



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 28, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent
 PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

BRUCE BARTLETT – Present at 3:00 p.m.

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present from 3:30 p.m. to 4:11 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, April 23, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the Zoning Ordinance changes approved by the City Council related to the extension of project approvals. He asked that the Commission be informed of projects that are given an extension.

Mr. de Forest also asked if the Commission is going to provide the Plan Santa Barbara team with feedback on the Draft General Plan. Chair Naylor responded that individual comments were requested by Staff, but not by the Commission.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 14, 2010.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 14, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Murray abstained. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Adams/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) The project at 228 E. Victoria Street, which was continued two weeks to today's meeting, was postponed two additional weeks at the architect's request.
- b) An appeal of the Historic Landmarks Commission's action on the project at 517 Chapala Street will be heard by the City Council at 2:00 p.m. on Tuesday, June 22. It was requested that at least two Commission members attend the hearing to represent the HLC.
- c) The Annual Workshop for City Advisory Groups will be held on Wednesday, May 19, from 4:30 to 5:30 p.m. at the Faulkner Gallery of the Central Library, 40 E. Anapamu Street.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Suding reported on the Lower Mission Creek flood control project.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. BUDGET FOR FISCAL YEAR 2011**

(1:43) Staff: Bettie Weiss, City Planner
(Presentation of Community Development Department budget information for FY2011.)

Present: Paul Casey, Community Development Director
Sue Gray, Administrative Services Manager

Discussion held.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 34 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
Application Number: MST2009-00266
Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (old Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 23,125 square feet of commercial/retail space, 37 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 78 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height. Planning Commission approval is requested for a tentative subdivision map and development plan.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and appendix and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required, and the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources applies and shall be on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**3. 34 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:07)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
Application Number: MST2009-00266
Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (old Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 23,125 square feet of commercial/retail space, 37 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 78 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height. Planning Commission approval is requested for a tentative subdivision map and development plan.)

(Review of revised Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates as requested by Staff. The report determined that the mosaic mural on the south elevation of the existing commercial building is eligible for City Landmark status.)

Present: Debra Andalaro, Senior Planner

Staff comments: Ms. Andalaro stated that the historical consultant revised the HSSR to focus on the potential cumulative impacts of the project on the adjacent historic landmark and the view of its tower.

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about preserving the Arlington Theater's monumentality.

Public comment closed at 2:20 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report with the condition that on page 49 the last sentence under the subtitle "Analysis" be stricken from the report.

Action: Pujo/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**4. 35 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:22)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Applicant: MF Santa Barbara LLC
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design Landscape Architects
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Barbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes 114 hotel units, nine timeshare units, 21,654 square feet of commercial floor area, and 243 underground and on-grade parking spaces.)

(Preliminary Approval of Area "A" at 35 State Street and continued Concept Review of Area "B" at 36 State Street and Area "C" at 118 State Street is requested. City Council approved the project on December 11, 2001, and a Substantial Conformance Determination was issued by the City Administrator on April 19, 2010. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-103.)

Present: Robert Farrell, Managing Director
 Melissa Cinarli, Project Manager
 Mark Shields, Architect
 Kim True, Landscape Project Manager
 Allison De Busk, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 2:59 p.m. and reopened at 3:16 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the tower in Area C; the pergola in Area B; shading at the terrace at Area C and the use of lawn there.

Public comment closed at 3:00 p.m. and reclosed at 3:18 p.m.

Review of Area "A" [also see MST2007-00538]**Motion: Preliminary Approval of Area "A" with the following conditions:**

1. This area should move forward ahead of the other areas to give it a sense of community priority.
2. The State Street elevation of the new addition should reflect its position as a more subordinate aspect to the existing building of the Californian façade. Explore re-proportioning the glazing to the plaster.
3. The plant palette is acceptable. Consider using *Platanus racemosa* in various areas, including the riparian areas.
4. Integrate the landscape plan with the Mission Creek Improvement project, especially along the creek bank.
5. Verify with Staff that the footprint on the south corner of the building is consistent with the previously approved project.

Action: Pujó/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Areas “B” and “C” continued indefinitely with the following comments:

“Area B”:

1. Revert back to the simplicity of the previously proposed elevation. At least one Commissioner felt that a redefinition of the entry should be part of that simplicity.
2. The trellis should be further integrated.

“Area C”:

1. There is a preference for more landscape with the suggestion of more succulents and perhaps the use of an herb garden.
2. Apply simplicity and simplification to the elevations; the railroad track elevation should embody that feeling.
3. Provide skyline trees at the Helena Street elevation and more landscaping in general.
4. Look into opportunities for temporary art installations and a water feature.
5. Reevaluate the expression of the public plaza to be more in keeping with outdoor spaces in Santa Barbara.

Action: Adams/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:04 P.M. TO 4:11 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 925 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:11)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-313-027
 Application Number: MST2010-00124
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Dawn Sophi Ziemer

(Proposal to remodel a former auto muffler repair shop into office space for City Fire Station No. 1. The project includes an upgrade of the front facade and streetscape including repainting the building and installing new sidewalk and landscaping. Also proposed is restriping the existing parking lot and installation of an electric gate on the south side of the building.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with the Chapala Street Design Guidelines.)

Present: Dawn Ziemer and Richard Khristian, KBZ Architects

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. There is a preference for an expression of symmetry at the elevation with the arches and how the storefront system is expressed.
2. Provide a developed landscape plan.
3. Replace the existing chain link fence with a wrought iron fence to match the proposed wrought iron gate.
4. Restudy the proposed shed roof.

Action: Suding/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM****A. 1036 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-001
 Application Number: MST2010-00099
 Owner: Levon Investments
 Architect: Richard Chavira

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Elks Club Building, Lloyds Bank." Proposal to remove an automated teller machine (ATM) from its current location, patch wall to match existing, and install a new ATM in a new location on the same elevation with a minor alteration to the landscaping and pavers.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A-2 of ATM only; signage over new ATM shall be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate application.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 2300 GARDEN ST**

RETIRED Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: M2 Architecture
 Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review After Final of change to Shop Building Foundation.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:29 P.M. ****