



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 8, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 2:34 p.m.
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present until 2:34 p.m.
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 JUDY ORÍAS – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Absent
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Absent

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are generally valid for one year. Per SBMC 22.68.110, a project design approval is valid for three years from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted or a building permit has been issued. Projects with a valid land use approval will also automatically extend the project design approval expiration date.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470, extension 3310. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470, extension 3311, or by email at SGantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov. Office hours are 8:30 A.M. to 4:00 P.M., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, June 3, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the Sign Committee review of the proposed signs for Casa Blanca Restaurant & Cantina. He suggested that the applicant's proposal for a large vertical sign be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 25, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 25, 2011 with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Suding abstained from Item 5. Murray abstained from Item 6. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Commissioner Sharpe announced he would be stepping down from Item 3, 813 Anacapa Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Boucher reported on the Sign Committee that met in the morning: During the review of the Consent Calendar, the applicant was requested to restudy the proposed large vertical sign for the Casa Blanca Restaurant & Cantina at 330 State Street.

Commissioner Orías reported that a letter was sent to members of the City Council to request that the Council: 1) Authorize the Historic Landmarks Commission, through its Historic Resources Element Subcommittee, to prepare a work program for the creation of a Historic Resources Element for the City General Plan; 2) Appoint interested and knowledgeable persons, who are representatives of organizations and have indicated interest, along with one member of the City Planning Commission to assist the subcommittee in the preparation of a draft Historic Resources Element.

Commissioner Orías added that the Historic Resources Element Subcommittee would meet on June 9, 2011, at 11:00 a.m. in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, 630 Garden Street.

NEW ITEM – REFERRED FROM CONSENT CALENDAR**40 E ANAPAMU ST****C-2 Zone**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
 Application Number: MST2011-00221
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Patrick Shanahan

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and is included on the **State Historic Resources Inventory: "Santa Barbara Main Library."** Proposal to replace 18,450 square feet of existing built-up roofing over the main section of the Central Library with new Energy Star Title 24-compliant, white PVC membrane roofing material. Also proposed is to replace an existing roof hatch, pipe and conduit supports, roof drains, and one gutter.)

Present: James Dewey, City Facilities & Energy Manager
 Patrick Shanahan, City Supervising Engineer

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the following comments:

1. The Commission supports the use of a Terracotta color membrane rather than the proposed white color to reduce potential impacts to other historic resources in the area, particularly the Santa Barbara County Court House.
2. It was suggested that insulation be installed between the membrane and the roof for energy savings.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**1. 1815 LAGUNA ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-051-009
 Application Number: MST2011-00044
 Owner: Tyler Gildred
 Designer: Tom Kress

(This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Lockwood de Forest, Sr. House."** Proposal for interior alterations to remove three illegal dwelling units and return the building to its legally permitted use as a single-family residence. Also proposed is to construct a new 709 square foot attached two-car garage and roof deck, enclose an existing 40 square foot stairwell from the garage to the house, replace the gazebo siding with new wood and rebuild the railing at the loggia end to match vintage photos, and replace the three-part living room window facing the loggia with a three-part door with wood base panels that will maintain the height and width of the existing opening. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-01018. The project will result in a residence of 7,421 square feet which is a guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) of .31 or 140% of the maximum FAR.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye. The report determined that the building is eligible for listing as a City Landmark and qualifies for listing on the California Register of Historical Resources and the National Register of Historic Places.)

Present: Tom Kress, Designer
 Tyler Gildred, Owner

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian/Associate Planner, stated that staff was involved with the initial process of the design. The applicant has worked hard to resolve any possible negative impacts on the historic resource while still modernizing the house. Staff has read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about his grandfather's importance, the fact that the property is eligible to be landmarked, and that all references cited in the text should have been placed in the bibliography.

Public comment closed at 2:08 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report with the following changes to be reviewed by Staff:

1. The report shall identify the style of architecture correctly:
 - a) Remove the reference to Irving (John) Gill.
 - b) Include language and discussion on the Austrian Secessionist style of architecture.
 - c) It is the modernist building with arts-and-crafts embellishments that makes it an unusual and rare piece of architecture in Southern California.
2. The report needs more information and emphasis on the importance of the significant person that occupied the house; namely, Lockwood de Forest, Senior.

Action: Boucher/Orías, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. **1815 LAGUNA ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:12) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-051-009
 Application Number: MST2011-00044
 Owner: Tyler Gildred
 Designer: Tom Kress

(This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Lockwood de Forest, Sr. House."** Proposal for interior alterations to remove three illegal dwelling units and return the building to its legally permitted use as a single-family residence. Also proposed is to construct a new 709 square foot attached two-car garage and roof deck, enclose an existing 40 square foot stairwell from the garage to the house, replace the gazebo siding with new wood and rebuild the railing at the loggia end to match vintage photos, and replace the three-part living room window facing the loggia with a three-part door with wood base panels that will maintain the height and width of the existing opening. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-01018. The project will result in a residence of 7,421 square feet which is a guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) of .31 or 140% of the maximum FAR.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment. Action may be taken contingent upon acceptance of Historic Structures/Sites Report. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings.)

Present: Tom Kress, Designer
 Tyler Gildred, Owner

Receipt of a letter from Lawrence Marks, neighbor, was acknowledged. He expressed concern that the easement and driveway that crosses his property not be damaged by heavy trucks and construction equipment.

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, spoke about the garage and easement, and asked whether the garage with a deck would compromise the historic footprint of the house.

Gregory Dahlen, adjacent neighbor, expressed support for the project.

Public comment closed at 2:25 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.68.060 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

3. 813 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:31) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-033
 Application Number: MST2010-00372
 Owner: SIMA El Paseo, LP
 Applicant: Thomas McMahan
 Business Name: Wine Cask

(This is a **City Landmark** and is **on the National Register of Historic Places: "El Paseo."** Proposal to permit as-built improvements on the Anacapa Street streetscape and in an interior courtyard at El Paseo including the restoration of an existing historic fountain and new exterior dining furniture including chairs, tables, heaters, and umbrellas. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-00359.)

(Review After Final of change to awning fabric color.)

Present: Thomas McMahan, Applicant

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final for the Sunbrella Parchment color canvas, Style# 4683-000, as proposed.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 5/0/0. (Sharpe stepped down. Boucher/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**NEW ITEM****A. 520 PLAZA RUBIO****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-281-003
Application Number: MST2011-00216
Owner: Tal Family Limited Partnership
Architect: DW Reeves & Associates, AIA

(Proposal to permit an as-built 20' x 19' detached two-car garage that was constructed to replace an existing garage of the same size damaged by a tree fall. The existing single-family residence and garage total 2,100 square feet on an 11,876 square foot parcel. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for an increase in roof height due to a changed roof pitch within the interior yard setback. This project addresses violations called out in zoning information report ZIR2011-00080 and enforcement case ENF2011-00123.)

(Comments only; Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modification.)

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the following comments:

1. The zoning modification request is supportable because it is consistent with the traditional neighborhood development pattern.
2. It is important for the structure to remain on the existing footprint.
3. Return for final approval on the Consent Calendar.
4. Roof tiles shall be terracotta to match the existing residence.

NEW ITEM**B. 40 E ANAPAMU ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
Application Number: MST2011-00221
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Patrick Shanahan

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and is included on the **State Historic Resources Inventory: "Santa Barbara Main Library."** Proposal to replace 18,450 square feet of existing built-up roofing over the main section of the Central Library with new Energy Star Title 24-compliant, white PVC membrane roofing material. Also proposed is to replace an existing roof hatch, pipe and conduit supports, roof drains, and one gutter.)

Referred to the Full Board.

NEW ITEM**C. 1301 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-015
 Application Number: MST2011-00222
 Owner: First Church of Christ Scientist
 Applicant: Curtis Skene
 Architect: Edwards- Pitman Architects, AIA

(Proposal for a new rooftop mechanical unit and screen wall at the rear of a commercial building.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**D. 1316 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00197
 Owner: Peter Benekos
 Architect: Peter Tolkin Architecture

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to enclose 176 square feet of existing outdoor patio area and storage area on the south elevation and other exterior alterations including new paint finishes on walls, windows, doors, gates, and ironwork, a new patio bar, bar window enlargement, stained concrete flooring, and new outdoor furniture; and wall heaters, curtains, awnings, and landscaping.)

(Project Design and Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on plans for the awning, doors, chairs and umbrellas with the following conditions:

1. Bar seats shall be dark wood and cushioned.
2. Not to exceed a total of 12 outdoor heaters.

NEW ITEM**E. 11 W ORTEGA ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-022
 Application Number: MST2011-00223
 Owner: Garrett Van Wyk
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Mission Revival Building."** Proposal for a new 82 square foot patio bar structure with roof within an existing rear patio area of a commercial building. The project requires a change of use of an existing leasehold space.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the following conditions:

1. 1 x 6 tongue and groove stained wood to be used on the roof deck.
2. The new structure shall be a dark brown color.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 114 NATOMA AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-072-009
Application Number: MST2011-00155
Owner: Steven D. Krieg
Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal to repair and rebuild dryrot-damaged rear decks and stairs at the front and rear of a multi-family complex. The front elevation second-floor walkway will also be widened by 18 inches and the rotted wood balcony railing will be replaced with a new wrought iron railing. New exterior light fixtures are also proposed.)

(Review After Final of additional changes including the following: enlarge the second-floor deck at the front courtyard to add 49 square feet; enlarge two first-floor decks at the rear to add 49 square feet; and change the height of the wrought iron railing to 42 inches maximum per Building Code.)

Final approval of Review After Final with the condition that final approval of details shall be reviewed by the City Historian to be consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation.

NEW ITEM**G. 1604 OLIVE ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-132-020
Application Number: MST2011-00226
Owner: Max Drucker
Designer: Adam Cunningham

(This is a designated **Structure of Merit: "Olive House."** Proposal to convert 215 square feet of floor area back to permitted garage space at the rear of an existing single-family residence and convert the detached carport back to a legally permitted two-car garage. Door and window changes are also proposed, as well as the removal of an unpermitted storage shed and lattice partition wall from the carport roof deck. Hardscape installed without a permit will be removed and replaced with grass in accordance with the last-approved site plan. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2011-00233 and zoning information report ZIR2011-00097.)

(Project requires Historic Resource findings.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the following findings and conditions:

- 1. Historic Resource Findings were made as follows:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.
- 2.** Light fixtures shall be traditional to match the architecture.
- 3.** Gutters shall be replaced to match the architecture.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:39 P.M. ****

PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURE AS USED BY CITY DESIGN REVIEW HEARING BODIES

(2:50)

Present: Heather Baker, AICP, Project Planner
Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor

Staff gave an introduction, a 45-minute video presentation of "Driving the Language of Parliamentary Procedure" by Susan Leahy MA.ABS, followed by discussion. Topics covered included Robert Rules of Order, board member and chair roles & responsibilities, motions, main motion, voting, debating, amendments, stepping down and abstaining.

**** TRAINING ENDED AT 3:50 P.M. ****