



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 6, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Vice-Chair Sharpe.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury (at 1:39 p.m.), La Voie (until 3:54 p.m.), Murray, Orías, Sharpe, and Winick.

Members absent: Boucher, Shallanberger and Suding.

Staff present: Limón (until 3:05 p.m.), Hernández (2:35 p.m. to 3:58 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 23, 2013.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 23, 2013, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 5/0/0. (Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Orías/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Chair Suding and Commissioners Boucher and Shallanberger would be absent from the meeting.
2. Commissioner Orías requested an update on the Italian Stone Pine Landmark Trees located in front of the Methodist Church on E. Anapamu Street. Mr. Limón responded that a plan is being developed and will then return for an update upon its completion.
3. Commissioner La Voie announced he would be leaving at 4:00 p.m.
4. Commissioner La Voie announced he attended the appeal hearing of the Arlington Village project (to be located at 1330 Chapala Street). The City Council upheld the HLC Project Design Approval decision with additional conditions.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM/TRAINING:

1. AVERAGE UNIT-SIZE DENSITY INCENTIVE PROGRAM

(1:45) Presenter: Bettie Weiss, City Planner; and Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor (Second of a two-part training on the relationship between Design Review and the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive program. This training will focus on the various new development standards of the AUD program and potential changes to refer some AUD projects to the Planning Commission for review and comments.)

Actual time: 1:40 p.m.

Present: Bettie Weiss, City Planner
Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

Staff comments: Mr. Limón and Ms. Weiss gave a Staff PowerPoint presentation. Ms. Weiss explained a new review process for projects over 45 feet in height and the types of average unit density (AUD) projects that will be reviewed solely by the HLC and those that will be reviewed in conjunction with the Planning Commission. The proposed review process changes were discussed.

There will be an AUD discussion item at the Planning Commission on December 12, 2013, where they will be asked to make a recommendation to City Council.

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern on building heights and asked if an HLC decision on an AUD project's height is appealable to the Planning Commission. He also asked if there is currently a height limit in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV).

Public comment closed at 2:16 p.m.

Ms. Weiss responded to public comment by saying that a 60-foot height limit is still allowed in commercial zones, even within the EPV. The appeal process has not changed: HLC and Planning Commission decisions are appealed to the City Council.

Ms. Weiss responded to Commission questions. Under the Adaptive Management Program, the effectiveness of the AUD Program will be reported on annually during the Joint City Council/Planning Commission meeting.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. The proposed design review changes for AUD Program projects are sensible provided there is adequate staff assistance. It seems staff's involvement will increase.
2. It will be even more critical for the HLC to make clear and concise comments to provide guidance to the applicant as to whether a comment is a suggestion or a requirement.
3. The HLC's comments shall reflect in which specific way the project meets the compatibility analysis criteria.
4. The Commission agrees with the recommended design review process changes as outlined in the Staff presentation.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:29 P.M. TO 2:36 P.M. ****

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 474 SCENIC DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-272-003
 Application Number: MST2013-00425
 Owner: Edward Yates
 Architect: Jonathan Villegas

(Proposal for alterations to a one-story five-unit apartment complex. The proposal would relocate an existing front site retaining wall to the front property line, re-grade the driveway entries, replace a wood deck and stairs at the rear of the existing single-family residential unit, replace an existing two-car carport with a two-car garage, and replace an existing three-car carport with a new three-car garage. The existing carports and proposed garages are non-conforming to the interior and rear setbacks. This project will address the violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00676 including the as-built installation of vinyl windows. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Conejo Archaeological Consultants.)

Actual time: 2:36 p.m.

Present: Dan Lindsay, Owner Representative
Jonathan Villegas, Architect

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, state that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that it is estimated that the potential for impacts to prehistoric or historic cultural resources is low; therefore no further archaeological investigation is warranted. However, the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources applies to the project and shall be reproduced on the plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Orías/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 900 CHANNEL DR

R-1/SD-3 Zone

(2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-393-002
Application Number: MST2011-00246
Owner: Santa Barbara Cemetery Association
Applicant: Tricia Knight
Architect: Sac Wireless

(Proposal for the installation of a new wireless communications facility consisting of nine panel cellular antennas on a new 50 foot tall tower pole structure and new ground-mounted equipment in a 700 square foot walled enclosure. An alternative design would be to conceal the tower inside a monopole. Planning Commission review is requested for a Conditional Use Permit, a Coastal Development Permit, and a zoning modification. This parcel contains a *City Landmark*: "Charles Caldwell Park Watering Trough and Fountain.")

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Don C. Perez of EBI Consulting.)

Actual time: 2:40 p.m.

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, state that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that any earth disturbing activity should be monitored by a qualified archaeologist in light of the project area's proximity to a prehistoric site.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:41 P.M. TO 2:54 P.M. ****

PUBLIC HEARING**4. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-007
Application Number: MST2013-00097
Owner: SB Restore, LLC
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for a voluntary lot merger of Assessor Parcel Numbers 025-252-006 and -007 and change of use from commercial to residential use. This is the site of the former Fielding Institute. The proposal includes the restoration of an existing 6,167 square foot, two-story building to a single-family residence and exterior alterations to remove awnings, skylights, staircases, and an accessible ramp. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 1,809 square foot detached commercial building to an additional dwelling unit and alterations to incorporate a two car garage within the existing building footprint. Site improvements will include removal of existing paved parking spaces, restoration of historic site walls, a new swimming pool and spa, and new landscaping. Total development on this merged 49,810 square foot parcel will be 8,178 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a Performance Standard Permit for the additional dwelling unit and zoning modifications. This *parcel is eligible for National Register listing, California Register of Historical Properties listing, and for City Landmark status: "Hodges House."*)

(Consideration to adopt a resolution to recommend to City Council the designation of 2112 Santa Barbara Street a City of Santa Barbara Landmark. The designation includes the entire parcel of the Italian Mediterranean estate constructed in 1921, and excludes the non-contributing elements outlined in Exhibit A of the Staff Report.)

Actual time: 2:54 p.m.

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Designer, Harrison Design Associates

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, gave a presentation of the site's historic significance.

Public comment opened at 2:59 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2013-06 and forward the Landmark designation request of the entire Hodges House parcel, excluding the non-contributing elements, to City Council for consideration.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 3626 SAN REMO DR**

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2013-00440
Owner: Nancy and Robert Madsen
Designer: KSD Enterprises, LLC
Applicant: Capital Pacific Development Group

(Proposal to demolish an existing two-story, 2,907 square foot single-family dwelling and construct a new two-story, 2,670 square foot single-family dwelling with an attached 443 square foot garage. (The original four-lot subdivision project proposed a restoration of the dwelling at 3626 San Remo Drive. The proposal has been revised to demolish and reconstruct the dwelling in order to comply with structural engineering codes.) The proposed development would be 72% of the recommended maximum floor-to-lot area ratio on a 15,507 square foot lot. The *front facade*, which *was found to be eligible as a Structure of Merit*, would be reconstructed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction. A Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole of Preservation Planning Associates was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission in March of 2010 for the subdivision of the property. Planning Commission (PC) review is requested for a Modification of the Solar Access Height Limitation and to change the conditions of approval for the subdivision found in PC Resolution 015-10. This *property is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List.*)

(Revised project requires Environmental Assessment, Planning Commission review, and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings.)

Actual time: 3:01 p.m.

Present: Daniel Gullett, Associate Planner
Kate Svensson, Kate Svensson Design
Vince Amore, VP of Operations, CP Custom Builders
Gavin Moores, Principal, CP Custom Builders
Robert Adams, Landscape Architect
Alex Cole, Historical Consultant

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commended the applicant for the rehabilitation of the historic structure. He questioned whether the entire structure qualifies for Structure of Merit status instead of only the front façade. He also asked when the addition was constructed and whether the applicant is proposing to use a portion of it.

Public comment closed at 3:21 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments:**
1. The applicant was commended for continuing the life of the building.
 2. The project is consistent with the original design esthetic and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction of Historic Properties.
 3. Capture the historic detailing of the column capitals to avoid a contemporary look. It is one of Edwards and Plunkett's signature designs.
 4. **The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:**
 - a) **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Guidelines.
 - b) **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular Neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c) **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the proposed development are appropriate for its neighborhood and consistent with the historic appearance of the house.
 - d) **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts. The design considers the Landmark Oak trees that are a character-defining feature and should be preserved.
 - e) **Public views of the Ocean and Mountains.** The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to established private views. There are no ocean views, and the design does not impede mountain views.
 - f) **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The design of the proposed development includes an appropriate amount of project open space and landscaping.
 - g) Carry forward the HLC comments to the Planning Commission with the recommendation that the project be accepted as submitted, including the proposed setback, as it is not greater than the existing footprint, and the solar access relief, in that it is already located in a shady neighborhood.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**6. 205 CHAPALA ST**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-070
Application Number: MST2010-00263
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Craig Drake
Agent: Applied Earthworks

(Proposal to replace the Chapala Street - W. Yanonali Street bridge over Mission Creek. The replacement bridge would be a single-span bridge consisting of a combination of precast and cast-in-place concrete slab with asphalt concrete or polyester concrete overlay on the deck for the road surfacing. City standard sidewalks would be added to both sides of the street on the bridge and would tie into the existing sidewalks along Chapala and Yanonali Streets. New combination vehicular/pedestrian railings would be installed on each side of the bridge. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit to perform this work in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Review After Final of plaque per December 19, 2012, HLC motion. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 003-12. Project was last reviewed administratively on October 9, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:42 p.m.

Present: Adam Hendel, Supervising Engineer

Public comment opened at 3:47 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the text could be condensed.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final of Option 2 at the applicant's discretion to include the north side abutment sandstone photograph in black and white.

Action: Winick/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:54 P.M. TO 4:04 P.M. ****

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**7. 101 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-006
Application Number: MST2011-00171
Owner: Romasanta Family Living Trust
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 714 square foot laundry building and 40 space parking lot and construct a new 22,133 square foot, three-story hotel with 34 guest rooms and a 33 space, at-grade parking garage totaling 9,943 square feet.)

(Second In-Progress Review of refined exterior elevations and landscape plan. Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination approved on August 8, 2013. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 002-13. Project was last reviewed on October 23, 2013.)

Actual time: 4:04 p.m.

Present: Mark Romasanta, Representing Ownership
Brian Cearnal and Alex Wyndham, Architects, Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned whether the color would be the same as the buildings in the Harbor View Inn.

Public comment closed at 4:16 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for details with conditions:

1. On the elevations where the Moorish grilles are locate, pay attention to the detail to soften the rectangularity of the openings.
2. The design of the fountain shall be considered without boulders.
3. The wainscot shall be painted the same color as the building.
4. The weathervane heron shall be of a form that is classically derived.

Action: Winick/Orías, 5/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**8. 1723 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-003
 Application Number: MST2013-00457
 Owner: Clifford M. and Stella Y. Fujimoto, Trustees
 Architect: Tom Smith

(Proposal to permit as-built improvements in an existing 1,476 square foot, two-story, single-family dwelling. The improvements comprise the conversion of a 290 square foot one-car garage to interior floor area, conversion of an existing 55 square foot covered porch to interior floor area, two new uncovered parking spaces, and 92 lineal feet of 8'-0" tall redwood fencing. An unpermitted trellis and shed are proposed to be removed, and over-height hedges will be trimmed to the required 8'-0". The project will result in 1,820 square feet of enclosed floor area, which is .29 or 67% of the maximum floor-to-lot-area ratio. This application addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00956. *This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.*)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Tom Smith, Architect
 Matt Freitas, Owner

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the building's historical integrity has been altered. Staff suggested removing the site from the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. In that case, the project would then fall under the purview of the Single Family Design Board.

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the house was on the Potential's List because of its age

Public comment closed at 4:39 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as presented with comments:

1. Any future proposed renovation shall require the preparation of a Historic Structure/Site Report.
2. The structure shall remain on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources for the protection of whatever remaining historical value it may have.

Action: Winick/Orias, 5/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie/Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**FINAL REVIEW****A. 836 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-001
 Application Number: MST2012-00385
 Owner: Arthur Louie
 Agent: Post/Hazeltine Associates
 Architect: Acme Architecture

(Proposal for a two-unit subdivision to include the following: demolish two detached single-car garages, a 383 square foot, one-bedroom cottage, an attached 102 square foot service porch, and two detached storage sheds. Structurally upgrade an existing three-bedroom, one-story house and foundation and replace windows and roof. Construct a new attached two-story, three-bedroom dwelling unit and two attached two-car garages to create a two-unit condominium. Also proposed is associated new landscaping and paving. This is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources*: "Residence: Constructed in 1912.")

(Final Approval of architectural details is requested. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 037-13. Project was last reviewed at Full Board on July 17, 2013.)

Final Approval of details with conditions:

1. All new windows in the original house shall be wood, having the same profiles and dimensions as the original windows.
2. A revised Sheet A8.2 shall be submitted to Staff.

NEW ITEM**B. 1319 OLIVE ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-085-012
 Application Number: MST2013-00443
 Owner: Cooper Real Estate Management, LLC
 Applicant: Jerry Rocci
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for exterior alterations to the rear of an existing 1,344 square foot single family dwelling. The work will include foundation repair, window and siding changes, removal of an existing chimney, partial new roof, and minor floor area changes which will result in an overall reduction of 2.0 square feet of floor area. The work will be confined to the front dwelling unit on an 11,250 square foot multi-family parcel, with no changes proposed for the existing middle and rear dwelling units, one-car garage, or one-car carport. This structure is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources*: "Contributing historic resource to the potential Bungalow Haven Historic District." The plans meet the proposed historic resource guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Rehabilitation, and will not have a negative impact on the resource.)

Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 514 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-037
Application Number: MST2013-00431
Business Name: Sandbar
Owner: Greg Newman
Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to replace three pair of existing patio entry doors with Lani system accordion-style doors. Also proposed is to permit as-built improvements within the front dining patio including wall-mounted televisions, wall-mounted lighting, wall-mounted and free-standing heaters, umbrellas, and artwork. This application addresses violations called out in enforcement case ENF2013-00134.)

Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar (of the as-built improvements).

NEW ITEM**D. 401 E CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-222-020
Application Number: MST2013-00455
Owner: 401 East Carrillo Street, LLC
Applicant: Earthform Design

(Proposal for new landscaping at 401 E. Carrillo Street (APN029-222-020) and to replace the existing asphalt parking lot and install new landscaping at 409 E. Carrillo Street (APN029-222-019).)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that a revised plan shall be submitted to Staff showing Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program Best Management Practices.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:45 P.M. ****