



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 30, 2009 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

| HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details) | | |
|--|-----------|--|
| CONCEPT REVIEW | Required | <u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable. |
| | Suggested | <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project. |
| PRELIMINARY REVIEW | Required | Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips. |
| | Suggested | <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate. |
| FINAL & CONSENT | Required | Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable. |

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, September 25, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:32):

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the following issues:

1. 301 E. Cañón Perdido Street with regard to building alterations.
2. Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, 221 N. Nopal Street, with regard to current alterations and project review history.
3. Mission Canyon Bridge with regard to stones that have once again been hit by a vehicle.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 16, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 16, 2009.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item F, which was reviewed by Robert Adams.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Drury would be absent from the meeting.
- b) The annual recruitment for City Advisory Group members is in progress. It was noted that resignations from current advisory group members must be received by the City Clerk's Office no later than Wednesday, October 7, in order for the position to be included in this recruitment process. The application deadline is Friday, October 23, at 5:00 p.m.

Interviews for perspective HLC members by the City Council:

Tuesday, November 10, at 4:00 p.m. (estimated time)

Tuesday, November 17, at 6:00 p.m.; and

Tuesday, November 24, at 4:00 p.m. (estimated time)

Appointments will be made: Tuesday, December 15

The recruitment information, list of the current vacancies, vacancy notices, and the Application for Appointment may be obtained at the office of the City Clerk at City Hall, 721 Anacapa Street, or by going to the city's website at [http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Boards and Commissions/Application.htm](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Boards_and_Commissions/Application.htm).

- c) Staff recently finished adding more photographs to the online photo gallery of architectural details appropriate in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The gallery is in addition to photos in the recently updated EPV Guidelines. Steve Hausz was thanked for his wonderful photography.
2. Mr. Jacobus announced that the Mills Act was adopted by City Council and applications will be made available to the public at the City's Planning and Zoning counter. The program assists property owners in the restoration of Structure of Merit and City Landmark buildings that are below a value of \$1.5 million by reducing the property taxes for those savings to be used in the restoration process.

Mr. Limón added that, as historic resource surveys are conducted, properties that may be candidates will be targeted. This will also be used as an incentive to negotiate and discuss designations with applicants. There is a limit of eight contracts per year and two of them can be commercial properties.
3. Commissioner Shallenberger commented that the Granada Tower antenna equipment is in the process of being removed.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Shallenberger reported that the El Encanto Hotel neighbors have been expressing support for revisions to the proposed project, which is in contrast with previous years. Mr. Jacobus added that, in spite of the general neighborhood support of the compromise, the Planning Commission decision has been appealed again. Commissioners Adams and Shallenberger volunteered to attend the City Council meeting on November 10 to represent the HLC.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. POTENTIAL LIST

(1:53) Staff member: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian
(Request by Staff to add the residence at 603 E. Valerio Street (APN 027-142-010) to the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Structures and Sites List.)

Present: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian

Motion: To add the residence at 603 E. Valerio Street to the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Structures and Sites List.

Action: Adams/Murray, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEM**2. HLC FIVE YEAR GOALS**

(1:57) Staff member: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner
Bettie Weiss, City Planner

Mr. Limón provided a background on the need for HLC to establish goals. He also gave past examples of its effectiveness.

Discussion held and a request was made by the Commission for a discussion item on Plan Santa Barbara in two weeks.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**3. 525 W JUNIPERO ST / 540 W PUEBLO ST**

C-O Zone

(2:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-090-046
Application Number: MST2007-00092
Owner: Cancer Center of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Review for the new Cancer Center of Santa Barbara. The proposed project involves 10 parcels and will include the demolition of 18,690 square feet of the existing 20,130 square foot medical facility and accessory structures, to be reconstructed further away from Mission Creek, and demolition of 6 existing residential buildings. Proposal for construction of a new 52,069 square foot, three-story, Cancer Center, a 56,422 square foot, four-story, 164 space, parking structure, an 18 space parking lot, for a total of 182 on-site parking spaces, and 3 new residential buildings totaling 6,739 square feet. The proposal will result in 53,509 square feet of commercial space and 6 new residential units, for a total of 11 residential units. The project includes the removal of 9 existing trees and proposed addition of 11 trees. The project requires Planning Commission review for Development Plan Approval findings.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan, Ph.D. The report concludes that five of the structures are not significant and one of the structures is worthy of Structure of Merit status.)

Present: Shelley Bookspan, Historical Consultant
Brian Cearnal, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that what is being presented is an addition to the report that was previously reviewed by the Commission. Both reports are to be incorporated and a complete version will be submitted to Staff for the permanent record. Staff has read the report and recommends its acceptance.

Public comment opened at 2:36 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on various aspects of the report.

Public comment closed at 2:40 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report with the following comments:

- 1) The Commission strongly recommends to the Planning Commission and Architectural Board of Review that a larger spatial buffer be provided between the homes on West Junípero Street and the new project in the interest of maintaining the historic character of the existing neighborhood.
- 2) The report will be modified to include a site map which delineates the affected parcels and includes the existing residences.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Shallanberger stepped down. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 536 STATE ST C-M Zone

(2:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-001
 Application Number: MST2009-00444 [not MST2007-00569]
 Owner: 536 State Street, LLC
 Architect: Dawn Sherry
 Business Name: Joe's Cafe

(Proposal to remove existing abandoned rooftop equipment and install four new air conditioning units and associated equipment. New equipment will be concealed behind a parapet and will not be visible from the street.)

(Referred up to Full Board from Consent Agenda.)

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:05 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for final details.

Action: Pujo/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 28 ANACAPA ST OC/SD-3 Zone

(3:13) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-113-009
Application Number: MST2009-00193
Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
Owner: Jason Leggitt
Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal to construct a new entry paseo to connect two privately owned parcels at 28 and 32 Anacapa Street to a City parking lot located at 15 Santa Barbara Street. The project would include the relocation of a city streetlight and an existing palm tree, and new landscaping. The proposal would not eliminate any parking lot spaces and no exterior alterations are proposed to the buildings at 28 and 32 Anacapa Street at this time. The project is located in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and will require a Coastal Exemption.)

(Project requires Coastal Review. Final HLC approval cannot be given until a public easement is procured.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
Kim Hughes, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and indefinitely continued.

Action: Pujon/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:22 P.M. TO 3:31 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 34 W VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone

(3:31) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
Application Number: MST2009-00266
Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 23,125 square feet of commercial/retail space, 38 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 87 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height. Planning Commission approval is requested for a tentative subdivision map and a zoning modification for the residential units to encroach into the interior yard setback.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Planning Commission approval.)

Present: Joe Andrulaitis and Brian Cearnal, Architects
 Margaret Cafarelli, Owner
 Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the proposed market and the “green” roof.

Public comment closed at 4:01 p.m.

- 1 Straw votes: How many Commissioners find the proposed mass, bulk and scale compatible? 1/5.
 (Adams/Boucher/Naylor/Murray/Sharpe opposed.)
- 2 How many Commissioners find that the project has been designed sensitive to the adjacent landmark? 6/0.
- 3 How many Commissioners find the proposed location for the mural appropriate? 6/0.
- 4 How many Commissioners find the amount of open space appropriate? 3/2/1.
 (Boucher/Sharpe opposed. Murray abstained.)
- 5 How many Commissioners find the architectural character compatible with the City and neighborhood? 6/0.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

- 1) Provide a real-time model.
- 2) Reduce the amount of the three-stories in the center section.
- 3) Reduce the three-story straight façade on the east and west that face the two paseos.
- 4) Reduce the amount of two stories on the sidewalk to help open up more views to the Arlington Theater building.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 5/1/0. (Pujo opposed because he finds the two-story element on Victoria Street appropriate as proposed. Shallenberger stepped down. Drury absent.)
 Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

CONTINUED ITEM

- A. 1316 STATE ST C-2 Zone
 Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-133-001
 Application Number: MST2009-00364
 Owner: Ronchietto Trust
 Designer: Ernesto Busnelli
 Business Name: Café Buenos Aires

(Proposal to install new windows to act as wind barriers in an existing streetscape dining patio. The area of work will be in three arched openings and two currently wrought iron-gated entries on the Arlington Avenue elevation.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

This item was postponed two weeks to October 14, 2009.

CONTINUED ITEM

B. 702 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-012
Application Number: MST2009-00407
Owner: Hortensia Ortega Luera
Architect: DesignARC Architects
Business Name: Paradise Café

(Proposal to construct a new 612 square foot wood trellis with retractable canvas awning over an existing outdoor dining patio.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

This item was postponed two weeks to October 14, 2009.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

C. 2 W MISSION ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-311-013
Application Number: MST2009-00314
Owner: Tafejian Family Trust
Applicant: Francisca Edwards
Architect: Gil García
Business Name: Santa Barbara Green Care Collective

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 600 square foot commercial building including new storefront window glass, six exterior dome cameras, and a new recessed door entry, resulting in a credit of 15 square feet of Measure "E" floor area. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Performance Standard Permit is requested for a Medical Marijuana Dispensary.)

(Review after Final of changes to entry and lighting.)

Final Approval with the condition that no lanterns will be placed on the Mission Street elevation.

NEW ITEM

D. 1127 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
Application Number: MST2009-00426
Owner: 1129 State Street
Owner: SIMA Management Corporation
Applicant: David Levy & Associates
Architect: Christophe Hungerland

(This structure is on the city's list of Potential Historic Resources and is on the California Inventory of Historic Resources: "San Marcos Court Building." Proposal to install two decorative metal panels to the front facade of the building and install white view control window film on the existing rear storefront glass. New signage will be reviewed under a separate application.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

E. 1220 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-019

Application Number: MST2008-00584

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Agent: Victor Garza and Jessica Grant

(Proposal for changes to City Parking Lot #5 including paving changes for improved access, ADA striping, enhanced landscaping, and installation of underground fiber optic links.)

(Review After Final of new parking lot pole light at Parking Lot #5 entrance on Chapala Street.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

F. 911 LAGUNA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-012

Application Number: MST2007-00210

Owner: Mr. and Mrs. Nick Tomkins

Architect: Ray Ketzell

Landscape Architect: Chuck McClure

(Proposal to demolish two single-family residences totaling 1,676 square feet and construct a new, three story, single-family residence of 3,732 net square feet including a 796 square foot basement mechanical room and cellar, and a 440 square foot attached two-car garage. The project will require overall site grading of 439 cubic yards. Zoning modifications are requested for the proposed garage to encroach into the front and interior yard setbacks, for portions of the second floor roof to encroach into the interior yard setback, and for the third floor to encroach into the interior yard setback. The proposal has a floor-to-lot area ratio of .74 on this commercially-zoned, 5,031 square foot parcel.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved landscape plan.)

Continued two weeks.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:15 P.M. ****