



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, August 15, 2012 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present until 3:30 and again at 3:53 p.m.
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 JUDY ORÍAS – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent
 BARRY WINICK – Present at 1:35 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
 HEATHER BAKER, AICP Project Planner – Present until 3:30 p.m.
 NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Associate Planner/Urban Historian – Present
 MICHAEL BERMAN, Environmental Analyst – Present at 3:30 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Absent
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding (until 3:30 p.m. and again at 3:53 p.m.), and Winick.

Members absent: Shallanberger.

Staff present: Baker (until 3:30 p.m.), Hernández, Berman (at 3:30 p.m.), and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Item 7 of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 18, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 18, 2012, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 1, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 1, 2012.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. (Sharpe abstained. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Commissioner La Voie.

Action: Boucher/Orías, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements:

- a) The revised proposed map for the Historic Resources Element was provided to individual Commissioners.
- b) The High Fire Hazard Area Landscape Guidelines handout was also provided for individual Commissioners. (These guidelines can also be found as Appendix B in the *Historic Landmarks Commission General Design Guidelines & Meeting Procedures*.)

2. Chair Suding requested a map and list of designated City Landmark structures, Structures of Merit, and structures listed on the City's Potential Historic Resources List.

3. Commissioner Drury announced that the Arlington Theater's southerly side is still viewable without visual interference.

4. Heather Baker, AICP Project Planner, announced that the City Council hearing to consider the adoption of the Historic Resources Element document is scheduled for October 2012. Staff is to confirm the correct tentative date. It Commissioner Orías urged public and HLC attendance at the hearing to support its adoption.

5. Commissioner La Voie announced he would be leaving at 4:20 p.m.

6. Commissioner Murray announced she would be leaving at 4:30 p.m.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

1. **40 E ANAPAMU ST** E-1 Zone
(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public hearing at 2:00 p.m. on August 29, 2012, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the Central Library, Faulkner Gallery, and five Eucalyptus *Corymbia* (*Citriodora*) trees located at 40 East Anapamu Street.)

Actual time: 1:41

Public comment opened at 1:42 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2012-01 as an intention to hold a Public Hearing to consider recommending to City Council that the Central Library, Faulkner Gallery, and all thirteen Eucalyptus *Corymbia* (*Citriodora*) trees, rather than five, located at 40 East Anapamu Street be designated as City Landmarks, as determined by the City Urban Historian as being eligible for designation, and postpone the hearing if necessary.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

2. **2300 GARDEN ST** E-1 Zone
(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public hearing at 2:20 p.m. on August 29, 2012, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the St. Anthony's Complex and Grounds located at 2300 Garden Street.)

Actual time: 1:47

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the Commission has worked with the property owner to rehabilitate the property since 2006. The property is significant for both its historical and architectural influence on the heritage of the City. The designation would include seven buildings and the grounds (certain landscape features, the walls and gates on Garden Street). They qualify for designation under the City's Master Environmental Assessment standards and criteria.

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2012-02 as an intention to hold a Public Hearing on August 29, 2012, to consider recommending to City Council that the St. Anthony's Complex and Grounds located at 2300 Garden Street be designated as City Landmarks, as determined in the Historic Structures Report accepted by the Commission May 13, 2009, to be eligible for designation.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**3. 300 E ISLAY ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-121-001
 Application Number: MST2012-00269
 Owner: John Markham
 Applicant: Pintado Pools
 Landscape Architect: Rob Maday

(Proposal for a new 480 square foot swimming pool and 40 square foot pool equipment structure on a 15,960 square foot parcel. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Annette Smith House.")

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by A. George Toren and Gwen R. Romani of Compass Rose Archaeological, Inc.)

Actual time: 1:51

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, since no known cultural resources exist within the project area, no further archaeological investigation is warranted at this time. However, the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources applies and shall be printed on the plans prior to building permit issuance.

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**4. 1130 N MILPAS ST**

E-1/R-3 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00551
 Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.
 Architect: Steve Carter

(Proposal to construct a new 2,210 net square foot one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza, and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,700 cubic yards of excavation and 1,200 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires City Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Report prepared by Fermina Murray, Architectural Historian. The report concluded that the proposed alterations will be done in a non-adverse manner and the physical characteristics will continue to convey its significance and eligibility for designation as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:53

Present: Fermina Murray, Historical Consultant
Trish Allen, Agent
Steve Carter, Architect

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that after careful review of the report, Staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State CEQA Guidelines, the MEA, and Secretary of Interior's Standard Numbers 1 and 5, and will not result in significant adverse impacts to the historic resource. Ms. Hernández clarified that the Dreier Building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Withdrawn

Motion: To accept the report disagreeing with the report preparer's conclusion that the proposal is compatible with the Dreier Building and therefore having no significant impact.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Orías abstained. Murray stepped down. Shallanberger absent.) Upon further discussion motion was withdrawn.

Substitute

Motion: To not accept the report as the Commission disagrees with the report's findings that the proposal, consisting of a box office building and pedestrian entrance/plaza, is compatible with the Dreier Building.

Action: Drury/Sharpe, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray stepped down. Shallanberger absent.)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

5. 1236 GARDEN ST

R-3 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-131-001
Application Number: MST2011-00258
Owner: Timothy Dewar
Applicant: Thompson Naylor

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,071 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes conversion of a 419 square foot attic space to habitable floor area, demolition of a 67 square foot enclosed rear porch and existing 171 square foot detached single-car garage, construction of a new 286 square foot attached one-car garage and storage space, addition of 48 square feet to the main floor, new dormer windows on the north and south elevations, two new skylights, one relocated window and one new window on the ground floor, removal of a tree within the front setback, and new landscaping. The total floor area on this 3,769 square foot parcel will be 1,767 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review of zoning modifications is required for the new garage and new second-story dormer to encroach into the interior yard setback and to reduce the non-conforming open yard area. The floor-to-lot-area (FAR) ratio will be .47, or 81% of the maximum FAR. The house is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and is **eligible for Structure of Merit status:** "Colonial Revival hybrid circa 1899.")

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report Letter Addendum prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The Letter Addendum concluded that the project would not result in significant adverse impacts to historic resources provided that the revised project includes photo-documentation.)

Actual time: 2:17

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants
Sherri Bryan, Owner

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that after careful review of the report, Staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA and the Secretary of Interior Standards Number 9 and will not result in significant adverse impacts to the historic resource.

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with the following revisions:

1. The second paragraph on page 8 shall read: "4) The applicant proposes to remove an existing one over one wood sash window and replace with one light window [...]"
2. In Appendix A, Sheet A3.0, the elevations shown shall include dash lines of existing windows transposed to indicate what is proposed.

Action: Drury/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 1236 GARDEN ST

R-3 Zone

(2:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-131-001
Application Number: MST2011-00258
Owner: Timothy Dewar
Applicant: Thompson Naylor

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,071 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes conversion of a 419 square foot attic space to habitable floor area, demolition of a 67 square foot enclosed rear porch and existing 171 square foot detached single-car garage, construction of a new 286 square foot attached one-car garage and storage space, addition of 48 square feet to the main floor, new dormer windows on the north and south elevations, two new skylights, one relocated window and one new window on the ground floor, removal of a tree within the front setback, and new landscaping. The total floor area on this 3,769 square foot parcel will be 1,767 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review of zoning modifications is required for the new garage and new second-story dormer to encroach into the interior yard setback and to reduce the non-conforming open yard area. The floor-to-lot-area (FAR) ratio will be .47, or 81% of the maximum FAR. The house is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and is **eligible for Structure of Merit status:** "Colonial Revival hybrid circa 1899.")

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on February 1, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:26

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect
Tim Dewar and Sherri Bryan, Owners

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with positive comments to the Staff Hearing Officer:

1. The Commission is in full support of the project.
2. The changes to the gable window as proposed and the simplification of the eave detail of the garage are supportable as presented.
3. This is a special house with architectural significance and it is important that it be maintained as a residence. The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:41 P.M. TO 2:52 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

7. **1321 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA**

A-1 Zone

(2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-027
Application Number: MST2012-00298
Owner: Ernest H. Brooks II
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to conceal exposed electrical conduits on an existing building with metal shrouding. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Jefferson Campus.")

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:52

Present: Lisa Plowman and April Palencia, Peikert Group Architects

Public comment opened at 2:57 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The applicant should return with appropriate architectural or landscape screening of all exposed conduit.
2. The pepper tree can be considered as part of the screening.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 340 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-036
Application Number: MST2012-00295
Owner: Samuel Dumas TTE
Applicant: Tesoro Refining
Architect: LMA Architects
Engineer: A & S Engineering, Inc.
Business Name: USA Gas

(Proposal to convert an existing automobile service station to a mini-mart. The proposal includes removal of the service bays, installation of a new storefront system, and replacement of the existing canopy. New landscaping is also proposed on this 15,600 square foot parcel. Nine parking spaces will be provided and no new floor area is proposed. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit is requested.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit.)

Actual time: 3:15

Present: Thomas Baudette, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:20 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments that the applicant should return with a design consistent with the location, reflecting its importance as a gateway to the City, and consistent with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**9. 205 CHAPALA ST**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-070
Application Number: MST2010-00263
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Applied Earthworks
Architect: Craig Drake

(Proposal to replace the Chapala Street - W. Yanonali Street bridge over Mission Creek. The replacement bridge would be a single-span bridge consisting of a combination of precast and cast-in-place concrete slab with asphalt concrete or polyester concrete overlay on the deck for the road surfacing. City standard sidewalks would be added to both sides of the street on the bridge and would tie into the existing sidewalks along Chapala and Yanonali Streets. New combination vehicular/pedestrian railings would be installed on each side of the bridge. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit to perform this work in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Project Design Approval of the project is requested. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 003-12. Project was last reviewed on March 30, 2011.)

Actual time: 3:29

Present: David Black, Landscape Architect
Craig Drake, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:42 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar for final drawings with comments and condition:

1. Arched openings in the concrete rail are preferred.
2. The metal railing and the use of sandstone as proposed are acceptable.
3. Interpretive signage shall be included indicating the change in sandstone and its history.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/1. Motion carried. (Suding abstained due to absence from review of item. Shallenberger absent.)

FINAL REVIEW**10. 33 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-001
 Application Number: MST2010-00327
 Owner: Unity Shoppe, Inc.
 Architect: PMSM Architects
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Victoria Hall Theater

(Proposed renovation and seismic upgrade including a rerouted circulation pattern at the front entry, reconstruction of the stage house at the south elevation, and raising the existing roof height to 55 feet to accommodate a new fly loft. Changes will occur on the north, east, and south elevations. Project requires City Council approval of a Public Works major encroachment permit. This is a **Structure of Merit**: "Former First Baptist Church." The building is **eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark, inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources, and the National Register of Historic Places.**)

(Final Approval of the project including concrete planter detail and color selection. Project was last reviewed on August 1, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:55

Present: Jason Currie, Project Manager, PMSM
 Steve Metsch, Board Member, Ensemble Theater Company

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:07 P.M. TO 4:10 P.M. ****

Public comment opened at 4:12 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of Details with comment and conditions:

1. The proposed planter is acceptable in material and style.
2. The exterior colors based on Scheme 3 shall be pursued as the most acceptable for a Tudor Revival style of architecture.
3. The applicant agrees to a time-certain commitment of three month to make a presentation to the HLC for proposed exterior painting colors.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/8/8. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**FINAL REVIEW****A. 2010 GARDEN ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-015
Application Number: MST2012-00142
Owner: Girod Family Trust
Landscape Architect: Earthform Design
Contractor: Ben Pettit

(Proposal to remove an existing trellis and deck and to construct a new 170 square foot deck approximately 18 inches off grade. Also proposed is to permit an as-built 10' to 12' combination wall, fence, and hedge on the front property line on Mission Street. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications for encroachment into the setback and for the over-height wall, fence, and hedge. This house is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Willits/Carrel Residence, Crocker Row.")

(Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 027-12.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 700 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-015
Application Number: MST2012-00230
Owner: Ortega Pacific, LLC
Applicant: Tony Stogsdill, Assoc. AIA
Business Name: Panera Bread Bakery

(Proposal to restripe an existing parking lot, adding an accessible space and path of travel, and construct a new trash enclosure. This parcel is in the 85% parking zone of benefit.)

(Review After Final of change to approved trash enclosure and ADA path of travel.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 1722 STATE ST****C-2/R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-021
Application Number: MST2011-00189
Owner: 1722 State Street Investors, LLC
Architect: Jan Hochhauser
Business Name: Former Bank of America

(Proposal to convert an existing two-story, 7,200 square foot bank building to a new surgery center and construct a 5,721 square foot, two-story addition. The existing 52 parking spaces will remain and new landscaping will be added to this 28,875 square foot parcel. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Conditional Use Permit, a Development Plan, a Transfer of Existing Development Rights and a Tentative Subdivision Map for up to eight commercial condominiums. The previously-approved mixed-use project is proposed to be withdrawn.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved project including the following: relocation of transformer, trash enclosure, bike rack, number of roof vents, added window on the north elevation, and handrail changes.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:26 P.M. ****