



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, December 17, 2014 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías (until 6:00 p.m.), Shallanberger (1:37 p.m. to 5:00 p.m.), Sharpe, and Suding.

Members absent: Winick.

Others present: Sheila Lodge, Planning Commission Liaison (until 4:25 p.m.)

Staff present: Limón (until 2:46 p.m. and again 5:17 p.m. to 5:50 p.m.), Hernández (until 5:00 p.m.), Kaufman, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 3, 2014.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 3, 2014, with corrections.

Action: Mahan/Sharpe, 4/0/3. (Drury/La Voie/Murray abstained. Shallenberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Agenda as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Mahan abstained from Item A, 107 Jorgensen Lane. Shallenberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman made the following announcements:

- a) The next HLC meeting regularly scheduled for December 31 was cancelled due to the holiday.
- b) Commissioner Winick would be absent and Commissioner Murray would be stepping down on Item 6, 1320 Olive Street.
- c) Commissioners Orías and La Voie were reappointed to the Historic Landmarks Commission. Julio Juan Veyna was appointed to the Historic Landmarks Commission.
- d) The Planning and Zoning offices will be closed December 24, 2014, through January 4, 2015. The appeal period for today's HLC hearing has been extended to 4:30 p.m. on Monday, January 5th due to holiday closure.
- e) Today is Commissioner Sharpe's final HLC hearing.

2. Commissioner Orías extended congratulations and expressed appreciation for the Pearl Chase Society's undertaking the task of watering the Italian Stone Pine Landmark Trees located on E. Anapamu Street.

3. Chair Suding read a note from Susette Naylor, past HLC member and chair, with respect to Donald Sharpe's contribution as a member of the Historic Landmarks Commission for his "experience, knowledge and gentle humor." Mr. Limón presented and read a certificate of recognition, narrating Mr. Sharpe's career and outstanding community service within the city of Santa Barbara.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

Appointment was made to fill the following vacancy:

- **HLC Consent Agenda:** Commissioner Bill Mahan (Architecture).

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. **316 W FIGUEROA ST** R-4 Zone
 (1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-212-024
 Application Number: MST2014-00565
 Owner: Darrel Leclair
 Architect: Pujo & Associates, Inc.

(Recommendation to consider adding the c. 1905, Queen Anne Free Classic house to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it was found to be eligible as a Structure of Merit in the Historic Structures/Sites Report that was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on December 3, 2014.)

Actual time: 1:43 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Historic Structures/Sites Report found that the property meets criteria D and E to qualify as a Structure of Merit. Staff recommends that the property be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Public comment opened at 1:44 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To add the structure located at 316 W. Figueroa Street on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it was found to be eligible for Structure of Merit designation.

Action: Orías/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. **1118 E CABRILLO BLVD** P-R/SD-3 Zone
 (1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-353-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00248
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jill Zachary
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer, Inc.

(This is a City Structure of Merit: Cabrillo Pavilion and Stoa. The proposal includes facade repair/renovation, and changes to existing windows and doors, structural upgrades, and upgrading of mechanical, plumbing and electrical systems. Also proposed are site improvements including: improvements to meet accessibility (ADA) requirements, restoration of the beach level promenade, installation of a boardwalk connecting the promenade to the beach, installation of a walkway along the west parking lot, renovation of site landscaping, addition of new outdoor showers, replacement of playground equipment, restoration of the stoa (covered walkway), removal of approximately 16 trees, relocating approximately 32 trees, and 8 new trees, enlargement of the trash enclosure, and addition of a mechanical equipment enclosure. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Review of Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone/Dudek.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Staff comments: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to this property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. The Case Planner, Allison De Busk, requests that Section 11.0 in Residual Impacts on page 18 be revised to state "Less than significant impacts would be further reduced with implementation of the recommended action in Section 10.0."

Motion: To accept the report with the requested amendment to Section 11.0 on page 18.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. CITYWIDE

P-R Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-060-017
 Application Number: MST2014-00485
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Engineer: Ashleigh Shue

(Proposal to modify five (5) existing pedestrian crosswalks locations with new enhanced pedestrian crossing safety features. Enhancements vary by site but include curb extensions, new and replaced sidewalk and paving, median refuge islands, new and replaced street lighting poles, and pedestrian crossing, push-button, dual-sided rectangular rapid flashing beacons. The intersections locations include (1) Cabrillo Boulevard at Anacapa Street, (2) Cabrillo Boulevard at Corona Del Mar, (3) State Street at Islay Street, (4) State Street at Pedregosa Street, and (5) State Street at Calle Palo Colorado Streets. The first four intersections are within the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) jurisdiction, and location number five is within the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) jurisdiction.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed October 8, 2014.)

Actual time: 1:48 p.m.

Present: Ashleigh Shue and Andrew Grubb, Project Engineers, Public Works
 Derrick Bailey, Supervising Transportation Engineer

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with the addition of street "furniture" such as pedestrian activated flashers that look too modern. It was his opinion that the proposed streetlights with mast arms do not belong in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely for details with comments:

1. With respect to Cabrillo Boulevard at Anacapa Street, Option 2 (flashing lights and no island) is acceptable on the basis that it provides the least impact on the resource.
2. The other locations under the HLC purview are acceptable; namely, Cabrillo Boulevard at Corona Del Mar, State Street at Islay Street, and State Street at Pedregosa Street.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 6/2/0. (Orías/Suding opposed. Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual comments:

- Commissioner Orías was opposed to the motion because she wanted to see the proposals for the other three locations before approving them, and not just the Cabrillo Blvd. at Anacapa Street applicant presentation. She clarified that she preferred Option 2 for the latter.
- Chair Suding was opposed to the motion because he believes curb extensions do not retain the historic character of Cabrillo Blvd.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 1125 ANACAPA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-019
 Application Number: MST2014-00593
 Museum Owner: County of Santa Barbara
 Library Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to add a new SCE Transformer to be located on the city parking lot (#7) parcel adjacent to La Arcada Plaza/Art Museum and the Library. Additional work includes realignment of existing walkway, new planting, add a new decorative fence to screen the transformer, and add a new guardrail to an existing retaining wall (adjacent to La Arcada).)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is available. Project was last reviewed on December 3, 2014.)

Actual time: 2:46 p.m.

Present: Douglas Campbell, Landscape Architect, Campbell & Campbell
 Irene Macías, Library Department Director
 Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 2:53 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed support for the revised proposal.

Public comment closed at 2:53 p.m.

Failed

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 3/3/2. (Orías/Sharpe/Suding opposed. La Voie/Murray abstained. Winick absent.) Motion failed.

Substitute

Motion: Continued four weeks for applicant to return with a design that makes the transformer look like something else at the same proposed location.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 6/1/1. (Suding opposed. Murray abstained. Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual comment:

- Staff shall provide the Commission with the final conditions of approval for the November 20, 2014, Planning Commission meeting.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 1130 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-020
 Application Number: MST2013-00237
 Owner: County of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Kupiec Architects PC
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Museum of Art

(Proposed addition and alterations to the Santa Barbara Museum of Art consisting of a 7,944 net new square foot one- and two-story addition (primarily within the existing building volume) and the renovation of an existing four-story 64,511 net square foot building. Also proposed is a new approximately 1,420 unenclosed square feet public rooftop pavilion, garden and terrace area with associated access elevator and stairway, new rooftop mechanical equipment and skylights. A new art receiving facility will add 402 square feet to the building footprint and a 5-foot long low curb wall at the northerly corner of the building will encroach onto City Central Library grounds. Miscellaneous site structure demolition will occur to support implementation of the proposed design. Two oak trees are proposed for removal with replacement of one oak tree on site and two others off site. A new electrical power transformer would be located on City property at Public Parking Lot No. 7. The net new square feet of new floor area will result in 72,455 net square feet of development. Construction staging would occur on the adjacent City library property. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Santa Barbara Museum of Art.")

(Request for Project Design Approval. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 029-14. The project was last reviewed on June 18, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Robert Kupiec, Architect, Kupiec Architects
 Derrik Eichelberger, ASLA, Arcadia Studio
 Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS
 Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the landscape and expressed concern with the towers and that he would prefer ones that fit better with the Italian Renaissance style of the original design. He also expressed concern with the visibility of the four-story pavilion and commented that the proposed roof garden does not tie in with the style of the building.

Public comment closed at 3:33 p.m.

A motion was made by Commissioner Drury to continue the project's review in four weeks and seconded by Commissioner Sharpe. Upon further conversation, there was insufficient action on the first motion and a substitute motion was made instead.

Substitute

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The size, bulk and scale and configuration of the building are acceptable.
2. Restudy the east entrance so that it looks more important and traditional to make it looks like one that would belong at a museum.
3. An overall simplification of the arch does not work, specially the Art Receiving Facility. Provide detailing for better assessment.
4. Resolve copper roof versus clay tile roof for use within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. A possible solution may be a lower pitch roof that essentially disappears.
5. The light fixtures are too modern. Provide cut sheet or actual fixtures of proposed lighting.
6. Sheet A3.2 better conveys the intent than the renderings do.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 7/1/0. (La Voie opposed. Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual comments:

- Staff shall provide the Commission with the final conditions of approval for the November 20, 2014, Planning Commission meeting.

The appeal period ending Monday, January 5, 2015, was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:09 PM TO 4:23 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 1320 OLIVE ST

R-3 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-034
 Application Number: MST2014-00569
 Owner: Brian McInerney
 Agent: Paul Zink

(Proposal for a new Average Unit Density (AUD) project involving the construction of a new 2,205 square foot, two-story duplex building, composed of a 730 square foot unit and a 675 square foot unit, with two attached, two-car garages (400 square feet each), located on an 8,123 square-foot parcel. The existing lot is developed with an existing, 1,785 square foot, one-story duplex, comprised of a 1,250 square foot unit and a 535 square foot unit. The proposal will result in a total of four residential units and will provide a total of four covered parking spaces and four covered bicycle parking spaces. Under base density a maximum of three (3) units are allowed, however under the Average Unit Density (AUD) Incentive Program the project proposes a total of four (4) units. The maximum allowed average unit size is 1,040 square feet; the proposed project average unit size is 797 square feet. The project proposes to demolish an existing two-car garage and shed, includes the removal of a 24" diameter bottle brush tree and an 8" diameter ornamental pear tree. The existing, 1,785 square-foot, one-story, duplex, located at the front of the parcel, will remain with no alterations. It is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District. This project addresses violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00356.)

(Comments only; requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 4:23 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect

Brian McInerney, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m.

Linda Martinez, adjacent neighbor, expressed concern with compromised privacy views, guidelines, and incompatibility with the Bungalow Haven neighborhood and character.

Janet Garufis, adjacent neighbor, expressed concern with the proposal's height that would impede light on to rooms in her home, and proposed cutting of the bottlebrush tree that currently creates screening between the adjacent property and hers, and loss of privacy in her backyard.

Graham Lyons, neighbor, expressed concerns as expressed in his written correspondence, including that the design should be complimentary to the historic neighborhood with homes traditionally orientated towards public streets, unlike the proposal that faces an alley.

Aaron Spechler, neighbor, expressed similar concerns to previous comments.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of public correspondence from Hiroaki Mukai and Mary Caroline Frost expressing concern with the project's incompatibility with the historic neighborhood and views from adjacent homes; Danny L. Poe expressing concern with the size of the proposal; and Mindy A. Wolfe/Graham Lyons, expressing concerns with the project's failure to meet the basic purpose of the Lower Riviera Special Design District Guidelines and requirements.

Public comment closed at 4:43 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposed addition should be more compatible with the architectural style of the existing building in the front.
2. Provide a solution that is more compatible with the Bungalow Haven Historic Neighborhood's character in size and density.
3. The square footage of the individual units is not in question. It is the overall massing, bulk and scale that were found to be problematic.

Action: Mahan/Oriás, 6/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Shallenberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual comment:

- Commissioner Drury suggested that attention be paid to the privacy concerns of the neighbor closer to Sola Street.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 1626 SANTA BARBARA ST**

R-3 Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-192-024
 Application Number: MST2014-00469
 Owner: Fulmer Family Trust
 Architect: Detlev Peikert

(Proposal to construct a new two-story attached 658 square foot, three-car garage with a 658 square foot residential unit above. The proposal includes the addition of a new one-story, 452 square foot master bedroom and an 88 square foot dining room to an existing single-family residence. The site is already developed with an existing, 2,156 square foot, two-story residence. The proposal will include a total of three-covered parking spaces and one-uncovered space. The proposed site development is 4,012 square feet, located on a 20,900 square foot lot. The proposal includes the relocation of the driveway and a new curb cut. This structure is a potential historic Structure of Merit.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer modifications are requested. Project last reviewed November 5, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:10 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect, Peikert Group Architects, LLP
 Bob and Pat Fulmer, Property Owners

Public comment opened at 5:18 p.m.

Jack Hewett, local resident, expressed support for the project.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of written correspondence from Craig Zimmerman, Douglas Hayes, and Larry Feinberg expressing support for the project.

Public comment closed at 5:25 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Appreciation was expressed for the owners' stewardship and care of this historic structure.
2. The project is ready for project design approval.
3. The architecture and design are appropriate for this historic resource, and no further historical analysis is required. The Historic Landmarks Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the Commission's analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
4. The addition's mass, bulk and scale are appropriate for the historic resource.
5. Study the circulation dimensions on the front hardscape. Minimize the amount of paving material and express the prioritization of the front entrance as the prime walkway to the house.
6. Amend the arborist report to address the proposed raised driveway and its impact to the existing Moreton Bay fig tree roots.
7. Staff is directed to begin the process of designating the site as a Structure of Merit.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual comments:

- As a mitigation for the garage facing the street, perhaps provide outriggers and the ability to plant a vine across the garage doors to make it look somewhat set back from the street. The proposed garage is supportable as the garage is trimmed nicely with lovely doors and subservient to the main house.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**8. 715 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00510
 Owner: Nancy Brock Trust
 Applicant: Don and Ra Disraeli, Kanaloa Seafood
 Architect: Michael Holliday, DMHA Architecture + Interior Design

(Proposal for Phase 2 tenant improvement including a change of use for the existing 1,956 square foot building from automotive to restaurant use for Kanaloa Seafood. The proposal includes 28 outdoor dining seats, 7 tables and umbrellas. Signage will be submitted under separate permit. Phase 1 site and parking improvements are being reviewed under a separate application (MST2014-00320).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on October 22, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:53 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect, DMHA
 Jerry Rocci, Project Manager, DMHA

Public comment opened at 6:03 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely for details with conditions:

1. Restudy the black steel planters.
2. The window on the south elevation facing Ortega Street should not have tile below it.

Action: Sharpe/Murray, 6/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**FINAL REVIEW****A. 107 JORGENSEN LN A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-110-037
 Application Number: MST2013-00515
 Owner: Leach Goodstein Family Trust
 Architect: Paul Poirier

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to construct a 584 square foot first-story addition, a 461 square foot basement, to attach the 458 square foot two-car garage to the dwelling and for approximately 75 cubic yards of cut grading to an existing single family dwelling. The existing 356 square foot accessory structure and 753 square foot of covered porches are proposed to remain. The proposed total of 3,632 square feet is 64% of the guidelines floor-to-lot area ration. This is a designated Structure of Merit: "Jorgensen Ranch House.")

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on July 2, 2014.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Actual Time: 11:00 a.m.

Present: Paul Poirier, Architect

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 232 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-009
 Application Number: MST2014-00579
 Owner: Council on Alcoholism & Drug Abuse
 Applicant: Synergy Development Services

(Proposal to install three new 4'-0" tall antennas and three new remote radio units within an existing faux chimney. The new antennas and equipment will not be visible.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Actual Time: 11:07 a.m.

Present: Ben Marcus, Synergy Development Services

Project Design and Final Approvals with the conditions that a notation on page A3 shall state that no new construction will occur impacting the exterior other than the addition of one antenna inside of the existing faux chimney.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:10 P.M. ****