



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 16, 2009 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, Chair – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, Vice-Chair – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 3:52 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:49 p.m.; and from 3:00 to 3:52 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Absent
 KATHLEEN GOO, Alternate Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, September 11, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Request by Staff to reconsider the motion of Item 9 from the September 2, 2009, HLC meeting.

Motion: To open the reconsideration of Item 9 from the September 2, 2009, HLC meeting.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Amend the motion for Item 9, City-Wide, of the September 2, 2009, HLC meeting as follows: Continued indefinitely with the comment that the Historic Landmarks Commission does not find the current proposal acceptable for El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and strongly recommends that the applicant place all the equipment underground.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 2, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 2, 2009, with corrections.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Craig Shallanberger.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Curtis has resigned from the HLC effective September 8th. The next recruitment for City Boards and Commissions opens at the end of September, with interviews in November and appointments in December.
- b) Commissioner Shallanberger will be in attendance at approximately 2:30 p.m.

- c) There will be an HLC Five Year Goals Subcommittee meeting in the Fishbowl Conference Room at 10:00 a.m. on Wednesday, September 23, 2009.

Mr. Limón announced that the information packet for the HLC Five Year Goals Subcommittee meeting will be distributed prior to the September 23rd meeting.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. Jacobus reported on the Survey Subcommittee that met in the morning. The issues discussed included the HLC five-year-plan and the establishment of a list of the twenty highest prioritized buildings to be recommended for designation as City landmarks.

Commissioner Sharpe announced a City forum sponsored by the Santa Barbara Conservancy and Citizen's Planning Association with 11 of the 13 council candidates to discuss preservation of historic structures and resources. The forum will be held at the Santa Barbara Public Library, Faulkner Gallery, on Thursday, September 17th, 7:00-9:00 p.m. The same forum and discussion is planned with the five mayoral candidates on Wednesday, September 23rd, at the same place and time.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 318 STATE ST C-M Zone

(1:49) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020
 Application Number: MST2009-00245
 Owner: 318 State St Properties, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Seaside Oil Company Building and Showroom aka Andalucía Building." Proposal to demolish an existing 2,436 square foot building at the rear portion of 314 State Street and construct a new trash enclosure and loading dock. Proposed for the rear structure of 318 State Street is a facade remodel including new awnings, doors, and windows. Also proposed is a reconfiguration and associated landscaping of five parking lots including the addition of 16 new parking spaces for a total of 84 parking spaces. These spaces are proposed to be the designated parking for the five parcels from 314 through 324 State Street, 323 and 327 Anacapa Street, and 24 E. Gutierrez Street. The proposal includes preservation of the existing historic arcade and front building located at 318 State Street. No new square footage is proposed.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Addendum prepared by Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)

Present: Michael Berman, City Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, stated that this is an amendment to the original Phase I report that had been accepted by the Commission. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and was concerned with historic privies on the property. The report meets both MEA and CEQA requirements, and adequately addresses Dr. Glassow's concerns that ground disturbing activities in the area of the privies be monitored by a City-qualified archaeologist.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent). Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 34 W VICTORIA ST

C-2 Zone

(1:56)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
Application Number: MST2009-00266
Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 23,125 square feet of commercial/retail space, 38 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 87 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height. Planning Commission approval is requested for a tentative subdivision map and a zoning modification for the residential units to encroach into the interior yard setback.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates. The report concludes that the mosaic mural is eligible for Landmark status.)

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the word "clusters of" should be struck as an inaccurate description from pages 39 and 48 of the report. Other than these two corrections, staff read the report and found it acceptable.

Public comment opened at 2:00 p.m.

Chair Naylor read an email with several comments and suggestions from Kellam de Forest.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report with the correction that the words "clusters of" should be struck from pages 39 and 48 on the report.

Action: Pujo/Naylor, 4/3/0. (Boucher/Sharpe/Murray opposed because they cannot agree that the cumulative effects of the proposed project will not negatively impact the Arlington Theater; and the spatial relationships are not addressed satisfactorily. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. 34 W VICTORIA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:24)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
 Application Number: MST2009-00266
 Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
 Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 23,125 square feet of commercial/retail space, 38 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 87 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height. Planning Commission approval is requested for a tentative subdivision map and a zoning modification for the residential units to encroach into the interior yard setback.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Planning Commission approval.)

Present: Brian Cearnal and Joe Andrulaitis, Architects
 Margaret Cafarelli, Owner
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:12 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

- 1 Straw votes: How many Commissioners find the proposed mass, bulk, and scale compatible? 3/4. (Adams/Boucher/Murray/Sharpe opposed.)
- 2 How many Commissioners find the project is compatible with the adjacent landmark? 1/6. (Adams/Boucher/Drury/Murray/Naylor/Sharpe opposed.)
- 3 How many Commissioners find the proposed location of the mural on the face of the commercial building on Chapala Street would be appropriate? 4/3. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe opposed.)
- 4 How many Commissioners feel that the mural should be kept on the project site? 7/0.
- 5 How many Commissioners find there is an appropriate amount of open space? 2/5. (Adams/Boucher/Drury/Murray/Sharpe opposed.)
- 6 How many Commissioners find the project has an appropriate amount of landscaping? 5/2. (Murray/Sharpe opposed.)

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

- 1) The project has an appropriate amount of landscaping.
- 2) The proposed location of the mural on the face of the commercial building on Chapala Street would be appropriate.
- 3) The mural should be kept on the project site.
- 4) The proposed mass, bulk and scale are not compatible.
- 5) The project is not compatible with the adjacent landmark.
- 6) Study increasing the amount of open space.

Action: Adams/Murray, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 1316 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(3:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-001
Application Number: MST2009-00364
Owner: Ronchietto Trust
Designer: Ernesto Busnelli
Business Name: Café Buenos Aires

(Proposal to install new windows to act as wind barriers in an existing streetscape dining patio. The area of work will be in three arched openings and two currently wrought iron-gated entries on the Arlington Avenue elevation.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Wally Ronchietto, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The upper panels are to be the "sunrise" option with fixed steel, clear, and of single-pane glass; and the bottom half being clear and of one piece of glass, and either removable or able to swing up.
- 2) Details of the project are to be worked out at Consent.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 7/0/1. (Pujo abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 702 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone

(4:36) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-012
Application Number: MST2009-00407
Owner: Hortensia Ortega Luera
Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
Business Name: Paradise Café

(Proposal to construct a new 612 square foot wood trellis with retractable canvas awning over an existing outdoor dining patio.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Mark Shields, Architect
Randy Rowse, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:43 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM**

A. 536 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-001
Application Number: MST2009-00444 [not MST2007-00569]
Owner: 536 State Street, LLC
Architect: Dawn Sherry
Business Name: Joe's Café

(Proposal to remove existing abandoned rooftop equipment and install four new air conditioning units and associated equipment. New equipment will be concealed behind a parapet and will not be visible from the street.)

(Review After Final of additional rooftop screening for existing HVAC equipment on the northwest elevation.)

Continued two weeks to the Full Board.

FINAL REVIEW

B. 1829 STATE ST C-2/R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-007
Application Number: MST2004-00132
Owner: Emmet J. Hawkes Family Trust
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for a mixed-use development on two separate parcels (027-031-007 for 1829 State Street and 027-031-006 for 11 W. Pedregosa Street). The existing 1,180 square foot residential unit located at 11 W. Pedregosa would be demolished. 2,539 net square feet of commercial space and six residential condominium units would be constructed. The project includes 23 parking spaces in a subterranean garage, which includes six, two care garages for the residential units, one guest parking space and 10 parking spaces for the commercial uses. The two parcels are proposed to be merged.)

(Final approval of lighting, bus shelter, and corner stairwell details is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

C. 1727 PROSPECT AVE R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-142-004
Application Number: MST2008-00517
Owner: Larson Family Trust
Architect: Amy Taylor

(This structure is eligible for Structure of Merit designation. Proposal to replace the existing exterior wood siding on the main residence with Hardi-shingle, replace existing windows in the same sized openings and configuration, and add a pair of double columns at the front porch. Also proposed is to add 152 square feet to an existing rear balcony and new stairs leading to the backyard.)

(Review After Final of the following changes: enlarge rear dormer by 38 square feet and change chimney material from brick to wood.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final with the condition that chimney material be either plaster stucco or stone veneer to match the base of the house.

NEW ITEM

D. 424 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025
Application Number: MST2009-00404
Owner: Ray Mahboob

(Proposal to install a backflow device and Fire Department connection for new fire sprinkler system.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

E. 1127 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
Application Number: MST2009-00406
Owner: SIMA Property Management
Applicant: David Levy & Associates
Architect: Christopher Hungerlund

(This is on the California Inventory of Historic Resources: San Marcos Court Building. Proposed new skylight and rooftop equipment for an existing commercial space.)

Final Approval as submitted with equipment color to be tan to blend in with the existing rooftop equipment.

NEW ITEM

F. 213 PASEO NUEVO C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
Application Number: MST2009-00400
Owner: Redevelopment Agency of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Kent Heiden
Architect: Tom Ochsner
Business Name: Pandora

(Proposed facade remodel of an existing tenant space at Paseo Nuevo. The remodel includes changing the existing windows, doors, and awnings. Signage to be reviewed under separate application.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A4.0.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

G. 911 LAGUNA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-012
Application Number: MST2007-00210
Owner: Mr. and Mrs. Nick Tomkins
Architect: Ray Ketzler

(Proposal to demolish two single-family residences totaling 1,676 square feet and construct a new, three story, single-family residence of 3,732 net square feet including a 796 square foot basement mechanical room and cellar, and a 440 square foot attached two-car garage. The project will require overall site grading of 439 cubic yards. Zoning modifications are requested for the proposed garage to encroach into the front and interior yard setbacks, for portions of the second floor roof to encroach into the interior yard setback, and for the third floor to encroach into the interior yard setback. The proposal has a floor-to-lot area ratio of .74 on this commercially-zoned, 5,031 square foot parcel.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved landscape plan.)

Continued indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:44 P.M. ****