



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 15, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Suding (left at 2:38 p.m., returned at 2:52 p.m.), and Veyna

Members absent: Grumbine and Shallanberger

Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Eng, and Sanchez

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There will be an HLC Paseo Nuevo Subcommittee meeting on Thursday, June 16, 2016 at 9:30 a.m. at 630 Garden Street, Community Development 2nd Floor Conference Room.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Request to re-open review of 28 W. Figueroa Street (MST2016-00111), which received Project Design Approval at the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 1, 2016 but did not receive Development Plan Approval findings and findings for a CEQA exemption under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183.

Motion: To re-open the item and amend the motion to add the following findings:

1. The Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City Staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
2. The Commission makes the following Development Plan findings: a) The proposed development complies with all provisions of this Title; b) The proposed development is consistent with the principles of sound community planning; c) The proposed development will not have a significant adverse impact upon the community's aesthetics or character in that the size, bulk or scale of the development will be compatible with the neighborhood based on the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria found in Sections 22.22.145 or 22.68.045 of this Code; and d) The proposed development is consistent with the policies of the City of Santa Barbara Traffic Management Strategy (as approved by City Resolution No. 13-010 dated as of March 12, 2013) as expressed in the allocation allowances specified in SBMC Section 28.85.050. (Ord. 5609, 2013.)

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Murray abstained. Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

- C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 1, 2016.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 1, 2016, with correction.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Murray abstained. Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Julio Veyna (Item A) and Bill Mahan (Item B).

Action: Murray/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

- E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following:

- a. Commissioners Grumbine and Shallenberger will be absent.
- b. The Ordinance Committee will meet on Tuesday, June 21 at 12:30 p.m. to discuss the status of amendments regarding historic resource protection and designation of districts.
- c. Item 7 (414 Chapala Street) and Item 8 (610, 612, and 618 Castillo Street) have each been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

- Ms. Hernandez provided an update on the reconstruction/conservation plan for 203 Chapala Street. Because of problems with the foundation, removal and reconstruction of the historic elements will be required. Alexandra Cole and Ms. Hernandez will be on site to ensure proper salvage and storage of these elements.

Commissioner Orías stated that she prefers Ms. Cole’s conservation plan letter to state that the Urban Historian will “monitor” the salvage and storage of these items rather than “observe,” and that the reconstruction plan “shall preserve” instead of “will preserve” historic material. She also emphasized the importance of inspecting the storage location.

- Commissioner Drury announced the approval of the Hotel Californian sign program at the Sign Committee meeting earlier in the day and the review and continuance of signage for the Hotel Milo.
- Commissioner Orías announced that recent action by the state government could affect El Pueblo Viejo and the approval of projects, and she requested further information from staff.

Mr. Limón responded that the City is currently revising its legislative platform to confront such action.

- Chair Suding announced that he will leave the meeting briefly at the beginning of Item 4.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

Ms. Hernandez reported on the Designations Subcommittee meeting earlier in the day. The subcommittee evaluated the Mills Act applications received thus far. Structure of Merit designations to qualify many properties for the Mills Act program are expected to come before the Commission this summer.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. PRESENTATION OF ARCHITECTURAL STYLES VIDEOS

(1:45) Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Actual time: 1:46 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commended the videos but expressed concern that viewers may think the architectural styles highlighted are the only accepted styles in Santa Barbara.

Public comment closed at 1:54 p.m.

Discussion held.

Commissioner comments:

- Chair Suding suggested that the photographs of historic homes include a caption with the designated property’s name to assist the public with further research.
- Commissioner Mahan pointed out that Queen Anne-style turrets are usually round or octagonal, not round or square, as the video indicates. He also suggested that the Architectural Foundation of

Santa Barbara or the Pearl Chase Society may be interested in including some of these historic homes in a walking tour.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 1028 OLIVE ST

R-3 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-230-017
Application Number: MST2015-00583
Owner: Adelaida Ortega
Architect: Dexign Systems

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 409 square foot detached two-car garage and construct a one-story, 750 square foot dwelling unit and 540 square foot three-car carport. The carport will connect an existing 1,574 square foot dwelling unit at the front of the parcel to the new one at the rear, resulting in a duplex, on a 7,500 square foot parcel. A total of three onsite parking spaces will be provided. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to provide three instead of the required four parking spaces. This structure is eligible for inclusion on the City's Potential Historic Resource List.)

(Review of a Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by Brent Leftwich.)

Actual time: 2:01 p.m.

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the archaeological report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:02 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with revision:

1. On page 2-1, "The project site is located at 1028 Street" shall be revised to include the street name.

Action: Murray/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 1601 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

(2:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-009
 Application Number: MST2015-00524
 Owner: 1601 State Street Hotel Investors, LP
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal for additions and alterations at the site of the existing "El Prado" La Quinta Inn and Suites. Demolish the existing 6,399 square foot annex and construct a 38,052 square foot addition to existing hotel consisting of a new four-story hotel addition, with 66 new hotel rooms. The ground level will have at-grade garage parking, the second level will have garage parking and six hotel rooms, and the second and third floors will house 60 hotel rooms which average 375 square feet. Along with the hotel rooms, the building will include 4,985 square feet of support space for hotel functions. Uncovered parking spaces are to be demolished and replaced with 122 covered parking spaces. The new vehicle entry and check-in will be at the rear of this addition, and the present entrance shall be reconfigured to include a putting green, low landscaping, and a new porte cochere modeled on the original 1959 plans, which were not executed. The new development area will total 73,707 square feet [this includes a 3,000 square foot small additions credit for each lot]. The additional non-residential square footage will be acquired through a Transfer of Existing Development Rights [TEDR] with the former Sandman Hotel site. The El Prado Inn main building is a designated Structure of Merit.)

a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Phase 2 Report prepared by Alex Cole of Preservation Planning Associates evaluating the new addition and reconfiguration of the original entrance of the existing main building, including the addition of the original porte cochere modeled on the original 1959 plan.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Alexandra Cole, Preservation Planning Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the porte cochere will retain the historical integrity of the elevation. She finds low landscaping acceptable but does not agree that a putting green will meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with comments:

1. Specify on page 3 that the contemporary annex was apparently designed by Ernest Watson, AIA.
2. Remove the putting green discussion from the report, per the Urban Historian's recommendation that it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

b) (Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission Review. Project was last reviewed on June 1, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:20 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Alexandra Cole, Preservation Planning Associates

Public comment opened at 2:22 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. Consider adding a strong vertical element that emulates the original screen to break the horizontality of the proposed addition.
2. Restudy and emphasize the entrance through the screen.
3. The Commission supports the removal of the paved area at the Arrellaga Street entrance and the implementation of landscape.
4. The Commission appreciates the sensitivity shown to adjacent structures, particularly the structure on State Street.
5. The Commission finds the project to be admirably designed.
6. The Commission makes the following Project Compatibility findings: a) The design is appropriate for the district, neighborhood, and the adjacent historic resource (El Prado Inn) and is therefore compliant with the City Charter and Municipal Code; b) The architecture is compatible with the architectural character of the City and the neighborhood, particularly the adjacent historic resource; c) The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood, location, and the adjacent historic resource; d) The design responds appropriately to public views of the mountains and ocean; and e) The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 100 BLK W GUTIERREZ ST 2035 SEG ID

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-035
 Application Number: MST2013-00312
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Public Works Department
 Engineer: Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to remove and replace the Gutierrez Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The existing bridge is 37 feet long and 36 feet wide and was constructed in 1926. The new bridge will be approximately 55.5 feet long and 47 feet wide.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on February 10, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:38 p.m.

Present: Craig Drake, Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.; and Jim Colton, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest questioned the extent of the widening and the wrought iron fencing.

Public comment closed at 2:50 p.m.

Motion: **Project Design Approval, with final details to return to the Consent calendar, with comments:**

1. Use concrete forms under the bridge and a faux sandstone liner on the creek walls.
2. Remove the bars as shown on page 76 that extend above the 42" railing; the 2" x 2" supporting square posts shown on page 75 should be above the railing by approximately an inch.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 6/0/1. (Suding abstained. Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 0 BLK W YANONALI ST 2069 SEG ID

(2:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-069, 033-041-012, 033-041-013, 033-074-001
 Application Number: MST2016-00236
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Matthew Griffin, P.E.
 Designer: Aric M. Torreyson, P.E.

(Proposal to construct a double reinforced concrete box culvert along lower Mission Creek, beginning at the terminus of Reach 1B, located just northeast of 120 Chapala Street. The box culvert continues upstream [northward] through Yanonali Street, immediately adjacent to the Chapala Street Bridge and terminating just south of the railroad tracks at the location of the completed Railroad Depot By-Pass Culvert Extension Project. The construction of the box culvert will remove and replace hardscape improvements along Yanonali Street and the remnant Chapala Street right-of-way and include limited site improvements at 134 Chapala Street.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program prior to Final Approval.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Matthew Griffin, Santa Barbara County Flood Control District; and Alex Ubaldo, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: **Project Design Approval, with final details to return to the Consent calendar, with comments:**

1. The Commission appreciates the project as a good step forward for the City and that the remnant of the abandoned segment of Chapala Street pays homage to the original Chapala Street geometry.
2. Restudy the plant material to be more native and variable in height and material.
3. The Commission requests that the applicant do a crack study on the Santa Barbara train depot; the applicant has indicated this will be done.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 1735 BATH ST

R-4 Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-082-007
 Application Number: MST2015-00590
 Owner: Joyce Peneau & Antoine Shabazz
 Applicant: Lisa Stidd-Silver
 Architect: Ed de Vicente

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a 576 square foot second-story master bedroom addition and a 49 square foot first-floor addition to an existing 1,273 square foot single-family residence with a detached 170 square foot one-car garage. The existing one-car garage will be demolished and replaced with a new 218 square foot one-car garage for a total of one covered parking space on site. The proposal includes construction of a new 3-foot high fence on top of an existing 30-inch high stone wall and will result in a 5 foot, 6 inch high cumulative height of the wall/fence. An "as-built" fence and trellis will be demolished. This project will address violations in a Zoning Information Report [ZIR2015-00063]. The total of 2,116 square feet of development on a 5,289 square foot lot is 84% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio [FAR]. The project requires an Administrative Height Exception for the over height wall/fence and for an over height hedge and wall at the property. This project included Staff Hearing Officer review to allow a conforming second-story addition resulting in changes to the basic exterior characteristics of an existing non-conforming building in the required front setback. This residence is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 15-00590. Project was last reviewed on December 16, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:37 p.m.

Present: Lisa Stidd-Silver, Applicant

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that the reason for the addition of a three-foot fence on top of the wall is unclear and that it will perhaps detract from the historic setting.

Public comment closed at 3:43 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval, with the revised window on the north elevation to return to the Consent calendar, with comments:

1. The Commission commends the architect for a project that is well done.
2. Restudy the composition of the stepped windows, perhaps combining as one element.
3. The Commission recommends that the wood picket Bath Street fence be set back from the inside face of the sandstone wall approximately 18" and have cascading or vertical landscaping installed in this space.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 414 CHAPALA ST

C-M Zone

(3:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-027
 Application Number: MST2016-00190
 Owner: John & Martha Peterson
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story, 3,200 square foot commercial building and construct a new four-story, mixed-use development with 4,000 square feet of commercial area, and 22 rental units on a 15,246 square foot parcel. The residential component is being developed under the Average Unit Density [AUD] program and proposes a unit mix comprising three studio units, 12 one-bedroom units, and 7 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 809 square feet. There will be a total of 31 parking spaces located within a ground-floor garage. The project requires a Concept Review by Planning Commission for the AUD development in the priority housing overlay and on a lot greater than 15,000 square feet in size.)

(Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on June 1, 2016.)

Item postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Motion: To postpone the item.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 610, 612, 618 CASTILLO ST****R-4 Zone****(3:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-113-032
Application Number: MST2016-00179
Owner: Edward St. George Revocable Trust
Applicant: Trish Allen
Architect: Keith Nolan

(Proposal for 10 rental residential units to be developed under the Average Unit Density [AUD] program on an 18,750 square foot lot. This includes demolishing an existing single-family residence [610 Castillo Street], constructing eight new residential units, and retaining two existing single-family residences [612 and 618 Castillo Street] located on separate parcels. Both properties will be merged through a Voluntary Lot Merger. The eight new units will be developed in four new buildings consisting of one triplex, two duplexes, and one new single-family residence. The resulting 10 units will have an average unit size of 1,130 square feet and will result in 15,652 square feet of development, including garages. Twenty covered parking spaces are proposed. The project requires a Concept Review by Planning Commission for the AUD development at high density [28-36 du/acre] and on a lot greater than 15,000 square feet in size.)

Item postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Motion: To postpone the item.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 6/0/1. (Suding abstained. Grumbine and Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:55 P.M. ****