



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 9, 2013

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Vice-Chair Sharpe.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Orías, Shallenberger, Sharpe, and Winick.

Members absent: Boucher, Murray and Suding.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:15 p.m.) Hernández, Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 25, 2013, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Winick, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Winick/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals. (Document)

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Commissioners Boucher, Murray and Suding would be absent from the meeting.
- b. Staff requested appointment of a new HLC Sign Committee Alternate because Commissioner Drury, the previously-appointed alternate, cannot attend Sign Consent meetings on Wednesday mornings due to a schedule conflict. Commissioner Winick agreed to be the new alternate.
- c. Commissioner Orías had requested a site visit to the Santa Barbara Museum of Art. The applicant's goal is to submit plans for the DART review in the next four weeks. Staff suggested that the HLC take part in the Planning Commission site visit that should occur on the Tuesday before the project is scheduled to be reviewed by the Planning Commission. The HLC agreed and found it unnecessary to conduct a separate site visit.
- d. The HLC decision on the Arlington Village project (to be located at 1330 Chapala Street) was appealed. Commissioners La Voie and Orías agreed to represent the Commission at the City Council hearing that is scheduled to occur on Tuesday, October 29, 2013.

2. Commissioner Orías requested a future discussion item with the City Arborist with respect to the two Italian Stone Pine Landmark Trees located in front of the Methodist Church on E. Anapamu Street that are dead. Staff agreed to communicate this concern to the Parks and Recreation Department.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports. (Document

DISCUSSION ITEM:1. **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW PROCESS**

(1:45) Presenter: Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst/Project Planner
(Presentation and discussion on the environmental review process and procedure for projects acted on by the HLC.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst/Project Planner
Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor/Historic Preservation Supervisor
Scott Vincent, Assistant City Attorney

Staff comments: Ms. Shelton summarized the environmental review process under California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requirements, and the Historic Landmarks Commission's role. The primary purposes of CEQA are to provide information about any significant environmental effects of a project, and to find ways to avoid or lessen effects.

Ms. Shelton reviewed exemption criteria for projects that do not require an environmental document under CEQA. Per the City CEQA Guidelines, exemption determinations are made by Staff. Staff exemption determinations are appealable following the project approval action using the standard City appeal process.

The HLC's role in environmental review includes the review and acceptance of archaeological and historic structures reports for adequacy. For CEQA Section 15183 exemptions (Projects Consistent with the General Plan), HLC makes a CEQA finding based on the Staff analysis prior to project approval. Negative Declarations are adopted by the decision-making body with findings. Environmental Impact Reports are certified by the Planning Commission, and the decision-makers make environmental findings. Decision-makers should be comfortable with a Staff CEQA determination, and should ask questions if concerns arise.

Mr. Limón discussed conditions of approval for projects, noting that standard language for conditions has been developed to comply with legal requirements. Conditions of approval will be applied as applicable on projects. Further training is scheduled at an upcoming meeting on the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program.

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern that staff is not always aware of a building's historic background. He suggested review of all historic resources by the HLC and the public for further insight.

Public comment closed at 1:58 p.m.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. When a project is approved, Staff should remind the HLC to make a public announcement that the decision is appealable within 10 days.
2. Applicants' perceptions should be clarified so that they do not think that the HLC cannot weigh in on projects that Staff has determined CEQA exempt.
3. Clarification was requested on the role of HLC with respect to Planning Commission conditions.
4. There are concerns in limiting conditions because of the need to protect neighbors during construction. The conditions are a requirement to the approval of the project and are essentially a contract agreed-upon by the applicant.
5. Clarification is needed on the AUD process regarding coordination of review; size of projects, etc.
6. Most projects go smoothly, so this constitutes refining processes for a few projects with issues.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
 Application Number: MST2011-00174
 Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for the following exterior alterations: Remove 4,650 square feet of existing brick paving for reuse with new brick in a new hardscape design, add 241 square feet of new brick paving, and construct new stairs, walkways, and ramps for ADA compliance at various locations around the building. The public sidewalks along E. Cañón Perdido and Anacapa Streets will be replaced. Two existing olive trees will be replaced with Carob trees and the landscaped areas along the streets will be simplified to more accurately represent the original landscape design. New planters at the Anacapa Street lawn areas will provide more effective storm water treatment. Also proposed is new rooftop HVAC equipment which will require a 7'-4" tall plaster parapet wall over the existing Green Room roof. Minimal lighting will be added at the proposed entry stair and Esplanade, and existing exterior sconces will be re-lamped and refurbished. This is a Designated City Landmark: "The Lobero Theatre." (This proposed work affects Assessor Parcel Numbers 039-322-009 & 039-322-038.))

(Review After Final of refurbishment of existing sign letters and new uplighting of signage and columns on the E. Cañón Perdido frontage. This review is in accordance with HLC motion of January 2, 2013.)

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Mat Gradias and Joe Wilcox, KBZ Architects

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, requested that the signage lettering be replicated exactly.

Public comment closed at 2:15 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. Lamping shall be reduced from the proposed 19 watt LED to something in the neighborhood of 60-70% luminosity.
2. The gels shall be included for color correction.
3. Correct Notes 1 and 2 on the front of page A0.1.

Action: Winick/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 1318 MORRISON AVE**

R-2 Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-021
 Application Number: MST2013-00138
 Owner: Christian Hill and Hope Firestone
 Architect: Bryan Pollard, AIA

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to construct a 137 square foot first floor addition and 358 square foot second story addition to an existing 1,030 square foot one-story residence on a 4,500 square foot parcel in the Lower Riviera Special Design District. The amount of floor area in the existing 395 square foot detached one-car garage with shop space will remain unchanged and a new garage door and window replacements are proposed. Six cubic yards of grading excavation is proposed. A zoning modification is requested for alterations to openings within the interior setback. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be 0.43 or 83% of the maximum FAR. This structure is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.*)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment, Staff Hearing Officer review, and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings.)

Actual time: 2:32 p.m.

Present: Bryan Pollard, Architect
 Christian Hill and Hope Firestone, Owners

Public comment opened at 2:46 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that a site plan indicating where adjacent houses are located on Morrison Avenue had been requested, but not provided by the applicant. He also commented that the building is too vertical and would have liked the residence to remain as one floor.

Public comment closed at 2:47 p.m.

Receipt of written correspondence expressing support for the project was acknowledged from Nancy Hirsch, Anne Farrell, Athena Sims and Tim Strand, Rick and Wendy Mokler, and Blake Andrews.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments:

1. The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines or the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance.
2. The majority found the design to be generally approvable and supportable.
3. Additional attention should be given to the detailing of window proportions, rafter tails and other architectural elements.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**CONTINUED ITEM****A. 1200 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-040
Application Number: MST2013-00354
Owner: Levon Investments, LLC
Architect: Wes Fukumori
Business Name: First Republic Bank

(Proposal for the following exterior changes to an existing commercial building: repaint the exterior, replace an existing wood guardrail with wrought iron, replace ceramic tile facing on seven streetscape planters and replant the planter boxes, install a new night depository, and install new lighting. This building is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Lower Hawley Building, Hitchcock Building."*)

(Second review.)

Project Design and Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 33 W VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-001
Application Number: MST2010-00327
Owner: Ensemble Theatre and Luria-New Vic, LLC
Architect: PMSM Architects
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
Business Name: Victoria Hall Theater

(Proposed renovation and seismic upgrade including a rerouted circulation pattern at the front entry, reconstruction of the stage house at the south elevation, and raising the existing roof height to 55 feet to accommodate a new fly loft. Changes will occur on the north, east, and south elevations. Project requires City Council approval of a Public Works major encroachment permit. This is a *Structure of Merit: "Former First Baptist Church."* The building is *eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark, inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources, and the National Register of Historic Places.*)

(Review After Final of change to courtyard decking material.)

Final Approval of Review After Final of TimberTech DockSider decking plank in TimberTech Grey.

NEW ITEM**C. 124 - 152 E CARRILLO ST (CONDOS)****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-410-CA1
Application Number: MST2013-00398
Owner: Richard Cochrane
Applicant: JMPE Electrical Engineering

(Proposal for new parking lot lighting including wall-mounted and pole-mounted LED fixtures. Scheme "A" would comprise one new pole with two new fixtures and the replacement of fixtures on three existing poles with two fixtures each, for a total of four poles and eight new light fixtures. No trenching would be required. Scheme "B" comprises eight new poles with one light fixture per pole, and 1,000 linear feet of trenching at 6" wide and 24" deep, with the approximately 37 cubic yards of pavement to be patched afterwards.)

Continued indefinitely to the Full Commission for review and acceptance of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report and revised fixtures.

NEW ITEM**D. 1400 SANTA BARBARA ST****P-R Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-012-001
Application Number: MST2013-00412
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Jill Zachary, Parks and Recreation Assistant Director

(Proposal for upgrades to the existing public restrooms at Alameda Park comprising the replacement in kind of the 450 square foot tile roof, construction of accessible landings, installation of new sidewalks, fencing and landscaping, new light fixtures, and a new drinking fountain.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheet 7.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 1816 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-032-021
Application Number: MST2009-00281
Owner: Alamar II, LLC
Architect: Bryan Murphy
Business Name: Fiesta Inn & Suites

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for an addition and exterior alterations to an existing three story commercial building. The proposal includes facade alterations, a 210 square foot lobby addition and 92 square foot entry porch, a tower addition having no new floor area, a 270 square foot storage room addition on the third floor of the building, a new 312 square foot deck, two new patio areas totaling 585 square feet, widening the second floor corridor by 164 square feet, removal of exterior stairs, new wall fountain, and alterations to the existing parking lot. This project received Planning Commission approval. Approval of this project will abate violations outlined in ENF2008-01335.)

(Review After Final of change to front elevation including a 263 square foot lobby expansion, new fountain on the State Street elevation, and truncated domes on accessible path of travel. A Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination was granted July 31, 2013. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-10.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:00 P.M. ****