



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 1, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury (at 1:52 p.m.), Grumbine (at 1:36 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Orías, Shallanberger (until 4:49 p.m.), Suding, and Veyna
Members absent: Murray
Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Eng, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Sheila Lodge presented photographs of the Casa de Las Fuentes housing development on Castillo Street, stating that it is a good example to consider when reviewing Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) projects in El Pueblo Viejo.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 18, 2016, as presented.

Action: Mahan/Shallanberger, 5/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained on Item 1. Drury, Grumbine, and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 6/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced that Commissioner Murray will be absent and Commissioner Drury will be late.
2. Mr. Limón announced that the AUD project at 1032 Santa Barbara Street is scheduled for review at the Planning Commission meeting of July 7; a Commissioner will be requested to attend as a representative of the HLC.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. STATUS REPORT ON HISTORIC PRESERVATION FIVE-YEAR WORK PROGRAM**

(1:40) Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor

Actual time: 1:35 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commended staff for working to preserve the City's historic resources. He inquired when the mapping materials will be available online and whether this information will help developers identify appropriate AUD project sites.

Mr. Limón responded that the information will be available soon, and staff is able to use it when examining project parcels to identify possible concerns.

Public comment closed at 1:58 p.m.

Discussion held.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL****E-1 Zone****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00511
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates

(This is a revised project description. Phase 1 of the Master Plan build-out for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. This includes compliance requirements for the demo/remodel of the Western Residence and Puesta del Sol pedestrian and right-of-way improvements. Includes replacement of the Butterfly Pavilion, pedestrian access and ADA improvements, trash & recycle enclosure, new fencing, bioswale & native habitat restoration, landscaping, lighting, mechanical equipment replacement, and interior repairs to existing buildings. The Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History is a designated Structure of Merit.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with City Council Resolution No. 15-029 adopted on March 24, 2015. Phase I without the right-of-way improvements was last reviewed on May 18, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:01 p.m.

Present: Heidi Jones, SEPPS; Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; and Susan Van Atta, Van Associates

Public comment opened at 2:08 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval as submitted with comments:

1. The Commission finds that overall, the development of the butterfly exhibit is appropriate to the adjacent historic resource and is much improved.
2. Include in plan view of the construction documents the stone "turning" the corner.
3. Study a large and more prominent keystone.
4. The keyed-in base/cornerstone is appropriate for the structure.
5. Enhance the thickness of the arch at the opening.

Action: Shallenberger/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:20 P.M. TO 2:28 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 1601 STATE ST****C-2 Zone****(2:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-009
 Application Number: MST2015-00524
 Owner: 1601 State Street Hotel Investors, LP
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal for additions and alterations at the site of the existing "El Prado" La Quinta Inn and Suites. Demolish the existing 6,399 square foot annex and construct a 38,052 square foot addition to existing hotel consisting of a new four-story hotel addition, with 66 new hotel rooms. The ground level will have at-grade garage parking, the second-level will have garage parking and six hotel rooms, and the second and third floors will house 60 hotel rooms that average 375 square feet. Along with the hotel rooms, the building will include 4,985 square feet of support space for hotel functions. Uncovered parking spaces are to be demolished and replaced with 122 covered parking spaces. The new development area will total 73,707 square feet [this includes a 3,000 square foot small additions credit for each lot]. The additional non-residential square footage will be acquired through a Transfer of Existing Development Rights [TEDR] with the former Sandman Hotel site. The El Prado Inn main building is a designated Structure of Merit.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on May 18, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:28 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Courtney Jane Miller, CJMLA; and Alexandra Cole, Historian

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez reminded the Commission that it cannot make compatibility findings until the updated Historic Structures Report is accepted by the HLC.

Public comment opened at 2:49 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked about the project timeline and for clarification of the plan for the entrance.

Public comment closed at 2:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission commends the architect and landscape architect for the excellent design of a building that is acceptable to the historic resource and HLC guidelines.
2. The Commission requests the implementation of the previously proposed canopy at the historic entrance on Arrellaga Street as mitigation for the loss of the car entrance.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

PRE-CONSULTATION REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 414 CHAPALA ST****C-M Zone**

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-027
Application Number: MST2016-00190
Owner: John & Martha Peterson
Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(One-time Concept Review of a proposal to demolish an existing one-story, 3,200 square foot commercial building and construct a new four-story, mixed-use development with 4,000 square feet of commercial area, and 22 rental units on a 15,246 square foot parcel. The residential component is being developed under the Average Unit Density [AUD] program and proposes a unit mix comprising three studio units, 12 one-bedroom units, and 7 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 809 square feet. There will be a total of 31 parking spaces located within a ground-floor garage. The project requires a Concept Review by Planning Commission for the AUD development in the priority housing overlay and on a lot greater than 15,000 square feet in size.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Brad Vernon, Developer

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest inquired about the height of the structure and whether it will be the tallest building on the block.
2. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Laurel Rose.
3. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Sharon Campbell.
4. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Kathy Houlihan.
5. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Lynn and Steve Vuilleumier.
6. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Dean Anderson.

Public comment closed at 3:28 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the five additional parking spaces that are provided in the tandem configuration.
2. The Commission is struggling with neighborhood compatibility.
3. The building packs too much, is too intense, and is too massive; it needs to be manipulated further to appear less dense.
4. The almost maximum push to each property line is problematic to the massing; however, the articulation on each elevation is appreciated.
5. The trash enclosure appears to be undersized.
6. Try to solve the problem of the first-floor ceiling height with the parking garage ceiling height, to the effect of lowering the rear fourth-story height of the building.
7. The projection and configuration of the fourth floor is appreciated; the Commission appreciates that the fourth story is not completely built out.
8. The Commission urges the applicant to communicate with the neighbors.

9. Consider developing a model.
10. Indicate the square footage of the fourth story as a percentage of square footage on the third story.
11. Show the dimensions of the setbacks on the upper floor.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:01 P.M. TO 4:09 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 700 E ANAPAMU ST

R-3 Zone

(3:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-240-003
 Application Number: MST2016-00218
 Owner: Santa Barbara High School District
 Architect: KBZ Architects, Inc.

(Courtesy review of a proposal to replace the Peabody Stadium grandstand at Santa Barbara High School and bring it into compliance with current building and accessibility codes. The new grandstand will include a new press box, restrooms, and storage spaces. The project also includes leveling the sports field and replacing the following items: the turf with an alternate playing surface with lower maintenance requirements, the 400 meter track, the lighting and sound system, and the storm drain system under the complex. Additional improvements are proposed to prevent ponding and flooding in the stadium. This is a City Landmark: "Santa Barbara High School Main Building and Stadium Ticket Booth.")

(Courtesy Review only.)

Actual time: 4:09 p.m.

Present: David Hetyonk, Director of Facilities and Operations, Santa Barbara Unified School District; and Matt Gradias, KBZ Architects, Inc.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez clarified which elements of the property are designated City Landmarks (High School Main Building and Stadium Ticket Booth) and those that remain on the Potential Historic Resources List (Manual Training Building, Gymnasium, and Peabody Stadium).

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked how much of the original stadium is to be preserved and about the new seating. He also stated that the alumni are concerned that this proposal is too much and does not fit Santa Barbara.

Public comment closed at 4:26 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. The architecture is exemplary.
2. The symmetry of the two tower elements is appropriate within the context of the campus and its buildings.
3. Study the cantilever on the rear side of the grandstand to make it more credible, perhaps using corbels.

4. Study using the healthiest artificial turf product available. Proper soil preparation may support the use of real turf.
5. Consider additional drainage for the tree planting pits and for the sub-surface drains in the field.
6. Study the railing ironwork, using existing ironwork at the school for inspiration.
7. Study the depth of the alcove on each end of the grandstand structure.
8. Study the transition of the top-level rail connection to the mid-level at the end of the grandstand.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 28 W FIGUEROA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-019
 Application Number: MST2016-00111
 Owner: Laxman Perera
 Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,386 square foot, one-story commercial building with two parking spaces and construct a new 4,360 square foot, two-story commercial building. The proposal includes new rooftop HVAC equipment and 200 cubic yards of grading excavation under the building footprint. This 3,045 square foot parcel is within the 100% Parking Zone of Benefit.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed May 18, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:49 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:56 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval, with revised drawings to return to the Consent calendar, with conditions:

1. The metal planters shall be a box and panel design.
2. The corbels shall support a beam, which supports the rafters.
3. Color samples shall be provided.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:05 P.M. ****