



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 17, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair*– Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*– Present until 3:28 p.m. and again at 4:00 p.m.
 ROBERT ADAMS– Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER– Present
 MICHAEL DRURY– Present
 FERMINA MURRAY– Present
 ALEX PUJO– Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 1:34 p.m.
 PHIL SUDING– Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW– Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: MICHAEL SELF– Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON– Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:46 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian– Absent
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician– Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary– Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, March 12, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

An HLC Survey Subcommittee meeting was held at 10:00 a.m. on Wednesday, March 17, in the Community Development Director's Conference Room, 630 Garden Street.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

No comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 3, 2010.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 3, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Murray, 7/0/1. (Boucher abstained. Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) The Commission was reminded that the next HLC meeting will take place on Tuesday, March 30, at 2:00 p.m. in the David Gebhard Meeting Room, with the Consent Calendar to be reviewed at the regular time in the Fishbowl Conference Room.
- b) Item 1 at 3626 San Remo Drive, Item 4 at 517 Chapala Street, and Item 7 at 1221-1235 State Street were postponed two weeks at the applicants' request. Item A on the Consent Calendar, 222 E. Carrillo Street, was referred to the full board for review and would be heard at approximately 3:00 pm.

Motion: To postpone Items 1, 4 and 7 for two weeks.

Action: Pujo/Suding, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

2. Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, spoke about information received from the Trust for Architectural Easements with respect to the City's adaptation of the Mills Act Program.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Adams reported on the Lower Mission Creek Design Subcommittee.
2. Commissioners Boucher and Murray reported on the Historic Survey Subcommittee that met in the morning. The Lower Riviera historic district survey will be submitted in April. Another two surveys will be completed during the summer.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. **3626 SAN REMO DR** E-3/SD-2 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
 Application Number: MST2009-00325
 Owner: Madsen Trust
 Agent: Alexandra Cole

(Proposal to subdivide one legal lot (known as parcels 053-231-011 & -010) into four legal lots. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing 3,137 square foot residence, a detached garage with studio apartment, a shed, a lath house and driveway. The four proposed parcels have development envelopes which provide a creek setback and implementation of a creek restoration plan. Development of the lots is not a part of this application.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. The report finds the structure to be eligible for Structure of Merit status.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

2. **13 E CABRILLO BLVD** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(1:46) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-111-012
 Application Number: MST2010-00033
 Owner: Virginia and Renee Castagnola Family
 Architect: James Zimmerman
 Business Name: Lighthouse Restaurant

(This proposed project is related to the E. Cabrillo Bridge Replacement Project. Proposed additions and alterations to an existing 5,155 square foot commercial building on a 7,274 square foot parcel in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The changes include demolition of 1,166 square feet on the first floor (part of which is currently overhanging Mission Creek), a 1,036 square foot second floor addition and stairway, and a new 350 square foot outdoor patio on the first floor. City Council approval is requested for a variance for the project to encroach into the ten foot E. Cabrillo Blvd. setback, Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit and a zoning modification to encroach into the twenty foot front yard setback, and the Chief Building official will need to make Development Along Creeks findings as well as assure compliance with Mission Creek development standards. The project will result in credit of 130 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit.)

Present: Jim Zimmerman, Architect
Virginia and Renee Castagnola
Steve Wiley, City Attorney

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, commented that the Compatibility Analysis criteria must be met.

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the lighthouse not belonging there, and questioned whether the proposed second floor would block views from Cabrillo Boulevard.

Public comment closed at 1:58 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. The landscape buffer between the creek and the building is much appreciated; it is an amenity to the City and community.
2. There is concern with how the second story is expressed; it should be a more traditional idiosyncratic view of Santa Barbara architecture with thicker walls and recessed windows.
3. Further explore the expression of the staircase, especially at the roof. It was suggested that it not be a chimney plaster element.
4. The second story should integrate better into the overall building and not appear separated; create more singularity.
5. Provide first and second-floor roof plans, sections, more elevations, and more descriptive photographs of existing conditions.

Action: Pujo/Suding, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:28 P.M. TO 2:56 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. **222 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-013
Application Number: MST2010-00072
Applicant: Dan Schultz
Business Name: CVS Pharmacy

(This building is on the city's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Pythian Castle Lodge Hall."
Proposal to install printed window shades in the front windows of a commercial retail store.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely due to applicant's absence.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**4. 517 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2005-00088
 Owner: H&R Investments, LP
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(The proposed project consists of a lot merger and the construction of a mixed-use development with six two-bedroom residential condominium units totaling 9,999 square feet (net) and two commercial condominium spaces totaling 2,872 square feet (net). One of the units would be affordable. A modification to allow the 10% open space on the second floor is requested. Seventeen parking spaces are proposed.)

(Second In-Progress Review. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 030-06.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONTINUED ITEM – Referred from the Consent Calendar**222 E CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-292-028
 Application Number: MST2010-00044
 Owner: Charles Jarvis Trust
 Applicant: The Towbes Group
 Architect: Edwards & Pitman Architect

(This building is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: "W.C. Logan Building." Proposal to replace 492 square feet of existing rooftop air handling equipment with new on an existing two-story commercial building.)

Present: Richard Redmond

Public comment opened at 3:05 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about obtaining a smaller cooling system or hiding it with an architectural projection.

Public comment closed at 3:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Story poles shall be reinstalled and pictures shall be taken.
2. Study sinking the equipment in some fashion.
3. The applicant's engineer is asked to attend the next meeting to discuss alternatives.
4. Staff is to research what screening is allowed to exceed the maximum allowable 60 foot height on buildings.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:12 P.M. TO 3:27 P.M. ****

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**5. 110 W SOLA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:27) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-062-010
 Application Number: MST2007-00413
 Owner: Carmac & Associates, LLC
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects
 Landscape Architect: Derrick Eichelberger

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to demolish an existing, one-story 15,730 square foot commercial office building and construct a new, three-story, 39'-6" tall mixed-use development. The project will comprise four residential condominium units ranging in size from 2,088 square feet to 2,639 square feet and three commercial condominium units totaling 2,424 square feet. Fifteen covered parking spaces will be provided on the ground level of this 15,930 square foot parcel. There will be approximately 470 cubic yards of grading excavation. This project has received Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map, the condominium development, and a zoning modification for encroachment into the interior yard setback at the west elevation. This project will also require an HLC waiver of the six-foot fence/decorative wall requirement at the property line between the subject parcel and the adjacent, residentially-zoned parcel. Original Historic Structures/Sites Report reviewed under MST2006-00427.)

(In-Progress review of landscaping only. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing officer Resolution No. 079-09 and an HLC waiver of the requirement for a fence or wall at the property line adjacent to a residential zone.)

Present: Derrick Eichelberger, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the landscaping and how it will tie in with the City Landmark on the Chapala Street side; the roof gardens that will be very visible, causing aesthetic confusion; and privacy concerns for residents.

Public comment closed at 3:33 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The applicant was complimented for the upgrade and vast improvement over existing conditions.
2. Parkways: Explore expanding the tree wells or changing the concrete for groundcover.
3. Sola Street: Study the potential of trees other than the sweetshade (*hymenosporum*).
4. Roof gardens: Revise or demonstrate that the proposed trees and umbrellas would not be visible.
5. Chapala Street: Place a smaller tree other than oak (*quercus agrifolia*); metrosideros and olive were suggested.
6. Northeast property line planter: Vines were suggested.
7. Southwest corner: It was suggested that the Upham Hotel be looked to for inspiration.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:48 P.M. TO 3:54 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 2420 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

(3:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-025
 Application Number: MST2010-00020
 Owner: Kent Hodgetts
 Architect: Lenvik and Minor Architects

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Bernhard and Irene Hoffmann Residence." Proposal to construct a new swimming pool, flagstone pool apron, above-ground pool equipment enclosure, realign and resurface an existing driveway, and construct new site walls.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Historic Resource Findings.)

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Architect
 Kent Hodgetts, Owner

The Commission held a site visit on Monday, March 15, to look at the proposed swimming pool orientation.

Public comment opened at 4:04 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed support for the project.

Public comment closed at 4:06 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners are comfortable with the pool orientation as proposed? 5/3.
 (Murray/Naylor/Sharpe opposed. Pujo abstained.)

How many Commissioners would prefer that the north wall at the terrace be plaster? 2/6.
 (Adams/Boucher/Murray/Naylor/Sharpe/Suding opposed. Pujo abstained.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The length of the swimming pool might best be extended so as to relate better with the north-south Ych axis.
2. Consider that the pool be aligned on its long axis, better relating to the music room. It was suggested that the center line of the pool and the center line of the music room window be aligned.
3. Consider placing the pool out of the ground at the west end to make it more traditional.
4. Study alternative materials for the walls and fences for the pool and the music room patio area. The transparency of wrought iron was suggested; it would be easily reversible at a lower cost.

Action: Suding/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 1221 - 1235 STATE ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-002
Application Number: MST2009-00526
Owner: 1221 Victoria Court, LP
Agent: Lori Smyth
Contractor: Ron Esposito

(The structure with the address of 1227 - 1233 State Street is a designated Structure of Merit: "Upper Hawley Building." Proposal to paint all structures in Victoria Court and make a minor plaster change to an entry arch. Also proposed is to legalize the as-built installation of entryway tile. Approval of this project will abate enforcement case ENF2008-01313.)

(Third Concept Review. Project requires Historic Resource findings. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM****A. 222 E CARRILLO ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-292-028
Application Number: MST2010-00044
Owner: Charles Jarvis Trust
Applicant: The Towbes Group
Architect: Edwards & Pitman Architect

(This building is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: "W.C. Logan Building." Proposal to replace 492 square feet of existing rooftop air handling equipment with new on an existing two-story commercial building.)

Referred to the Full Board.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 128 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004
Application Number: MST2003-00243
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties, Ltd.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge
Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(This is a revised Project Description: Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story, mixed-use development. The proposal consists of the following alterations: remove two "as-built" residential units, convert existing residential garages to storage, and add a laundry room. Also proposed are exterior changes to the existing garage doors, new doors and changes to windows, moped and bicycle parking, removal of an "as-built" balcony partition, new gates and walls, closing off the driveway along Santa Barbara Street, and a landscape plan. Development Plan approval is requested to allow 2,718 square feet of new non-residential floor area for the conversion of the garages. Zoning modifications are requested to eliminate the existing residential parking and to not provide new parking for the converted commercial square footage.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-07.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A3.11.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:42 P.M. ****