



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 28, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
PHILIP SUDING
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Shallenberger (at 1:44 p.m.), Suding, Veyna.

Members absent: Orías and Winick.

Staff present: Limón, Hernández (until 3:44 p.m.), Kaufman, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Election of Chair for 2015.

Ms. Kaufman opened nominations for office of Chair.

1. Nomination for Chair: **Suding**.

A vote was taken and Commissioner Suding was elected as Chair.

B. Public Comment:

No public comment.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 14, 2015.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 14, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 6/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

D. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Agenda as reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced that Commissioners Orías and Winick would be absent from the meeting.
2. Ms. Hernández announced the landmark designation hearings for the Joseph Knowles Murals (38 W. Victoria Street), First Church of Christ, Scientist (116-120 E. Valerio Street), and Mount Joie (931 Las Alturas Road) will be held at the beginning of the City Council meeting on February 3, 2015.
3. Commissioner Mahan announced the HLC Awards will be held during the February 3, 2015, City Council meeting.
4. Commissioner Mahan requested a future discussion item on Public Noticing as a result of a written public comment received with respect to the 1320 Olive Street project (proposed two-story duplex).
5. Commissioner Murray announced she would be stepping down on Item 3, 1320 Olive Street.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. **333 W ORTEGA ST**

R-4 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-113-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00623
 Owner: John R. Whitehurst
 Applicant: Post/Hazeltine Associates

(Historic Site/Structures Report for an existing multi-unit residential building, the Emigh House, constructed in the Italianate style c. 1888. No development project is proposed. This building is listed as a contributing structure to the potential Castillo Street Historic District.)

(Review of Phase I Historic Sites/Structures Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concludes that the original 1888, Italianate wing of the house, sandstone retaining wall, and hitching post are considered significant historic resources.)

Actual time: 1:44 p.m.

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, provided a written summary stating that, based on the analysis of the report, Staff agrees that the 1925 wing and garage are not significant and that the 1888 house, sandstone wall and hitching post meet the criteria to be designated historic resources.

Public comment opened at 1:45 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with the condition that the report be amended to discuss the second story windows aluminum framed screens.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

2. 800 BLK STATE ST 1700 SEG ID

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-700
Application Number: MST2015-00018
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

(On behalf of the Neighborhood Improvement Task Force (NITF), the project proposes the removal of four existing, public benches in the sidewalk right of way fronting addresses 821 & 825 State Street. Benches were installed in 2001 as elements of the State Street Sidewalk Beautification Project, Phase 2.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Present: Marck Aguilar, Project Planner, Planning Division – NITF Representative
Bryan Kerr, Police Officer, Patrol Division – NITF Representative
Jessica Grant, Project Planner, Transportation Division – NITF Representative

Staff comments: Mr. Aguilar stated the benches were installed as part of the State Street Beautification Project. The layout in this area is unique in that benches face each other although the original design was to only have benches against the wall. Coupled with the extensive overhang of the building, the layout draws large groups of people behaving in a manner requiring frequent calls for Police Department response while also narrowing the pedestrian pathway.

Public comment opened at 1:55 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned whether the removed benches could be recycled and placed somewhere else.
2. Matt Wallace, business owner, spoke in support of the proposal and commented on the harassment caused by those congregating in front of the building.

3. Kacy Lynd, business manager, spoke in support of the proposal and commented on the benches placed for beautification, but that intent is far from the reality with threats to business owners and illegal activity being conducted, as well as her company's need to hire a security service to protect employees and customers.
4. Martin Irabier, local resident, spoke in support of the proposal and commented on the harassment of passersby and that the benches are not an enhancement.
5. Maggie Campbell, Executive Director of Downtown Organization, spoke in support of the proposal and commented that every morning the area needs to be thoroughly cleaned. It has become a nuisance to the neighborhood, a public safety issue, and is not beautifying the downtown.
6. Wade Whitmer, business manager, spoke in support of the proposal and commented that there are 33,000 less visitors entering his business every year as a result of being located in an area with a hostile environment.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of public correspondence in support of the proposal from Maggie Campbell, Trisha Taylor, and Arleen McGuire; and a letter from Bob Cunningham requesting that the application be denied so that the City Council can make a final decision on the use of benches in that area.

Public comment closed at 2:13 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that the City Council be informed that the Commission has no objection to the removal of the benches.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/1/0. (Suding opposed. Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 1320 OLIVE ST**

R-3 Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-034
Application Number: MST2014-00569
Owner: Brian McInerney
Agent: Paul Zink

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a new Average Unit Density (AUD) project involving the construction of a new 1,820 square foot, two-story duplex building, composed of a 544 square foot unit above a 400 square foot two (2) car garage, and an attached two-story 684 square foot unit. The project is located on a located on an 8,123 square-foot parcel. The existing lot is developed with an existing, 1,785 square foot, one-story duplex, comprised of a 1,250 square foot unit and a 535 square foot unit. The proposal will result in a total of four residential units and will provide a total of three (3) covered parking spaces and one (1) uncovered parking space for a total of four (4) parking spaces. Four covered and secured bicycle parking spaces are provided. Under base density a maximum of three (3) units are allowed, however under the Average Unit Density (AUD) Incentive Program the project proposes a total of four (4) units. The maximum allowed average unit size is 1,040 square feet; the proposed project average unit size is 753 square feet. The project proposes to demolish an existing two-car garage and shed, includes the removal of a 24" diameter bottle brush tree and an 8" diameter ornamental pear tree. The existing, 1,785 square-foot, one-story, duplex, located at the front of the parcel, will remain with no alterations. It is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District. This project addresses violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00356.)

(Second concept review; action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption. Project last reviewed December 17, 2014.)

Actual time: 2:38 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect
Brian McInerney, Owner

Staff comments: In response to concerns from the public regarding neighborhood compatibility, Jaime Limón stated that the Commission should analyze multi-family residential additions in historic districts based on the project's compatibility with the preservation of the historic district neighborhood character and impacts to the streetscape.

Public comment opened at 2:51 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of letters expressing concerns:

- Graham Lyons – failure to provide notice of the hearing, proposal not meeting the basic parameters of the Lower Riviera Special Design District Guidelines, and reducing project to less than four units.
- Karen Boyer – lack of privacy, traffic on tiny alley, and inappropriate development for the Heritage Bungalow Neighborhood.
- Linda Robyn – safety issues with increased number of cars in an already dense areas.

- Janet Garufis – no meeting notice, only one side of her home with natural light precisely on the proposed development side, removal of Bottle brush tree, her home’s private green space privacy issues, impact on neighborhood’s unique character and style, purpose of Lower Riviera Special Design District Guidelines, increased density, and reduction of units with removal of second story element resulting in reduction of parking spaces and less traffic in alley.

Public comment closed at 2:53 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The architecture can be improved.
2. The Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been met for this project with respect to the project’s preservation of the streetscape and the Potential Bungalow Haven Historic District neighborhood character.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 5/0/1. (Veyna abstained. Murray stepped down. Orías/Winick absent.)
Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:04 PM TO 3:13 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. **1721 SANTA BARBARA ST** E-1 Zone
(2:50) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 027-111-005
Application Number: MST2014-00456
Owner: WGH Ventures, Inc.
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza, AIA

(Proposal to reconstruct a total of 1,075 square feet of one- and two-story additions (including 528 square feet on the ground floor, and 547 square feet on the second floor) at the rear of the an existing 2,119 square foot two-story, single-family residence. The proposed addition restores original square footage that was demolished without a permit, and will result in the originally approved 3,194 square foot residence. Also proposed is to relocate two garage doors from the north to the east on the existing 543 square foot, detached two-car garage. This application addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00237. The proposed total of 3,737 square feet, located on a 12,792 square foot lot, is 92% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Edwards-Abraham House designed by architect Thomas Nixon c. 1875.)

(Second concept review; action can be taken if sufficient information present. Project last reviewed November 19, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Applicant

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the Pearl Chase Society members were afraid this building would be destroyed by neglect. He asked whether the house would be eligible to be designated a City Landmark once it has been rehabilitated. [Staff responded it would meet the criteria to be landmarked once it is rehabilitated in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.]

Public comment closed at 3:21 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The building form should be simplified to be more compatible with the 1875 Eastlake Style (one of the Victorian era architectural styles) of architecture.
2. The addition, while supportable in size and scale, needs to be more compatible with the style of the original house in its form, articulation and roof line.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/1. (Veyna abstained. Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 316 W FIGUEROA ST**

R-4 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-212-024
 Application Number: MST2014-00565
 Owner: Darrel Leclair
 Architect: Pujo & Associates, Inc.

(Proposal for two-story additions and alterations to an existing 3-unit residential development on a 7,555 square foot parcel. The work at Unit 1 will attach it to Unit 2 with a two-story addition comprised of a 378 square foot 1-car garage/workshop and laundry on the ground floor and a 443 square foot Master suite on the second story, making the total size of Unit 1 1,861 square feet. Demolition of a 90 square foot rear porch and a new 53 lineal foot wood fence is also proposed. Two "as-built" sheds located within the interior setback will be removed from the west side of the property. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications including a fence and trellis that exceed the maximum allowable height, distance between buildings, to allow a conforming addition to an existing building that is non-conforming to the interior setback, and a proposed new window in the front setback. This residence is proposed to be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project last reviewed December 3, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:31 p.m.

Present: Alex Pujo, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:38 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines or the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance.
2. Provide foundation landscaping between the fence and pavement edge to screen the fence height.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Veyna abstained. Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:44 PM TO 3:49 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. **1125 ANACAPA ST** C-2 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-019
 Application Number: MST2014-00593
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to add a new SCE Transformer to be located on the city parking lot (#7) parcel adjacent to La Arcada Plaza/Art Museum and the Library. Additional work includes realignment of existing walkway, new planting, and addition of a new guardrail to an existing retaining wall (adjacent to La Arcada).)

(Fourth Concept Review. Action can be taken if sufficient information is present. Project was last reviewed on January 14, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:49 p.m.

Present: Scott Love, Library Services Manager
 Doug Campbell, Landscape Architect, Campbell & Campbell
 Regula Campbell, Architect, Campbell & Campbell
 Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented the proposed screening for the transformer is sufficient.

Public comment closed at 4:01 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted with comment and condition:

1. Appreciation was expressed for the applicant's work in pursuing a direction that provides an acceptable solution to alleviate the Commission's concerns.
2. Select the plant size for the maximum biomass per planter size.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/1/0. (Suding opposed as he does not agree with the location. Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:09 PM TO 4:14 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

7. **121 STATE ST** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00028
 Owner: Marc and Laurie Recordon
 Agent: Brooke Kelloway
 Business Name: Hotel Indigo

(Proposal to paint a temporary mural on the south elevation of an existing two-story building. The mural will remain on the building wall from March 7, 2015 through January 31, 2016. This mural has been reviewed by Visual Art in Public Places. A temporary mural had been previously approved at the same location on the building wall from January 25, 2014 through December 7, 2014.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Miki Garcia, Executive Director, Museum of Contemporary Art (MCA)
Brooke Kellaway, Associate Curator, MCA
Monika Molnar-Metzenthin, Director of Community Engagement, MCA

Public comment opened at 4:31 p.m.

1. Jennifer Kennedy, MCA Board member/Journalist, expressed support and commented on importance of having art by internationally known artists that bring notoriety to Santa Barbara and makes art more accessible to the public.
2. Josh Blumer, MCA Board member, expressed support and commented on the process and the applicant's willingness to work within the City's rules and guidelines to bring this type of art to the community and children.
3. Nathan Hayden, local artist, expressed support and commented on the unique opportunity for artists to work on a grand scale and for young people in the community to participate.
4. Ginny Brush, Santa Barbara County Arts Commission Executive Director, expressed support and commented that the proposal is thoughtful and strategic; and focuses on a variety of community engagement opportunities with local nonprofits, and serves as a link to the downtown cultural corridor and the nearby Funk Zone.
5. Jacquelyn Klein-Brown, MCA Board President, expressed support and commented that the proposal will engage the community and broaden community outreach. Visitors and residents of different backgrounds will be exposed to be further educated and exposed to culture.
6. Laurie Recordon, Hotel Indigo owner, expressed support and commented on the positive response from the community to the previously approved mural at this site.
7. Nathalie Gensac, Youth Interactive CEO, expressed support and commented that this project will involve at-risk youth in the community that will allow interaction with a world-class artist and to grow as artists.
8. Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked how this mural program fit into El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV). [Staff responded that the City has a greater flexibility with temporary art in public spaces.]

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of public correspondence from Laurie Recordon, principal owner of Hotel Indigo and board member of the Museum of Contemporary Art, expressing support for the project.

Public comment closed at 4:43 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted with the specific termination date of January 31, 2016, with comments:

1. Any future proposals at this location should be incorporated to fit within the architectural context.
2. This approval is specific to this building and location at this time.

Action: Drury/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comments: Staff is requested to provide findings that can be made in the future for similar proposals. Although some of the Commissioners have reservations as to the appropriateness of the nature of the proposed art within the EPV, others expressed enthusiasm and highlighted positive aspects of the project: It involves young people whose energy is diverted for use in a positive activity. The applicant has gone through the appropriate channels to receive an approval. The likelihood of similar projects emerging is unlikely based on the lack of proposals of this nature in the City's history.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 202 STATE ST

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-018
 Application Number: MST2015-00016
 Owner: Howe Family Partnership
 Applicant: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposal for exterior tenant improvements to an existing restaurant. Exterior alterations include new windows, awnings, and doors. Patio improvements include the removal of existing bar space and fireplace to accommodate for new plaster walls. Alterations to two existing wrought iron gates are also proposed.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Actual time: 5:07 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

Public comment opened at 5:18 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked if the building called for the preparation of a Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR) and commented that the lights on the building are only allowed in the City as temporary installations. [Staff responded that an HSSR that determined the building does not have historical significance was accepted by the Commission in 2005.]

Public comment closed at 5:19 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Agenda for details with comments:

1. The proposed red color to frame the entrance to the shop is acceptable.
2. Provide a more traditional fireplace design.
3. Provide a more traditional pergola design.
4. The proposed white wash terracotta pot is acceptable.
5. All other aspects of the proposal are acceptable.

Action: Shallanberger/Drury, 7/0/0. (Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**9. 215 E FIGUEROA ST**

R-O Zone

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-037
 Application Number: MST2015-00026
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Michael Wiltshire, Supervising Engineer

(Proposal to place a new decorative statue designed by Bud Bottoms located in the front of the Police Station, along the Figueroa Street entrance. The statue will be a memorial for fallen Santa Barbara Police officers. This statue has been reviewed by Visual Art in Public Places.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Actual time: 5:33 p.m.

Present: Michael Claytor, Police Officer
 Bradley Klinzing, Project Engineer
 Riley Harwood, Sergeant

Public comment opened at 5:46 p.m.

Ginny Brush, Santa Barbara County Arts Commission, spoke in support and stated that the proposal was reviewed by the Arts Advisory VAPP Committee and comments/suggestions were given, recognizing the importance of this project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked what would happen to the proposed sculpture if the building is remodeled in the future or if the police station is moved to a different site. He also asked if the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines give provision for statues. [Officer Harwood responded that the statue can be moved, if necessary.]

Public comment closed at 5:48 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks with comments:

1. The applicant is commended for the efforts to bring this project to life for the benefit of the community.
2. It was suggested that the police officer be made larger with his head better proportioned to his body.
3. The current Police Station sign is not appropriate in its relationship to the proposed sculpture or the building's architecture. It was recommended that it either be moved to be opposite side of the sculpture or moved to not conflict with the sculpture.
4. A different material other than the black granite should be used. Porphyry stone in dark terracotta (brownish red) was suggested.
5. It was suggested that individual plaques be used to recognize each officer.
6. Show on the plans how the sculpture will be lit. Consider downlighting the sculpture from the adjacent tree.
7. The proposal shall meet the Tree Protection Measures as shown in the HLC Conditions of Approval dated January 28, 2015.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Orías/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONSENT AGENDA (1:00 P.M.)

Consent Agenda was reviewed by Philip Suding.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 1035 ORILLA DEL MAR DR****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-322-013
Application Number: MST2014-00187
Owner: Schulz Living Trust
Architect: Vadim Hsu Architect

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to replace existing windows with Milgard Ultra wood clad, and replaced exterior doors with TM Cobb Wood Panel, and replace roof with GAF, Timberline Ultra HD, "Charcoal" color. Alterations to front yard landscaping are also proposed. This multifamily residential building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Review After Final to alter front yard landscaping.)

Actual Time: 1:02 p.m.

Present: Jesse Walz, Channel Coast Corporation

Final Approval of Review After Final with comment and condition:

1. The proposed location and dimension of the hedge is acceptable.
2. Substitute the *Ficus nitida* (Indian Laurel Fig) hedge with one of the following options in a 5-gallon size: a.) *Myrsine africana* (Cape Myrtle); b) *Buxus microphylla japonica* (Green Beauty); or c) *Rosmarinus officinalis* (Tuscan Blue).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:04 PM ****