



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 23, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc by clicking on "Videos" under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan (1:39 p.m.), Murray (2:06 p.m.), Orías, Shallanberger, Suding, Veyna, and Winick
Members absent: None
Staff present: Limón, Hernández, and Flemmings

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Ms. Hernández reported that Virginia Rehling has appealed Item 2 of the August 26, 2015 meeting, which added 29-37 E. Victoria Street to the City's Potential Historic Resources List. Ms. Rehling pointed out that Administrative Regulations mandate that the HLC Designation Subcommittee recommend the item before it is reviewed by the HLC. The item will be reprocessed to appear before the Designation Subcommittee on October 21 and subsequently forwarded to the HLC. Commissioner Shallanberger recommended that the Administrative Regulations be adjusted to allow for the Urban Historian to recommend structures to be added to the Potential Historic Resources List directly to the HLC. Ms. Hernández stated that Jaime Limón and the City Attorney are working on updating the Administrative Regulations.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 9, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 5/0/2. (Suding and Winick abstained. Mahan and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Philip Suding (Landscape portion of Item B).

Action: La Voie/Winick, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements:

a) Discussion Item #2, History of Trees, will be presented on Wednesday, October 7. La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

b) Item #8, 36 W. Gutierrez, will be postponed at the applicant's request. La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

c) Update on Channel Drive Transmission Tower enforcement case (ENF2015-00708): Mr. Limón reported that there is a temporary excavation of 250 burial vaults at the cemetery across the street, with a County grading permit. Due to the resulting dirt stockpile on the City parcel, a City permit will be required. Commissioner Orías requested a timeline for the operation, as she is worried about the safety of the trees. Mr. Limón replied that time limits will be understood once the permit application is filed. He stated that tree loss can be mitigated by new plantings, and in the interim, Stormwater Management Practices include tree protections. Mr. Limón also reported that regarding 29-37 E. Victoria Street, there have been no enforcement actions to date resulting from the HLC's referral to staff about code violations. The applicant is in the permitting plan check process for roof equipment, and determinations of what needs a permit and what is not in code regarding piping, lighting, and other infrastructure are still needed. No permit will be issued until these things are addressed. Mr. Limón assured the Commission that staff will be following up and issuing deadlines to the applicant.

- d) There will be a Designation Subcommittee Meeting on Wednesday, October 21, 2015 at 1:00 p.m. in the Director's Conference Room.
 - e) Next Tuesday, September 29, 2015, there will be a City Council hearing to designate the Santa Barbara News-Press building, the Peter Grant House, and the San Marcos Building as City Landmarks, as recommended by the HLC.
2. Commissioner Drury announced his visit to the MOXI children's museum. He reported that it was quite spacious, had an extraordinary view, and will be a jewel in downtown Santa Barbara.
 3. Commissioner Winick announced stepping down on Item 3; Commissioner Shallenberger stepped down on Item 9.
 4. Commissioner Veyna reported that on top of a building next to the Hill-Carrillo Adobe is a large apparatus covered in stickers; he asked if screening could be proposed. Mr. Limón encouraged the Commissioners to fill out a complaint form for such concerns, and staff would investigate.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF ARCHITECTS (ArchitecTours)

(1:45) Staff: Christopher Mason-Hing (AIA)

(The American Institute of Architects – Santa Barbara Chapter announces the annual ArchitecTours held on October 3, 2015, with the theme 'Architecture with a Story' featuring nine projects with intriguing personal stories of the design obstacles encountered during the processing and building phases.)

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Christopher Mason-Ming (AIA)

Discussion held.

DISCUSSION ITEM

2. HISTORY OF TREES

(1:47) Staff: Amanda Burgess, Parks and Recreation

(Presentation on the history of trees in Santa Barbara's five oldest parks.)

Item was postponed at the applicant's request.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:55 P.M. TO 2:02 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW**3. 40 E ANAPAMU ST****C-2 Zone****(2:02)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
 Application Number: MST2011-00428
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Irene Macias, Library Director
 Business Name: Central Library
 Landscape Architect: Campbell & Campbell

(Proposal to upgrade both landscape and hardscape areas in the plaza and around the perimeter of the Santa Barbara Public Library and the Faulkner Gallery. The improvements would include approximately 3,200 square feet of additional hardscape, 750 cubic yards of imported fill, a reduction in turf area, and a reduction in total trees from 75 to 56, a new water feature, artwork display areas, lighting, and an approximately 4,500 square foot activity space. An ADA-compliant access would be added to the south Library entrance and all other hardscape, both new and existing, would be ADA compliant. No changes to the buildings are proposed. The Central Library building, constructed in 1917, the Faulkner Gallery, constructed in 1931, and five Eucalyptus Citriodora trees planted in 1931 are designated City Landmarks. Also, the Central Library is listed on the State Historic Resources Inventory.)

(Final approval of details is requested. Project last reviewed on May 20, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:02 p.m.

Present: Irene Macias, Library Director; and Jessica Cadiente, Library Services Manager

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

1. The Commission expresses appreciation for Ms. Macias' contributions and leadership.
2. The Commission commends the applicant for a very nice design.
3. The design of the handrails is imaginative and appropriate.
4. The proposed lamp design is acceptable.
5. Restudy the shape of the bollards to be more traditional.
6. Subsequent to the painting of the building, Campbell & Campbell should review the pavement material color in the sunlight for compatibility with the new building color, with final details forwarded to the Consent calendar during construction.
7. Coordinate the ashlar paving so that it ends on a grout joint.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. (Winick stepped down.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:22 P.M. TO 2:31 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 103 CHAPALA ST****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

(2:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-073-003
Application Number: MST2015-00152
Owner: 103 Chapala, LLC
Architect: Jeff Gorrell

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for an addition, exterior alterations and an interior remodel to an existing 4,444 net square foot, four-unit, three-story apartment building with a detached 574 square foot four-car garage with an attached 137 square foot storage building on a 6,116 square foot lot. The proposal includes a new second floor wrap around balcony, new exterior stairs, changes to the size and location of windows and doors, removal and replacement of an existing second-story deck on the west side of the property, a 40 square foot entry addition, four new condenser units and site alterations, including new landscaping. No new bedrooms will be added to existing units. The proposal also includes demolition of the existing four-car garage to be replaced with four uncovered parking spaces. The existing 137 square feet of storage building will remain. This project received Staff Hearing Officer approvals for two front setback modifications, an interior setback modification, a rear setback modification, a lot area modification, and an outdoor living space modification. This building is a contributing historic resource to the proposed West Beach Historic District and on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. This parcel is located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Project Design and Final Approval are requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 048-15. Project last reviewed on July 1, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Architect, LMA Architects

*** The Commission recessed from 2:38 p.m. to 2:39 p.m. to view the proposed colors in the sunlight. ***

Public comment opened at 2:41 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval of the building as submitted; landscape plan and final tile material selection forwarded to Consent:

1. Both entry door designs are acceptable, though simplification is recommended; final selection is at the applicant's discretion.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 340 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

(3:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-036
 Application Number: MST2012-00295
 Owner: George Dumas, Trustee
 Applicant: Tesoro Refining
 Engineer: A & S Engineering, Inc.
 Architect: LMA Architects
 Business Name: USA Gas

(The proposed project involves the as-built conversion of the interior of an existing 1,478 square foot automobile service station building to a mini-mart. The proposal includes minor exterior changes to the existing building consisting of replacing the two existing overhead doors at the auto repair bays with storefront windows, minor changes to the front entry door, and landscaping improvements with additional planter areas. Nine parking spaces would be provided and no new floor area is proposed on the 15,600 square foot parcel. The existing pump islands and canopy would remain.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution 008-15. Project was last reviewed on September 9, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:50 p.m.

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Architect, LMA Architects; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 2:56 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed. It was reopened at 3:06 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest wondered about the regulations for bollards for prevention of vehicles drifting into the sidewalk. He commented that seven bollards are excessive, and the fewer used the better, if safety conditions are satisfied.
2. Ms. Hernández read two comments from the Planning Commission that asked the HLC to examine sidewalk protection with physical barriers and consider a higher perimeter wall and landscaping as tools to ensure adequate screening of the adjacent apartments.

Public comment closed at 3:07 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval of the building with conditions; landscape forwarded to Consent:

1. The concrete wall should not exceed 6' and should be stucco on both sides, with off-white paint. The wall with proposed vegetation is appropriate for screening.
2. The Commission approves the bollards to be Malaga green with a white chevron pattern.
3. Check with Transportation to determine the minimum number of bollards required for safety.

Action: Mahan/Winick, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:17 P.M. TO 3:23 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. BIRD REFUGE / 00 BLK LOS PLATOS WAY****P-R/SD-3 Zone****(3:27)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00353
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Justin Van Mullem

(Proposal to install small scale outdoor fitness/stretch equipment adjacent to the multi-modal beach way at the Andree Clark Bird Refuge. Four pieces of equipment will be installed including a stretch bar, hip flex, air walker, and an additional stretch structure with informational/instructional signage. The equipment ranges in height from 3 foot 6 inches (stretch structure) to 4 feet, 1 inch (stretch bar, air walker and hip flex). A decomposed granite surface is proposed around all pieces of equipment. The existing nonconforming accessible parking space would be restriped for a van size space with new signage resulting in the loss of one parking space for a total of 15 parking spaces. The total stretch area would be approximately 500 square feet. Instructional signage on the stretch equipment will be permitted under a separate permit. This project is in the Coastal Commission Permit and non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Project Design and Final Approval are requested. Project was last reviewed on July 29, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:23 p.m.

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Associate Planner, Parks & Recreation, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comment:

1. The Commission accepts equipment material that is inappropriate to the district as it has been treated in an artistic manner and is a sculptural, not architectural, element.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/1/1. (Suding opposed. Shalanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:35 P.M. TO 3:38 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1424 STATE ST****C-2 Zone****(3:47)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-072-020
 Application Number: MST2015-00442
 Owner: 22483 PCH II, LP
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for changes to landscaping plans at an existing commercial parcel including the removal of 20, ten to 14 inch in diameter, existing Eucalyptus trees and six, 20 inch in diameter, Coral trees to be replaced with 17 Brisbane box trees, three Australian willow trees, four Magnolia trees, and two Mediterranean Fan Palm trees. All other landscaping and hardscaping are to remain. No changes are proposed to the existing commercial building in El Pueblo Viejo.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 3:35 p.m.

Present: Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest voiced opposition to removing trees from the urban forest, saying that lack of care rather than the trees themselves may be the problem. He also wondered how long it would take for the new trees to attain the biomass of the current trees.
2. A letter from Mark Winnikoff in support of the project was read by Chair Suding. The letter provided background of the perilous nature of Coral trees.

Public comment closed at 3:46 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Return with an arborist report that addresses age of trees, viability, compelling reasons for removal, and risk management.
2. The property owners should consider making the site a public space.

Action: Orías/Mahan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 36 W GUTIERREZ ST

C-M Zone

(4:12)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-021
 Application Number: MST2015-00467
 Owner: Mark Vestal
 Applicant: Michelle Lang

(Proposal for a tenant improvement to convert an existing auto service building to an office use. Changes include refinishing the existing masonry walls with stucco, repairing and replacing the existing tile roof, installing new skylights, replacing gutters and downspouts, removing the existing auto service doors to be replaced with bi-fold doors, and replacing the existing windows and exterior door. A new handicap space will be provided for a total of one parking space. One parking space is required. No new non-residential square footage is proposed.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Item was postponed at the applicant's request.

SIGN REVIEW**9. 211 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone****(4:37)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-312-015
 Application Number: SGN2015-00094
 Business Name: Jenny Schatzle
 Owner: Drake Properties, LTD
 Applicant: Wasantha Mohottige

(Proposal for one (1) new 3.1 square foot, non-illuminated, wood projecting sign, one (1) new 6.3 square foot, non-illuminated, wood wall sign, and two (2) new 3.1 square foot, non-illuminated, vinyl, digital print window signs on an existing commercial building. Total proposed signage is 15.6 square feet. Total allowable signage at this location is 45 square feet.)

Actual time: 4:16 p.m.

Chair Suding read a letter from Natalie Cope, Chair of the Sign Committee, that strongly recommended that the HLC disallow the bright yellow background color.

Present: Wasantha Mohottige, Applicant; and Steven Stowe, Co-Owner

Public comment opened at 4:24 p.m.

Kellam de Forest mentioned that there is great precedence for toning down corporate logos to conform to El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) guidelines.

Public comment closed at 4:25 p.m.

*** The Commission recessed from 4:26 p.m. to 4:28 p.m. to view the proposed colors in the sunlight. ***

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Sign Committee with comments:

1. Use a traditional rectangular wood frame with exposed wood trim. Sandblast the wood to receive the yellow paint better.
2. The Commission can accept the cobalt blue color and the type font.
3. For the window signage, the letters should be on glass with no background color.

Action: Shalanberger/Drury, 0/0/0. Motion withdrawn.

2nd Motion: Continued to the Sign Committee with recommendations:

1. The Commission thanks the Sign Committee for its referral and concerns regarding this project.
2. The shape of the sign needs to be more traditional according to El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) guidelines.
3. The yellow background color must be toned down as suggested and contained within a natural wood frame.
4. The type font and the cobalt blue color are acceptable.
5. The lettering on the window signage should be silhouetted against the glass and not be contained within a field of color.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:43 P.M. ****