



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 26, 2014 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie (at 1:35 p.m.), Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger (at 1:48 p.m.), Sharpe, and Suding (until 3:09 p.m. and again at 3:22 p.m.).

Members absent: Winick.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:30 p.m. and again at 3:30 p.m.), Hernández, Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 12, 2014.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 12, 2014, with corrections; with the exception of Item 9, which was tabled to a later time.

Action: Murray/Mahan, 6/0/2. (Drury/La Voie abstained. Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Item 9 on the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 12, 2014, with corrections.

Action: Murray/Mahan, 6/2/0. (Drury/La Voie opposed. Winick absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Agenda.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. (Suding abstained from Item D at 9 W. Haley Street. Winick absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commission Winick would be absent from the meeting.
2. Ms. Hernández, Urban, Historian, announced that Staff is aware of a proposed City plaque placement at the base of a tree located near the Santa Barbara Mission. The design of the plaques dedicating trees in people's honor was approved in 2010 (known as the Commemorative Tree Plaque sponsored by Santa Barbara Beautiful and designed by former HLC Commissioner Steve Hausz). Mr. Limón explained that the plaque program has been in existence for quite some time. There are different types of recognitions and placements throughout the City. At the time of approval, it was with the understanding that every plaque location does not have to reviewed and approved by the HLC. Even so, Staff agreed on updating the Commission as to the exact placement of the plaque in question.
3. Commissioner Orías requested an update on the action plan for the preservation of the Italian Stone Pine Landmark Trees located on E. Anapamu Street, and the proposed fence at the Garden Street Academy. Staff agreed to follow up.

Commissioner Shallenberger noted that the recently planted replacement Stone Pine located at the corner of Garden and Anapamu Streets needs to be watched so that it does not die as well.

4. Mr. Limón announced the following:
 - a. There will be staff changes beginning next month. Susan Gantz will staff the Architectural Board of Review and Michelle Bedard will staff the Historic Landmarks Commission.
The Commission expressed appreciation for Ms. Gantz's work with the HLC during the last nine and one-half years.
 - b. Staff will work towards implementing the Commission's request that applicants provide one full scale plan and three half scale plans for the HLC to review during the meeting.
 - c. Multiple copies of previous meeting minutes will be provided to the Commission at the beginning of a project's review. Traditionally it has only been given to the Chair.
5. Chair Suding announced he would be stepping out at 2:30 p.m. for a short time.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. DRAFT HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL STYLES GUIDE**

(1:45) Application Number: MST2014-00076

Staff: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Review and discussion of draft Historic Architectural Styles Guide of Santa Barbara that will be an appendix to the *Historic Resource Design Guidelines*. The final draft guide will be forwarded to the City Council for adoption once the entire document is completed.)

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the Historic Architectural Styles Guide was drawn and designed by Anthony Grumbine at Harrison Design Associates. In 2013, Mr. Grumbine gave the HLC a presentation on the guide. Since then, Staff has been working with the HLC Historic Resource Design Guidelines Subcommittee to complete the Style Guide that will serve as an appendix to the Historic Resource Design Guidelines. The Style Guide final draft is before the HLC for review and comments.

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the document should state that it only presents a selection of architectural styles in Santa Barbara. The title of the guide gives the impression that there are no other important architectural styles in the City. He expressed concern that there is no reference of Adobe or Modern Adobe, California Ranch, and International or Streamline Moderne styles.

Public comment closed at 2:05 p.m.

In response to public comment, Staff explained that, when the document was being prepared, over 20 styles were identified in the City. It is a work in progress and the idea is to expand into more styles as time permits with volunteer participation and the HLC Historic Resource Guidelines Subcommittee's assistance. At the Commission's suggestion, a statement will be added to the document that other styles will be added later.

Commission comments:

1. Appreciation was expressed for the author's and City staff's work on this document.
2. Add a statement to the document that discloses it is a work in progress and indicating how it relates to El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
3. Ultimately include other architectural styles, such as Adobe, Monterey, and Moderne, etc.
4. Change the font on each style's introduction to be black on a white background for easy visibility instead of the brown-colored box.
5. Under the history for the Italianate style (page 2), the year should be corrected to read "because until 1872, Stearns Wharf had not been built."

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 0 BLK W MASON ST (2096 SEG ID)**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
 Application Number: MST2010-00261
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Linda Sumansky

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 24.4 feet and the new road bed width will be 28 feet. Overall existing bridge width is 33.4 feet and is proposed to be 49.5 feet.)

(Review After Final for new pad-mounted electrical transformer. Referred up from the January 29, 2014, Consent Agenda.)

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Linda Sumansky, Principal Engineer
 John Ilasin, Project Engineer
 Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with comments:

1. The presentation's completeness and photo simulations are appreciated.
2. Option B is preferred.
3. The surrounding historic resources survey information should have been presented when the Mason Street Bridge project was reviewed and approved.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**3. 25 E MASON ST**

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-014
 Application Number: MST2014-00029
 Owner: East Mason SB, LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for tenant improvements to an existing 3-story building for offices and lab facilities, project consists of window and doors changes, new trash enclosure, EV charging, landscape alterations and exterior site improvements and reconfiguration to the parking lot including a new fence. No new square footage is proposed. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is eligible for listing on the California Register of Historic Properties.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project was last reviewed on January 29, 2014.)

Actual time: 2:36 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architect, AB Design Studio

Commissioner Drury stated that he reviewed the minutes and video of the previous review for the project.

Public comment opened at 2:44 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the fencing that does not comply with El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines with its mix of materials. He suggested wrought iron only.

Public comment closed at 2:45 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners could support the introduction of wood elements on the building (canopy and railing posts)? 2/6. (Drury/La Voie/Mahan/Murray/Orías/Sharpe opposed.)

How many Commissioners could accept the bike rack design as proposed? 5/3. (La Voie/Mahan/Sharpe opposed.) The majority of the Commission could initially support the proposed bike rack design since it is to be far from public view and an innovative program between the campuses.

After a brief discussion, members changed their vote to the majority opposing the bike rack design as proposed. 2/6. (Drury/La Voie/Mahan/Murray/Orías/Sharpe opposed.)

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The applicant's response to the Commission's previous comments is appreciated. The upgrades are a great improvement and the adaptive reuse is appreciated.
2. The landscape plan as presented is acceptable.
3. Restudy the gooseneck lamps so that they are more appropriate to the building style. It was suggested that something other than gooseneck lamps be used.
4. Restudy fence elements that are more appropriate to the building style.
5. Provide canopy details. The canopy and railing should be metal rather than wood so that they have more of a vernacular 1920s industrial feel.
6. Study a bike rack design that would be appropriate in all locations within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:09 PM TO 3:17 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 608 & 614 CHAPALA ST**

C-M Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-020
 Application Number: MST2013-00397
 Owner: Figueroa Investors, Ltd.
 Architect: elevenModern

(Proposal to infill 5,121 square feet under an existing roof area attached to a 20,579 square foot commercial building and to add a 187 square foot restroom addition to an existing 459 square foot detached commercial building. No change in use is proposed and no grading is required. This parcel is in the 50% parking Zone of Benefit and the parking requirement is 27 spaces, with 33 proposed. Total development on this 42,972 square foot parcel will be 27,762 square feet. This project requires Planning Commission review for a Development Plan. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is included in the State Historic Resources Inventory: "Former C & H Chevrolet constructed in 1946.")

(Continued Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on February 12, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Kip Bradley, Representing Ownership
 John Beauchamp, Architect, elevenModern
 Robin Donaldson, Representing Tenant
 Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner

Commissioner Drury stated that he reviewed the minutes and video of the previous review for the project.

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the unsuccessful attempt to "Hispanicize" the structure and requested that the Chapala Street side viewed by the public conform better to El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines. He questioned the type of signage proposed and when it will be addressed.

Staff clarified that because the project is listed on the Potential Historic Resources List for its mid-century modern style, it is permitted to approve projects that retain, restore and compliment the historic style rather than conform to El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.

Public comment closed at 3:32 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The applicant has responded successfully to previous Commission comments.
2. The owner keeping the building as one-story is appreciated.
3. The design as proposed is acceptable.
4. The awnings are appropriate to the façade.
5. The windows at the front yard area are acceptable as proposed.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 1220 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-020
Application Number: MST2014-00056
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Teri Green

(Proposal to replace all 13 existing light poles and fixtures (several are double-headed) in City Parking Lot #5 with new poles and LED fixtures. The new fixtures will be connected to existing circuits and the existing pole bases will be modified to accept the new poles.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the comment that future like projects will qualify for Administrative approval unless additional circumstances would require Consent review.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 128 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004
Application Number: MST2003-00243
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties, Ltd.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(This is a revised Project Description: Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story, mixed-use development. The proposal consists of the following alterations: remove two "as-built" residential units, convert existing residential garages to storage, and add a laundry room. Also proposed are exterior changes to the existing garage doors, new doors and changes to windows, moped and bicycle parking, removal of an "as-built" balcony partition, new gates and walls, closing off the driveway along Santa Barbara Street, and a landscape plan. Development Plan approval was granted to allow 2,718 square feet of new non-residential floor area for the conversion of the garages. Zoning modifications have been approved to eliminate the existing residential parking and to not provide new parking for the converted commercial square footage.)

(Review After Final of changes to previously-approved plans including the revision of a CMU and plaster wall to a wood grape stake fence, and the enclosure of the mailbox units in plaster with a 2-piece tile build-out.)

Approval of Review After Final as noted on both sheets.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 514 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-037
Application Number: MST2013-00431
Owner: Greg Newman
Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.
Business Name: Sandbar

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to replace three pair of existing patio entry doors with Lani system accordion-style doors. Also proposed is to permit as-built heaters and umbrellas in the front dining patio. This application addresses violations called out in enforcement case ENF2013-00134.)

(Final Approval is requested of more complete structural plans and architectural details per HLC motion on November 6, 2013.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 9 W HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-005
Application Number: MST2014-00049
Owner: Donald L. Torgeson Credit Shelter
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis LLP

(Proposal to stripe a new parking lot on an approximately 8,800 square foot paved vacant lot. There will be 27 parking spaces which will include one ADA accessible space. Landscape planters are also proposed. This parcel is in the 20% parking Zone of Benefit.)

(Final approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 1318 MORRISON AVE****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-021
Application Number: MST2013-00138
Owner: Christian Hill & Hope Firestone
Architect: Bryan Pollard, AIA

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to construct a 137 square foot first floor addition and 358 square foot second story addition to an existing 1,030 square foot one-story residence on a 4,500 square foot parcel in the Lower Riviera Special Design District. The amount of floor area in the existing 395 square foot detached one-car garage with shop space will remain unchanged and a new garage door and window replacements are proposed. Six cubic yards of grading excavation is proposed. A zoning modification has been granted for alterations to openings within the interior setback. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be 0.43 or 83% of the maximum FAR. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 074-13. Project was last reviewed on January 15, 2014.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 1017 & 1017-A STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-018 & 039-281-019
Application Number: MST2013-00390
Owner: GOM Properties, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis LLP

(This is a second revision to the project description. This project involves one building spanning two separate parcels: 039-281-018 and -019. Proposal for front elevation changes to relocate store entry doors which will result in a 136 square foot addition. New doors, windows, and tile base are proposed on the front elevation and door and window changes are proposed on the rear elevation.)

(Review After Final of change to add 136 square feet of new non-residential floor area. This addition had originally been approved but then the project was revised to add no new floor area. The project is now being revised again to add the square footage originally proposed and approved.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:03 P.M. ****