



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, December 18, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
 MICHAEL DRURY
 WILLIAM LA VOIE
 FERMINA MURRAY
 JUDY ORÍAS
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
 BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
 NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Murray (until 5:00 p.m.), Orías (until 5:00 p.m.), Shallanberger (at 2:13 p.m.), Sharpe (until 5:26 p.m.), Suding and Winick.

Staff present: Limón (at 5:10 p.m.), Hernández (until 4:19 p.m.), Gantz (until 5:00 p.m.), and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 4, 2013, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Sharpe, 6/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Murray/Drury, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Chair Suding announced that Louise Boucher passed away on December 9th. She served the community tirelessly and participated on advisory groups for over 22 years. She will be greatly missed.
2. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Commissioner Murray would be leaving the meeting at 5:00 p.m.
 - b) In January, Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital will have Peter Winn, a certified arborist, perform some required root pruning of the City Landmark Moreton Bay fig tree to make way for a nursing pavilion addition. The recommendations for care, protection, invigoration, and preservation of the tree outlined in Conditions D. 17 and 19 of Planning Commission Resolution # 020-05 have been completed in advance of the work.
3. Ms. Hernández announced that the Hodges House, located at 2112 Santa Barbara Street, was designated as a City Landmark by the City Council on December 10th. The execution of a Mills Act contract and an exception to exceed contract limits were granted.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEM1. **URBAN FOREST MANAGEMENT PLAN PROJECT**

(1:45) Staff: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director
(Review the Urban Forest Management Plan (UFMP) project and make recommendation to the City Council for Adoption of the UFMP.)

Time: 1:35 p.m.

Present: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director

Staff comments: Ms. Zachary explained the development of the plan, goals and objective, actions, implementation priorities identified for the first five years, and the schedule for moving forward. She requested comments from the Commission and a recommendation to be forwarded to the City Council. A revised version of the UFMP will return to HLC late January/early February, 2014.

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on addressing the needs of designated historic trees, redefining “specimen tree,” and review of trees located within the site of a designated landmark.

Public comment closed at 1:51 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

The Commission requested that changes be made to the draft UFMP and the draft return for additional review prior to adoption. The Commission made the following comments:

1. On page 6, the wording “where appropriate” is too vague and should be more specific.
2. The list of organizations involved should include the HLC.
3. On page 7, the organization AHLC should be written out as it may be a typo.
4. On page 20, the enforcement of the “maintenance of approved plans” should be addressed.
5. On page 21, explain the final solution for mediation.
6. On pages 23 and 36, include porous paving in as many places as possible.
7. Solar systems should be addressed.
8. Provide clear direction of the balance between the desire for solar access and a tree canopy so that it is not so arbitrary.
9. Coordinate with the Pedestrian Master Plan, including pedestrian walking in neighborhoods.
10. Provide an analysis of the age of various trees and their replacement.
11. Address the proper watering of replacement trees.
12. On page 30, explain the penalty for illegal removal or damaging of trees during construction.
13. On page 35, plantings should include root barriers, if possible.
14. Historic trees should be addressed, such as the Stone Pines on Anapamu Street, to identify what should be done to save as many of them as possible.
15. Outreach efforts should be made to inform tree trimming companies and further education of staff in supportable to empower those who ultimately handle these issues.
16. Cluster of trees should be defined to determine whether they are considered a hedge.
17. Define specimen trees and address landmark designated trees as suggested during public comment.
18. The written plan should be more concise to make it a more readable document and user-friendly.
19. Historic trees should be placed under Objective 2.
20. Take advantage of Commissioners willing to volunteer to work on the organization/prioritization of Objective 2.
21. Address the maintenance of trees located along easements.
22. On page 41, address the cutting of old trees by contractors hired by utility companies, such as Southern California Edison.

(Shallanberger absent.)

DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEM**2. MUNICIPAL CODE AMENDMENTS (SBMC §28.87.170)**

(2:05) Staff: Renee Brooke, AICP, Senior Planner, Community Development Department
(Presentation and discussion of proposed amendments to the Santa Barbara Municipal Code related to Fences, Screens, Walls and Hedges, with direction to staff.)

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Renee Brooke, Senior Planner
Fred Sweeney, Single Family Design Board Representative

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.

John Gurley, Dover Road resident, commented that there will be a significant amount of properties in his neighborhood that would need to make changes to their property if the proposed amendments were to be adopted. The safety issues and traffic revisions make sense, but there would be enforcement issues with respect to front hedges.

Meg Gurley, Dover Road resident, commented on the acknowledgement of elevation changes between properties, and safety issues considered on a case-by-case basis.

Grant Castleberg, Garden Street resident, commented that the hedge height limit is not high enough for privacy.

Lynda Courtney, Lasuen Road resident, commented in support of the eight foot hedge height limit between properties without exceptions and would like to have the statement “the proposal to allow higher hedges if it helps address neighborhood compatibility or privacy issues” removed.

Joan Livingston, Upper East neighborhood resident, commented that there is not a general agreement on keeping the existing limits for the frontline hedges. There is agreement with the safety-visibility triangle. She would like to see changes to the solar and view ordinances for any existing problems with hedges.

Fred Sweeney, Upper East Association President, commented on whether there is a need to change the character of the community beyond addressing hedges of dispute and safety issues.

Lisa Burns, Garden Street resident, suggested adding that El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District be part of a non-conforming exception to allow six foot hedges in front yards and twelve foot hedges on interior property lines by right.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on growth of hedges and pruning to proper height. He questioned how hedge limits are enforced and whether the EPV should be expanded to include the Upper East historic neighborhood.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of public correspondence letters from Kurt Huffman, Richard and Diane Powell, and Joe Rution.

Public comment closed at 2:56 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. There should be flexibility taking into account the age and character of certain neighborhoods for creation of exception criteria.
2. It was noted that the higher hedges tend to get less growth at the bottom portion of the plant, which lessens the level of screening.
3. The Commission would be in favor of different front yard fence/wall height limits depending on the neighborhood, considering the newly adopted Historic Resources Element (HRE) and neighborhood compatibility. Sections HR2.5, HR5.1, HR6.3, HR7.1, and HR7.2 of the HRE should be considered in the ordinance.
4. Hedges should be addressed in a separate ordinance.
5. Pilasters should be better defined.
6. Better define individual trees versus a long line of trees that create a hedge.
7. Concerns were expressed about shadows, shading and protecting solar equipment.
8. The Commission indicated that they wanted to see future changes for their review and comments.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:33 PM TO 3:41 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**3. PLAZA DE VERA CRUZ**

P-R Zone

(2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-004
 Application Number: MST2013-00491
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Cameron Benson, Creeks Manager

(Proposal to replace the existing impermeable asphalt alley paving with permeable pavers to comply with the City's Storm Water Management Program. The proposed project area is approximately 10,000 square feet. This park is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Plaza de Vera Cruz, one of the city's original parks.")

(Project was previously reviewed on December 4, 2013 as a Discussion Item. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:41 p.m.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would be in favor of the dark grey pavers proposed? 4/4 (Drury/Murray/Sharpe/Winick opposed).

How many Commissioners would be in favor of the lighter color grey pavers proposed? 4/4 (Drury/Murray/Suding/Sharpe opposed).

How many Commissioners would be in favor of the sand/stone pavers proposed? 7/1 (Suding opposed).

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that Angelus block Sand/Stone pavers or equal in color and texture shall be used.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**4. 1200 BLK LAGUNA ALLEY**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-003-167
Application Number: MST2013-00492
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Cameron Benson, Creeks Manager

(Proposal to replace the existing impermeable asphalt alley paving with permeable pavers to comply with the City's Storm Water Management Program. The proposed project area is approximately 5,000 square feet.)

(Project was previously reviewed on December 4, 2013, as a Discussion Item. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:01 p.m.

Present: Cameron Benson, Creeks Resources/Clean Water Manager, Parks and Recreation
Tim Burgess, Water Resources Specialist, Parks and Recreation
Laura Yanez, Project Engineer, Public Works

Public comment opened at 4:06 p.m.

Michael Gones, adjacent resident, commented on proposed color and pattern, enhancement of design by adding trees, and benefit of pavers for utilities.

Dennis Allen, neighboring resident, requested a simple pattern for the paving material. He commented on the extensive use of the alleyway.

Jennifer Cushnie, neighboring resident, suggested the use of permeable paving in terms of water conservation and prefers sandstone.

Public comment closed at 4:14 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The Angelus Sand/Stone pavers in a herringbone pattern would be supportable.
2. Add tree pockets to the extent possible allowing for adequate fire truck access.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 0 BLK ARLINGTON AVE**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-345
Application Number: MST2013-00493
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Cameron Benson, Creeks Manager

(Proposal to replace the existing impermeable asphalt street surface and concrete sidewalks on Arlington Avenue with permeable pavers to comply with the City's Storm Water Management Program. The proposed project area is approximately 23,500 square feet.)

(Project was previously reviewed on December 4, 2013, as a Discussion Item. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:28 p.m.

Present: Cameron Benson, Creeks Resources/Clean Water Manager, Parks and Recreation
Tim Burgess, Water Resources Specialist, Parks and Recreation
Laura Yanez, Project Engineer, Public Works

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on whether the proposal conforms to the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines and questioned whether a less busy street could be used for a demonstration project.

Public comment closed at 4:34 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Continued to January 15, 2013, with comments:

1. The expanded tree wells are accepted as proposed.
2. The concept of permeable pavers in the roadbed and sidewalk is acceptable.
3. Paving material should be used in a more decorative pattern appropriate to Hispanic design.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/2/0. (Murray/Suding opposed.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 917 LAGUNA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-009
 Application Number: MST2013-00497
 Owner: Mosel Properties
 Designer: Gary Mosel

(Proposal for a minor residential addition and alterations to an approximately 5,800 square foot parcel containing two one-story single-family dwellings. The proposal comprises the demolition of an existing 58 square foot laundry room and construction of two new laundry rooms totaling 137 square feet at the rear of a 795 square foot dwelling unit at 917 Laguna Street. (One of the two new laundry rooms is for use by the 532 square foot rear dwelling unit at 917-1/2 Laguna Street.) Also proposed at the front unit is to replace all windows and entry door, reroof, replace the existing ribbon driveway with concrete, and repave the parking area with permeable pavers. The existing front porch and site walls will be rebuilt, a new fence will be constructed in the front yard, and non-conforming hedges will be reduced in height. An unpermitted laundry shed will be demolished and a new trash enclosure will be constructed in the parking area. Four uncovered parking spaces are proposed. No exterior changes are proposed for the rear dwelling unit. This proposal will address violations outlined in enforcement case ENF2013-01037. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification. A parking design waiver is requested.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Staff Hearing Officer review, Parking Design Waiver, and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings.)

Actual time: 4:53 p.m.

Present: Gary Mosel, Designer

Public comment opened at 5:04 p.m.

John Chufar spoke in support of the project.

Public comment closed at 5:04 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments and to the Consent Calendar with comments and findings:

1. The modification is aesthetically appropriate, it does not pose consistency issues with design guidelines, and is compatible with the neighborhood.
2. Relocate the trash enclosure to the back of the property.
3. Restudy door and window placement at the east and west elevations.
4. Stone veneers should look real and plaster was suggested as an alternative, if the cost is an issue.
5. Gray concrete color for the driveway is preferred.
6. The landscape strip at the driveway should remain.
7. The parking design waiver is supportable for the existing design.
8. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.).

Action: Drury/Winick, 5/0/1. (Suding abstained as he was not present for the entire presentation. Murray/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 1100 BLK ANACAPA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-0RW
Application Number: MST2008-00338
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Blackbird Architects
Applicant: Santa Barbara Metropolitan Transit District

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for two new Metropolitan Transit District bus stop shelter designs for city sidewalk locations in the 1100 block of Anacapa Street and the 300 block of W. Carrillo Street. A third proposed location at 00 Block of E. Anapamu Street will be reviewed under a separate application in the near future.)

(Request for re-approval of an expired application. This project was granted Preliminary Approval on October 1, 2008 and a Time Extension valid through October 1, 2010. Final Approval was granted at Full Board on September 15, 2010, with Final Approval of Details granted at Consent on December 8, 2010, with condition.)

Actual time: 5:18 p.m.

Present: Ken Radtkey, Architect, Blackbird Architects
Brad Davis, Project Manager, MTD

Public comment opened at 5:31 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Project Design and Final approvals of reapplication with the comment that the architect was commended for the inventive interpretation of Hispanic architecture.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 5/0/1. (Suding opposed because he previously could not support the laser cut ironwork. Murray/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**8. 34 E PADRE ST**

E-1 Zone

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-312-044
 Application Number: MST2013-00473
 Owner: Elizabeth Lepley and Lawrence Gore
 Architect: Wade Davis Design

(Proposal for a 471 square foot single-story addition to an existing two-story, 2,446 square foot single-family dwelling with attached 583 square foot two-car garage. The project includes the relocation of a window and the removal of two windows on the second floor, removal of a door on the ground floor, removal of a post and replacement of a beam in the existing garage, and the extension of an existing uncovered patio. This project will result in a total development of 3,500 square feet on a 15,160 square foot parcel, or 0.23 guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This Spanish Colonial Revival house was designed by Russel Ray in 1929, retains a high amount of original materials, and conveys significant historic integrity.)

(Second Concept Review. Project was previously reviewed on November 20, 2013. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings.)

Actual time: 5:26 p.m.

Present: Akiko Wade-Davis and Jim Davis, Architects, Wade Davis Design

Public comment opened at 5:32 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

An arborist report was distributed to the Commission in advance of the project's review with respect to the oak trees, as requested.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with comments and findings:

1. Appreciation was expressed for modifying the plans to accommodate and preserve the Oak tree.
2. The architect was commended for a design of the addition that is sensitive to the style of the existing building.
3. The proposed buildings are designed with architectural details compatible with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines and appropriate for a historic structure.
4. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings (per SBMC §22.69.050).

Action: La Voie/Winick, 5/0/0. (Murray/Orías/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:34 PM TO 5:43 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**9. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

(5:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
 Application Number: MST2013-00371
 Owner: American Tradition, LLC
 Applicant: Teri Malinowski

(Proposal for the development of two parcels located at 433 E. Cabrillo Blvd. (APN 017-680-009) and 103 S. Calle César Chávez (APN 017-113-020). Currently permitted is a 142,600 net square foot hotel with 150 rooms which received approval under application MST95-00175. The revised proposal comprises approximately 60,000 net square feet configured in two-and three-story buildings, providing 50 to 65 rooms. Back-of-house uses will be provided in a 26,000 square foot, three-story building on the S. Calle César Chávez parcel, with approximately 60 parking spaces. The total lot area of both parcels is 236,095 square feet and the total development on site is proposed to be approximately 86,000 net square feet. An additional 100 parking spaces will be provided at a third site, a segregated portion of the parking lot at the Fess Parker Hotel across S. Calle César Chávez from the proposed site. Planning Commission review is requested for an amended Coastal Development Permit and a Development Agreement.)

(Requires Environmental Assessment, Planning Commission review, and City Council review of a Development Agreement.)

Actual time: 5:43 p.m.

Present: Peter Lawson, Associate Planner
 Bettie Weiss, City Planner
 Mike Niemann, Architect
 Teri Malinowski, Project Manager, Applicant

Public comment opened at 6:17 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Motion: Continued to January 15, 2014, with comments:

1. There is support for the project's site plan and concept in general.
2. The increased open space is supportable.
3. The concept of a flat roof swimming pool is supportable.
4. The open site design and reduction of the mass and volume are supportable, and a great improvement over what had been proposed under a previous application.
5. The buildings need to be pushed back.
6. The project's architectural design does not comply with the El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines.
7. Look at Bertram Goodhue's work locally for inspiration.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 5/0/0. (Murray/Orías/Sharpe absent.)

FINAL REVIEW**A. 9 W FIGUEROA****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-041
Application Number: MST2012-00330
Owner: City of Santa Barbara PW - Streets
Applicant: Public Works - Streets Division

(Proposal to install a 200 square foot prefabricated bikestation module in City Parking Lot #3 near the current MTD bus station. This project is being funded by a Measure A grant.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Continued to January 15, 2014.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-007
Application Number: MST2013-00097
Owner: SB Restore, LLC
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for a voluntary lot merger of Assessor Parcel Numbers 025-252-006 and -007 and change of use from commercial to residential use. This is the site of the former Fielding Institute. The proposal includes the restoration of an existing 6,167 square foot, two-story building to a single-family residence and exterior alterations to remove awnings, skylights, staircases, and an accessible ramp. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 1,809 square foot detached commercial building to an additional dwelling unit and alterations to incorporate a two car garage within the existing building footprint. Site improvements will include removal of existing paved parking spaces, restoration of historic site walls, a new swimming pool and spa, and new landscaping. Total development on this merged 49,810 square foot parcel will be 8,178 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a Performance Standard Permit for the additional dwelling unit and zoning modifications. This parcel is eligible for National Register listing, California Register of Historical Properties listing, and is a designated City Landmark: "Hodges House.")

(Final approval of pool equipment and fencing is requested.)

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 515 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-006
Application Number: MST2013-00478
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for a legal change of use and alterations to the State Street elevation including recessing the doors and windows to their original built location. This will result in a credit of 461 square feet of floor area. Also proposed is to reconstruct an enclosed loading dock at the rear elevation and add 16 square feet of floor area, construct a new trash enclosure, and restripe the existing parking lot where eight parking spaces are required but 16 parking spaces are being proposed. The total net credit of non-residential floor area is 445 square feet. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Automotive and Machine Shop, L.N. Diedrich Building.")

(Final approval of architectural details is requested.)

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Final Approval as submitted of details.

NEW ITEM**D. 924 GARDEN ST B****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-030
Application Number: MST2013-00510
Owner: Mary Dresser Trust
Architect: Shelter Architecture Urban Design

(Proposal to replace an existing entry door with a window on the northwest elevation. This structure is a designated City Landmark: "El Caserío.")

(Requires Historic Resources Findings and Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark.)

A letter from Paula Westbury was received.

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on plans.

**** THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 6:42 PM
IN HONOR POSTHUMOUSLY OF FORMER COMMISSIONER LOUISE BOUCHER ****