



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, October 22, 2014**     **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**     **1:30 P.M.**

---

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*  
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*  
MICHAEL DRURY  
WILLIAM LA VOIE  
BILL MAHAN  
FERMINA MURRAY  
JUDY ORÍAS  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER  
DONALD SHARPE

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor  
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian  
MICHELLE BEDARD, Assistant Planner  
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician  
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos) then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members present: Shallenberger.

Staff present: Limón (at 1:34 p.m. until 2:05 p.m.), Hernández, Bedard (until 2:05 p.m.), Kaufman, and Feliciano.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 8, 2014, as presented.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Agenda.

**Motion:** Ratify the Consent Agenda as reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Orías/Winick, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Murray would be leaving by 5:30 p.m.
- b) Commissioner Shallanberger would be absent.
- c) The incorrect owner is listed on the agenda for 15 E. Cabrillo Blvd. The records for Case MST2010-00033 have been changed to show the owner as “Virginia Castagnola-Hunter Family Trust.

2. Commissioner Orías announced there would be a demolition of a building at 15 W. Mason Street. There is a plaque on the building that tells about the garage that was part of the Californian Hotel. She requested that the plaque, being relevant to the site, be saved and relocated on the new building.

3. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:

- a) Michelle Bedard, former HLC Planning Technician, has been promoted and this would be her last meeting.
- b) At the October 14, 2014, appeal hearing of the “gatorboy” as-built mural located at the back of the Cajun Kitchen restaurant, 901 Chapala Street, the City Council upheld the HLC decision for a one-year temporary installation.
- c) 100 Block of Cañón Perdido Street (Bike Corral): Derek Bailey, Supervising Transportation Engineer, has prepared a memo detailing safety improvements to the newly installed bike corral on the 100 block of Cañón Perdido Street. To ensure public safety, public works has determined the need to install two additional white steel bollards on both ends of the newly installed bike corral after a September 30, 2014, incident where a car presumably knocked down one of the hoop bike racks.

Peter Brown, Associate Transportation Planner/Mobility Coordinator, answered questions with respect to the proposed steel bollards and explained they have not been installed yet.

The Commission recommended that a six-inch diameter steel pipe, painted white, with a five inch finial be installed to make the design more compatible with El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and the surrounding historic setting. The proposed schematics will be placed on the Consent Agenda in two weeks for consideration.

- d) Italian Stone Pine Update: The Parks and Recreation Department has made improvements to the watering and maintenance practices for the Historic Doremus Stone Pines. Four dead trees on or near East Anapamu Street will be removed in late October with notification to surrounding residents.

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

1. **116 E VALERIO ST** R-3 Zone  
 (1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-191-012  
 Application Number: MST2014-00477  
 Owner: First Church of Christ, Scientist  
 Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to re-adopt a revised Resolution of Intention to set a new date to hold a Public Hearing on November 5, 2014, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the building located at 116-120 East Valerio Street known as the "First Church of Christ, Scientist." The public hearing originally scheduled for October 8, 2014, was postponed at the owner's request.)

Time: 1:58 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández stated that members of the church had requested a postponement of the previously scheduled HLC meeting. She met with the church committee, answered questions and provided further information. They are now ready to move forward.

**Motion:** To re-adopt Resolution 2014-09 of Intent to hold a Public Hearing on November 5, 2014, to consider recommending to City Council that the "First Church of Christ, Scientist", located at 116-120 E. Valerio Street, be designated a City Landmark.

Action: Winick/Oriás, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

2. **931 LAS ALTURAS RD** A-1 Zone  
 (1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-141-002  
 Application Number: MST2014-00478  
 Owner: Lynn Lincoln and Laurie Ashton  
 Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to re-adopt a revised Resolution of Intention to set a new date to hold a Public Hearing on November 5, 2014, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the building located at 931 Las Alturas Road known as "Mont Joie." The public hearing originally scheduled for October 8, 2014, was postponed at the owner's request.)

Time: 1:59 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández stated that the property owners had a family emergency that prevented them from attending the previously scheduled meeting. Since then, she has met with the owners and gave them more information about the designation.

- Motion:** To re-adopt Resolution 2014-10 of Intent to hold a Public Hearing on November 5, 2014, to consider recommending to City Council that the "Mont Joie", located at 931 Las Alturas Road, be designated a City Landmark.
- Action:** Murray/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

### **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

3. **3626 SAN REMO DR** E-3/SD-2 Zone  
 (1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011  
 Application Number: MST2013-00440  
 Owner: Nancy and Robert Madsen  
 Applicant: Capital Pacific Development Group  
 Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 3: Proposal to demolish an existing two-story, 2,907 square foot single-family dwelling and construct a new two-story, 2,767 square foot single-family dwelling and an attached 443 square foot garage. (The original four-lot subdivision project proposed a restoration of the dwelling at 3626 San Remo Drive. The proposal has been revised to demolish and reconstruct the dwelling because the existing building was structurally unstable, as per the engineering report.) The proposed development total of 3,210 square feet, located on a 14,810 square foot lot, is 74% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The front façade, which was found to be eligible as a Structure of Merit, would be reconstructed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction, as per the Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum prepared by Alexandra C. Cole of Preservation Planning Associates that was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on February 12, 2014. A Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole of Preservation Planning Associates was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission in March of 2010 for the subdivision of the property. This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

**(Project Design and Final Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 022-14. The project was last reviewed on October 8, 2014.)**

**Time:** 2:05 p.m.

**Present:** Kate Svensson, Designer, KSD  
 Robert Adams, Landscape Architect, Earthknower Studio  
 Vincent Amore, Applicant Representative, Capital Pacific

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

- Motion:** **Project Design and Final Approvals with the following conditions to be verified by Staff:**
1. The applicant is in compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 022-14.
  2. Adjust Detail 4 on page AD3.0 to show the cap extending in a random pattern over the gutter.
- Action:** La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

4. **125 STATE ST** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-012  
 Application Number: MST2009-00119  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Children's Museum of Santa Barbara  
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.  
 Architect: AB Design Architects and Planners

(The project includes a new 16,691 square foot, three-story building to be used as the Children's Museum of Santa Barbara with indoor and outdoor galleries, a courtyard, and roof terrace. The maximum building height would be 45 feet. The project also includes two uncovered parking spaces accessed from Kimberly Avenue and pedestrian access on the south side of the site connecting State Street and Kimberly Avenue. The proposal received a Final Community Priority Designation by City Council on October 25, 2011.)

**(Review After Final for the following revisions: 1. The addition of a new rooftop equipment room; 2. Proposed rooftop and exterior lighting; 3. Revised trash enclosure configuration to accommodate a transformer; 4. Door and window changes; 5. Updates to the exterior finish materials; and 6. Revised landscape planting and details. The project was last reviewed October 8, 2014.)**

Time: 2:21 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architects, AB Design Studio, Inc.  
 Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect, Van Atta Associates, Inc.  
 Ann Kale, Lighting Designer, Anne Kale Associates  
 Allison De Busk, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 2:38 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with the treatment of the big window in front, whether it will be covered, and if the inside of the building would be viewable through the window. He also questioned what impact it would have on State Street on occasion when the building is lit.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt and summarized the contents of a letter received from Christopher Kelly, Assistant General Attorney, Union Pacific Railroad, expressing concerns with respect to the at-grade rail crossing related to safety, increased traffic impact causing pedestrians/vehicular traffic to conflict with train operations, trespassing on to the railroad right-of-way, and noise/vibration impact of the 24-hour rail operation.

Public comment closed at 2:42 p.m.

**Motion: Approval of Review After Final with conditions to be verified by Staff:**

1. Revise the landscape plan as noted for the addition/relocation of a Palm tree.
2. The tile edge of the tower shall be staggered in a random pattern, three to five inches beyond the edge.
3. The chandelier light in the tower shall be enlarged to at least 32 inches.
4. The sconce cap shall be enlarged by two inches.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****5. 1118 E CABRILLO BLVD**

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-353-001  
 Application Number: MST2014-00248  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Jill Zachary  
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer, Inc.

(This is a City Structure of Merit: Cabrillo Pavilion and Stoa. The proposal includes façade repair/renovation, and changes to existing windows and doors, structural upgrades, and upgrading of mechanical, plumbing and electrical systems. Also proposed are site improvements including: improvements to meet accessibility (ADA) requirements, restoration of the beach level promenade, installation of a boardwalk connecting the promenade to the beach, installation of a walkway along the west parking lot, renovation of site landscaping, addition of new outdoor showers, replacement of playground equipment, restoration of the stoa (covered walkway), removal of approximately 16 trees, relocating approximately 32 trees, and 8 new trees, enlargement of the trash enclosure, and addition of a mechanical equipment enclosure. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

**(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit. The project was last reviewed on September 24, 2014.)**

Time: 2:59 p.m.

Present: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks & Recreation Director  
 Joe Wilcox and Mark McFarlin, Architects, KBZ Architects  
 Allison De Busk, Project Planner, Planning Division

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed appreciation for the rehabilitation of the original 1926 design of the building. He expressed concern with the front entrance on Cabrillo Blvd. and the need to balance the ADA ramp with retaining the building's symmetry. He also requested that the original light fixtures be retained.

Public comment closed at 3:23 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments:**

1. The proposed ironwork is appropriate to the architecture along with the hierarchy of the decoration.
2. The proposed replication and restoration of as many of the historic light fixtures as possible is much appreciated.
3. The recessed light fixtures for the stairways do not go with the style of the building. Perhaps smaller LED light fixtures would be acceptable as they would be less noticeable. Look to the San Ysidro Ranch wall wash step lights for inspiration.
4. Provide photometrics to better assess the need for the proposed amount of lighting on the site.
5. The north elevation symmetry would be more sympathetic to the architecture if it was simplified.

6. The proposed terrace enclosure is a good solution, although a wood enclosure would have been preferred.
7. The chamfer on the terrace enclosure should be greater the proposed ¾-inch and increased to as much as two inches.
8. Study the glass line of the second floor column to be pulled back to express the true depth of the column (instead of placement in the middle of the columns as proposed).
9. The columns should be restored to the historic/original color, and the pilasters should be a lighter color.
10. Address the problem of seagulls sitting on the terrace handrail.
11. **The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:**
  - a. **Compliance:** The project's design complies with all City regulations and is consistent with design guidelines.
  - b. **Compatibility:** The project's design is compatible with the architectural character of the City and neighborhood within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.
  - c. **Appropriateness:** The project's size, bulk, height and scale are appropriate for the building and neighborhood.
  - d. **Sensitivity:** The project's design is sensitive to this historic resource and the historic nature of the boulevard.
  - e. **Public views:** The proposed design does not block established public views of the mountains or ocean.
  - f. **Open Space/Landscaping:** The proposed design provides a generous amount of landscaping and open space.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual Commission comments:

- Provide a graphics file copy of the original drawings to be added to the City's landmark standards for light fixtures.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:44 P.M. TO 3:50 P.M. \*\***

**FINAL REVIEW / HISTORIC STRUCTURE REPORT****6. 920 SUMMIT RD**

A-2 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-211-009  
 Application Number: MST2005-00831  
 Owner: MCC BB Property, LLC  
 Applicant: Ty Warner Hotels and Resorts  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services  
 Business Name: Montecito Country Club

(Proposals for renovations to the Montecito Country Club. This proposal has been reduced in scope to the following: façade improvements to the existing clubhouse; a new 5,746 square foot golf cart storage building; a new 702 square foot storage and maintenance building; modify parking lot; relocate pool; modify pool support building; add a pool pavilion, 365 square foot snack shop, 555 square foot pool equipment room, splash pool, lap pool, whirlpool; sand volleyball court, bocce ball court; new patios, and landscaping. The clubhouse structure is eligible for Structure of Merit status and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. The project includes major grading with 192,000 cubic yards of cut and fill for recontouring, and renovation of an existing 18-hole golf course. Significant tree removals (252), tree relocations (43), and new trees (725) are proposed, with a net gain of 479 additional trees. The project received Planning Commission approval on September 10, 2009 (Resolution No. 035-09) for a Conditional Use Permit Amendment, Coastal Development Permit, and Development Plan Approval. Proposed development has been reduced by approximately 7,200 square feet from the approved project. The project involves the following Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 015-300-001, 015-300-002, 015-300-003, 009-091-014, 009-091-019, 009-091-020, 009-151-006, 009-151-007, 015-211-009, 015-211-010, and 015-280-014.)

Time: 3:50 p.m.

Present: Steven Welton, Senior Planner, SEPPS  
 Robert Yager, Senior Associate, Marsh & Associates  
 Bill Medel, Project Manager, Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts  
 Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio, Inc.  
 Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants  
 Allison De Busk, Project Planner, Planning Division

**a. HSSR (Review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)**

**Motion: To accept the addendum report as presented.**

Action: Murray/Orías, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**b. Project Final Review (Final Approval of the project is requested. Project received Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination on January 27, 2014, for reduced scope of work and requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 035-09. The project was last reviewed July 16, 2014.)**

Staff comments: Ms. De Busk explained that this project was incorrectly agendized as "Project Final Review," but it is for in-progress review only.



**Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:**

1. The change to the two lap pool locations is supportable. The layout is inventive.
2. The *allée* should end with a focal point.
3. The majority felt that the large pool area layout is too contemporary.
4. Restudy the use of two large palm trees in the center (“island”) of the large pool, as they interrupt the *allée*. Consider less bulky trees or rotating the island.
5. Study breaking up the staff building elevation differently, not with the nine square recesses that may tie in with the cart barn, but serve no purpose on this building.
6. The small pavilion (“sense of arrival building”) seems out of place and looks like a fragment. It should be designed to tie-in artistically and visually with the site. A trellis or more open garden structure may be a better solution.

Action: Mahan/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****7. 2012 ANACAPA ST**

E-1 Zone

(4:10) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-321-012  
 Application Number: MST2014-00096  
 Owner: Ethan Reece  
 Agent: Jarrett Gorin  
 Architect: Michelle McToldridge

(Proposal to demolish an 80 square foot shed structure and construct a 916 square foot, detached, two-story, accessory structure to include a 500 square foot, two-car garage, with a 416 square foot accessory room above the garage. The site is currently developed with an existing, 2,900 square foot, two-story residence, a 520 square foot, one-story residence, and a 285 square foot accessory structure to remain. The proposal will provide a total of three parking spaces to include two-covered and one-uncovered space. The proposed site development of 4,621 square feet, located on a 16,911 square foot lot, is 106% of the guideline floor-to-lot ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. This is a City Landmark: the Pearl Chase Residence.)

**(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer with Resolution No. 055-14. The project was last reviewed at HLC on June 4, 2014.)**

Time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Michelle McToldridge, Architect  
 Ethan Reece, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

Action: Sharpe/Orías, 7/0/1. (Suding abstained as he was not part of previous reviews. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****8. 715 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-008  
 Application Number: MST2014-00510  
 Owner: Nancy Brock Trust  
 Applicant: Don and Ra Disraeli  
 Architect: Michael Holliday

(Proposal for Phase 2 tenant improvement including a change of use for the existing 1,956 square foot building from automotive to restaurant use for Kanaloa Seafood. The proposal includes 28 outdoor dining seats, and 7 tables and umbrellas. Signage will be submitted under separate permit. Phase 1 site and parking improvements are being reviewed under a separate application (MST2014-00320).)

**(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires environmental assessment.)**

Time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect  
 Jerry Rocci, Project Manager

Staff comments: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, explained that this project was incorrectly agendized for Project Design Review, but it is for Concept Review only since this is a new proposal and environmental assessment is still required.

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m.

Wayne LaBrie, Architect, Lynx Property Management, spoke in support of the project.

Public comment closed at 4:52 p.m.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. The project's concept is supportable.
2. The adaptive reuse of the building is greatly appreciated.
3. The use of redwood-colored wood and the concept of a pergola are supportable.
4. The overuse of a metal trellis is problematic.
5. The window approach is too contemporary for El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Glass down to the ground/patio level would not be acceptable. A more traditional looking fenestration should be proposed.
6. There should be a tile cap on the parapet in some imaginative form.
7. Consider a storage area for outside furniture.
8. Propose a design for outside heaters if they are to be used.
9. The landscaping and perimeter walls should create a sense of unity amongst all buildings, including those that are not part of this application.

Action: Sharpe/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONSENT AGENDA (11:00)****REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 15 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-111-012  
Application Number: MST2010-00033  
Owner: Virginia Castagnola-Hunter Trust  
Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects  
Engineer: Frank Cunningham  
Business Name: Lighthouse Restaurant

(The project consists of the partial demolition of an existing 142-seat restaurant building; construction of an approximately 1,020 square foot second story addition, 250 square foot second story balcony, and 150 square foot trash enclosure; remodel; and new creekside landscaping. The project is associated with the previously approved Cabrillo Bridge Replacement Project (MST2004-00878, PC Reso. 029-07), which includes demolition of 447 square feet of the restaurant building and the 350 square foot exterior patio over Mission Creek to facilitate replacement of the Cabrillo Bridge and to provide for Mission Creek flood control improvements.)

**(Review after final for the following revisions: 1. Removal of two (2) Kentia Palms within the front setback at the northeasterly corner and creekside landscaping alterations. 2. Temporary siding.)**

Present: Adam Hendel, Supervising Civil Engineer  
David Black, Landscape Architect  
Gabriel Zamora, Architect

**Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. Detail corners on tops and bottoms of temporary siding.
2. Use a board and batten treatment to give a more traditional marine look to the temporary siding. Battens may be 1x2, 1x3, or 1x4.
3. The paint colors for the temporary siding do not need to match the existing building color.
4. The Kentia Palms shall be stockpiled then replanted within twenty feet of their current location following completion of the Cabrillo Bridge project.

**Correction: Item was improperly agendized under application number MST2010-00033. Review After Final of the project changes was continued and will be placed on the November 5, 2014, agenda under the correct application number MST2004-00878.**

**CONTINUED ITEM**

**B. 34 W VICTORIA ST**

**C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016  
Application Number: MST2014-00330  
Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC  
Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Proposal to provide a new outdoor patio dining area for the Santa Barbara Public Market.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Jeff Hornbuckle, Architect

**Continued two weeks to Consent with the comment that the applicant shall coordinate with the Consent Agenda reviewer and propose a more traditional design.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:13 P.M. \*\***