



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, May 18, 2016**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*  
MICHAEL DRURY  
ANTHONY GRUMBINE  
WILLIAM LA VOIE  
BILL MAHAN  
FERMINA MURRAY  
JUDY ORÍAS  
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

JASON DOMINGUEZ

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor  
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian  
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician  
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC) by clicking on Videos under Explore.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 2:10 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Orías, Shallanberger (at 2:57 p.m.), Suding, and Veyna

Members absent: Murray

Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Eng, and Sanchez

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 4, 2016, with corrections.

Action: Orías/Mahan, 4/0/2. (La Voie and Suding abstained on Item 2. Grumbine, Murray, and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion:** Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan (Item A & B) and Philip Suding (Item B).

Action: La Voie/Orías, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Murray, and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following:

- a. Item 3, 518 State Street, has been postponed at the applicant's request.
- b. Commissioner Murray will be absent.
- c. Staff would like to arrange a meeting of the Paseo Nuevo Subcommittee in June and will contact the subcommittee members to schedule a date.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced that three City Landmarks were designated at the City Council meeting of May 17, as recommended by the HLC: "The Olives" Residence, Our Lady of Sorrows Church, and Dolores/Notre Dame School.

3. Commissioner Drury shared a photograph of the Santa Barbara National Guard Armory on Canon Perdido Street circa 1930. He also urged the Commission to visit the "Crescent Crossing" artwork at its new location at the train depot.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Suding reported on the ad hoc Parks Signage Subcommittee meeting of May 11. The bulk of the conversation was about pole types; the subcommittee directed the designer to use more decorative, round metal posts with a finial and some sort of ornamentation on the pole. The subcommittee will meet again on June 7. Chair Suding further stated that the installation of posts and signs in any park or facility in El Pueblo Viejo when new or major renovation takes place must come before the HLC for approval.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****1. 1601 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

**(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-009  
 Application Number: MST2015-00524  
 Owner: 1601 State Street Hotel Investors, LP  
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal for additions and alterations at the site of the existing "El Prado" La Quinta Inn and Suites. Demolish the existing 6,399 square foot annex and construct a 38,052 square foot addition to existing hotel consisting of a new four-story hotel addition, with 66 new hotel rooms. The ground level will have at-grade garage parking, the second level will have garage parking and six hotel rooms, and the second and third floors will house 60 hotel rooms that average 375 square feet. Along with the hotel rooms, the building will include 4,985 square feet of support space for hotel functions. Uncovered parking spaces are to be demolished and replaced with 122 covered parking spaces. The new development area will total 73,707 square feet [this includes a 3,000 square foot small additions credit for each lot]. The additional non-residential square footage will be acquired through a Transfer of Existing Development Rights [TEDR] with the former Sandman Hotel site. The El Prado Inn main building is a Designated Structure of Merit.)

**\*\* The HSSR item was tabled until after the concept review. \*\***

**b) First Concept Review.**

**(Comments only. Project last reviewed as pre-application review item on April 20, 2016. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission Review.)**

Actual time: 1:41 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Courtney Jane Miller, CJMLA; and Alexandra Cole, Historian

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that a Historic Structures Report will be necessary as the project continues through the design process to ensure compatibility of the addition with the original building, which is a Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 2:02 p.m.

Kellam de Forest questioned the necessity of the number of rooms and the suitability of expanding a building of this architectural style in El Pueblo Viejo.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

**\*\* The motion was tabled until after the HSSR item. \*\***

**Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. The Commission finds that: a) The applicant has been directed to a waiver of the City historic ordinance to design a new building addition compatible with an existing adjacent historic resource, as allowed in the ordinance, and it is therefore compatible with architectural character of the City; b) Some adjustments have been requested to make the building appropriate in size, bulk, scale; c) Those adjustments would make it

- more sensitive to the adjacent historic resource; and d) There is an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
2. The addition needs to be married more to the existing El Prado building.
  3. The overhang on the roof is a good element; the shadow line helps reduce the height of the building.
  4. A continuous architectural horizontal element on the State Street elevation will help marry the addition to the existing building. Character-defining, exemplary features of the existing building are the strong horizontal soffit that has no header on the third floor and the pattern created by the rhythm of the balconies across the building. The incorporation of Moorish elements in the bris soleil may better integrate the project with the El Pueblo Viejo district.
  5. The north and west elevations need the same layering.
  6. The north elevation is the most improved.
  7. The landscape composition needs to respond to the Mid-Century period, rather than the contemporary period; a good example is Garrett Eckbo's work.
  8. Start to think about the lighting.
  9. Continue studying the proximity of the addition, especially on the west property line.
  10. An HSSR needs to analyze the addition's compatibility to the original building, including the change to the Arrellaga Street entrance.
  11. The northwest Arrellaga Street egress is very close to State Street; however, the Commission recognizes that it is existing.
  12. The Commission appreciates the reference on the new elevator tower cantilever to the original elevator tower cantilever.

Action: La Voie/Drury. Motion withdrawn.

**2<sup>nd</sup> Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. The Commission recognizes the positive direction of the project.
2. Continue to study the compatibility of the new addition with the existing building.
3. The addition needs to be married more to the existing El Prado building.
4. The overhang on the roof is a good element; the shadow line helps reduce the height of the building.
5. A continuous architectural horizontal element on the State Street elevation will help marry the addition to the existing building. Character-defining, exemplary features of the existing building are the strong horizontal soffit that has no header on the third floor and the pattern created by the rhythm of the balconies across the building. The incorporation of Moorish elements in the bris soleil may better integrate the project with the El Pueblo Viejo district.
6. The north and west elevations need the same layering.
7. The north elevation is the most improved.
8. The landscape composition needs to respond to the Mid-Century period, rather than the contemporary period; a good example is Garrett Eckbo's work.
9. Start to think about the lighting.
10. Continue studying the proximity of the addition, especially on the west property line.
11. An HSSR needs to analyze the addition's compatibility to the original building, including the change to the Arrellaga Street entrance.
12. The northwest Arrellaga Street egress is very close to State Street; however, the Commission recognizes that it is existing.
13. The Commission appreciates the reference on the new elevator tower cantilever to the original elevator tower cantilever.

Action: Mahan/Drury. 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Letter Report prepared by Alex Cole. Letter report concludes that the Annex building is not considered historically significant.)**

Actual time: 2:33 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historian

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted with comment:**

1. The Commission recommends that the applicant include in the scope of work photo documentation and copies of any existing plans for the D'Alfonso annex to be made prior to demolition of this structure and per the City standards for documenting Structures of Merit.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:51 P.M. TO 2:57 P.M. \*\***

## **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

### **2. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

**E-1 Zone**

**(2:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003  
 Application Number: MST2015-00511  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History  
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.  
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates

(This is a revised project description. Phase 1 of the Master Plan build-out for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. This includes compliance requirements for the demo/remodel of the Western Residence and Puesta del Sol pedestrian and right-of-way improvements. Includes replacement of the Butterfly Pavilion, pedestrian access and ADA improvements, trash & recycle enclosure, new fencing, bioswale & native habitat restoration, landscaping, lighting, mechanical equipment replacement, and interior repairs to existing buildings. The Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History is a designated Structure of Merit.)

**\*\* The sub-items were reviewed out of order. \*\***

**c) (Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with City Council Resolution No. 15-029 adopted on March 24, 2015. Phase I without the right-of-way improvements was last reviewed on May 4, 2016.)**

Actual time: 2:57 p.m.

Present: Heidi Jones, SEPPS; Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; and Susan Van Atta, Van Atta Associates

Public comment opened at 3:03 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Paulina Conn.

Public comment closed at 3:05 p.m.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. The trash enclosure is much improved and is approvable.
2. The octagonal decks are acceptable as presented.
3. The entrance to the butterfly pavilion requires refinement, in emulation of the original mortar at the Hazard wall.
4. The majority of the Commission supports the use of stone material for the entrance; however, the details of the stone construction need further study.
5. Soften the corners of the stone at the building corners.
6. Bigger stones should be used on the bottom of the wall.
7. The voussoirs need to be larger.
8. The vestibule needs landscaping.
9. The vestibule has no prelude; perhaps boulders in the landscape around it would help.
10. Study walls in the neighborhood that are compatible to the height of this wall.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/1/0. (Drury opposed. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**b) (Project Design Approval is requested for the lighting plan. Requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 15-029 adopted on March 24, 2015. Lighting was last reviewed on February 24, 2016.)**

Actual time: 3:25 p.m.

Present: Heidi Jones, SEPPS; Vince Turango, Lighting Designer; and Susan Van Atta, Van Atta Associates

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Paulina Conn.

Public comment closed at 3:37 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design and Final Approval, with revised butterfly pavilion light fixture to return to the Consent calendar, with comments:**

1. The lighting is sensitive and responsive to the site and responds appropriately to the comments of the HLC.
2. Fixture XD at the butterfly exhibit should be more abstract; it is too quaint and needs to fit the historic resource and HLC guidelines. The butterfly motif may be acceptable.
3. The Commission finds that the proposal has no negative impact on the adjacent historic resource and is appropriate to the neighborhood and El Pueblo Viejo II Guidelines.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. Report concludes that the proposed lighting plan does not result in substantial impacts to the historic resources on site.)**

Actual time: 3:57 p.m.

Present: Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the proposal meets CEQA guidelines, and she emphasized the usefulness of pictures embedded in the text of the report.

Public comment opened at 3:58 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: To approve the report with revision:**

1. On page 28, revise the sentence to read, "The restoration would involve . . ."

Action: Shallenberger/Drury, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

### **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

#### **3. 518 STATE ST**

**C-M Zone**

**(3:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046

Application Number: MST2013-00140

Owner: Charles & Georgetta Craviotto Survivor's Trust

Architect: W.M. Howard Wittausch

(Revised proposal to install one freestanding, permanent canvas tent canopy [1,509 square feet] with oval steel pole frame. The original proposal involved three [3] separate canopies and a new 138 square foot storage enclosure. The proposed storage enclosure has been eliminated from the scope of work. This application addresses violations outlined in enforcement case ENF2012-01002.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on May 4, 2016.)**

**Item postponed at the applicant's request.**

**Motion: To postpone the item indefinitely.**

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Murray, and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:01 P.M. TO 4:08 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****4. 320 E CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

**(3:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-004  
Application Number: MST2015-00438  
Owner: Pacific Homes Funding, Inc.  
Architect: Ted Meeder

(Proposal to demolish the existing single-family residence and all existing site improvements and construct a new three-story, three-bedroom, 2,555 square foot single-family residence with an attached 624 square foot two-car garage. Other exterior improvements include new site retaining walls, new stone walls and gates, landscaping improvements, and upper-level balconies. The proposed total of 3,161 square feet on the 3,600 square foot lot is 144% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on April 20, 2016.)**

Actual time: 4:08 p.m.

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m.

1. Joseph Moticha, adjacent neighbor, stated that he likes how the project has evolved and requested that the HLC pay close attention to the details of the design.
2. Kellam de Forest questioned the overall height of the building and whether the design fits in El Pueblo Viejo.

Public comment closed at 4:17 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:**

1. The size, bulk, and scale, and the modification of scheme 2 are supportable.
2. The details of the stone need resolution.
3. The arch for the pedestrian entrance from the sidewalk needs more massing.
4. The balcony rail detail needs to be more traditional and typical of downtown buildings.
5. Massing proportions above the garage opening need to be reconsidered.
6. Details will need to be flushed out and are expected to be consistent with El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.
7. Start to consider landscaping, particularly for the front, potentially two trees flanking the building.
8. The architectural style, selection of materials, and general direction of colors are appropriate to the district and supportable.

Action: Mahan/Shallanberger, 7/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****5. 1115 GARDEN ST****R-O Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-013  
 Application Number: MST2016-00170  
 Owner: Harrel Properties, LLC  
 Architect: Steve Harrel

(The proposed project is using the Average Unit Density [AUD] Incentive Program Priority Overlay project on a 4,658 square foot lot with a density of 38 dwelling units per acre [du/ac]. The project is proposed as a three [3] story building, with four [4] units with four [4] covered parking spaces. The units will include one 4-bedroom unit and three 2-bedroom units totaling 3,625 square feet with 800 square feet of covered carports. Existing on the site is an office building that will be partially demolished and converted to residential use. The project includes a roof deck above the third level. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow the private outdoor living space to be located within 10 feet of the front lot line.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification.)**

Actual time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Steve Harrel, Owner and Architect

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m.

1. Paul Spieler, neighbor, expressed concern about the scale of the project and obstruction of views.
2. Kellam De Forest questioned if the project exceeds height limitations.
3. Chair Suding acknowledged written comments submitted by Marilyn Bernstein.

Public comment closed at 4:37 p.m.

*Straw vote:* How many Commissioners can support the modification of the patio in the setback?  
 5/3 Passed

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:**

1. The Commission in its majority supports the modification of the patio in the setback.
2. The mass, bulk, and scale of the front section are successful; however, the mass, bulk, and scale of the rear section are not compatible with the neighborhood.
3. Provide height comparisons of neighboring buildings.
4. A simplification of the massing would be helpful.
5. Space for people to recreate (open space) is important for quality of life.
6. The architecture is appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo.
7. Perhaps shifting the building closer to the south property line, switching the driveway, may help relieve the impact and incompatibility with the neighbor to the north.
8. Perhaps removing or reducing the roof deck on the fourth floor will help reduce the massing.
9. Reduce height, perhaps by reducing plate heights.
10. The Commission appreciates the model provided.
11. Provide more street views of structures surrounding the site.

Action: Shalanberger/Veyna, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****6. 28 W FIGUEROA ST****C-2 Zone**

**(4:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-019  
 Application Number: MST2016-00111  
 Owner: Laxman Perera  
 Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,386 one-story commercial building with two parking spaces and construct a new 4,360 square foot two-story commercial building. The proposal includes new rooftop HVAC equipment and 200 cubic yards of grading excavation under the building footprint. This 3,045 square foot parcel is within the 100% Parking Zone of Benefit.)

**(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed April 6, 2016.)**

Actual time: 4:58 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. The building has potential with its proposed design.
2. Corten steel for the planters is not acceptable in El Pueblo Viejo; panelized steel in black or other dark, approved color is appropriate.
3. The green color of the eyebrow on the south elevation is not acceptable; however, the shape is acceptable.
4. The plaster corbels should be holding a beam that in turn holds the rafters.
5. Study examples for the plaster corbels.
6. Study more plaster at the first level on the south elevation to make it more credible.
7. The openings on the rear elevation should relate to one another with less variety.
8. Massing to the right of the service door needs to be increased.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****7. 202 W CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone****(5:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-092-008  
 Application Number: MST2016-00173  
 Owner: HHLP Santa Barbara I Assoc, LLC  
 Architect: Joe Andrulaitis + Mixon

(Proposal to permit an "as-built" awning at the entrance of Hotel Milo to abate a zoning violation. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested to allow the awning to encroach into the required front setback. This property is located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Ambassador-By-the-Sea Motel, constructed 1951.)

**(Comments only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification.)**

Actual time: 5:29 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:31 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

*Straw votes:* How many Commissioners can support the shape of the awning as is, with its pitched form and open gable? 1/8 Failed

How many Commissioners can support a barrel or rounded top? 8/0 Passed

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:**

1. The Commission supports the modification for the encroachment into the front setback.
2. The shape of the awning is too contemporary.
3. The top of the awning shall be a barrel or rounded shape.
4. Open the end of the awning at the sidewalk.
5. The ironwork is acceptable.
6. Study using scallops on the valance.
7. The cantilever is problematic; perhaps less of a cantilever would be more acceptable.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:38 P.M. \*\***