



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 28, 2005

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

ANTHONY SPANN, Chair, Present, left at 2:54 p.m., returned at 4:19 p.m.,
 VADIM HSU, Vice-Chair, Present at 1:43 p.m.
 STEVE HAUSZ, Present at 1:33 p.m., left at 2:10 p.m., returned at 2:37 p.m.
 WILLIAM LA VOIE, Present, left at 5:12 p.m.
 ALEX PUJO, Present at 1:36 p.m.
 CAREN RAGER, Present at 1:31 p.m.
 PHILIP SUDING, Present, left at 2:54 p.m., returned at 6:01 p.m.
 FERMINA MURRAY, Present, left at 2:13 p.m., returned at 2:44 p.m.
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON, Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician I, Present
 BARBARA WALSH, Recording Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.

- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **Many of the items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. in the City Clerk's office, at the Central Library, and www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.**

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Land Use Controls or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on September 23, 2005 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the Community Development bulletin board, in the office of the City Clerk, and on the bulletin board on the outside of City Hall.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 14, 2005.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 14, 2005, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Naylor, 4/0/2. La Voie and Murray abstained.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Anthony Spann.

Action: Naylor/Suding, 6/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following:

- a) Commissioners Spann and Suding will be stepping down from Item 4, 901 E. Cabrillo Boulevard.
- b) Commissioner Suding will step down from Item No. 8, 21 E. Anapamu Street and will leave the meeting at 4:00 p.m. for approximately an hour and a half.
- c) Change to the Agenda: Item No. 9, 628 State Street, has been postponed to October 12th at the applicant's request.

Motion: Postpone Item No. 9, 628 State Street, two weeks to the October 12th meeting.

Action: Suding/Naylor, 7/0/0.

- d) There will be an Airline Terminal Design Subcommittee meeting on October 5th, 2005, beginning at 9:00 a.m. in the Airport Administration office at 601 Firestone Road. Commissioners Spann and Murray are on that Subcommittee.
- e) There will be a joint ABR/HLC meeting for the Highway 101 Operational Improvements Project at the ABR meeting of November 7th, 2005, at 3:20 p.m.
- f) City Advisory Group Annual Recruitment is about to begin. Potential resignations must be received in the City Clerk's office (first floor, City Hall) no later than Friday, October 14, 2005. The application deadline for new applications is October 28, 2005, 5:00 p.m. Interviews will take place on November 15th at 6:00 p.m. and November 22nd at an estimated time of 3:30 p.m., and appointments will be made on December 13th. There will be two vacancies on the HLC and blank application forms available at http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Boards_and_Commissions/ or in the City Clerk's office on the first floor of City Hall.

2. Chair Spann announced he will step down from item No. 5, 1219 State Street.

3. Commissioner Murray announced she will step down from Item No. 1, 2100 Laguna Street.

4. Commissioner La Voie announced he will leave the meeting at approximately 5:00 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

To consider adopting resolutions to designate the following buildings as City Landmarks: Santa Barbara High School at 700 E. Anapamu Street and the Figueroa Street Ticket Booth, both on APN 029-240-008; and, the residence at 215 W. Valerio Street, APN 027-171-005 – Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian.

(1:36)

Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, presented a resolution to recommend to Santa Barbara City Council that they designate the Main Building and Figueroa Street Ticket Booth on the Santa Barbara High School Campus as a Santa Barbara City Landmark. He stated the Alumni Association, which is one of the largest in the nation, has been working towards this designation for a number of years, and he congratulated them for their efforts. Also, Mr. Jacobus thanked the Board of Education and the Santa Barbara High School District for allowing the designation request to go forward. Mr. Jacobus stated the quality of the architecture speaks for itself and requested the Historic Landmarks Commission recommend to City Council that they grant the Landmark status.

Public comment opened at 1:40 p.m.

John Campilio, Former President of the Alumni Association, stated his appreciation to the City of Santa Barbara and all institutions involved in the effort to designate the building as a Landmark and requested the HLC grant the designation.

David Hetyonk, Director of Facilities and Operations, stated his support of the designation.

Public comment closed at 1:43 p.m.

Motion: Adopt a resolution to designate Santa Barbara High School main building, at 700 E. Anapamu Street, and the Figueroa Street Ticket Booth as Santa Barbara City Historic Landmarks.

Action: Hausz/Suding, 9/0/0.

(1:44)

Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, gave a presentation regarding 215 West Valerio Street: He stated the building was the subject of a Historic Structures Report which concluded that the house qualifies as a City landmark and additionally would qualify for the California Register of Historic Resources and the National Register of Historic Places. He added the house was constructed in 1887 and is a "Queen Anne" style house which retains all of its original detail on the main block. Mr. Jacobus requested that the Historic Landmarks Commission pass a resolution to designate the "Queen Anne" style house at 215 West Valerio Street as a Santa Barbara City Historical Landmark and forward it to the Santa Barbara City Council for consideration.

Public comment opened at 1:45 p.m. and seeing no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion Adopt a resolution to designate the house located at 215 West Valerio Street as a Santa Barbara City Historical Landmark.

Action: La Voie/Suding, 9/0/0.

DISCUSSION ITEM**(1:46)**

Proposed design of the Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge – David Black, Landscape Architect; Hal Hill, Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Md Wahiduzzaman; Bengal Engineering, present.

Mr. Hill presented an overview of the Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge and stated the intention to re-design the bridge in a manner that will honor the history of the bridge and the fact that it is located in the Waterfront Historical District.

Mr. Black gave a photo presentation which illustrated the original 1912 bridge railings and other elements. Additionally, Mr. Black discussed the proposed opening of the corner, planting opportunities, pilings, location, height, alterations of the railings, obstruction of views, and bicycle lanes.

Mr. Wahiduzzaman explained the intention to eliminate the bridge piers, the tidal effects, current and flood issues.

The Commission had the following questions, observations and comments:

1. Asked if the grading will be required with the new design.
2. Asked about the paving.
3. Asked if there are historic photos or drawings of the bridge.
4. Stated the bridge had previously been reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission during a session with CalTrans and reminded the Commission that the 1927 design was recommended at that time.
5. Confirmed the bridge is not a State Highway.
6. Asked if the arched freeboard is problematic.
7. Expressed concern about the height of the rail.
8. Thought that the rail can be an open design.
9. Thought that the 1920's bridge rail design should be studied at a 52 inch height.
10. Thought pedestrian separation should be considered.
11. Questioned the distance of the bike path from the railing in order for it to not be 52 inches tall.
12. Asked if there are specific engineering requirements in addition to the 52 inch requirement.
13. Suggested the bridge be studied to reduce the rails as much as possible if there are no restrictions.

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m.

Kellem De Forest, resident, stated he is interested in the historical material and photographs of the original bridge and hopes the historical review will indicate the number of times that debris actually caused the bridge to become a dam during the water flow across Cabrillo Boulevard.

Public comment closed at 2:10 p.m.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**1. 2100 LAGUNA ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-263-016

Application Number: MST2005-00539

Owner: Jody Shields

Agent: Fermina Murray

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Fermina B. Murray.)

(2:13)

Mark Shields and Jody Shields, Owners; and Fermina Murray, Preparer, present.

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated the house is a good example of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture. The report finds the house is Structure of Merit-worthy and concludes that the proposal does not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards to the letter, but with the exception of the six foot high entry wall, the proposal does meet the intent of the Standards. Mr. Jacobus stated his preference that the house not be altered, but if it is to be altered, the proposed architecture appears to meet the intent of the Standards.

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.

Kellem De Forest, resident, reiterated the importance of the structure as part of an overall plan that Mary Craig was attempting to create as an entry way to the Santa Barbara Mission. Mr. De Forest related the importance of maintaining the vision of the original urban planning.

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

HLC Comments: At the applicant's request, the HLC commented on the proposed six foot-high wall at the entrance to the house. The HLC supports the Historic Structures Report's conclusion that a six foot-high wall is inappropriate at that location. The HLC would consider a wall of less than six feet if one is proposed as part of the overall design, but made it clear that their willingness to consider a wall does not assure that they will ultimately approve a wall at the front entrance.

Fermina Murray, Historian and Preparer of the report, stated she cannot support adding into the report the addition of the wall, at any height, as it would constitute an adverse impact on the resource.

Motion: The Commission approved the report as submitted.

Action: Pujó/La Voie, 4/3/1/1. Hsu, Naylor, and Spann opposed. Murray stepped down. Hausz abstained.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 1505 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-060-008

Application Number: MST2005-00545

Owner: Christophe Lancashire

Applicant: Lane Goodkind

Applicant: Gina Gianetto

(Landscape and hardscape improvements to a project under construction. Addition of new swimming pool, terraces, driveway, and entry gates.)

(Review of revised addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye.)

(2:44)

Lane Goodkind, Landscape Architect; Christophe Lancashire, Owner; and Ronald Nye, Historian, present.

Motion: The Commission approved the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 9/0/0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 1505 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-060-008
 Application Number: MST2005-00545
 Owner: Christophe Lancashire
 Applicant: Lane Goodkind
 Applicant: Gina Gianetto

(Landscape and hardscape improvements to a project under construction. Addition of new swimming pool, terraces, driveway, and entry gates.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

(2:48)

Lane Goodkind, Applicant; Christophe Lancashire, Owner; and Ronald Nye, Historian, present.

Motion: Final approval and a two-week continuance to the Consent Calendar for review of the entry gate and the following Findings: 1. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings: the Neighborhood Preservation criteria have been met in accordance with Section 22.22.131 of the Zoning Ordinance. 2. Historic Resource Findings: the project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 9/0/0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**4. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-313-018
 Application Number: MST2004-00052
 Owner: Richard Gunner
 Architect: Harrison Design Associates
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn

(Proposal to enlarge the main entry of the hotel and remove and relocate two units and the third floor sun deck. The project also includes major facade changes to the building and pedestrian access enhancements comprised of landscape, hardscape, decorative paving materials, and the removal of curb cuts. The net increase of new floor area is 876 square feet; however, there is a net decrease of 361 square feet of Measure E square footage. Modifications were granted on August 24, 2005. This project has been revised from the original submittal.)

(2:54)

Bill Harrison, Architect; Bernard Austin, Architect; Philip Suding, Landscape Architect; Richard and Michael Gunner, Owners, present.

Public comment opened at 3:08 p.m.

Kellem De Forest, resident, related his support in the design of the project.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary approval and an indefinite continuance to in-progress of the details and the landscape with the following comments and conditions:

Architecture:

General comments: 1) The shutters on the windows on elevations one and ten seem to be gratuitous and should be eliminated in favor of another design element. 2) The awning openings on all of the tower elements should be more vertical in proportion.

Elevation one, southwest Milpas elevation: 1) Redesign the first arch to be less "squashed" in proportion. 2) Restudy the awning above the first arch to have a more vertical proportion. 3) Make the *reja* above the opening adjacent to the main drive entrance more elaborate. 4) The arcade on the third floor shall either have thicker columns or have the columns expressed with a capital and base. 5) Redesign the windows with shutters to be more consistent with the other elements of the building. 6) Make the spacing of the three large openings to have more regular spacing and be less symmetrical on the tower. 7) The connection between the building and the tower to be expressed as an architectural element. 8) The pop-up for the elevator shall be treated in a more architectural way.

Elevation two, southeast Cabrillo elevation: 1) The dome on top of the tower shall be reduced in height to have a more round form. 2) The window in the *claraboya* shall be star shaped. 3) The arcade on the third floor shall either have thicker columns or have the columns expressed with a capital and base. 4) The pop-out element at the entry shall be more consistent with the rest of the architecture, and perhaps restudied to make the element more asymmetrical. 5) The impost between the arches shall be made thicker. 6) Engage the chimney into the building.

Elevation three: Restudy the awning openings at all octagonal towers to have more vertical proportions.

Elevation five: 1) The window in the *claraboya* shall be star shaped. 2) Restudy the alignment of the cantilever deck and the door below. 3) Add additional bracketing below the cantilever decks and increase the thickness of the cantilever brackets.

Action: Elevation ten: Redesign the elements composing the elevation to be less symmetrical. La Voie/Pujo, 7/0/2. Suding and Spann stepped down.

Landscape:

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full-Board with the following comments: 1) Restudy reversing the edge and the lawn area along the bike path. 2) Some Commissioners thought the use of the Monterey Cypress needs to be reconsidered. 3) Realign the pedestrian path to include an arterial connection to the Milpas Street crosswalk. 4) Restudy the entry *allée* that would include the walk and the use of columnar trees. 5) Study the use of double Washingtonia Palms or Orange Star pines as an entry feature typical of the 1890's to 1920's era. 6) Consider the use of public signage to identify the public areas being improved. 7) Provide an overlay study of the wind screen elements and landscaping for further review.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 7/0/2. Suding and Spann stepped down.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 1219 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00643
 Owner: Unity Shoppe, Inc
 Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(The building fronting State Street is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list; this project involves the rear bungalow facing City Parking Lot 5 (behind Victoria Court). This proposal involves a remodel of the rear facade of an existing commercial building including the reduction of an existing deck, addition of a trash enclosure, a handicap lift, security gates, and minor exterior architectural details.)

(3:53)

Bill Harrison, Architect; Bernard Austin, Architect; and Tom Reid, Director of Unity Shoppe, present.

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated the house was originally a brick bungalow style house, which are rare in Santa Barbara. Mr. Jacobus also stated that the HLC can request a Historic Structures Report for further evaluation.

Public comment opened at 4:04 p.m.

Kellem De Forest, resident, asked if a Historic Structures Report is needed.

Public comment closed at 4:05 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments: 1) A red asphalt roof is acceptable. Lay it flat, especially in respect to the rake detailing. 2) It is acceptable to leave the craftsman building in the current state. 3) Simplify the site elements and eliminate the gratuitous elements of the design. 4) The Commission appreciates the appropriate cleaning up of the building and site issues. 5) Restudy the dumpster portal orientation. 6) Place the fence gates on the left side behind the building plane.

Action: Naylor/La Voie 7/0/1. Spann stepped down.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 209 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-012
 Application Number: MST2005-00266
 Owner: Redevelopment Agency/Santa Barbara
 Agent: Louis Lazarine
 Business Name: Amtrak Passenger Station

(This is a Historic Landmark. Proposal to place a rail car on existing rail spur at the west end of the existing rail station.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

(4:15)

Louis Lazarine, Redevelopment Agency, City of Santa Barbara; and Alexandra Cole, Preservation Planning Associates, present.

Motion: Final approval as submitted with the following Historic Resource Findings: the rail car will enhance a historical resource.

Action: La Voie/Pujo, 7/0/0. Spann abstained.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 1528 STATE ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-012
 Application Number: MST2005-00389
 Owner: Bradley 2001 Family Trust Agreement
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposed demolition of 1,290 square feet of commercial space and construction of a new 4,100 square foot commercial space and three new residential condominium units, ranging from 2,120 to 2,782 square feet. The proposal includes 15 parking spaces.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN.)

(4:21)

Brian Cearnal, Architect; and Mike Jones, Designer, present.

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated there has been an historic evaluation of the building and it was determined the structure has no historic value.

Staff comment: Irma Unzueta, Project Planner, requested suggestions from the Commission and stated there are 15 parking spaces required, which are provided in the plan.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following positive comments: 1) The proposal is ingenious in design and land use. 2) The Commission commends the subterranean parking and the use of the single driveway. 3) The Commission recommends the driveway throat be narrowed and set-back from its present location. 4) The addition of a small four story element as proposed could be supportable, depending on its final design. 5) Concern was expressed regarding the provision of open space for a unit which joins the property line in a commercial zone and the potential loss of light and air by a future developer.

Action: La Voie/Pujo, 8/0/0.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**8. 21 E ANAPAMU ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-037
 Application Number: MST2004-00173
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Redevelopment
 Applicant: People's Self-Help Housing
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to construct a three-story structure composed of twelve residential units. The units would be rental for low-income clients of People's Self-Help Housing. The units are approximately 575 square feet and provide private outdoor areas on the 3,780 square foot lot. The project requires Planning Commission approval for modifications.)

(In-progress review of landscape plan and paseo improvements.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-05.)

(5:30)

This item was taken out of order.

Detlev Peikert, Architect; Ariane Risto; Project Manager; and Rob Maday, Designer, present.

Motion: Preliminary approval of the landscaping and a two-week continuance to the Consent Calendar for final approval with the condition to place an additional King Palm tree near the gas meters on the west side near the proposed patio.

Action: Pujo/Hsu, 7/0/0. Suding and La Voie absent.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED9. **628 STATE ST** C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-026
 Application Number: MST2005-00584
 Owner: Bernard Mac Elhenny
 Architect: On Design
 Business Name: The Habit

(Proposal to install three outdoor heaters and construct a new retractable canopy structure to cover the rear patio on a property located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW10. **1086 COAST VILLAGE RD** C-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-212-013
 Application Number: MST2005-00625
 Owner: Alan Porter
 Contractor: Quality Roofing

(This is a City Landmark: Moody Sisters cottage. Proposal to re-roof a commercial building from a brown/grey asphalt/composition shingle to a new brown asphalt/composition shingle.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND FINDINGS FOR ALTERATIONS TO A CITY LANDMARK.)****(4:50)**

This item was taken out of order.

Alan Porter, Owner, present.

Public comment opened at 4:58 p.m.

Louise Boucher, resident, stated her concern regarding the proposed and existing roofing materials.

Public comment closed at 4:59 p.m.

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that he has met with the Building Department and it has been determined that the building is not located in a high fire area; therefore, a Class B rated fire-treated wood shingle is acceptable.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the condition that only a wood shingle roof replicating the original design and detailing is acceptable on this City Landmark in that this type of roofing is a major contributing element of the design.

Action: La Voie/Pujo, 8/0/0.

THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:12 P.M. TO 5:18 P.M.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**11. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Tynan Group, Inc.
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Third Concept Review. Update of main building.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)

(5:18)

This item was taken out of order.

Henry Lenny, Architect; and James Jones, Applicant, present.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The siting for buildings 25, 26, 27 and 28 is approved. 2) The design concept for building 29 is approved. 3) The design concept for building 28 is too formalized and needs to be more rustic.

Action: Naylor/Rager, 7/0/0.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**12. 400 & 500 BLOCK OF STATE STREET**

DUMMY Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-0RW
 Application Number: MST2005-00507
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Brian Bosse, Redevelopment Supervisor
 Architect: Bob Cunningham

(Proposal to remove the existing tile sidewalks of the 400 and 500 blocks of State Street and replace with new brick sidewalks, benches, and improved landscaping. The project will carry the design theme of the 600-1200 blocks of State Street.)

(6:36)

Marck Aguilar, Redevelopment Agency; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, present.

Staff comment: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor, stated there was a special joint meeting held with Philip Suding, William La Voie, and Caren Rager of the Historic Landmarks Commission; Marshall Rose of the Downtown Organization; himself; and the interested business owners. Mr. Limón stated various business owners were originally opposed to the twenty-one benches proposed. During the meeting, it was determined that twelve benches and a phased approach, incorporating more benches over time if needed, was an acceptable solution. Mr. Limón stated that the benches will continue to be monitored and added or removed, dependent on usage. He also stated the City of Santa Barbara is committed to monitoring the use of the benches and hopes the compromise will be amenable to all involved.

Public comment opened at 6:48 p.m.

Chair Spann read a letter submitted by Marshall Rose of the Downtown Organization which stated his support of the number of twelve benches agreed upon.

Public comment closed at 6:48 p.m.

Motion: Revised preliminary approval and a four-week continuance to the October 26th meeting with the following conditions: 1) Place the benches at the shuttle stops perpendicular to the street. 2) If possible, in locations where there is only one bench at a shuttle stop, it shall face the direction of the shuttle. 3) The sidewalk widening at Gutierrez and State Streets is preferred and the Commission supports the design. 4) The bench in front of 401 and 403 State Street on the alternate plan is not approved at that location and should instead remain at the shuttle stop.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 8/0/0. La Voie absent.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

13. **211 E YANONALI ST** M-1/SP-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-630-005
 Application Number: MST2005-00645
 Owner: The Wright Partners
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor
 Agent: John Dohm

(Proposed removal of existing open yard and storage uses and construction of a two-story, 42,500 square foot commercial building on a 132,422 square foot parcel in the Coastal Zone. Parking areas will provide 136 spaces.)

(Comments only; early Concept Review requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A DEVELOPMENT PLAN AND A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT.)

(6:01)

John Dohm, Agent; and Dave Jones, Architect, present.

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated the applicant will need two modifications: One for parking and one for the two front yard set-backs in accordance with the Specific Plan.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comments that the site design as presented is unacceptable and the Historic Landmarks Commission strongly suggests a joint meeting with the Planning Commission prior to the project moving forward.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 8/0/0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

FINAL REVIEW

A. **1033 ANACAPA ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-035
 Application Number: MST2005-00578
 Owner: Levon Investments
 Applicant: Elisa Garcia
 Architect: Elisa Garcia
 Business Name: American Riviera Bank

(Proposal to remove an existing window and install a new ATM machine and install a new night depository through an existing wall in the covered entry area of the Figueroa Street elevation of a one-story commercial building. Also proposed is to replace the front entry door and entry tile.)

(Final Review is requested of revised night depository and new entry portico door and tile.)

Final approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1505 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-060-008
 Application Number: MST2005-00244
 Owner: Christophe Lancashire
 Applicant: Gina Giannetto

(Proposal to change two doors and windows to one pair of French doors and a band of three windows on the north side, remove three basement windows and install one pair of French doors with sidelights and a single door with sidelights on the south side. On the west side, remove one door and add one window, and add new patio paving. Extend two balconies on the south side and increase the height of the rail on the first floor, south-facing patio.)

(Review After Final of materials for rooftop decking and kitchen patio.)

Final approval of the Review After Final with the condition that the rooftop decking shall be "Asia Jaipur" tile, with dark grout.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 306 W CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-091-013
 Application Number: MST2005-00187
 Owner: Theodore Smyth
 Architect: Bob Pester
 Business Name: West Beach Inn

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to replace an existing 2,101 square foot concrete swimming pool deck with a new 2,902 square foot swimming pool deck; add a 27 square foot entry portico; switch existing swimming pool equipment room with existing office (191 square foot remodel); add one guest parking space and new plaster and wrought iron swimming pool enclosure; add 4'-0" high plaster privacy walls at two guest suites.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Continued indefinitely at the applicant's request.

NEW ITEM**D. 122 NATOMA AVE**

R-4/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-072-010
 Application Number: MST2005-00600
 Owner: Cynthia Howard
 Applicant: Todd Eliassen

(Proposal to replace a deteriorating as-built window on the first floor west elevation of one unit in a residential duplex with a new, custom made, wood window to exactly match the old in material, size, and configuration. A modification is requested to permit construction within the interior yard setback.)

Continued indefinitely to the Modification Hearing Officer with the following comments: 1) Proposed window should be drawn and detailed as the existing window to be replaced. 2) The electric meters and conduits should be enclosed in a cabinet, which is to return to the Consent Calendar.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 428 CHAPALA ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026
 Application Number: MST2005-00079
 Owner: Casa De Sevilla Partners, LP
 Architect: DesignArc
 Business Name: Casa De Sevilla

(Proposed 1,000 square foot dining patio including an additional restroom, masonry wall, fountain, bar, and fabric awnings for an existing restaurant.)

(Final Approval of the entry door is requested.)

Final approval as submitted with the condition that the door shall be stained darker to match the approved color board.

FINAL REVIEW**F. 800 STATE ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-010
 Application Number: MST2005-00529
 Owner: Westen Family Group
 Architect: Robert Klammer
 Contractor: Signal Construction Company
 Owner: Sima El Paseo, LLC
 Owner: Trust for Historic Preservation

(Proposal to improve the existing alley behind 800 State Street immediately adjacent to the De La Guerra Adobe and connecting to El Paseo Shopping Center. The proposal includes a new enclosure for the existing electrical service box and sump pump, replastering exterior walls, new doors, windows, light fixture, gate, and trash enclosure. The proposal also includes repaving with stamped concrete.)

(Final Approval of lighting details is requested.)

Continued indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.

NEW ITEM**G. 320 PASEO NUEVO** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2005-00631
 Owner: Redevelopment Agency/Santa Barbara
 Agent: Glen Morris
 Business Name: Aldo Shoe Store

(Proposal to construct new metal canopies, exterior paint, and tile at an existing storefront in Paseo Nuevo.)

Final approval as submitted with the following conditions: 1) The cabling color shall match the wrought iron color.
 2) Signs are not a part of this approval.

NEW ITEM**H. 328 LOMA VISTA AVE** R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-084-002
 Application Number: MST2005-00632
 Owner: Timothy Kehl

(Proposal to change the exterior paint color of an existing single-family residence in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Final approval as submitted with the following conditions: 1) Body color shall be Cabot's "Red Cedar" solid body stain; trim color shall be Frazee #8231W "Sawyer's Fence," and accent color shall be Behr "Red Hawk" ECC-46-3.
 2) The applicant is to provide an updated color board to Staff prior to issuance of building permit.

NEW ITEM**I. 1107 STATE ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-012
 Application Number: MST2005-00642
 Owner: D & D State Street LLC
 Applicant: Hyo Pun Kim
 Business Name: So-Good Jewelry

(Proposal to obtain approval for an as-built repainted exterior of a commercial building.)

Final approval as submitted with the following conditions: 1) The plaster shall be painted ACE brand "Summer's Tan" #83D, and the wood shall be painted Frazee brand "Brush Box, #8235D". 2) The applicant is to provide an updated color board.