



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 11, 2009 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 3:35 p.m.
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present until 3:35 p.m.
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present until 1:41 p.m. and again at 1:56 p.m.
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 3:35 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Thursday, November 5, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:31):

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 28, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 28, 2009, including the clarification of the motion's comments for the project at 34 W. Victoria Street.

Action: Adams/Pujo, 6/0/2. (Drury/Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: To table the ratification of the Consent Calendar to the end of the meeting.

Action: Sharpe/Adams, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

(4:20)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item B, which was also reviewed by Robert Adams.

Action: Adams/Murray, 5/0/0. (Boucher/Sharpe/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Commissioner Sharpe would be stepping down from Item #2, 101 W. Canon Perdido.

b) A Plan Santa Barbara and Planning Commission joint worksession will take place at 1 p.m. on Thursday, November 19, 2009, in Council Chambers at City Hall. The Staff Report may be viewed on the general plan update website at www.youplansb.org.

2. Commissioner Adams announced there will be a lecture entitled "Historical Gardens of Santa Barbara." Kellam de Forest added that the noted Santa Barbara landscape architect, Sydney Baumgartner, will show slides of many of the most celebrated gardens of Santa Barbara and Montecito taken in 1926. Her lecture is based on the lectures given by Elizabeth Kellam de Forest in the 1970s. It is to take place on Thursday, November 19, at 7:00 p.m. on the 1st floor of the Santa Barbara County Planning Commissioner's Conference Room, 123 E. Anapamu Street.

3. Commissioner Shallenberger announced he would be stepping down from Item 3, 633 E. Cabrillo Blvd.
4. Marck Aguilar, Redevelopment Supervisor, announced that the Plaza de la Guerra Infrastructure Improvement project is returning to City Council with a revised concept proposal. It is scheduled to be heard on Tuesday, November 24, 2009. The City Council/Redevelopment Agency Board meeting will begin at 2:00 p.m. in Council Chambers at City Hall. The meeting agenda will be available from the City Clerk and on the City's website on the Thursday prior to the hearing date.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Drury reported on the West Beach Art Project: The Syuxtun Story Circle is complete. He commented that it is quite extraordinary and encouraged everyone to go see it.

PUBLIC HEARING

710 ANACAPA ST

(1:41) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013

(Consideration to adopt a resolution to designate the structure known as the "Myers Cottage" as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.)

Staff present: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian
Carlos Adame, Owner

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that there is no reason the cottage could not be designated as a City of Santa Barbara Historic Landmark.

Public comment closed at 1:51 p.m.

Motion: To adopt a resolution to designate the Myers Cottage, located at 710 Anacapa Street, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit with the following comments:

1. The sandstone wall, front yard lawn area and steps in front of the house shall be included in the designation.
2. The name shall be changed in the resolution to Carpenter's Gothic Cottage.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Pujo stepped down.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**561 W MOUNTAIN DR**

(1:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-110-018
(Consideration of Intent to Hold a Public Hearing.)

Staff present: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian

The Commission was requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to Hold a Public Hearing on December 2, 2009, to consider the structure at 561 West Mountain Drive, known as "Jorgensen Ranch," be designated a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 1:57 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the designation should include the area around the house that has retained a portion of the original landscaping.

Public comment closed at 1:58 p.m.

Motion: To adopt a resolution of intention to hold a Public Hearing on December 2, 2009, to consider a request by the property owner to designate the structure, located at 561 West Mountain Drive, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit. The boundaries to be designated shall be included in the resolution in the form of a map.

Action: Sharpe/Adams, 7/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**1. 35 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:07) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
Application Number: MST97-00357
Applicant: MF Santa Barbara, LLC
Architect: DesignARC
Agent: Ken Marshall
Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.
Landscape Architect: Philip Suding

(Proposal for Entrada de Santa Barbara (formerly the Ritz-Carlton Club) involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 22-120 State Street, 15 East Mason Street, 125 State Street, and the State Street right-of-way between Mission Creek and the Union Pacific Railroad right of way.)

(Single Concept Review of revised project. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-103.)

Present: Melissa Cinarli, Project Manager
Mark Shields, Architect
Phil Suding, Landscape Architect
Ken Marshall, Contractor
Allison De Busk, City Project Planner

Public comment opened at 2:43 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about various grounds of Area C pushing into State Street; the third story elements are still much too massive; and that maybe there should be a green wall on the south side of Area B instead of sandstone.

Public comment closed at 2:45 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners are in favor of prioritizing the open space in Area C to the increase in density in Area B? No vote.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the City Administrator with the following comments:

- 1) The mass, bulk and scale of Area A remains untouched; the mass, bulk and scale of Area B is relatively comparable to the entitled project; the mass, bulk, and scale of Area C has been vastly reduced and more in keeping with the historic district.
- 2) Review the curbside parking on Mason Street and the need to accommodate hotel guests.
- 3) Architecturally, the Commission supports the new direction, but asks that the elements be simplified and be less dramatic wherever possible, including the scaling down the elevator towers.
- 4) Break up the public commercial spaces A and F in Area C to make the scale of the project more compatible with the rest of State Street.
- 5) Pay attention to the Area B elevation on Helena Avenue regarding the driveways; that is, enhance the pedestrian experience along Helena Avenue, considering there are a lot of driveways there.
- 6) The landscape choices should integrate well with the State Street view shed/corridor.
- 7) The landscaping looks substantial, which is supportable.

Action: Pujol/Boucher, 4/4/0. (Adams/Boucher/Drury/Sharpe opposed because they believe it is premature to specifically say that Area B should be the same size as it was in the entitled scheme, and that there may be a better solution by taking some of Area B and putting it into Area C and making a better project out of it.) **Motion withdrawn.**

Substitute

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the City Administrator with the following comments:

1. The Commission is confirming the comments made at the October 14 meeting that this project continues to be an improvement on the previous proposal.
2. The Commission continues to support the increase in open space at Area C.
3. There are concerns about the commercial area in Area C.
4. The Commission is reserving comments and will not be making a decision regarding the prioritization of Area C's open area and its affect on the massing of Area B.
5. It is the wish of the Commission for the applicant to explore the affect in hotel drop-off and transportation on Mason Street.
6. There is concern with respect to the driveways on Helena Street at Area B.

Action: Drury/Murray, 7/1/0. (Sharpe opposed.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:35 P.M. TO 3:37 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**2. 101 W CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:37)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-042-023
 Application Number: MST2009-00397
 Owner: Verizon California, Inc.
 Agent: Blu Croix, Ltd.
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a one-lot subdivision into two new lots and conversion of existing office space into four commercial condominium units in an existing four-story telecommunications switch facility. Also proposed on this 75,134 square foot parcel is the installation of a new ADA accessible lift at the Chapala Street entry and street improvements including a new bulbout and landscaping at the south corner of the intersection of Chapala and W. Canon Perdido Streets. No new floor area is proposed. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for the Tentative Subdivision Map and the condominium conversion.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval.)

Present: Michael Morgan, Representative
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect
 Stacey Wilson, City Assistant Transportation Planner

Public comment opened at 3:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments:

1. The railings into the front entry should be more traditional and in keeping with the simplicity of El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
2. The ADA access system should be less intrusive.
3. The front landscaping planters should be addressed with revitalized landscape, including studying replacing the Hollywood Junipers in front and addressing groundcover.
4. The applicant should work with the city to adjust the location of the very important Jacaranda canopy tree.

Action: Adams/Pujo, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Sharpe stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 633 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:09)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-013
 Application Number: MST2009-00486
 Owner: Fess Parker Doubletree Hotel
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLC
 Landscape Architect: Bob Cunningham

(Proposal to construct a new, one-story, 240 square foot stucco building for use as the tennis office at an existing hotel.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Substantial Conformance Determination.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with positive comments to the Planning Commission regarding the landscaping and the mass, bulk and scale. The architectural improvements to the building are acceptable and appropriate to its diminutive mass.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 5/0/0. (Shallanberger/Sharpe stepped down. Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

CONTINUED ITEM

A. 1935 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-007
 Application Number: MST2009-00310
 Owner: Serfas Service Station, LP
 Applicant: Fiedler Group
 Business Name: AM-PM Minimarket

(Proposal for exterior changes to an existing service station/mini market including the following: repaint existing commercial building and fuel islands, replace the entry door, add a new ADA pedestrian path of travel along the northwest side of the lot and new truncated domes at the existing ramp, restripe parking lot for seven parking spaces, add perimeter planting at parking area, and permit as-built installation of two antennas at rear of building.)

This item was postponed to December 2, 2009, at the applicant's request.

FINAL REVIEW

B. 1704 STATE ST C-2/R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-017
 Application Number: MST2007-00494
 Owner: 1704 State Street
 Architect: Hochhauser Blatter

(Proposal for expansion of the existing Santa Barbara Artificial Kidney Center. The project includes the demolition of an existing 992 square foot structure formerly known as the DAC Video Store and the original bank teller drive-thru area. The proposed project includes the construction of a new, one-story, 5,693 square foot addition to an existing, two-story, 11,742 square foot medical office building. A total of 44 parking spaces are proposed, along with landscaping and repairs to the existing building. The project will require Planning Commission approval of the Development Plan, a Zoning Modification for a reduction in the required number of parking spaces, and a Conditional Use Permit.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 15 E ANAPAMU ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-028
 Application Number: MST2009-00265
 Owner: Santa Barbara Oddfellows Lodge
 Applicant: Eric Lassen

(Proposal to demolish 365 square feet of existing rooftop structures and enclose 542 square feet of the second floor rooftop area, and other exterior alterations at the rear of an existing commercial building. Also proposed is to install a new elevator, extend an existing balcony along the east elevation, increase the height of an existing rooftop parapet wall, install one new door and two new windows, and install new exterior light fixtures.)

(Final approval of exterior details is requested.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A8.1.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 435 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-007
 Application Number: MST2009-00484
 Owner: Stella and James Anthes
 Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio
 Business Name: Whiskey Richard's

(Proposal to recess an existing storefront and remodel the facade to create a new outdoor dining area. This will result in a Measure "E" credit of 250 square feet. New signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

This item was postponed to December 2, 2009, at the applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 418 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-024
 Application Number: MST2009-00236
 Owner: Gregory and Cheryl Young
 Architect: Howard Wittausch
 Business Name: India House

(Proposal to abate enforcement case ENF2009-00268 to upgrade roof trusses and remodel an existing storefront entry. The entry remodel will consist of recessing the storefront entrance 12'- 6" to provide covered, outdoor dining at the street front. This will result in a Measure E square footage credit of 488 square feet.)

(Review After Final of change in arch material from tile to plaster.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final as submitted.