



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, October 10, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER
KEVIN MOORE
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KRYSTAL M. VAUGHN, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Cung (left at 5:38 p.m.), Hopkins, Miller, Moore, and Wittausch.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Gantz and Vaughn.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **September 26, 2016**, as amended.
Action: Hopkins/Moore, 5/0/2. (Wittausch and Cung abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 3, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gradin and Miller.
Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 10, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gradin and Miller.

Action: Miller/Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

None.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Board Member Hopkins and Wittausch reported on the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) subcommittee meeting.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 116 E COTA ST

C-M Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00627
 Owner: Cota Street, LLC
 Architect: Designarc

(This is a revised project description for a project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD): Proposal for a new four-story mixed-use building on a 10,865 square foot vacant parcel adjacent to Plaza Vera Cruz. The project includes 15 two-bedroom, two-bathroom residential units and approximately 738 square-feet of commercial space. Sixteen covered parking spaces will be provided on the ground level. Residential units will be on the second, third, and fourth floors. The proposed building height is 45 feet, with a 457 square foot rooftop deck. The proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with an average unit size of 827 square-feet. A maximum density of 63 dwelling units per acre is allowed on this parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Medium-High Density within the Priority Housing Overlay area.)

(Seventh review. Revised parking garage access requires new Project Design Approval. Project was last reviewed on September 26, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect; Ken Vermillion, Architect; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; and Jaime Limon, Senior Planner II, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members feel the project is ready for Project Design Approval as submitted? 3/0/4 (failed.)

Straw vote: How many Board members can support the following comment: "It appears that there is room to push the upper-floor areas of the residential portion back away from Cota Street." 4/0/3 (passed)

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Board established that the project is moving in the right direction.

2. The Board is concerned with the amount of metal and different types of metal screening proposed. Reduce, simplify, and/or eliminate some of the different types and the amount of metal and metal screening being used, particularly at the stair tower.
3. Study ways to break up the “blockiness” and sense of mass at the east E. Cota Street façade. Break up the roofline that becomes the cowl. Study the possibility of pushing the upper residential portion back away from E. Cota Street to provide greater relief at the street elevation.
4. Look for code exceptions available to the fourth floor rear stair tower.
5. Study the possibility of raising the commercial parapet height.
6. Study ways to break up the repetitive use of forms, particularly on the park facing elevation.
7. Study warming up the color palette and materials proposed to make the project conform better to the downtown Santa Barbara area.
8. Return with more information on the perforated screens and supports.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 6/1/0. (Tripp opposed.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 321 OCEANO AVE

R-2/SD-3 Zone

(4:15)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 045-071-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00347
 Owner: Brad and Cynthia Frohling Living Trust
 Architect: Acme Architecture

(This project has been revised from three to two new dwelling units. The current proposal is to construct a new two-story residential duplex consisting of a 1,765 square foot unit with a 444 square foot attached 2-car garage, and a 2,037 square foot unit with a 443 square foot attached 2-car garage. Related site grading, utilities, paving, drainage and landscaping are also proposed. The 7,564-square foot project site is currently developed with a 1,186-square foot one-story single family dwelling, including a 228 square foot attached 2-car garage, which will be demolished. This project requires Staff Hearing Officer approval of a lot area modification and a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Staff Hearing Officer approval. Project was last reviewed on February 1, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:16 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect; and Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel the fin elements on the south elevation need to be restudied? 4/0/3 (passed)

Motion: **Continued to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:**

1. The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:
 - a. The Board made the finding that the proposed development project’s design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b. The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.

- c. The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. This criteria is not applicable to the proposed project, as the project is not in close proximity to any adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features.
 - e. This criteria is not applicable to the proposed project, as the project is not in close proximity to any established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
2. Restudy the location of the trash enclosure in relation to the common open space to maximize the viable use of outdoor landscaping and functional open space.
 3. Restudy the arrangement of the balcony parapet element as it relates to the planter wall.
 4. Restudy the fin elements, especially those on the south elevation.

Action: Cung/Gradin, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1116 SAN PASCUAL ST

R-3 Zone

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-202-016
 Application Number: MST2016-00359
 Owner: Edward St George
 Architect: On Design LLC

(Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes demolition of an existing, detached, 720 square foot garage and 176 square foot shed and construction of a new 2,444 square foot two-story duplex. An existing 675 square foot single-family dwelling on site will remain unchanged. The residential unit mix will include one, 2-bedroom unit (existing dwelling), one, 5-bedroom unit on the first and second floors, and one, 1-bedroom unit on the second floor of the new duplex, with an average unit size of 1.039 square-feet. The proposed density on this 6,880 square foot parcel is 21 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Private outdoor living space for the new units will be provided in two second floor decks totaling 173 square-feet. There will be a total of three parking spaces provided, two in a 420 square foot, attached two-car garage, and one uncovered space. No grading is proposed. Total development on site will be 3,119 square-feet of floor area. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2016-00345.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:00 p.m.

Present: Shelby Messner and Keith Nolan, Architects.

Public comment opened at 5:09 p.m.

A letter of expressed concerns from Helen Mortensen regarding inadequate parking and loss of views was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:10 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the two story nature of the site.

2. The Board is concerned that there is insufficient landscaping and would like the applicant to study moving the private outdoor space of the new ground floor unit to the ground floor.
3. The cantilevered balcony is too close to the adjoining roof.
4. The proposed trash enclosure collides with the existing windows as designed.
5. The Board is concerned with the bedroom to parking space ratio.
6. Provide more architectural distinction.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:34 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 6:06 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 208 OCEANO AVE

R-2/SD-3 Zone

(6:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-074-007
 Application Number: MST2016-00023
 Owner: Tantri LLC
 Architect: Craig Goodman

(Proposal for major remodel, partial demolition, and reconfiguration of an existing two-story duplex which will result in a 1,400 square foot duplex at the rear of an 8,756 square foot parcel. The duplex will include a 330 square foot covered porch on the ground floor, remodeled 302 square foot uncovered deck on the second floor, and a new stairway. A portion of the structure will be demolished, including as-built work, as part of the major remodel to alter the structure to a Spanish architectural style. The garage size will be increased and building footprint widened to provide a reduced 3 foot side yard setback at the ground floor. Four tandem covered parking spaces are proposed in the new parking configuration. Other site work will include the replacement of existing fencing with new site walls, a new raised planters, new driveway, hardscape, landscaping, and a relocated trash enclosure. The existing four unit apartment building at the front of the site also requires approval of as-built window replacements, proposed storage, and a new entry. Requires Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification to provide less than the required open yard area. Three parking design waivers are being requested from the Transportation Division. This proposal will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00524.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment, Staff Hearing Officer review, and three Parking Waivers from the Transportation Division. Project was last reviewed on August 15, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:06 p.m.

Present: Craig Goodman, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:24 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Indefinitely Continued to the Staff Hearing Officer with the following comments:

1. Applicant to study reducing the effective hardscape area throughout the site, especially the driveway.
2. Applicant to study relocating the accessible route and ramp or better address its proximity to the building.
3. Applicant to provide an Arborist report for the existing oak tree.
4. Applicant should alter the style of the existing building to be more in keeping with Monterey style architecture.

5. Consider altering the front door of the ground floor studio unit to face the front of the property in an effort to eliminate the headroom clearance of the stair.
6. Consider shifting the color scheme to something other than white windows and white walls.
7. Verify that an additional zoning modification is not required for the work proposed in the front yard setback. If an additional modification is required, the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) would be in support of it and the applicant would not need to return to ABR for comments on it.
8. The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:
 - a. The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b. The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. This criteria is not applicable to the proposed project, as the project is not in close proximity to any adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features.
 - e. The proposed project appropriately addresses the preservation of established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project as currently designed does not provide an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Miller/Gradin, 6/0/0. (Cung absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 316 W MICHELTORENA/1516 CASTILLO STS

R-4 Zone

(7:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-212-026
 Application Number: MST2016-00125
 Owner: Drake Forest Investments, LLC
 Architect: Douglas Keep

(Proposal for a new 21 unit residential project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD) on two perpendicular lots at 316 W. Micheltorena and 1516 Castillo Streets (APNs 027-212-026 and 027-212-022). Between the two parcels, there are currently five existing buildings. The proposal would demolish three buildings, two carports, and a portion of Building C (5,049 square-foot); retain two buildings (6,073 square-foot); and construct four buildings (8,809 square-foot), for a new total of six residential buildings (14,882 square-foot). A detailed breakdown is as follows: Building A: Existing 4,468 square-foot 3-stories (7 units), Building B: New 2,580 square-foot 2-stories (3 units), Building C: Existing 1,605 square-foot 2-stories (2 units), Building D: New 2,320 square-foot 2-stories (4 units), Building E: New 2,756 square-foot 3-stories (4 units), and Building F: New 1,153 square-foot 2-stories (1 unit). The unit mix comprises 13, 1-bedroom units and eight, 2-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 767 square-feet and a density of 27 du/acre. The project also includes 21 parking spaces, approximately 426 square-foot of detached accessory structures, reconfigured driveways, and new landscaping. Both properties will be merged through a Voluntary Lot Merger and will result in a combined lot area of 35,263 square-feet. One Tipuana tree is proposed to be removed. The project is in the R-4 zone with a General Plan designation of Medium-High Density.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Tree Removal Permit. Project was last reviewed on August 1, 2016.)

Actual time: 7:09 p.m.

Present: Douglas Keep, Architect; and Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:16 p.m.

1. Lorin Grean spoke in opposition and expressed concerns regarding parking and traffic circulation.
2. Mark Sheridan spoke in opposition and expressed concerns regarding circulation and how adjusting the driveways will negatively affect the surrounding historic structures.
3. Forrest Wilde spoke in opposition and expressed concerns regarding the insufficiency of the parking.
4. Edward Rocket spoke in opposition and expressed concerns regarding the parking and a telephone pole that will be affected by the traffic change.

Public comment closed at 7:35 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and indefinite continuance to In-Progress review, with CEQA 15183 findings, the conditions of approval for an annual resident's survey, and comments:

1. The Board is pleased with the project and feels the architecture is appropriate.
2. Traffic, parking, and circulation are as good as they can be.
3. The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:
 - a. The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b. The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. The proposed development is sensitive to adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.
 - e. The project does not impact Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.
 - f. The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
4. Provide better planting buffers and way access to building D.
5. Study adding buffering and landscaping to the driveway leading to Castillo Street and the property line on the south edge of the parking lot in the rear.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 5/1/0. (Hopkins opposed; Cung absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:58 P.M. ****