



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 11, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie (at 2:15 p.m.), Mahan, Murray, Orías, Suding, Veyna (at 1:34 p.m.), and Winick.

Members absent: Shallanberger.

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 25, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Drury/Murray, 6/0/1. (Suding abstained. Orías abstained from Item 8, 215 E. Figueroa Street. La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Agenda.

Motion: Ratify the review of the Consent Agenda as reviewed by Bill Mahan; with the exception of Item G, which was reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Winick/Orías, 7/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman made the following announcements:

- a. The next HLC meeting regularly scheduled for March 25 will need to end by 5:30 p.m. to allow staff to set up for a district elections workshop that is to begin at 6:00 p.m.
- b. The last item on the agenda, Item 7, 1978 Mission Ridge Road, has been postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

Motion: To postpone Item 7, 1978 Mission Ridge Road, to the March 25, 2015, meeting at the applicant's request.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Murray abstained. La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

2. Commissioner Murray shared a memorial of Louise Boucher, former Commissioner, written by Naomi Kovacs and published in the March 5-12, 2015, issue of *The Santa Barbara Independent*.
3. Commissioner Winick announced that he attended the Joint Planning Commission/City Council meeting on March 5, 2015. One of the subjects discussed pertinent to the HLC is the implementation of the General Plan, including the Historic Resources Element.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM – PUBLIC HEARING1. **UPDATE TO THE CITY'S LIST OF POTENTIAL HISTORIC RESOURCES**

(1:50) Staff: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Hold a Public Hearing to consider staff report and recommendations to update Appendix C of the *City of Santa Barbara Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines for Archaeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites* with proposed additions, deletions and errata to the City of Santa Barbara List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m. and again at 2:03 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, suggested that the property at 1426 Garden Street remain on the list. The Victorian façade of the property at 422 W. De la Guerra Street should be retained.

Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, local historians, commented that the loss of integrity for the property at 1426 Garden Street is understood, but the concern is that the integrity of the remaining historic windows will not be protected if it is removed from the list. If it was to remain on the list, property owners may be encouraged in the future to make improvements that would restore the integrity.

Public comment closed at 2:01 p.m. and again at 2:04 p.m.

***The following properties were considered for removal from the City’s List of Potential Historic Resources as they no longer meet the criteria to qualify as historic resources due to alterations of character-defining features:**

<u>Building and Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>
1. Holman Bungalow Court, 1426 Garden Street	029-021-023
2. Bungalow residence, 932 Nopal Street	029-311-010
3. Vernacular cottage, 202 Soledad Street (1201 East Yanonali Street)	017-062-020
4. Victorian residence, 422 West De La Guerra Street	037-031-027
5. Former Jordano’s Grocery Store, 104 West Anapamu Street	039-172-003

Motion: To remove the recommended properties from the City’s List of Potential Historic Resources; with the exception of 1426 Garden Street and 422 W. De la Guerra Street that shall remain on the List for further study by the Designations Subcommittee.

Action: Winick/Oriás, 7/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

****The following properties were recommended to be included as potential historic resources:**

<u>Building and Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>
Squadron Hangar 1 (Airport Building 317) 1601 Cecil Cook Place	APN 073-450-003
Squadron Hangar 2 (Airport Building 309) 1495 Cecil Cook Place	APN 073-450-003
Squadron Hangar 3 (Airport Building 267) 303 John Donaldson Place	APN 073-450-003

Motion: To add the recommended properties to the City’s List of Potential Historic Resources with expressed appreciation for the work of the Designations Subcommittee and Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 300 BLK W DE LA GUERRA ST 1942 SEG ID**

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-942
Application Number: MST2013-00292
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to remove and replace the De la Guerra Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The existing bridge is 31 feet long and 60 feet wide and was constructed in 1914. The new bridge will be approximately 61 feet long and 55 feet wide.)

(Review of Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Applied Earthworks.)

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Staff comments: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report and the memorandum prepared by Applied EarthWorks pertaining to the property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:13 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented with appreciation expressed for the report's thoroughness.

Action: Drury/Winick, 7/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**3. 121 E ISLAY ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-041-010
Application Number: MST2015-00024
Owner: Alta Community Investment VI

(Historic Structures/Sites Report only; future remodel is pending.)

(Review of Phase I Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post Hazeltine Associates. The report has concluded the property is not eligible as a historic resource.)

Actual time: 2:17 p.m.

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff agrees with the conclusion of the report that the property does not meet the criteria to qualify as a historic resource.

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed

Motion: To accept the report with appreciation expressed for the report's thoroughness and background of the architects involved, and the request that on page 7 it be noted in the postscript that Henry Howell began working for the Robert Ingle Hoyt architectural firm in 1961 until just before his death in 1962.

Action: Mahan/Oriás, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:24 PM TO 2:43 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 1221 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-005
 Application Number: MST2015-00086
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court, LP
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects

(Proposal for alterations and a reduction in non-residential square footage as follows: Proposal to recess an existing commercial storefront resulting in a 346 square foot outdoor dining patio on the State Street elevation. Also proposed is to raise 250 square feet of existing basement area to the ground level and to reduce 250 square feet of the existing mezzanine level in order to extend the trash room. There will be a credit of 596 square feet of Growth Management Plan floor area. This structure is on the list of Potential Historic Resources called Victoria Court constructed in 1910 added to the Potential Historic Resources list in 1978 and found eligible for the California Register of Historic Resources and is connected to a designated Structure of Merit: "Upper Hawley Block.")

(Conceptual Review; comments only. Environmental Assessment is required.)

This item was reviewed out of order.

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Richard Six, LMA Architects

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed outdoor dining area and whether it would impeach on the historic Upper Hawley Block building. He also expressed concern in making this area of State Street busier than it already is.

Public comment closed at 3:17 p.m.

Motion: **Project Design Approval of the interior improvements to the trash enclosure area with comments:**

1. The trash enclosure area does not affect the exterior of the building and the applicant could proceed without the preparation of a focused Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR).
2. If the applicant proceeds with exterior changes to the building, the preparation of a HSSR would be required at staff's discretion as to whether it would be a focused report.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 1721 SANTA BARBARA ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-005
 Application Number: MST2014-00456
 Owner: WGH Ventures, Inc.
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza, AIA

(Proposal to reconstruct a total of 1,072 square feet of one- and two-story additions (including 523 square feet on the ground floor, and 549 square feet on the second floor) at the rear of the an existing 2,119 square foot two-story, single-family residence. Also proposed is to relocate two garage doors from the north to the east on the existing 543 square foot, detached two-car garage. This application addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00237. The proposed total of 3,734 square feet, located on a 12,792 square foot lot, is 92% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Edwards-Abraham House designed by Architect Thomas Nixon c. 1875.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on January 28, 2015.)

This item was reviewed out of order.

Actual time: 2:43 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect
 Karen Phillips, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:51 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned if there were photographs show what original rear addition to the house looked like before it was torn down. The flat roof area looks abrupt for the historic period of the building's style.

Staff had a copy of the HSSR that had photographs that illustrated a flat roof over the original of the rear addition.

Public comment closed at 2:53 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to the Consent Agenda for final drawings.

1. The applicant's response to previous comments is appreciated.
2. Increase the new chimney's height located in back by at least two feet.
3. The design shall emulate and not copy the existing chimney.
4. The corbels over the porch shall match the alignment or relate to the porch post spacing on the west elevation.
5. Brackets shall be added to the new porch in a much simplified version of what was suggested in front of the building.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 224 LOS AGUAJES AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-032-007
Application Number: MST2014-00405
Owner: Arne Richard Pedersen
Applicant: Michelle Lang
Contractor: Santa Barbara Design & Build

(Proposal to construct a total of 654 square feet of one- and two-story additions to an existing, one-story, 839 square foot, single-family residence, and an existing, detached, 165 square foot one-car garage, located on a 3,242 square foot lot in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposed 654 square feet of additions includes a new 544 square foot second-story addition, and the proposed one-story additions include 82 square feet to the existing residence and 28 square feet to the existing garage. The proposed one-story additions will attach the residence to the one-car garage. The proposal includes one new uncovered tandem parking space, a total of 589 square feet of ground level patios, 177 square feet of second level patios, and a 378 square foot roof deck. The project also includes the removal of an "as-built" shed, and portions of a concrete patio and porch canopy at the rear of the house. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications. The structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as an eligible Structure of Merit as it is an original Spanish Colonial Revival style residence constructed in 1928.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 012-15. Project last reviewed November 19, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:00 p.m.

Present: Michelle Lang and Don Gragg, Santa Barbara Design & Build

Public comment opened at 3:06 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Agenda for details and working drawings.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/1. (Veyna abstained. Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 1978 MISSION RIDGE RD****A-1 Zone**

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-083-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00184
 Owner: Nazerian Family Trust
 Architect: Thea Van Loggerenberg

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 165 square foot, detached, one-story, accessory building, and construct first and second story floor additions totaling approximately 1,500 square feet to an existing two-story, single-family residence. The proposed additions will connect the existing residence to the existing, detached accessory buildings. The proposal includes remodeling the existing, detached accessory buildings, to result in two-covered parking spaces in a carport, to remodel existing habitable floor area on the first-story and for new habitable area above the carport, and a 125 square foot balcony. An existing pool equipment shed is proposed to be demolished and replaced with pool equipment screened by a wall and an existing pergola on the north side of the garage will be removed and a new portico, fireplace, and balcony above will be constructed. The proposal includes 33 cubic yards of grading excavation and 29 cubic yards of fill. This project will result in a total development of 7,139 square feet and is 125% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as a Spanish Colonial Revival style residence constructed c. 1926 designed by the noted architectural firm of Soule, Murphy, and Hastings.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 070-14. Project last reviewed February 25, 2015.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)

Consent Agenda was reviewed by Bill Mahan (Items A-F) and Philip Suding (Item G at 1:00 p.m.).

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 215 E FIGUEROA ST****R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-037
 Application Number: MST2015-00026
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Michael Wiltshire

(Proposal to place a new decorative statue designed by Bud Bottoms located in the front of the Police Station, along the Figueroa Street entrance. The statue will be a memorial for fallen Santa Barbara Police officers.)

(Review After Final for statue plinth details. Action can be taken if sufficient information is presented. Project last reviewed February 25, 2015.)

Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Provide notes on plinth finish and edge details.
2. Bring a color sample board with proposed concrete stain.
3. Show location of engraving on plinth elevation and show engraving font.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1815 LAGUNA ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-051-009
Application Number: MST2011-00044
Owner: Tyler Gildred
Designer: Tom Kress

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Lockwood de Forest, Sr. House." Proposal for interior alterations to remove three illegal dwelling units and return the building to its legally permitted use as a single-family residence. Also proposed is to construct a new 709 square foot attached two-car garage and roof deck, enclose an existing 40 square foot stairwell from the garage to the house, replace the gazebo siding with new wood and rebuild the railing at the loggia end to match vintage photos, and replace the three-part living room window facing the loggia with a three-part door with wood base panels that will maintain the height and width of the existing opening. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-01018. The project will result in a residence of 7,421 square feet which is a guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) of .31 or 140% of the maximum FAR.)

(Review After Final for changes to the configuration of the rooftop BBQ area and door location. Action can be taken if sufficient information is presented. Project last reviewed on June 8, 2011.)

Public comments:

1. Greg Dahlan, neighbor, expressed privacy and noise concerns due to the reconfiguration of the rooftop BBQ area. Also stated that a tree may have been removed without a permit.
2. Ana Citron, legal representation, requests that these revisions be reviewed by the Full Commission and that the changes should conform to the 2011 approval.

Continued two weeks to the Full Commission with comments:

1. Proposed changes shall be presented to the authors of the Historic Sites/Structures Report to determine if an addendum will be required.
2. Indicate on plans clearly what is "as-built" or not per the approved 2011 plans.

NEW ITEM**C. 817 MORENO RD****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-071-003
Application Number: MST2015-00084
Owner: Barnes Family Trust
Architect: JFSARCH

(Proposal for a 49 square foot addition on the ground floor of an existing single-family residence, relocation of one window and reconfiguration of windows on the ground floor, and the installation of a barbeque, countertop, and retractable awning at the rear of the residence. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is presented.)

Project Design and Final Approvals and continued to the Full Commission with conditions:

1. The retractable awning is not approved. A trellis would be a better solution for the Spanish Colonial Revival style house. An application would have to be submitted for Historic Landmarks Commission and Staff Hearing Officer review for the proposed trellis on the west elevation that would require an interior setback modification.
2. Change details on windows to show proposed windows will be aluminum clad and not to match existing.
3. Study the rooftop lighting.

NEW ITEM**D. 1035 ORILLA DEL MAR DR****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-322-013
 Application Number: MST2015-00102
 Owner: Schulz Living Trust

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to an existing multifamily residence. Alterations include removal and replacement of the existing wood studs and siding on exterior deck privacy wall due to dry rot, new siding to match existing, installation of new wrought iron handrails; permit four "as-built" awnings and conversion of existing gas lamps to electric. This structure is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is presented.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted. The Designations Subcommittee and Urban Historian shall review the property to possibly remove it from the City's List of Potential Historic Resources due to its degradation and loss of historic integrity.

NEW ITEM**E. 29 E VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-009
 Application Number: MST2015-00087
 Owner: Tioga Holdings, LP
 Contractor: Total Heating & Air
 Business Name: Ca' Dario

(Proposal to address violations of ENF2014-01029 and permit five (5) "as-built" HVAC rooftop units and equipment screening.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is presented.)

Continued two weeks to the Full Commission.

NEW ITEM**F. 236 E CABRILLO BLVD P-R/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-191-004
Application Number: MST2015-00109
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to remove the existing corrugated steel roof at the Laguna Pump Station Facility with a similar corrosive resistant N Deck corrugated steel roof. No other exterior alterations are proposed.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is presented.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the comment that a galvanized metal roof with marine quality paint in terracotta or corten or corten steel with no finish would be acceptable.

CONTINUED ITEM**G. 1500 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-008
Application Number: MST2013-00266
Owner: Trinity Episcopal Church
Applicant: Patsy Price
Business Name: Trinity Episcopal Church

(Proposal to alter the existing landscape plan including replacement of existing groundcover and shrubs with water-wise ground cover and shrubs. This is a Structure of Merit: "Trinity Episcopal Church.")

(Fourth Review. Action can be taken if sufficient information is presented. Project last reviewed on October 23, 2013.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. Landscaping is acceptable as submitted.
2. Lighting fixture closer to State Street shall be relocated on the other end of the bench.
3. It was recommended that the proposed lighting fixtures more closely match those on the adjacent sidewalk.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:40 P.M. ****