



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 27, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 2:00 p.m.
- PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Present

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:04 p.m. and again 2:40 p.m. to 3:03 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are generally valid for one year. Per SBMC 22.68.110, a project design approval is valid for three years from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted or a building permit has been issued. Projects with a valid land use approval will also automatically extend the project design approval expiration date.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470, extension 3310. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470, extension 3311, or by email at SGantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov. Office hours are 8:30 A.M. to 4:00 P.M., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, April 22, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 13, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 13, 2011, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Murray abstained from Item 9 and Suding from Item 4. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: La Voie/Suding, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioner Murray would be stepping down from Item 3.
2. Mr. Jacobus stated that the ceiling that used to be in the main lobby of the "Verizon Building" located at 101 W. Cañón Perdido Street was removed by the owner in order to preserve it.
3. Mr. Limón announced that the Planning Division was the recipient of Outstanding Planning Awards from the Central Coast American Planning Association for the following:
 - Update to El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines
 - Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance
 - Solar Energy Awards Program

These documents are worthy of nomination for California Chapter APA Planning Awards as well. Appreciation was expressed for the participation of Design Review Staff as well as Commissioners Boucher, LaVoie, Naylor, Sharpe, and Former Commissioners Steve Hausz and Alex Pujo.

4. Mr. Limón announced that Commissioners have the opportunity to continue supplementing the design review guidelines with details and examples of buildings in the city that can be included in the City's web site and for nomination for future HLC/ABR Design Awards.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Orías reported that the HLC Historic Resources Element Subcommittee has received research information and the first meeting will be planned soon. Mr. Limón added that Council direction is needed on the makeup of participants. Staff will be participant in all meetings.

Commissioner Suding reported on the appeal of the Planning Commission decision with respect to the Highway 101/Salinas Street off ramp project. The decision was upheld by the City Council on April 26 with additional direction on landscaping and maintenance.

FINAL REVIEW1. **100 BLK E CARRILLO ST**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-509
 Application Number: MST2008-00558
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jessica Grant, Project Planner
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith

(This is a revised project description. The City of Santa Barbara, Public Works Department proposes to construct traffic signal, pedestrian, and drainage infrastructure improvements at the intersection of Carrillo and Anacapa Streets. The proposed work is necessary due to a signal visibility issue at the intersection. Traffic signal and pedestrian improvements include the following: 1) Removal of existing single post signals at Carrillo and Anacapa Streets; 2) Installation of seven new traffic signal poles with mast arms over Carrillo Street (two sets) to improve signal visibilities along Carrillo Street, and one mastarm southbound Anacapa Street; 3) New pedestrian signal indicators with countdown heads for all directions with mast arm signals; 4) Relocation of the traffic control equipment cabinet on the southeast side of Carrillo Street; 5) Installation of new ADA-compliant dual directional access ramps at The northeast and southeast corners of the intersection; and 6) Installing up to five new drop inlets (DIs) on the northerly side of Carrillo Street between Anacapa and approximately 250 feet east of Anacapa Street.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project last reviewed on July 21, 2010.)

Present: Jessica Grant, City Project Planner
 Ashleigh Shue, City Project Engineer

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval with the condition that the individual letters of the brass street name insignia (Key # 9 on Sheet 3 of plans) shall be set in new concrete.

Action: Suding/Drury, 7/0/1. (Orías abstained. Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**2. 1201 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(1:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-021
Application Number: MST2011-00159
Owner: Charles D. Ealand
Applicant: Eric Swenumson
Business Name: Maggie's

(Proposal for a 495 square foot addition and exterior alterations at the former State and A Bar and Grill. The proposal includes approximately 1,350 square feet of new solid roof over the existing outdoor dining patio, new columns, new ADA compliant entry ramp at the State Street frontage, new outdoor patio bar, and new awnings. The proposed 495 square foot addition will be located at the rear of the site and will not be visible from either State or E. Anapamu Streets. All new signage to be reviewed under a separate Sign Committee application.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Barry Shulman, Business Owner
Eric Swenumson, Designer
Charles McClure, Landscape Architect
Beau Schmidt, Contractor

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would agree to have the sandstone columns minimized and retain the unused stones to be used on the site? 1/8. (Boucher/La Voie/Murray/Naylor/Orías/Shallanberger/Sharpe/Suding opposed.)

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Sandstone columns shall be retained in their current configuration and size.
2. Reconsider the use of plaster as a pergola element and return with details of the proposed design.
3. Provide detailing of the proposed pergola skylights.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 7/2/0. (Drury/Naylor opposed.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 1727 PROSPECT AVE**

R-2 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-142-004
 Application Number: MST2008-00583
 Owner: Larson Family Trust
 Owner: Phil Larson
 Architect: Amy Taylor

(This structure is **eligible for Structure of Merit designation**. This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 307 square foot, two-car detached garage and construct a new 462 square foot, detached two-car garage with 286 square feet of basement storage and rear access door with new stairs. The existing 13'-0" curb-cut would be extended to 20'-0". Also proposed is to demolish the existing sandstone stairs and stair support walls next to the existing garage. Approval of the project would permit proposed stairs and as-built flagstone steps/pathways at the center of the parcel, a sandstone tree well with new tree and landscaping, new gravel path, planting beds, trees, site lighting, and decorative pots. A zoning modification was approved for the proposed new garage and storage to encroach into the front setback on this 11,105 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. The existing two legal dwelling units on the lot are proposed to remain.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 013-09. Project was last reviewed on April 13, 2010.)

Present: Amy Taylor, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Drawings should reflect what is being proposed and presented to the Commission since any approval would be based on those drawings and not verbal representations.
2. Changes to the drawings should be bubbled and indicated with a delta so that the changes can be tracked.
3. Provide materials and color samples as part of the complete application submittal.
4. Use of faux stone is not acceptable. Alternative materials would be supportable for the base of the building, such as siding to match the existing, vertical board and batten siding, and/or stucco.
5. Reconsider the tree materials such that sufficient and appropriate height trees are included.

Action: La Voie/Suding, 8/0/0. (Murray stepped down.) Motion carried.

Note: The April 13, 2011, minutes were reiterated with respect to the Commission's direction to the applicant: The details of the garage, including the roof pitch, should match the main house, in that it is the primary structure on the site.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**4. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2007-00140
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Henry Lenny
Architect: Gensler
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. The proposed project is a **Revised Master Plan** for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates, focused on the Pool/Fitness Center.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant

Motion: To accept the addendum to the report as presented.

Action: Suding/Sharpe, 8/1/0. (Naylor opposed.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**5. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:08) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00140
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Architect: Gensler
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. The proposed project is a **Revised Master Plan** for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Final Approval is requested for the swimming pool/fitness center. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 004-09. Project was last reviewed on April 13, 2011.)

Present: Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect
 Casey Nagel, Architect
 James Jones, Representing Ownership

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Shallanberger/Boucher, 8/1/0. (Naylor opposed.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:19 P.M. TO 3:29 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
 Application Number: MST2011-00174
 Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(This is a **City Landmark: Lobero Theatre**. Proposal to add one new rooftop HVAC unit and revisions to the front entry landscape/hardscape. Also proposed is a new accessible ramp to be constructed on the west elevation.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment, Historic Resource Findings, and Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark.)

Present: Dawn Ziemer and Richard Krystian, Architects
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect
 Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on George Washington Smith plans with respect to landscape and hardscape on Cañón Perdido Street, the historic design, and appropriateness of brick versus flagstone.

Public comment closed at 3:52 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Provide a Phase 2 Historic Structures Letter Report with respect to the impact that the proposed mechanical equipment, parapet, and placement of stairs in front of the leveled plaza would have on the appearance of the historic structure and setting.
2. Any design should more closely resemble the original design's simplicity and the intent of the original architect.
3. Simplify the plant palette to three or four plant types.
4. Consult with the City Access Advisory Committee with respect to the proposed ADA access ramp.
5. Provide spot elevations of existing and proposed topography.

Action: La Voie/Suding, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

FINAL REVIEW

A. **322 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST** **C-2 Zone**
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-021-028
 Application Number: MST2010-00365
 Owner: Craddock Living Trust
 Architect: Peter Becker Architect

(This structure is **on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Pedotti House."** This is a revised project description: Proposal for residential alterations including the following new work: one pair of French doors, a 10 linear foot long, 4'-6" tall wood fence at the front property line, an 87 linear foot long stucco wall at the interior property line, a wider entry door in the legal accessory building, a new flat glass skylight, a new plaster chimney, and a repaved driveway, and a new 4 linear foot long, 9-0" tall wall with man door between the rear of the house and the front of the accessory building, and a rebuilt wood gate and fence and new trash enclosure. Total development on this 7,405 square foot parcel will be 2,001 square feet and will be 66% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project last reviewed on March 30, 2011.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 801 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-001

Application Number: MST2011-00168

Owner: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency

Architect: James Lencioni

Business Name: Nordstrom eBar

(Proposed exterior changes to an existing storefront including new trim color, new speakers, and new outdoor dining furniture and umbrellas. New signage to be reviewed under separate application.)

Project Design and Final Approval as submitted.**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:18 P.M. ****