



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 2, 2008

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair* – Present  
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present  
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
 KEN CURTIS – Present until 5:24 p.m.  
 STEVE HAUSZ – Present  
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
 SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present  
 ALEX PUJO – Absent

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

ROGER HORTON – Present until 4:00 p.m.

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

STELLA LARSON – Present until 4:00 p.m.

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present from 3:00 p.m. until 4:30 p.m.  
 DEBRA ANDALORO, Senior Planner – Present from 1:45 p.m. to 3:20 p.m.  
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present  
 Suzanne Johnston, Assistant Planner – Present from 1:45 p.m. o 3:50 p.m.  
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present  
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required <u>at the time of submittal &amp; each time plans are revised</u> . <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. <u>Plans</u> to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The time the item was reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would have been postponed indefinitely. If an applicant canceled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission Approval.
- \*\* **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if someone needs special assistance to participate in a meeting, the Planning Division would need to be contacted at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting would enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc). If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. and 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday; or by email at [sgantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov](mailto:sgantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov). Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on Friday, March 28, 2008, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video) and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast.

**GENERAL BUSINESS (1:33):**

- A. Public Comment:

Mary Louise Days, local resident, expressed concern about the present condition of the 1891 stone bridge over Mission Creek located at the Mission Historical Park. She believes that any planned proposals of repair work should be submitted to the Historic Landmarks Commission for review and approval. It was Ms. Days' understanding that the bridge was included when different areas of Mission Historical Park were landmarked.

Chair La Voie commented that this bridge is a very important historical resource and a Historic Structures Report should be prepared evaluating the repair of the bridge.

Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that this is the oldest surviving bridge in Santa Barbara County. He reported that the bridge was damaged when the long rail in the middle of the bridge was hit by a truck and it shifted to the side. Making the bridge structurally sound is under the City's purview. The Public Works Department will be accepting bids with the intent to have the bridge repaired by experienced stonemasons. Mr. Jacobus commented that the review by the Historic Landmarks Commission has not been scheduled yet.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on possibly initiating a historic restoration fund to assist in the repair of the bridge.

Mr. de Forest also expressed concern for the length of time it takes to begin construction for projects once an approval has been given.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 19, 2008.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 19, 2008, with corrections.**

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

Chair La Voie acknowledged receipt of a letter from Kathianne Brown, local resident, commenting about the meeting minutes.

## C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion:** Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item J, 1900 Lasuen Road, which was reviewed by Robert Adams, and Item F, which was referred to the Full Board for review.

**Action:** Adams/Hausz, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

## 1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a. Commissioner Pujo would be absent from the meeting. Commissioners Adams and Sharpe would be stepping down from Item 1, 210 W. Carrillo Street.

b. The Planning Commission is scheduled to review the Radio Square project at 210 W. Carrillo Street at the April 17<sup>th</sup> meeting. Staff requested that someone attend the hearing to represent the Commission.

Chair La Voie and Commissioner Sharpe agreed to attend.

c. The next step in the Plan Santa Barbara process is a discussion of recent development trends and their implication for the future. A report on development over the past 18 years would be presented to the Planning Commission at a special work session in the Faulkner Gallery of the Santa Barbara Public Library on Monday, April 7<sup>th</sup> starting at 3:30 p.m. This will be televised live on City TV channel 18. Two community workshops to further discuss these development trends will be held in the Faulkner Gallery on Saturday, April 19<sup>th</sup> from 9:00 a.m. until noon, and on Wednesday, April 23<sup>rd</sup>, from 6:00 p.m. to 9:00 pm. For more information on this, go online to [www.YouPlanSB.org](http://www.YouPlanSB.org), or contact Peggy Burbank at [PBurbank@SantaBarbaraCA.gov](mailto:PBurbank@SantaBarbaraCA.gov) or contact her by phone at (805) 564-5470.

Chair La Voie reported that he had already spoken to Staff about concerns he would like to be addressed during the April 7<sup>th</sup> Special Work Session.

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Boucher reported she attended a meeting of the State of the Art Gallery Subcommittee and passed out the "call for entries" brochure. The Subcommittee is considering possibly accepting submissions from landscape architects and stated that anyone on the Commission could do so as well.

Chair La Voie reported on the last meeting of the Airport Subcommittee. The project plans are almost ready for submittal for a building permit. Minor changes are being made to include concerns expressed by the Architectural Board of Review. The airport construction is scheduled to begin in May and is to be finished by the year 2010. Chair La Voie mentioned that art in public spaces may be displayed at the Airport. The Airport is also negotiating the acquisition of an old Channing Peake mural found at El Paseo Restaurant to be displayed in the airport's main lobby.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Commissioner Hausz asked whether the Building Department refers applicants to the Planning Division for design review. He commented that on West de la Guerra, between Paseo Chapala and the Cearnal/Andrulaitis building being built, new electric service has been installed on the side of the building with big conduits. Ms. Gantz responded that it was reviewed and approved with the condition that it match the building color. Mr. Jacobus also stated that the Fire Department and Southern California Edison prefer having electrical equipment moved to the front portion of buildings in order to identify it quickly and be able to immediately cut off the power.

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

1. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

**(1:57)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025  
 Application Number: MST2007-00554  
 Owner: Old Town Mall  
 Owner: Steve Delson and Ian Brown  
 Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 32 residential condominium units (27 market rate and 5 affordable). A modification to allow the 5 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

**(Review of revised focused Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. The report identifies potential historic resources adjacent to the site and potential impacts of the proposed project on those resources.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
 Steve Yates, Architect  
 Debra Andaloro, City Senior Planner

A discussion was held as to the process of the Commission accepting an Historic Structures Report, but disagreeing with its findings.

Staff comments: Debra Andaloro, Senior Planner, clarified Staff's role and responsibility when environmental reviews are conducted in conjunction with the review of an historic structures report. Ms. Andaloro requested that, in the future, the Commission clearly articulate the reasons the Commission does not agree with the Historic Structures Report's conclusions, although the report itself may be accepted.

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the Historic Structures Report's conclusion that the proposed project would have a less than significant impact on the surrounding neighborhood as a Class III impact. He commented that the Commission has the right to conclude that it would have a Class I or Class II impact.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

**Motion:** To accept the report with the condition to strike the timeline described as a recommended mitigation measure found in the last paragraph on page 3.

**Action:** Hausz/Naylor, 5/0/1. (Murray abstained. Adams/Sharpe stepped down. Pujo absent.)  
Motion carried.

### **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

2. 710 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

**(2:32)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013  
Application Number: MST2006-00312  
Owner: Carlos Adame  
Agent: Lisa Plowman  
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(This is a revised proposal for a new 4,031 square foot, three-story, 42 foot tall mixed-use development including the preservation of 577 square feet of an existing 1,562 square foot structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources (Myers Cottage). The project will include relocation of the existing structure (which will be used as commercial space) nine feet to the west, new construction at ground level to provide two residential condominium units (one, two-bedroom unit and one, three-bedroom unit), three covered residential parking spaces, and one uncovered commercial parking space. The existing stone site wall will be preserved.)

**(Review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum of January 8, 2008, prepared by Shelley Bookspan. Original Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by HLC on September 20, 2006.)**

**Present:** Debra Andaloro, City Senior Planner  
Detlev Peikert and Lisa Plowman, Architects  
Carlos Adame, Owner

A discussion was held as to the process of the Commission accepting an Historic Structures Report, but disagreeing with its findings.

**Staff comments:** Debra Andaloro, Project Planner, requested that, in the future, the Commission clarify what in the Historic Structures Report the Commission disagrees with, although the report itself may be accepted. Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, explained that the Commission should make clear what portion of the rear of the historic structure should be preserved and the desired level of proximity the new building should have to the historic structure.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would agree with the report that the proposed development does not have a significant impact on the historic structure? No vote was taken.

Public comment opened at 3:24 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that he recently attended a SHPO (State Historic Preservation Officer) workshop in Ventura. One of the subjects addressed was what would be a significant impact to an historical structure. It was stated that the building of an inappropriate structure in the immediate proximity of a landmark is a significant impact and requires a full environmental impact review. Mr. de Forest gave as an example that the construction of a McDonald's by the historic Mission would be unacceptable to that historic resource.

Public comment closed at 3:25 p.m.

**Motion:** **Continued indefinitely with the following comments and changes to the report:**

- 1)** The Commission disagrees with the evaluation of the period of significance, finding that the period of 1892 is perhaps more significant in that it shows a traditional accretion to an historic core, which had existed for some 50 years.
- 2)** The Commission recognizes that the information provided in the report reveals that the rear portion of the building had been significantly damaged by fire and somewhat shoddily reconstructed, perhaps using historic materials.
- 3)** The Commission accepts the determination of the report that the front portion rectangle of the building is the most significant portion of the structure extant.
- 4)** With the removal of the possibly historic structure to the rear, a mitigation measure would be that any additions to this building occur within the previous footprint of 1892.
- 5)** The Commission disagrees with the findings of the report; specifically that the proposed development would have no impact on the proposed structure based on the evidence of a computer simulation provided by the architect.
- 6)** The mass of the building is found to be too large and there is not sufficient landscape screening between the building, the historic structure, and the view from the building.
- 7)** The Commission suggests the following mitigation measures:
  - a)** The mass of the proposed building should be reduced, particularly as it addresses the historic building.
  - b)** A landscape buffer should be provided on-site between the historic building and the proposed building, and between the proposed building and adjacent sites.
  - c)** The elements that tend to break the roofline (chimneys) should be positioned away from the historic structure.
  - d)** Some commemoration of the footprint of the historic structure should be remembered in the landscape elements, or a portion thereof.
  - e)** No modification of the separation of structures be supported, and the Commission requested a minimum of a 15 foot separation.
- 8)** The Commission acknowledges the movement of the building forward by nine feet, as indicated in a previous report.

**Action:** Boucher/Sharpe, 7/1/0. (Hausz opposed. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

## 3. 710 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

**(3:52)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013  
Application Number: MST2006-00312  
Owner: Carlos Adame  
Agent: Lisa Plowman  
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(This is a revised proposal for a new 4,031 square foot, three-story, 42 foot tall mixed-use development including the preservation of 577 square feet of an existing 1,562 square foot structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources (Myers Cottage). The project will include relocation of the existing structure (which will be used as commercial space) nine feet to the west, new construction at ground level to provide two residential condominium units (one, two-bedroom unit and one, three-bedroom unit), three covered residential parking spaces, and one uncovered commercial parking space. The existing stone site wall will be preserved.)

**(Consideration of project and potential design alternatives based on additional environmental documentation received.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, MODIFICATIONS, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND APPROVAL OF THE CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT.)**

Present: Lisa Plowman and Detlev Peikert, Architects  
Carlos Adame, Owner

**Motion: Continued two weeks.**

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:53 P.M. TO 4:04 P.M. \*\***

4. **DISCUSSION ITEM****(4:04)**

Present: Alison Jordan, City Water Conservation Coordinator  
Jaime Limón, City Senior Planner

Alison Jordan, Water Conservation Coordinator, discussed the water conservation requirements for new construction and renovations at City facilities that were adopted by City Council on February 5, 2008.



5. **DISCUSSION ITEM**  
**(4:08)**

Present: Alison W. Jordan, City Water Conservation Coordinator

Alison W. Jordan, Water Conservation Coordinator, discussed the proposed revisions to the City's Water Conservation Landscape Design Standards originally adopted by City Council in June, 1989.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about enforcement measures.

Public comment closed at 4:16 p.m.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:26 P.M. TO 4:28 P.M. \*\***

**FINAL REVIEW**

6. 2127 CASTILLO ST

R-3 Zone

**(4:28)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-221-007  
 Application Number: MST2007-00555  
 Owner: Karen Haskell  
 Applicant: Lauri Vivatson

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is included on the State Historic Resources Inventory: "Hunt Residence." Proposal for a 312 square foot one story addition to an existing 980 square foot one story residence on a 6,000 square foot lot. There is an existing 255 square foot detached one-car garage which will remain.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested.)**

Present: Karen Haskell, Owner  
 Lauri Vivatson, Applicant

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury in opposition to the project.

**Motion:** **Final Approval with revised drawings to return in two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comment and conditions:** 1) The Commission appreciates the restoration of the porch. 2) There shall be a consistency between the detailing and the intent of the drawings, particularly that the roof rafter sides be identified consistently throughout the drawings. 3) All windows, except the large picture windows, shall be double hung windows. 4) An accurate architectural eave detail shall be included in the plans.

Action: Hausz/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

7. 316 CASTILLO ST C-2 Zone

**(4:42)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-232-015  
 Application Number: MST2008-00038  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Genealogical Society  
 Architect: Gary Jensen

(Proposal to construct a 2,709 square foot one-story library addition, new patio cover at the interior courtyard, and make interior alterations. Also proposed is a new screen wall to be constructed around an existing electrical panel next to the driveway. The project will result in 6,995 square feet of development on this 20,040 square foot parcel.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)**

Present: Gary Jensen, Architect  
 Sheryl Jensen, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:55 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury in opposition to the project.

**Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The roof form on the south elevation and the other proposed elements at this level are acceptable. 2) The entrance at the south elevation needs some enhancement, either with an architectural addition of a window, by careful attention to the landscaping, or by making it asymmetrical. 3) The majority of the Commissioners would support library windows in their current location. One Commissioner suggested that the rafter tails line up with the windows. 4) The pergola needs to be redesigned to minimize the amount of coverage.

Action: Sharpe/Adams, 8/0/0. (Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**FINAL REVIEW – Referred from the Consent Calendar**

16 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

**(5:13)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-044  
 Application Number: MST2008-00055  
 Owner: Masonic Properties Santa Barbara, Inc.  
 Applicant: Gil García  
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Masonic Temple." Proposal to relocate an existing ATM, replace a storefront window, add new plant pots and light fixtures, and paint a colored band on the exterior of the office of Santa Barbara Bank & Trust.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested. Preliminary Approval was given on March 19, 2008.)**

Present: Gil García, Architect

This item was referred to the Full Board from the Consent Calendar for re-review of the proposed storefront window replacement. The owners of the building do not want the Mason ideography associated with the neighboring bank that is located on the first floor of the building.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners could support Scheme A (the blind solution)? 6/2. (Murray/Naylor opposed.)

How many Commissioners could support Scheme B (the cast stone screen solution with a black background)? 2/6 (Boucher/Curtis/Hausz/La Voie/Murray/Sharpe opposed.)

How many Commissioners agree that the dark, anodized, narrow line arcadia door proposed by the applicant should be different than what is shown by the applicant? 3/5. (Adams/Curtis/La Voie/Murray/Sharpe opposed.)

**Motion: Final Approval of drawings as submitted of Scheme A, which is the solution of retaining the plaster with no ornamentation between the two large openings.**

Action: Sharpe/Adams, 5/2/1. (Hausz/Naylor opposed. Hausz found the proposed doors and their finish inappropriate. Naylor preferred the originally approved scheme. Murray abstained. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING**

8. 1732 SANTA BARBARA ST E-1 Zone  
**(5:22)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-001  
 Application Number: MST2008-00122  
 Owner: Brian P. Gregory  
 Designer: Christopher DeRose

(This structure is a City Landmark: "Huning Mansion." Proposal for a new 660 square foot detached one-story garage comprised of two parking spaces of 500 square feet and 160 square feet of accessory workshop area. Two Zoning Modifications will be required for encroaching into the interior yard setback and the required open yard area on this 19,884 square foot parcel developed with an existing 4,603 square foot single-family residence.)

**(Comments only; one concept review only.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND TWO ZONING MODIFICATIONS.)**

Present: Brian Gregory, Owner  
 Christopher DeRose, Designer

Public comment opened at 5:44 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury in opposition to the project.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners could support the design as proposed? 5/2. (Murray/Naylor opposed. Murray disagreed only with the proposed doors.)

**Motion:** **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** 1) The proposed design is supportable. 2) The Commission would like to see the design of the gate similarly inspired by the house. 3) The requested modification for open yard space is supportable because sufficient open yard space would remain on the site, if not in the prescribed location. 4) The requested modification for the encroachment into the interior setback is supportable in that it is consistent with the existing pattern of development in the neighborhood, it provides a necessary improvement to the lot, it is consistent with the style of the architecture, and it is an enhancement to the property. 5) The Commission's landscape architect would like to see the palm tree placed at a different location on the site. 6) The preparer of the drawings was commended for the level of detail and aesthetic quality. The owner was commended for being sensitive to a wonderful home and for saving two oak trees on the site.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 5/2/0. (Murray/Naylor opposed. Curtis/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

### **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

9. 1811 EL ENCANTO RD E-1 Zone  
**(5:53)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-018  
 Application Number: MST2006-00750  
 Owner: Emily and Blake Jones  
 Architect: Peter Becker

(This structure was found to be eligible for City Landmark status and is to be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. The proposed changes are to a site comprised of two existing single-family residences. A remodel and addition is proposed for one of the residences including a 699 square foot addition, 2,019 interior remodel, 100 square foot crawl space conversion for pool equipment and remodel of basement space. New structures would include a 750 square foot detached garage, a new 220 square foot pergola with fireplace and a new 20' x 50' swimming pool. The other residence would include a remodel and window change. A modification is requested for conversion of a non-conforming garage to an accessory space.)

**(Review After Final of permeable paving and photo documentation requirements.)**

### **(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION 043-07 AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)**

Present: Peter Becker, Architect  
 Grant Castleberg, Landscape Architect  
 Rich Kaufmann, General Contractor

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the conclusion of the Historic Structures Report prepared was that this structure is worthy of City Landmark status and the National Register. One of the conditions of approval was that full photo documentation be done prior to installations and additions to the house. The photo documentation was not done prior to re-roofing.

Public comment opened at 5:57 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the proposed fountains are not appropriate for the structure. He requested that a fountain be designed as originally planned, rather than something that looks as if it was taken out of a box.

Ms. Gantz acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury in opposition to the project.

Public comment closed at 5:59 p.m.

**Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final with the following comments:** 1) The previously approved fountain design shall be installed. The proposed fountain substitute is inappropriate, and the original proposal was more appropriate for the design of the garden and the scale and design of the house. 2) The Commission accepts the fact that the building was not photo documented as required by the previous approval. The following solution to this dilemma shall be implemented: a) The photographs provided by the project's architect shall be coordinated with photographs provided by the Historical Consultant Ron Nye. b) The photographs already provided by the architect shall be reprinted on black-and-white archival paper. c) The applicant, in consultation with the City Urban Historian, shall provide, as best as possible, a record of the existing structure. 3) **The following Historic Resource Findings were made:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Curtis/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

G. Adjournment.

**Motion: To adjourn the meeting.**

Action: Hausz/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Curtis/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

## CONSENT CALENDAR

### FINAL REVIEW

A. 1230 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-027  
 Application Number: MST2008-00049  
 Owner: Ray Mahboob  
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal to replace storefront doors and windows in same size openings and materials.)

**(Final approval of shop drawing details is requested.)**

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**FINAL REVIEW****B. 813 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-033  
Application Number: MST2007-00490  
Owner: SIMA El Paseo, LP  
Applicant: Chris Vigilante, Regional Director of Operations  
Applicant: Bernard Rosenson, President, Wine Cask, Inc.  
Agent: Preservation Planning Associates  
Landscape Architect: Bob Cunningham  
Business Name: Wine Cask Restaurant

(This structure is a City Landmark and is on the National Register of Historic Places: "El Paseo." Unpermitted exterior changes to El Paseo's Wine Cask restaurant including the removal of an existing 80-foot tall eucalyptus tree, removal of the courtyard fountain, replacement of stone pavers, removal of landscaping, repainting building in courtyard, replacement of courtyard lighting, and outdoor dining furniture, plant holders, and portable heaters. This is to abate enforcement case ENF2007-00873 initiated on 8-27-07.)

**(Final approval is requested of umbrella poles and patio heaters.)**

**Final Approval of the umbrella poles in teak wood and with heaters to return to Staff for approval.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****C. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018  
Application Number: MST2005-00241  
Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC  
Agent: Mary Rose & Associates  
Architect: M2 Architecture  
Contractor: Plant Construction Company  
Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

**(Continued Review After Final of changes to window and chimney.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**

**CONTINUED ITEM**

D. 620 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-031  
 Application Number: MST2008-00001  
 Owner: Metro 4 Theater Property, LLC  
 Business Name: Rockin' Yogurt

(Proposal to change an as-built chrome and glass entry storefront system to wood frame. Also proposed is to replace the valance of the existing awning with new fabric to match the awning. This is to abate ENF2007-00916.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

E. 1535 SANTA BARBARA ST R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-241-005  
 Application Number: MST2007-00266  
 Owner: The Unitarian Society of Santa Barbara  
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects  
 Landscape Architect: Robert Fowler

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Unitarian Church." Proposal for a partial interior remodel of three existing buildings; accessibility and upgrading of architectural finishes; replacement of 11 windows in the Parish Hall; adding a new terrace with new 678 square foot storage room below; and landscape and hardscape improvements in the Jefferson Hall Courtyard.)

**(Continued Review After Final of changes to omit fountain, add a concrete bench, replace approved brick pavers with stamped concrete, and straighten the top of the terrace walls.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**

**FINAL REVIEW**

F. 16 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-044  
 Application Number: MST2008-00055  
 Owner: Masonic Properties Santa Barbara, Inc.  
 Applicant: Gil García  
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Masonic Temple." Proposal to relocate an existing ATM, replace a storefront window, add new plant pots and light fixtures, and paint a colored band on the exterior of the office of Santa Barbara Bank & Trust.)

**(Final approval of the project is requested.)**

**Referred to Full Board.**

**NEW ITEM**

G. 401 E YANONALI ST OM-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-540-001  
Application Number: MST2008-00137  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Agent: Timothy Burgess  
Business Name: Progressive Waste/McCoy Electric

(Proposal to replace an existing six foot tall, 433 linear foot fence with a new eight foot tall fence and to erect 241 linear feet of new eight foot tall fencing to prevent pedestrian access at a portion of Laguna Creek. The proposed fencing will be constructed of ornamental iron and mini-mesh chain link. New barbed wire will top an existing six foot tall, 249 linear foot fence near the City annex yard at the east creekbank fence location.)

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM**

H. 1920 STATE ST C-2/R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-015  
Application Number: MST2008-00142  
Owner: Richard Perry Living Trust  
Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(Proposal to remove an existing permitted air conditioning unit and install a new one in a different location, and to permit an as-built exterior alteration to remove an existing aluminum sliding door and install a new aluminum sliding window.)

**Final Approval as noted on Sheet A1.11.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

I. 630 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-027  
Application Number: MST2008-00086  
Owner: Jodell A. Williams Trust  
Applicant: Sherry & Associates  
Business Name: Zelo Restaurant and Bar

(Proposal to expand an enclosed patio including new plaster walls with wrought iron to match existing and new landscaping. This project may require an encroachment permit for new tile in the public right-of-way.)

**(Review After Final of proposed change to patio wall height.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on Sheet A.1.1.**



**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

J. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST2005-00490  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Agent: SEPPS  
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Review After Final of relocation of two existing trees and the removal and replacement of one existing jacaranda tree.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final with tree transplant notes to be provided to Staff.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:21 P.M. \*\***