



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 20, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Boucher and La Voie.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:17 p.m.), Hernández (until 3:04 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 6, 2013, with correction.

Action: Drury/Sharpe, 5/0/2. (Shallanberger/Suding abstained. Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Orías/Drury, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Commissioners Boucher and La Voie would be absent from the meeting.

b) Due to the Thanksgiving holiday closure on November 28 and 29, the submittal deadline for the HLC meeting of December 4 has been moved up to Monday, November 25, 2013.

2. Commissioner Orías requested the 2014 HLC Calendar. Staff agreed to email it to all Commission members.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

PUBLIC HEARING1. **1236 GARDEN ST**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-131-001

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Consideration to adopt a resolution to designate the "Queen Anne Free Classic residence" constructed c. 1898-1903 as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:36 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, reviewed the criteria that qualify the structure as a Structure of Merit. The house retains its integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association that allow it to convey its original appearance. Staff Recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission adopt a resolution to designated 1236 Garden Street as a Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 1:39 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt a resolution to designate the "Queen Anne Free Classic residence," located at 1236 Garden Street, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Action: Shallanberger/Orías, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

PUBLIC HEARING**2. 1601 STATE ST - EL PRADO INN**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-008

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Consideration to adopt a resolution to designate the "Vernacular Mid-Century Modern Motor Inn" constructed in 1959 as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, reviewed the criteria that qualify the structure as a Structure of Merit. The El Prado Inn still retains its use as a hotel, the has integrity of its location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association that allow it to convey its original appearance. There have been no significant changes or additions to the structure, and its character-defining features remain in place. Staff Recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission adopt a resolution to designate El Prado Inn as a Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt a resolution to designate the "Vernacular Mid-Century Modern Motor Inn," located at 1601 State Street, including the two sandstone pilasters, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Action: Winick/Murray, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**3. 2525 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-041-010

Application Number: MST2013-00451

Owner: Raymond Karam

Applicant: Ronald Nye, Historian

(Historic Structures/Sites Report to analyze the historical significance of an existing single-family dwelling.)

(Review of a Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Ph.D. The report found that the residence does not qualify as a historic resource under City guidelines.)

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Ronald Nye, Historical Consultant
Chris Jacobs, Attorney at Law, Representing Ownership

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the structure had been identified as a property with potential historic significance since the 1980s. The house was designed by Kem Weber, who was a significant architect. The property was reviewed in April 2013 and an HSSR was requested to evaluate all alterations that have occurred. The report concluded that the property has lost its historical integrity. Staff reviewed the report, agreed with its conclusions, and recommends acceptance of the report. If the report is accepted by the Commission, the structure would be removed from the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Any future design reviews would be under the Single Family Design Board's purview.

Commissioner Murray expressed concern that the property was altered although it was on the Potential List. Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, responded the Potential List did not exist before 2002, but was instead known as a “priority list” and parcels were not adequately tagged to alert staff. If a parcel did not have a discretionary trigger, an alteration could occur without environmental review.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Orías/Drury, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

4. **34 E PADRE ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:15) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-312-044
 Application Number: MST2013-00473
 Owner: Elizabeth Lepley and Lawrence Gore
 Architect: Wade Davis Design

(Proposal for a 471 square foot single-story addition to an existing two-story, 2,446 square foot single-family dwelling with attached 583 square foot two-car garage. The project includes the relocation of a window and the removal of two windows on the second floor, removal of a door on the ground floor, removal of a post and replacement of a beam in the existing garage, and the extension of an existing uncovered patio. This project will result in a total development of 3,500 square feet on a 15,160 square foot parcel, or 0.23 guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This Spanish Colonial Revival house was designed by Russel Ray in 1929, retains a high amount of original materials, and conveys significant historic integrity.)

(Request by Staff to add the structure at 34 E. Padre Street to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Actual time: 2:06 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff recommends placing the structure on the City’s List of Potential Historic Resources to make sure that this historic resource is treated according to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for any alterations or additions.

Public comment opened at 2:07 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept Staff’s recommendation of placing the structure located at 34 E. Padre Street on the City’s List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: Murray/Orías, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 34 E PADRE ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-312-044
 Application Number: MST2013-00473
 Owner: Elizabeth Lepley and Lawrence Gore
 Architect: Wade Davis Design

(Proposal for a 471 square foot single-story addition to an existing two-story, 2,446 square foot single-family dwelling with attached 583 square foot two-car garage. The project includes the relocation of a window and the removal of two windows on the second floor, removal of a door on the ground floor, removal of a post and replacement of a beam in the existing garage, and the extension of an existing uncovered patio. This project will result in a total development of 3,500 square feet on a 15,160 square foot parcel, or 0.23 guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This Spanish Colonial Revival house was designed by Russel Ray in 1929, retains a high amount of original materials, and conveys significant historic integrity.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: Akiko Wade-Davis and Jim Davis, Architects, Wade Davis Design

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern as to the changes that would impact the visual look of the house and how visible the garage door is from the street.

Public comment closed at 2:16 p.m.

Motion: Continued four weeks with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the sensitive approach to the details.
2. More fenestration and/or adornment on the south elevation would enhance that side of the building.
3. Consider reuse of the windows.
4. Articulate the east elevation.
5. Consider pulling the addition away from the 30 inch oak.
6. Provide an approach to protect the oak trees during construction.
7. Provide an arborist report for the oak trees. If they need to be replaced, it would have to be on a 3:1 ratio.

Action: Orías/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 515 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(2:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-006
 Application Number: MST2013-00478
 Owner: Ray Mahboob
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for a legal change of use and alterations to the State Street elevation including recessing the doors and windows to their original built location. This will result in a credit of 461 square feet of floor area. Also proposed is to reconstruct an enclosed loading dock at the rear elevation and add 16 square feet of floor area, construct a new trash enclosure, and restripe the existing parking lot where eight parking spaces are required but 16 parking spaces are being proposed. The total net credit of non-residential floor area is 445 square feet. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Automotive and Machine Shop, L.N. Diedrich Building.")

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:37 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio, Inc.
 Edward DeVicente, Architect, DMHA

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that, since the proposal involves the restoration of the structure, Staff found no need for the preparation of an Historic Structures/Sites Report.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the owner's commitment to restore the building and arcade.
2. Consider the security of the arcade space.
3. Consider the sectional door breakup to be in thirds.
4. Provide details of sectional door for the Commission to better evaluate (particularly) the stops.
5. Provide planting at the entrance of the parking lot.
6. Provide details of any heaters or outdoor equipment being proposed.

Action: Sharpe/Orías, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:04 P.M. TO 3:11 P.M. ****

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**7. 2082 LAS CANOAS RD**

A-1 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-030-037
Application Number: MST2012-00262
Owner: Ron Petelski
Architect: James McClintock
Engineer: Victor Beck
Applicant: David Stone, Archaeologist

(Proposal for site grading; construction of multiple retaining walls; to level, extend, and pave the driveway; and create a building pad for a future residence located on a 3-acre parcel in the Hillside Design District. The proposal involves 1,250 cubic yards of cut, 1,250 cubic yards of fill, and 1,000 cubic yards of recompaction to be balanced on site. Retaining walls include a new 120 linear foot retaining wall ranging in height from 6-inches to 12 feet, a new 200 linear foot retaining wall ranging in height from 4- to 5-feet, and a new 145 linear foot 6-foot tall site wall. The proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2012-00172.)

(Review of a Phase 2 Archaeological Investigation prepared by David Stone and Ken Victorino of Dudek. Page 11 of the report recommends actions to minimize impacts to the archaeological resource including a conservation easement. The Phase I Archaeological Resources Report and an Addendum were accepted by the HLC on January 30, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Archaeological Consultant
James McClintock, Architect, McClintock Architecture
Steven Greer, Project Planner / Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that the wall may be constructed just outside the 20-foot conservation easement with the requirement that a qualified archaeologist be on site to monitor any ground-disturbing activities within 30 feet of the archaeological resource. Mr. Greer responded to public comment saying that the easement alignment follows the aqueduct.

Public comment opened at 3:12 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the easement following the root of the historic aqueduct that goes through the property and questioned where the aqueduct easement boundaries are found.

Public comment closed at 3:14 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented with Dr. Glassow's and Staff's comments to be considered as amendments to the report in order to minimize the impacts to the resource:

1. The wall shall be allowed to be constructed just outside the 20-foot conservation easement.
2. Prior to the implementation of the conservation easement, the entire aqueduct easement will be designated as a No-Build Area.

Action: Drury/Murray, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. **121 STATE ST** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-001
Application Number: MST2013-00467
Owner: Santa Barbara Beach House Hotel, LP
Agent: Brooke Kellaway
Business Name: Museum of Contemporary Art

(Proposal to paint a temporary black and white mural on the south elevation of an existing two-story building. The mural will remain on the building wall from January 25 through December 7, 2014. Review by the Visual Art in Public Places Committee is required.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Brooke Kellaway, Assistant Curator, MCA Santa Barbara
Laurie Recordon, Owner, Hotel Indigo

Commissioner Winick disclosed that, as the HLC liaison, he attended the VAPP Committee meeting in which the proposal was discussed and later met with the museum's director.

A letter was received from Nathan Vonk, President of Santa Barbara Arts Collaborative, in support.

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m.

Ginny Brush, Santa Barbara County Arts Commission, spoke in support of the proposed mural.

Ryan Greenwood, local resident, spoke in support of the proposed mural.

Nils Hammerbeck, local resident, spoke in support of the proposed mural.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned whether the mural fits into the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 3:36 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted with the specific termination date of December 7, 2014, as proposed.

Action: Shallanberger/Drury, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comments: Although some of the Commissioners have reservations as to the appropriateness of the nature of the proposed art within the EPV, others expressed enthusiasm and highlighted positive aspects of the project: There will be no adverse negative impact on any adjacent historic resource; a mural would create a doorway to the "Funk Zone"; it involves children and community members; and there is a specific termination date.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**9. 500 NIÑOS DR**

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-002
 Application Number: MST2013-00465
 Owner: City Parks and Recreation
 Applicant: Tynan Group
 Architect: Blackbird Architects
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Zoo

(Proposal for a new 1,300 square foot giraffe shelter at the Santa Barbara Zoo. The structural steel and plaster enclosure will be 24-8" tall with two sliding entry doors and sliding panels at the top of two walls for ventilation. The structure will be heated with gas-powered space heaters and will be illuminated by low impact security lighting. No grading will be required and the existing concrete pad will be reused in its current size. A Coastal Development Permit is required.)

(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment and Coastal Review.)

Actual time: 3:47 p.m.

Present: Richard Block, CEO, Santa Barbara Zoo
 Ken Radtkey, Principal Architect, Blackbird Architects, Inc.
 Cameron Carey, Agent, Tynan Group, Inc.

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed appreciation for the applicant's efforts to conceal the new structure, and commented on the possible removal of the artificial rock wall.

Public comment closed at 4:01 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments:

1. Consider a more organic shape to the proposed barn.
2. Consider eliminating the green screen in favor of more willow and sycamore plantings.

Action: Winick/Drury, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**10. 1003-A SANTA BARBARA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-013
 Application Number: MST2013-00418
 Owner: Robert Dibley
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC
 Architect: Arketype Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for a 1,731 square foot two-story addition to be constructed on top of an existing 1,489 square foot, one-story commercial building. The commercial building will be converted to residential use and will be used as a four-car garage and storage. The resulting three-story single-family dwelling unit will be 39'-0" tall on an approximately 2,000 square foot parcel. Total floor area on site will be 3,312 square feet, or a 1.65 floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). A 398 square foot rooftop deck is also proposed, as well as 536 square feet of balcony and patio space. There will be 124 square feet of permeable paving installed in the driveway. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications for setback encroachments and open yard area. The project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

(Requires Environmental Assessment, Staff Hearing Officer Review, and environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

Actual time: 4:09 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning, LLC
 David Ferrin, Principal Architect, Arketype-Architect, Inc.
 Robert Dibley, Property Owner
 Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 4:18 p.m.

Tom Parsai, neighboring property owner, commented on the project's proposed windows and the temporary easement.

Public comment closed at 4:21 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Perhaps too many modifications are being requested.
2. It is difficult to review the project with so many unknowns.
3. Study improving the third floor elevation. The interface of the third floor deck with the third floor is problematic.
4. Consider enhancing the north elevation to take advantage of the views to the north, possibly by adding more windows.
5. The design is too contemporary. It should be more traditional, refined and in keeping with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines and the surrounding historic buildings.
6. The mass, bulk, and scale are close to being approvable, but restudy the chimney mass.
7. Provide setback dimensions on all plans and elevations.

Action: Winick/Oriás, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**FINAL REVIEW****A. 101 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-006
Application Number: MST2011-00171
Owner: Romasanta Family Living Trust
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 714 square foot laundry building and 40 space parking lot and construct a new 22,133 square foot, three-story hotel with 34 guest rooms and a 33 space, at-grade parking garage totaling 9,943 square feet.)

(Final Approval of architectural details is requested. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 002-13. Project was last reviewed by the Full Board on November 6, 2013.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1017 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-018
Application Number: MST2013-00390
Owner: Victor W. and Susan Marie Schaff
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description. This project involves one building spanning two separate parcels: 039-281-018 and -019. Proposal for front elevation changes to relocate store entry doors which will not result in a change in square footage. New doors, windows, and tile base are proposed on the front elevation and door and window changes are proposed on the rear elevation.)

(Review After Final of changes to previously-approved storefront alterations. New square footage is no longer proposed.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 118 E CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-291-002
Application Number: MST2013-00463
Owner: Friedrich Enterprises, LP
Applicant: Permit Consultants
Architect: Gensler Architect
Business Name: Wells Fargo, the Private Bank

(Proposal to install security card readers at the front and rear entries and a barrier gate with bollards at the E. Carrillo Street entry to the rear parking lot. Also proposed is to paint new exterior trim colors around the front door and the two windows facing E. Carrillo Street.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that electrical trench shall be 12 inches maximum depth as noted on Sheet A2.01.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:49 P.M. ****