara - Airport Admin.  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.  
 Applicant: Direct Relief  
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to construct a new facility for Direct Relief, a nonprofit organization, including a new 127,706 square foot warehouse with an attached two-story 27,294 square foot administrative office building, a secure truck yard loading area, and 162 parking spaces on a 7.99 acre parcel to be purchased from the City of Santa Barbara Airport. The existing eight buildings totaling 12,937 square feet would be demolished. A new public road is proposed to be constructed immediately south of the project site, which is located in Sub-area 3 of the Airport Specific Plan [SP-6]. The project received a designation as a Community Benefit project and an allocation of 80,000 square feet [and reservation of 30,000 square feet] of non-residential floor area from the Community Benefit category by the City Council. Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission is required.)

**(Review of a Phase 3 Archeological Resources Report Research Design Proposal prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)**

Actual time: 1:53 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: To accept the report with comment:**

1. On page 19, change "ceiling tiles" to "roof tiles."

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, Murray, and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****2. 316 W MICHELTORENA ST & 1516 CASTILLO ST****R-4 Zone****(1:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-212-026  
Application Number: MST2016-00125  
Owner: Drake Forest Investments, LLC  
Architect: Douglas Keep

(Proposal for 21 units to be developed under the Average Unit Density [AUD] program on a 35,263 square foot lot. This includes demolishing 7 units, retaining 9 units, and constructing 12 new units located on two separate parcels. Both properties will be merged through a Voluntary Lot Merger. The project is proposed as six buildings, with 21 units with 21 parking spaces. The unit mix comprises 13 one-bedroom and 8 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 767 square feet. The project includes 614 square feet of accessory structures, reconfigured driveways, and new landscaping. The buildings that are eligible to be designated as Structures of Merit will not be impacted by the proposed project.)

**(Review of a Phase 1 Archeological Resources Report prepared by Heather McDaniel and David Stone, Dudek.)**

Actual time: 1:58 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Mr. Eng also stated that Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst for the City, requests that the archaeological recommendation action for unanticipated discoveries include the standard language from the City's Master Environmental Assessment.

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m.

Mark Sheridan, neighbor, spoke of concerns about neighborhood compatibility, which he will voice at the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) concept review. He also asked how the adjacent historic resources are considered.

Ms. Hernandez responded that the building at 1516 Castillo Street has been altered and no longer qualifies as a historic resource, and the two buildings at 316 W. Micheltorena Street are historic resources but will not be touched by the project. The owner is aware that the new buildings must be compatible with the historic resources and the streetscape on Castillo Street.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. The Commission expressed concern about compatibility with the historic setting and other aspects of the project, and requested that these concerns be addressed by the Urban Historian and the Architectural Board of Review during concept review.
2. Commissioner Orías listed concerns about neighborhood compatibility, significant trees on the site, the small sandstone wall, and aspects of livability. She will produce a complete list of concerns for the Urban Historian to forward to the ABR.

3. Commissioner Mahan reiterated concern about compatibility with neighboring properties of historic interest to the north and south on Castillo Street, particularly setbacks.

**Motion:** To accept the report as submitted.

**Action:** La Voie/Veyna, 5/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, Murray, and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

### **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

#### **3. 1626 SANTA BARBARA ST**

**R-3 Zone**

**(1:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-192-027  
 Application Number: MST2016-00220  
 Owner: Fulmer Family Trust  
 Architect: Acme Architecture

(Proposal to construct a 2,537 square foot, two-story single-family dwelling with an attached 471 square foot two-car garage. The proposal will add a third dwelling unit on a site currently developed with a 3,666 square foot duplex and 719 square feet of garage space. The project includes one additional uncovered parking space, a new driveway, alterations to a sandstone boundary wall, site work, new landscaping, and 10 cubic yards of grading excavation and fill to be balanced on site. The proposal will result in a total of 6,942 square feet of development on a 20,900 square foot parcel, with the three dwelling units proposed to be condominiums. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a Tentative Subdivision Map to create the condominiums. The original 1904 dwelling unit, which was approved to be changed to a duplex under application MST2014-00469, qualifies for designation as a Structure of Merit and is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. The sandstone boundary site walls, a Canary Island date palm, and a ficus tree have also been found to be historically significant. The Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates determined that the proposed project would meet Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and project impacts would be Less than Significant [Class III]. Therefore, the project does not warrant review by the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

**(Review of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)**

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m.

Kellam de Forest questioned how the separate dwelling unit came to be.

Public comment closed at 2:21 p.m.

**Motion: To accept the report with comment:**

1. In the report, include that the modest scale and size of the proposed new residence further decreases any negative impact to the existing historic resource.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 5/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, Murray, and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****4. 329 E CANON PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-048  
 Application Number: MST2015-00483  
 Owner: Kenneth Olsen  
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC  
 Architect: John Beauchamp

(Proposal for the demolition of an existing 683 square foot single-family residence and the construction of a new three-story, 1,418 square foot single-family residence with a 161 square foot cellar, a new 668 square foot garage, a new roof deck with exterior stairway, new walls, stairs, and associated grading. The proposed total of 2,086 square feet is 95% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio [FAR]. The attached two-car garage is proposed on the ground level to back out to Canon Perdido Street. This project will address violations in enforcement case ENF2015-00115 and Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00023. The project included Staff Hearing Officer review for a front setback modification, two interior setback modifications, and a rear setback modification.)

**(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 028-16. Project was last reviewed on November 18, 2015.)**

Actual time: 2:21 p.m.

Present: John Beauchamp, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked about the overall height of the structure compared to neighboring structures.

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval, with final details to return to the Consent calendar, with conditions:**

1. Restudy the design of the stepped wall to be traditional.
2. The design of the windows and French doors fronting Canon Perdido Street should be more vertical than horizontal and in a traditional composition.
3. The garage doors should have a more traditional design, with the suggestion that they be panelized.
4. The chimney termination should have a screen material in the plaster face to help obscure the mushroom spark arrester.
5. Soften corners of plaster at all corners.
6. Provide an unobstructed elevation view of the Canon Perdido Street fenestration.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/2. (Murray and Orías abstained. Drury and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

## **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

### **5. 518 STATE ST**

**C-M Zone**

**(2:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046  
 Application Number: MST2013-00140  
 Owner: Charles & Georgetta Craviotto Survivor's Trust  
 Architect: W.M. Howard Wittausch  
 Business Name: India Bazaar

(Revised proposal to install one freestanding, permanent canvas tent canopy [1,509 square feet] with oval steel pole frame. The original proposal involved three [3] separate canopies and a new 138 square foot storage enclosure. The proposed storage enclosure has been eliminated from the scope of work. This application addresses violations outlined in enforcement case ENF2012-01002.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 4, 2016.)**

Actual time: 2:41 p.m.

Present: Howard Wittausch, Architect; and Krishan Gupta, Business Owner

Public comment opened at 2:49 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest questioned the permanency of the canvas and when it will be replaced if it deteriorates.
2. Maggie Campbell, Executive Director of Downtown Santa Barbara, stated that the tent canopy appears to be a temporary structure and is an attractive nuisance when the business is closed; she also expressed concern about potted plants.

Public comment closed at 2:54 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 3:16 p.m.

Tamara Erikson, owner of the Neal Callahan building, is concerned about the impact of a fence on the ambiance of the area and hopes that what is approved will not change the look and feel of the block.

Public comment closed at 3:18 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:**

1. The Commission is concerned about the precedent set by an approval of this proposal.
2. The 3" x 3" newel posts should be smaller.
3. Consider varying the pattern of the collars and the straps on the pickets.
4. Consider a vining plant that grows rapidly, rather than the proposed shrubby jasmine.
5. Hand water any potted plant material.
6. The canopy solution is not traditional enough for El Pueblo Viejo, especially the posts; it lacks romance and elegance.
7. The pattern of the fence is still too unrelenting; it needs more design.
8. The connection of the rail to the post is not traditional.

9. Consider a 6' high fence.
10. The gates should look more like gates, especially during open business hours.
11. Consider breaking up the linearity of the space.
12. The fence detracts from the open-air shopping/bazaar feel of the space.
13. The applicant should look to the temporary tent structure behind the Lobero Theatre as an example of a possible solution.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Drury and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

#### **6. 634 ANACAPA ST**

**C-M Zone**

**(3:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-151-001  
 Application Number: MST2015-00300  
 Owner: Georgetta Craviotto, Trustee  
 Owner: Craviotto Primo Investments, LLC  
 Applicant: Anatega Partners, LLC  
 Architect: The Cernal Collective, LLP

(Proposal to demolish two existing commercial buildings totaling 5,520 square feet and an existing 1,850 square foot single-family residential unit and detached garage to construct a new three-story mixed-use building on two lots [630 and 634 Anacapa Street] totaling 28,145 square feet. The new project consists of 4,955 square feet [net] of ground-level commercial space. Residential space is comprised of 8 studios, 13 one-bedroom units, and 9 two-bedroom units for a total of 30 units. A parking garage accessed from Ortega Street will provide 32 parking spaces. This is an Average Unit Density [AUD] Incentive Program Priority Housing project with a proposed density of 63 dwelling units per acre [du/ac] and an average unit size of 733 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow the project to exceed the allowed density.)

**(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. Project was last reviewed on July 1, 2015.)**

Actual time: 3:19 p.m.

Present: Brian Cernal, The Cernal Collective, LLP; and Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Irma Unzueta, Project Planner, stated that the AUD five-foot variable setback is not treated any differently than others with respect to what is allowed to encroach. There is a provision that would allow a cantilevered element to encroach two feet into the setback; anything beyond will require a modification.

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that on the Ortega Street fenestration, the windows should vary in size and shape to conform to El Pueblo Viejo guidelines. He also questioned setback rules in El Pueblo Viejo.

Public comment closed at 3:36 p.m.

- Motion:**        **Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:**
1. The building will be a good addition to this significant corner.
  2. The building appears to have the right amount of simplicity in balance with variety.
  3. The variety and uniformity of the windows feels successful.
  4. The corner element at Ortega and Anacapa is appropriate and acceptable.
  5. The Commission supports a modification to allow the project to exceed the allowed density by one unit.
  6. The Commission supports a modification for a canopy-type projection into the five-foot variable front setback. The loss of such an overhead element would be unfortunate. The Commission suggests pursuing at least an alternative solution such as a smaller two-foot canopy or trellis projection into the setback, embellished with a vine. The columns are also an important part of that ground-level setback and elevation.
  7. Pay close attention to the expression of thick walls at openings, especially at the vehicular openings.
  8. The southeast corner needs better resolution, perhaps terminating the pitch into a chimney.
- Action:**        Mahan/Orías, 7/0/0. (Drury and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:51 P.M. \*\***