



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 4, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present at 2:04 p.m.
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Present from 2:40 p.m. to 3:30 p.m.

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Present at 5:07 p.m.

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:10 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 BEATRIZ GULARTE, Project Planner – Present until 2:10 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. On February 27, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:31):

- A. Public Comment:

Louise Boucher, local resident, commented on a report written by Robert Ooley, County Architect, pointing out that the seemingly arbitrary application of "Spanish detailing" to a building has driven the cost of developments to be higher. Simple application of detailing works better. The overdone approach by the large buildings on the west side of State Street helps neither the new nor honors the historic.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 18, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 18, 2009, with correction.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Curtis/Drury, 8/0/0. (Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Chair Naylor would be leaving at 7:00 p.m.

b) The California Preservation Foundation's Annual Conference will be held in Palm Springs from Thursday, April 16th to Sunday, April 19th. HLC members should email Susan Gantz if they wish to attend.

2. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, announced that Item 10, the Historic Structures/Sites Report for 1330 Chapala Street, will be continued two weeks. Staff needs more time to work with the historical consultant.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, reported that the draft update to the EPV Guidelines is ready for review. A discussion will be scheduled in two weeks to invite the public as well as the Commission to provide comments. Heather Baker, Project Planner, added that the goal is a recommendation to City Council for approval of the final product.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. Discussion of potential charter amendment regarding building height.

(1:41)

Present: Beatriz Gularte, Project Planner
Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Beatriz E. Ramírez, Project Planner, provided an update on the results of the Ordinance Committee meeting held on Tuesday, March 3.

Public comment opened at 1:45 p.m.

William La Voie, local architect, commented about the history of the Salvation Army building on Chapala Street. The argument, prior to its construction, was that the building would be too big for Chapala Street. Now it is dwarfed with the new developments on that street. The community priorities are to preserve the character of the town and provide reasonable housing. A 30% affordable housing requirement is not enough.

Jim Westby, Save EPV member, commented about what lead Save EPV to initiate a charter amendment. Development such as the Chapala One building is not what the community wants.

Cathie McCammon, Allied Neighborhood Association, commented that neither ballot measure contains meaningful protection to historic resources and do not contain language to not allow special exceptions within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Public comment closed at 1:52 p.m.

The Commission made the following comments with regard to a potential for a maximum height in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District:

1. Five Commissioners agreed with the 40 foot height limit within EPV. Three Commissioners expanded on the issue of 45 foot limit in the rest of the city. The 45 foot height limit outside EPV would maintain the character of Santa Barbara.
2. One Commissioner believes a 45 foot height would allow roof elements. It is difficult to get three stories to look like Santa Barbara within 40 feet in EPV.
3. Three Commissioners would not like to add a restriction. Guidelines should not be in the City charter, but rather in the ordinance.

4. The Urban and EPV Guidelines and the compatibility description are the philosophy needed to make decisions. The proposed instrument to make the height limit 45 feet is a blunt instrument. Commissioners should be allowed to make decisions based on their own discretion and experience.
5. The character of the city is the basis on which it should be developed.
6. The Save EPV initiative should be allowed to take its course.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 1041 MISSION RIDGE RD

A-1 Zone

(2:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-031-015
 Application Number: MST2008-00572
 Owner: Alan & Katherine Van Vliet
 Architect: Tom Jacobs
 Contractor: Peter Copeland Construction, Inc.

(Proposal for an addition and alterations to an existing, three-story, single-family residence including the following: 356 square foot single-story addition to the existing attached two-car garage resulting in a three-car garage, new doors and windows on the main house, terrace railing, site retaining walls, flagstone paving, two water features, landscaping and tree relocation, and the restoration of doors, windows, shutters, and stucco cladding to their original locations. Also proposed is to abate enforcement case ENF2008-00406 by the removal of a sink located in the swimming pool cabana and to demolish a gazebo structure and its foundation in the front yard setback. Zoning modifications are requested to rework the driveway and replace the entry and main gates within the front yard setback. An encroachment permit from the Public Works Department will also be required. This existing 7,645 square foot residence is on a 2.15 acre parcel located in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 8,386 square feet is 132% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Ph.D., Historian. The report concludes that this structure meets the eligibility criteria as a Structure of Merit.)

Present: Ronald Nye, Historical Consultant
 Tom Jacobs, Architect
 Charles McClure, Landscape Architect
 Peter Copeland, Contractor

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that this addendum addresses the expansion of the two-car garage to a third bay. The report concludes that it would not have a negative impact.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 8/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1041 MISSION RIDGE RD

A-1 Zone

(2:17)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-031-015
 Application Number: MST2008-00572
 Owner: Alan & Katherine Van Vliet
 Contractor: Peter Copeland Construction, Inc.
 Architect: Tom Jacobs

(Proposal for an addition and alterations to an existing, three-story, single-family residence including the following: 356 square foot single-story addition to the existing attached two-car garage resulting in a three-car garage, new doors and windows on the main house, terrace railing, site retaining walls, flagstone paving, two water features, landscaping and tree relocation, and the restoration of doors, windows, shutters, and stucco cladding to their original locations. Also proposed is to abate enforcement case ENF2008-00406 by the removal of a sink located in the swimming pool cabana and to demolish a gazebo structure and its foundation in the front yard setback. A zoning modification is requested to replace the entry and main gates within the front yard setback. An encroachment permit from the Public Works Department will also be required. This existing 7,645 square foot residence is on a 2.15 acre parcel located in the Hillside Design District. The proposed total of 8,386 square feet is 132% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Zoning Modifications.)

Present: Tom Jacobs, Architect
 Charles McClure, Landscape Architect
 Peter Copeland, Contractor
 Ronald Nye, Historical Consultant

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, commented that the zoning modification for reworking of the driveway is to be taken out of the project description.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** **1)** Positive comments are to be forwarded to the Staff Hearing Officer to approve the modification request for legalizing the existing six foot fence in its location: The fence is covered with landscaping, screens the house, and has been standing for a long time, yet has not drawn any negative attention. **2)** The expansion of the garage and how it is proposed is acceptable. **3)** The landscape plan should consider the property is in a high fire zone and it was suggested that it be a drought tolerant design.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 8/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 301 W PEDREGOSA ST R-4 Zone

(2:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-012-008
 Application Number: MST2009-00025
 Owner: Edward Gutiérrez
 Architect: David Ferrin

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Reynolds Bungalow/Etchelecu House." Proposal to demolish an existing, 159 square foot carport and construct an attached, 225 square foot one-car garage with a partially covered, 228 square foot roof deck. Also proposed is to demolish 70 square feet of interior floor area of the existing, one-story 955 square foot residence and construct a 372 square foot first floor addition and new rear deck totaling 297 square feet. No grading or excavation is proposed on this 5,264 square foot parcel. The proposed total of 1,482 square feet is 58.9% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: David Ferrin, Architect
 Edward and Monica Gutiérrez, Owners

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks with the following comments:
 1) The owner's recognition of the value of this house and willingness to revitalize it in a sensitive way is greatly appreciated. 2) Restudy the screening of the staircase.
 3) Simplify the roof deck covering.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:14 P.M. TO 3:26 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW

5. 100 W ANAPAMU ST C-2 Zone

(3:26) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-0RW
 Application Number: MST2005-00619
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Lisa Arroyo, Project Engineer
 Architect: Conceptual Motion
 Landscape Architect: Earthform Design

(West Downtown Improvement Project proposal to install pedestrian lighting, repair sidewalks, and enhance intersections with curb extensions and crosswalks. Also proposed is new landscaping for the 0-400 blocks of West Anapamu and West Ortega Streets. This project will be reviewed by both the Architectural Board of Review and the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with the Chapala Street Design Guidelines.)

Present: Lisa Arroyo, City Project Planner
 Edward de Vicente, Architect
 Josh Monroy, Landscape Architect

Motion: Final Approval with the condition that the plantings be hand watered for a minimum of nine months.

Action: Murray/Boucher, 7/1/1. (Drury opposed because he opposes bulb-outs. Shallenberger abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW

6. 0-300 W CABRILLO BLVD

HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone

(3:41)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018

Application Number: MST2009-00118

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Jeannette Candau, Redevelopment Specialist

Applicant: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency

(Proposal for a permanent public art installation consisting of four tile and brass mosaics at four new plaza areas along W. Cabrillo Blvd. and four new concrete benches along the *Los Baños* walkway.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Jeannette Candau, Redevelopment Specialist
Richard Irvine, Artist
Lori Anne David, Artist

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued four weeks with the following comments:
1) It would be preferred that the narrative signage not be a plaque on the stone or placed on the vertical edge of the low sea wall. The plaque should reflect the Washington Projects for the Arts spirit. **2)** It was suggested that a brochure be created with the appropriate background to be made available to the public rather than placement of a plaque. **3)** Explore the possibility of using recycled tiles for the environmental piece. **4)** Make sure the *tilde* is used in *Baños*.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

7. 2050 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-001
 Application Number: MST2008-00593
 Owner: Melanie Ellison
 Architect: Harrison Design Associates
 Contractor: Giffin & Crane General Contractors, Inc.

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was determined to be eligible for City Landmark status: "Crointher Residence, Crocker Row." Proposal to rehabilitate the street façade of an existing three-story, 3,543 square foot, single-family residence to a close approximation of its historic appearance circa 1894-1905. Proposed exterior alterations include door and window changes, foundation replacement, façade rehabilitation, removal of an exterior staircase on the east elevation, new plaster finish, new Mission tile and metal roof, and new landscaping. No new square footage is proposed on this 10,125 square foot parcel.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Tony Spann, Barbara Lowenthal and Bernard Austin, Harrison Design Associates
 Kris Kimpel, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:22 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.
 Action: Adams/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:30 P.M. TO 4:34 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 1732 SANTA BARBARA ST E-1 Zone

(4:34) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-001
 Application Number: MST2009-00114
 Owner: Richard Nash
 Designer: Peter Kavonian & Associates

(This is a City Landmark: "Huning Mansion." Proposal for a new landscape plan for an existing single-family residence on a 20,000 square foot parcel. The plan includes the removal of nine trees from the front yard to be replaced with a new hedge and 30 rose bushes. Also proposed are new trees and shrubs in the side and rear yards, a new fountain, and a new wood trellis in the backyard. Approval of this project will abate enforcement case ENF2009-00052.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment, Historic Resource Findings, and Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark.)

Present: Peter Kavonian and Chava Riley, Peter Kavonian & Associates

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the destruction of the trees and tearing up of the entire garden is not acceptable and the new owners have not gone through the correct venue.

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

Motion: **Continued four weeks with the following comments:** 1) In view of the property's landmark status, the applicant should consult with or hire a landscape architect who will understand the historicity of the property and building. 2) Include all graphic representations to communicate what was removed, what is in existence, and what is proposed. 3) Suggestions were made as to what could be considered by the landscape architect: a) avoid the use of *Ficus nitida* to prevent the deterioration of the stone walls; b) the removal of trees should be mitigated, considering the historical affect that the trees had before they were removed; c) *Tipuana tipu* would not have been a traditional tree used; d) review the height requirements.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

9. 1529 SANTA BARBARA ST R-3 Zone

(5:12) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-241-005
 Application Number: MST2009-00116
 Owner: The Unitarian Society of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Coop Community Energy

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Unitarian Society. Proposal for a 3.6 kilowatt roof mounted photovoltaic solar array to be installed on the rear, southwest corner of the Parish Hall on E. Arrellaga Street. The maximum distance from the roof to the top of the tallest panel is 7'-6" in height.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Chris Shorb, Cooperative Community Energy
 Christopher Blunt, Ojai Solar Electric

Public comment opened at 5:17 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: **Continued two weeks with the comment that the applicant should provide a more graphic expression, photographs at a closer range, and story poles.**

Action: Drury/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

10. 1330 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-001
Application Number: MST2007-00371
Owner: Metropolitan Theatres Corporation
Applicant: Peikert Group Architects

(There is a Structure of Merit on this site: "Arlington Hotel Garden Arch." Proposal for a three-story, mixed-use project on a vacant parking lot site. The commercial portion would include 10,000 square feet and the residential portion would include 55,180 square feet and consist of 35 residential condominium units, including 26 market rate units, four workforce units, and five inclusionary units. A 6,200 square foot "village green" and courtyard would be provided on-grade between the theater and the proposed development. The project would include a 41,000 square foot underground parking garage providing 117 parking spaces, a certain number of which would be available in the evenings for theater patrons. This project will require Planning Commission approval of a Development Plan and a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Review of revised, focused Historic Structures Letter Report prepared by Alexandra Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

This item was continued two weeks to March 18, 2009.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

11. 1330 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(5:33) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-001
Application Number: MST2007-00371
Owner: Metropolitan Theatres Corporation
Applicant: Peikert Group Architects

(There is a Structure of Merit on this site: "Arlington Hotel Garden Arch." Proposal for a three-story, mixed-use project on a vacant parking lot site. The commercial portion would include 10,000 square feet and the residential portion would include 55,180 square feet and consist of 35 residential condominium units, including 26 market rate units, four workforce units, and five inclusionary units. A 6,200 square foot "village green" and courtyard would be provided on-grade between the theater and the proposed development. The project would include a 41,000 square foot underground parking garage providing 117 parking spaces, a certain number of which would be available in the evenings for theater patrons. This project will require Planning Commission approval of a Development Plan and a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, Historic Resource Findings, and Planning Commission approval.)

Present: Detlev Peikert, Lisa Plowman and Gordon Brewer, Architects

Public comment opened at 5:48 p.m.

Gill Barry, Allied Neighborhood Association, commented that the mass, bulk, and scale are not acceptable. This parcel is in a transitional area of downtown and the three stories proposed are not compatible with the residential neighborhood.

Cathie McCammon, Allied Neighborhood Association, expressed concern that the Arlington is threatened by an adjacent project that is too massive. It would be better to have 40 foot heights next to historic buildings, especially in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV).

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the renderings from a previous architectural design by Henry Lenny contained one and two story buildings that are more compatible with the surroundings. The project does not conform to the 40 foot height limit as is being proposed for EPV.

Public comment closed at 5:54 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners find the mass, bulk and scale as presented is acceptable? 0/7.
(All opposed.)

How many Commissioners do not find the mass, bulk and scale acceptable? 6/3. (Curtis/Pujo/Shallanberger opposed.)

How many Commissioners feel that minor refinements are required to bring the project into conformance with a supportable mass, bulk and scale? 3/6. (Adams/Boucher/Drury/Murray/Naylor/Sharpe opposed.)

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** 1) The focal point of the Arlington should be opened up and a twenty foot widening of the *paseo* between Buildings 1 and 2 to provide an unobstructed view of the theater from Sola Street would be helpful. 2) Due to the proposed proportions, the mass, bulk, and scale is not appropriate. The massing of the buildings should be manipulated to provide a variation with fewer third floor units so that it has less of a blocky appearance. 3) It was suggested that the landscaped areas between Buildings 3 and 4 be increased and the building heights vary with single and two story heights in that area. 4) Provide a simplification of the detailing and fenestration. 5) The setbacks from the sidewalk should be increased. 6) It was suggested that a play area for children be provided.

Action: Adams/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM**

A. 516 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-037
Application Number: MST2009-00063
Owner: Judith Johnson Garrett
Applicant: Marty Poole
Business Name: Pierre Lafond Bistro

(Proposal to repaint the exterior of a commercial building.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

B. 19 W CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-003
Application Number: MST2009-00097
Owner: The Volentine Foundation
Architect: Edwards - Pitman Architects

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations on the south elevation of an existing commercial building. The proposed work includes the following: demolish an existing exterior stairway; add a new second floor balcony with wrought iron rail; new awnings; add a new basement level window; and, change two existing solid doors to French doors.)

This item was postponed two weeks to March 18, 2009

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:57 P.M. ****