



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 23, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie (at 1:38 p.m.), Mahan, Orías, Shallanberger (at 2:22 p.m. until 3:29 p.m.), Sharpe, Suding, and Winick (until 3:29 p.m.).

Members absent: Murray.

Planning Commission
Member present: Lodge.

Staff present: Limón (until 1:50 p.m.), Hernández and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Sheila Lodge, local resident, commented on the August 12, 1974, Advisory Landmarks Committee minutes with respect to a structure that used to be known as the Commercial and Farmers National Bank (now the location for the Rabobank at Carrillo and Anacapa Streets). The members included Pearl Chase, Peter Edwards, David Gebhard, Marie O. Riggs, and John Woodward. Mr. Gebhard was quoted as saying that “he would like to see a building that strongly suggests Santa Barbara, specifically as a place, and that takes into account the element of scale. This building does not convey the specificity of

Santa Barbara, the basic esthetics are not Santa Barbara, and does not convey a sense of scale, especially in relationship to the little town club. The mass should be broken up.” Ms. Lodge mentioned that the building design of what was actually constructed does not reflect those comments. She gave this building as an example to not “give in” to the pressure of approving projects because the buildings are going to be around for a long time. She stressed the importance of the Historic Landmark Commission’s careful review and collaborative decisions that make Santa Barbara such a special place.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 9, 2014.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 9, 2014, with amendments.

Action: Drury/Winick, 6/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Commissioner Orías requested a response to Wanda Livernois’ concerns at the last meeting with respect to the 720 De La Vina Street project.

- Chair Suding reported that he, along with Commissioners Drury and Winick, went on a site visit of the project. They reported back to Staff what they found. The neighborhood is in a C-2 zone although it reads more as a residential neighborhood. Although the wall of the new project stepped down a bit to allow sunlight and air into the adjacent building to the south, it is very close since the neighboring home is right on the property line. Staff met with the building inspectors and concluded the walls are being built per the approved plans.
- Mr. Limón stated this experience provides a good lesson: The review of the project did not consider the adjacent property. There could be more consideration in the future regardless of zoning. Commissioner Winick suggested this project calls for the need of more site visits.
- Commissioner Drury questioned whether more relief could be allowed between the buildings since the wall of the new construction is touching the eave of the residence to the south. Mr. Limón responded that adjustments to new construction could be made at the request of adjoining neighbors during the design review phase of a project, but at this point it would not be possible for the buildings in question.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Orías/Winick, 7/0/0. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Hernández announced that Commissioner Murray would be absent from the meeting and Commissioner Winick would be leaving by 3:30 p.m.
2. Mr. Limón made an announcement regarding outdoor patio furniture, including appropriate heater and umbrella styles. Staff suggested a subcommittee be formed to review these types of applications or come up with acceptable standards that are appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Commissioner Orías recommended El Paseo Restaurant as a starting point as well as looking into other locales to have multiple exemplary choices. Commissioners Sharpe and Winick volunteered to form part of the *ad hoc* subcommittee.

3. Commissioner Drury commented on the installation of square concrete bollards in front of the County Bowl. He questioned whether they were approved since he did not recall the HLC reviewing them. Mr. Limón pointed out that it is a County facility and responded that Staff will research whether the Architectural Board of Review had purview over the review of the bollards.
4. Commissioner La Voie pointed out the difficulty in finding parking as a Historic Landmarks Commission volunteer before the start of meetings. (Although there are at least nine parking spaces assigned on Wednesdays for HLC members, they are occupied by non-members.) Mr. Limón agreed to look into it and a solution will be strategized.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioners Drury and Sharpe reported that they met at the Lobero Theater with La Entrada de Santa Bárbara project applicant team to view the lighting mock-up. The use of the proposed gobos is a very fine line between gentle illumination and advertisement. They suggested that lighting the flora in the courtyard would be enough patterning on the wall rather than a formal Moorish design. The concern is that the HLC may set a precedent since there are other buildings downtown projecting huge unpermitted signs on a wall and sidewalk.

CONTINUED ITEM

1. **1936 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001
 Application Number: SGN2013-00142
 Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation
 Architect: Kirk Gradin
 Business Name: 7-Eleven
 Business Name: Subway

(Proposal for a new sign application for a proposed new building with two commercial tenants for a Subway and 7-Eleven store. Signage will include a total of 31.8 square feet, to include 16.5 square feet for the 7-Eleven, and 15.3 square feet for the Subway. The signage includes: a 9.8 square foot, externally-illuminated metal monument ground sign (Sign A), a 3.8 square foot wall sign with reverse illuminated channel letters (Sign B), a 3.2 square foot wall sign with reverse illuminated channel letters (Sign C), a 4.0 square foot externally-illuminated blade sign (Sign D), a 3.8 square foot wall sign with reverse illuminated channel letters (Sign E), a 3.2 square foot wall sign with reverse illuminated channel letters (Sign F), and a 4.0 square foot blade sign externally-illuminated (Sign G). The exterior building lighting was approved under the application approved by HLC (MST2011-00167).)

(The sign application was reviewed by the Sign Committee on April 9, 2014. The project was referred to HLC by Planning Staff to request a final determination of the monument sign (Sign A).)

Time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect
 Christopher Gilliland, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m.

Milton Hess, Upper East Association member, commented that the site is at the entry to the outer State Street parkway and near the proposed Mission Gardens Historic District. He requested that the signage not detract further from the appearance of the intersection.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on access to the businesses and sufficient parking for the fast food establishments. He also commented on the importance of the corner and whether a modification of the logos could be considered by the tenants to make the signs look more like they belong in Santa Barbara and less like a common shopping mall sign.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The proposed ground sign is not supportable. The sign is too large and tall for placement at the corner.
2. Signage placement in proximity to either of the two driveway entrances may be more appropriate.
3. The ramp option as shown is not supportable.
4. Look at the original location of the steps as a solution. That location placement off of the State Street sidewalk is important to the architecture. Study other solutions, such as placing it at the corner.
5. Study a second set of stairs combining the original location and the one presented off of the Mission Street sidewalk.

Action: Mahan/Winick, 7/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 920 SUMMIT RD

A-2 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-211-009
 Application Number: MST2005-00831
 Owner: MCC BB Property, LLC
 Applicant: Ty Warner Hotels and Resorts
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting
 Architect: David Van Hoy
 Business Name: Montecito Country Club

(Proposals for renovations to the Montecito Country Club. This proposal has been reduced in scope to the following: facade improvements to the existing clubhouse; a new 5,746 square foot golf cart storage building; a new 702 square foot storage and maintenance building; modify parking lot; relocate pool; modify pool support building; add a pool pavilion, 365 square foot snack shop, 555 square foot pool equipment room, splash pool, lap pool, whirlpool; sand volleyball court, bocce ball court; new patios, and landscaping. The clubhouse structure is eligible for Structure of Merit status and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. The project includes major grading with 192,000 cubic yards of cut and fill for recontouring, and renovation of an existing 18-hole golf course. Significant tree removals (252), tree relocations (43), and new trees (725) are proposed, with a net gain of 479 additional trees. The project received Planning Commission approval on 9/10/09 (Resolution No. 035-09) for a Conditional Use Permit Amendment, Coastal Development Permit, and Development Plan Approval. Proposed development has been reduced by approximately 7,200 square feet from the approved project. The project involves the following Assessor Parcel Numbers: 015-300-001, 015-300-002, 015-300-003, 009-091-014, 009-091-019, 009-091-020, 009-151-006, 009-151-007, 015-211-009, 015-211-010, and 015-280-014.)

(Project Design Approval requested. Project requires Substantial Conformance Determination and requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 035-09. The project was last reviewed by HLC on January 15, 2014.)

Time: 2:26 p.m.

Present: Steven Welton, Senior Planner, SEPPS
Ken Alperstein, Landscape Architect, Pinnacle Design Company
Robert Yager, Senior Associate, Marsh & Associates
Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio, Inc.
Bill Medel, Project Manager, Ty Warner Hotels and Resorts
Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates
Allison De Busk, Project Planner

Commissioner Winick disclosed that, although he was not present at the last review, he reviewed the video and minutes.

Public comment opened at 2:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commended the flat roof solution. He provided photographs of cottages with flat roofs by the same designer as examples. In his point of view the proposed flat roof would help tie into the main building's architecture and be referential to the work of Bertram Goodhue.

Public comment closed at 2:49 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission's comments are based on the 8 ½ x 11 elevations and 11x17 plans shown during the hearing.
2. The hip roof helps with the requested roof breakup.
3. The design's simplicity is appreciated.
4. The pool house and snack shack are nicely designed. The window size as shown on the plans should be clarified.
5. The proposed awning colors in tan and black are appropriate.
6. The flat roof solution is preferred with a cool grey roof.
7. Applicant shall consider how access to the roof will be treated.
8. Provide a sample of the material and photographs from Summit and Rometto Roads looking at the cart barn to show the impact of the proposed flat roof from the houses above.
9. Provide some variation in the parapets. Study Bertram Goodhue's design of parapets for inspiration.
10. The proposed pole light and uplighting are inappropriate to the neighborhood and site.
11. Study buttresses to be more traditional.
12. An open fenestration with spindles is very appropriate to the style of architecture as wells as for ventilation.
13. Demonstrate that the plant palette is water-wise.

Action: Winick/Drury, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:20 PM TO 3:29 PM ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**3. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

E-1 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00116
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates, Inc.

(Review of the Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Time: 3:29 p.m.

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants
 Suzanne Elledge, Agent, SEPPS
 Daniel Gullett, Project Planner

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, commented that Staff reviewed the report and supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA. There are some concerns about the compatibility of the steel trees and decking, but staff feels this is a design review issue rather than a CEQA issue. The drawings are conceptual; therefore, the report refers to the possible need for addendums to be prepared as the final details are worked out to determine whether they meet CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on written comments he submitted in advance. He requested they be considered for amendments to the HSSR. He pointed out Lockwood de Forest's contributions should be included and offered to do further research. He inquired about the tile that Elizabeth de Forest gave to the museum around 1980 (Figure 19 in the report, located at the water fountain) and what significance they have today since they were not part of the "period of significance." He asked if the redoing of the restrooms will affect the water fountain. He asked if historical research has been done for the now Woodland Court property with respect to the original location of the cottages.

Public comment closed at 3:34 p.m.

In response to public comment, Dr. Post stated that most of Mr. de Forest's inquiries were addressed in the Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report. Ms. Elledge pointed out that the Phase 1 Report was accepted by the Commission in August of 2012.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with the condition that the City Historian shall address the suggested corrections although they do not affect the conclusions of the report.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/0. (Murray/Shallanberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

E-1 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00116
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates, Inc.

(Proposed Master Plan for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History to carry out the following improvements anticipated in the next 15 years: improved accessibility and ADA compliance; full renovations to the Marine Paleo Exhibit Hall and restrooms, including an 82 square foot addition; replacement of the butterfly exhibit; rehabilitation of Gould Hall; relocation of trash and recycling; new fencing; enhancements to existing outdoor activity areas; landscape improvements; native habitat restoration; mechanical equipment upgrades; and interior repairs to existing buildings. The project includes Planning Commission review and annexation of parcels 023-250-039, -066, and -068.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment, Planning Commission and City Council review.)

Time: 3:58 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Agent, SEPPS
 Luke Swetland, President and CEO
 Walter Schacht, Architect, Schacht Aslani Architects
 Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect, Van Atta Associates, Inc.
 Susette Naylor, Architect, Thompson Naylor

Public comment opened at 4:39 p.m.

Virgina Guess, local resident and SBMNH member, spoke in support of the proposal.

Public comment closed at 4:41 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. This is what Santa Barbara is about: taking precious architectural resources, recycling and improving them. The concept is wonderful and supportable. The stewardship environmentally, historically and structurally is appreciated.
2. This Master Plan is superb and supportable. The project scope has great merit.
3. The Compatibility Analysis criteria are ready to be made.
4. The Commission would like to be involved and kept informed as the project progresses as a way to supplement the Urban Historian's review/approval of any changes to the plan that may require addendums to the HSSR for CEQA review.
5. The new deck and handrails need further study to be sympathetic to the site: The detailing, materials, handrails, and how the existing asphalt (that is to remain) will be hidden are of concern. Study making the deck look less of an alien feature and made to be more as part of the site.
6. Details of the butterfly exhibit need further development; i.e., the sandstone entry and exit structures.
7. Study making the butterfly exhibit more natural in its form and appearance.

8. Restudy the metal tree form of the netting support at the butterfly exhibit that may not need to or want to emulate a tree. Perhaps it should look like what it is intended to be (that is, for support) rather than artificial trees.
9. Study the new window on the Marine Paleo Exhibit Hall west elevation to be more traditional in its size and composition: The detail where the window was recessed would be more appropriate if the stucco is curved under. It would also be more successful if the window was the full width of the opening.
10. The awnings should be larger.
11. Study the sandstone wall north of the butterfly exhibit on Sheet A-5.12 as it may need to be more sympathetic to the Spanish building behind.
12. Study the connection of the delivery drop-off area to the main entrance through the stegosaurus wall, including the paving area.
13. Study the end treatment of penetration of the stegosaurus wall.
14. Study whether the complete historic (stegosaurus) wall can be retained.

Action: Sharpe/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Murray/Shallanberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW

A. **613 E VICTORIA ST**

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-093-015
 Application Number: MST2013-00338
 Owner: Giegerich-Polchin Family Trust
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for a 219 square foot ground floor addition, and a new 120 square foot trellis to the rear of an existing 965 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, with a detached, 251 square foot, one-car garage. Also proposed is to permit an "as-built" wall ranging from 3'-6" to 5'-8" in height. Other alterations will address violations identified in ZIR2002-00154, which include to demolish an unpermitted addition, relocate the water heater and to remove a trellis. The proposed project total of 1,435 square feet, located on a 4,500 square foot lot, is 62% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested for zoning modifications. This is a contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District.)

(Project Design and Final Approval requested. The project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 079-13. The project was last reviewed by HLC on September 25, 2013.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 1129 STATE ST A****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
Application Number: MST2014-00176
Owner: 1129 State Street
Applicant: Jaime Heer
Agent: Jones Design Landscape
Business Name: Armada Wine & Beer Merchant

(Proposal to provide a new 261 square foot outdoor patio area, to serve as a new tasting patio for the Armada Wine & Beer Merchants tenant, located within an existing covered paseo. The proposal will include new tables and chairs, and the area will be enclosed by ten (10) new 40" x 18" planters and plantings to reach but not exceed 48" in height.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:11 P.M. ****