



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 17, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
JULIO J. VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger, Suding, Veyna, and Winick.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Hernández, Kaufman, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Fred Sweeney, volunteer of Mission Heritage Trail Association, and Heidi Jones, SEPPS and volunteer of Mission Heritage Trail Association, requested the Commission schedule a time to review the whole Mission Canyon Corridor Conceptual Plan.

In response, the Commission requested that staff schedule a discussion item to review the plan prior to the continued review of the Historic Structures/Sites Report.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 3, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Orías/Drury, 7/0/2. (Veyna and Winick abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Julio Veyna (Item A) and Bill Mahan.

Action: Winick/Murray, 7/0/0. (Veyna abstained / La Voie and Suding stepped down on item A.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1) Ms. Hernández announced that the City Council will be reviewing the Parks and Recreation recommendations to demolish the Francheschi House.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Shallenberger reported that the Designation Subcommittee will hold a meeting on July 1st at 1 p.m. The Wayfinding Signage will meet on July 24th.

Ms. Hernández reported that the Guidelines Subcommittee will be completing the final draft of the guidelines.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 1804 CLEVELAND AVE

R-2 Zone

(1:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 027-061-014

Owner: Jim and Bevra Kreyger

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council for City Landmark Designation of the Queen Anne style residence at 1804 Cleveland Avenue.)

Actual time: 1:53 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 1:57 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To forward the recommendation to City Council for designation as a city landmark with the comment to refer to the residence as the Grant House.

Action: Orías/Mahan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 715 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(1:55) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-092-036

Owner: 715 Anacapa, LLC (CA)

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council for City Landmark Designation of the Santa Barbara News-Press Building located at 715 Anacapa Street.)

Actual time: 1:58 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest inquired about the 1951 tower element fitting in the George Washington Smith design.

Public comment closed at 2:05 p.m.

Motion: **To postpone four weeks to allow time for the Designation Subcommittee to meet with the owners including comments:**

1. Include the landscaped area in front of the building in the designation.
2. Include the Pulitzer Prize editorial of the John Birch Society.

Action: Orías/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1129 STATE ST (1119-1137 STATE ST & 9-15 W ANAPAMU ST)

C-2 Zone

(2:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037

Owner: 1129 State Street, LLP

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council for City Landmark Designation of the San Marcos Building located at 1129 State Street, including 1119-1137 State Street and 9-15 West Anapamu Street.)

Actual time: 2:10 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:20 p.m.

- 1) John Parke, representing the owner, can support the resolution with one qualification: that an appendix, including photos, is provided to identify the non-original features of the building.
- 2) Kellam de Forest requested to have the courtyard returned to its original shape and look. Any resolution should encourage further historic restoration.

Public comment closed at 2:26 p.m.

Motion: **Continued four weeks to with comments:**

1. Provide an appendix with photos or drawings of the elevations identifying the non-original elements of the structure.
2. Include the tower element in the staff report.
3. The owner's involvement is appreciated.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**4. 100 BLK W GUTIERREZ ST 2035 SEG ID**

(2:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-035
 Application Number: MST2013-00312
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Public Works Department
 Engineer: Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to remove and replace the Gutierrez Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The existing bridge is 37 feet long and 36 feet wide and was constructed in 1926. The new bridge will be approximately 62 feet long and 43 feet wide.)

(Review of Phase I Archeological Resources Report and memorandum prepared by Applied Earthworks.)

Actual time: 2:30 p.m.

Staff comments: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supported the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:31 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.
Action: La Voie/Orias, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**5. 100 BLK W GUTIERREZ ST 2035 SEG ID**

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-035
 Application Number: MST2013-00312
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Public Works Department
 Engineer: Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to remove and replace the Gutierrez Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The existing bridge is 37 feet long and 36 feet wide and was constructed in 1926. The new bridge will be approximately 62 feet long and 43 feet wide.)

(Review of Historic Structure/Sites Report and memorandum prepared by Applied EarthWorks. The report concludes that the subject properties are not considered historic resources.)

Actual time: 2:32 p.m.

Present: M. Colleen Hamilton, Historical Archaeology Program Manager, Applied EarthWorks, Inc.

Public comment opened at 2:40 p.m.

1) Kellam de Forest requested that there be an acknowledgement of the importance of the former restaurant, Talk of the Town, to preserve its history.

Public comment closed at 2:41 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:
 1. Re-evaluate the historical significance of the 123 West Gutierrez Street structure.
 2. Provide additional information about the importance behind the Talk of the Town restaurant.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:50 P.M. TO 2:57 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 1308 N SALSIPUEDES ST

R-2 Zone

(2:25)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-092-010
 Application Number: MST2015-00234
 Owner: Sereboff Family Trust
 Applicant: Thompson Naylor Architects

(Proposal for a 188 square foot single-story addition to the rear of an existing 818 square foot one-story single-family residence. A 260 square foot one-car garage will be demolished and replaced with a new 233 square foot one-car garage. Exterior alterations to the residence include new roofing, doors, and windows including an enlarged window opening within the interior setback. Site alterations include the removal and replacement of the existing driveway with a reduced ribbon driveway, new fencing, and a retaining wall. The proposed total of 1,239 square feet of development on a 3,241 square foot lot is 57% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for open yard and interior setback modifications. This project addresses violations in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2013-00173). This property is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District and in the Lower Riviera Special Design District.)

a) (Review of the Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concludes that proposed projects impacts on the historic residence would be less than significant.)

Actual time: 2:57 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, agreed with the conclusions of the report, finding that it met with the Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation and will not have a negative impact on the historic resource.

Motion: To accept the report with the understanding that the spatial relationship will be addressed in the report to demonstrate there is no negative impact to the adjacent property.

Action: Murray/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

b) (Conceptual review; comments only. This project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for open yard and interior setback modifications.)

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Suzette Naylor, Architect, Thompson Naylor Architects; Dr. Pamela Post, Architectural Historian, and Timothy Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m.

1) Kellam de Forest questioned the reasoning behind relocating the garage since the change would impact the spatial relationship between properties.

A letter of concern from Dan and Sheryl Wheeler was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:22 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The Commission supports the design with the modest addition, and the maintenance of the rear yard.
2. The modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the guidelines concerning the lot area modification since there is no increase in floor area and no impact to the adjacent property.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

7. 9 W FIGUEROA ST

C-2 Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-041
 Application Number: MST2015-00268
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Public Works Downtown Parking

(Conceptual review of proposal to upgrade walking surfaces, landscaping, lighting, and receptacle enclosures in the City's Parking Lot 3 Paseo. The applicant is requesting direction and comments from the HLC prior to hiring a design team for the project.)

(Concept review; comments only.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Victor Garza, Parking/TMP Superintendent, City of Santa Barbara; and Jessica Grant, Public Works Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 3:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments:

Commissioner Veyna requested further study of the paving material. He recommended an element be added to create a sense of entry suggesting that lighting be used to create a focal point for passage from the front to the rear.

Commissioner Drury asked for the opening of the paseo including the removal of the pillars to create a more inviting pedestrian environment.

Commissioner Mahan requested the removal of the columns and the relocation of the trash bins into the parking lot. The amount of landscaping should be minimized and lighting should be provided on the walls, perhaps by. He suggested the paseo be uncluttered, that EPV appropriate materials such as flagstone or brick be used to replace permeable paving, and to use traditional bollards congruent to the architecture. Proposed bollards should look traditional.

Commissioner Murray requested that the trash bin be relocated and that lighting be added to the paseo. She recommended removing the existing curbed planters and replacing with potted plants.

Commissioner La Voie appreciated that the applicant came to get HLC direction before selecting a design team. He agreed with the relocation of the trash bin to the parking lot and the removal of the columns. He suggested adding to the tree canopy, opening up the paseo, and the existing raised planters should be brought to the ground.

Commissioner Orías recommended to add lighting to the walls of the building in the paseo and to remove the columns. She wanted the runoff to be directed to the planters. If the trash bins could not be relocated, she suggested moving all the trash containers to one side.

Commissioner Shallenberger commented on creating an aesthetically-pleasing area following in the direction of the guidelines.

Chair Suding recommended moving the trash enclosure to the parking lot, being selective on the tree removal, and suggested incorporating pedestrian-scale plantings. Permeable paving is not acceptable in an urban setting.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:09 P.M. TO 4:13 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 1220 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-019
 Application Number: MST2015-00274
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studios
 Engineer: Laura Yanez

(Proposal to realign the existing sidewalk, curbs, and gutters to improve the pedestrian right of way and create the future potential for outside dining. New landscaping will be installed in the parkway and Victoria Street will be restriped to accommodate the new right-of-way improvements. The project also includes the following improvements to City Parking Lot 5: replacement of existing landscaping with xeriscaping, removal of six (6) London Plane Trees to be replaced with three (3) Paperbark Trees, four (4) Jerusalem Thorn Trees, and two (2) Queen Palms, and new hoop style bicycle racks. One (1) 15 minute parking space on Victoria Street will be removed.)

(Conceptual review. Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program compliance.)

Actual time: 4:13 p.m.

Present: Teri Green, Associate Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studios; and Victor Garza, Parking/TMP Superintendent, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:24 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest expressed concern with tree removals and inquired if the removal of the 15 minute parking space on Victoria Street would eliminate all parking between Chapala Street and State Street. He stated that the kiosk be included in the project to blend into the landscaping and the proposal.

Public comment closed at 4:25 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

Commissioner Veyna requested that the sidewalk and the restaurant patio pavement be uniform. Reconsider the abundance of plantings and provide an alternate to the Paperbark Trees given their size and maintenance requirements. Consider additional opportunities for pedestrian oriented lighting leading to the parking lot.

Commissioner La Voie was generally supportive of the application, but stated that the geometry of the eastern walkway needed to be softened to create a natural transition and compatibility with the landscape.

Commissioner Winick agreed with having uniformity between the sidewalk and the restaurant patio.

Commissioner Mahan requested there be a perspective of the parking lot to the Arlington Theater to demonstrate possible viewshed impacts from the proposed tree plantings. He also requested that the applicants bring photos of the previously approved kiosk and supports the loss of one fifteen minute stall.

Commissioner Drury highlighted the importance of recognizing the project area as a visual paseo as it is adjacent to the Arlington Theater.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Not necessary to revisit the engineer plans.
2. Provide revised landscape plan.
3. Provide a simulation of the view from the south end of exit lane toward the Arlington tower.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 202 W CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-092-008
 Application Number: MST2015-00258
 Business Name: Hotel Milo
 Owner: HHLP Santa Barbara I Assoc, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
 Contractor: Allen Construction

(Proposal to add new post-lanterns in the patio of building 5 and decorative outdoor LED string lights above four patio areas at buildings 2, 3, 4, and 6, for the existing Hotel Milo. All lighting will be affixed to existing building elements and connected to existing electrical service for each building. There are contributing resources to the Potential West Beach Historic District onsite.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on June 3, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:47 p.m.

Present: Rogelio Solis, Architect, Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP.

Public comment opened at 4:54 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Revise the lighting design to include a reduction in proposed lighting and fixtures, and provide an alternate to the string lighting.
2. The proposed posts and lanterns need to be simplified.
3. Future proposals need to show the amount of light trespass across property lines.

Action: Shallenberger/Oriás, 8/1/0. (La Voie opposed) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:14 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-313-018
Application Number: MST2008-00313
Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn
Owner: Richard Gunner
Applicant: Michael Gunner
Architect: William La Voie
Architect: Marks Bloxom Architects, Inc.
Architect: John Von Doren
Landscape Architect: Suding Design

(Proposal for a major façade remodel to the existing four-story, 43,354 square foot Santa Barbara Inn. The project will consist of the following: change the exterior facade design, enlarge the main entry, remove and relocate two units, relocate existing bar and restaurant, relocate existing hotel rooms, replace existing swimming pool and spa, remove existing equipment shed and replace it with a new, partial below-ground vault, redesign the landscape and hardscape, remove the entry area drive and two curb cuts and replace with landscaping, install new sidewalk on the Milpas Street side, and repave and landscape the parking area. The proposal will result in 492 square feet of new floor area; however, there is a net decrease of 1,082 square feet of commercial floor area. The project will result in a 43,191 square foot structure. The original project approval was granted under application MST2004-00052. The project is currently under construction under BLD2012-00380.)

(Review After Final for proposed landscaping changes. Project was last reviewed at HLC Consent on April 22, 2015.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 920 SUMMIT RD****A-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-211-009
 Application Number: MST2005-00831
 Business Name: Montecito Country Club
 Owner: MCC BB Property, LLC
 Applicant: Ty Warner Hotels and Resorts
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning And Permitting
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal for renovations to the Montecito Country Club. This proposal has been reduced in scope to the following: facade improvements to the existing clubhouse; a new 5,746 square foot golf cart storage building; a new 702 square foot storage and maintenance building; modify parking lot; relocate pool; modify pool support building; add a pool pavilion, 365 square foot snack shop, 555 square foot pool equipment room, splash pool, lap pool, whirlpool; sand volleyball court, bocce ball court; new patios, and landscaping. The clubhouse structure is eligible for Structure of Merit status and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. The project includes major grading with 192,000 cubic yards of cut and fill for re-contouring, and renovation of an existing 18-hole golf course. Significant tree removals (252), tree relocations (43), and new trees (725) are proposed, with a net gain of 479 additional trees. The project received Planning Commission approval on 9/10/09 (Resolution No. 035-09) for a Conditional Use Permit Amendment, Coastal Development Permit, and Development Plan Approval. Proposed development has been reduced by approximately 7,200 square feet from the approved project. The project involves the following Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 015-300-001, 015-300-002, 015-300-03, 009-091-014, 009-091-019, 009-091-020, 009-151-006, 009-151-007, 015-211-009, 015-211-010, and 015-280-014.)

(Final approval is requested for pergola details. Project received Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination on January 27, 2014, for reduced scope of work and requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 035-09. Project last reviewed on May 20, 2015.)

Continued two weeks with comment:

1. Restudy the connection to the post to the ground.

NEW ITEM**C. 31 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00267
 Owner: KHP II Canary, LLC
 Applicant: Ashley Snodgrass

(Proposal for accessibility improvements at an existing ADA ramp at the Canary Hotel. The proposed alterations include raising the level of the existing ADA ramp, providing a new handrail, new ADA signage, and the addition of one new planter box. The new planter box and planting material will match existing adjacent landscaping.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. Handrail detail on sheet A2 will match handrail details A and B as shown on sheet A3.
2. The surface of the ramp will be 12"x12" tile laid diagonally to match the existing.

NEW ITEM**D. 716 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-016
Application Number: MST2015-00104
Owner: Safina Abraham Trustee
Applicant: Jyl Ratkevich

(Proposal for an uncovered parking space with landscaped screening and paving to match the existing concrete driveway, new wooden handrails on the front stairs and rear entry, and an interior remodel to revert the existing structure to a single-family residence. This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. The application will address violations of ENF2014-00395.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and continued to Staff for verification of details with the following comments:

1. Enlarge landscaped screening of side parking.
2. Extend the concrete paving to cover the extent of the driveway.
3. Extend the handrail on the northeast elevation 12 inches beyond the bottom post.
4. Paint the handrail white to match the existing trim.

NEW ITEM**E. 2121 GARDEN ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003
Application Number: MST2015-00283
Owner: Zohar Ziv Qualified Personal Residence
Applicant: Ray Ames
Architect: Tom Ochsner Architect

(Proposal to add a two foot, six inch in height wooden safety rail around a 230 square foot flat roof area of an existing single-family residence. No other site alterations are proposed. The residence is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. Add note that the roof area cannot be occupied and the rail is a safety rail only.
2. Paint to match the siding of the house.