



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, September 12, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER
KEVIN MOORE
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KRYSTAL M. VAUGHN, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Cung, Hopkins, Moore, and Wittausch.
Planning Commission Liaison: John Campanella (arrived at 2:45 p.m. and left at 4:02 p.m.).
Members absent: Miller and Tripp.
Staff present: Gantz and Vaughn.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF ARCHITECTS (AIA)
Architect Christopher Manson-Hing of American Institute of Architects, Santa Barbara Chapter, made a short presentation to announce the 8th Annual ArchitectTours to be held on Saturday, October 1, 2016, with the theme "Spirit of Santa Barbara – Past & Present", featuring a combination of commercial and residential projects showcasing historic structures that have withstood the test of time, balanced by contemporary buildings strongly rooted in the community.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of August 29, 2016, as amended.
Action: Hopkins/Moore, 4/0/1. (Gradin abstained; Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 6, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gradin (all Items) and Miller (Item A only).

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/1. (Gradin abstained; Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 12, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gradin.

Action: Hopkins/Moore, 5/0/0. (Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

1. Board Members Miller and Tripp will be absent from the meeting, and Chair Gradin will step down from Item 4, 1236 San Andres Street.
2. Annual recruitment for City Advisory Group members began on Tuesday, September 6, 2016 and the recruitment schedule is as follows:

Tuesday, September 20th: Resignation Deadline for Board Members not at the end of their term. (Current members resigning by this date will allow the City to recruit for that opening now, as opposed to operating with only six ABR member for the next six months.)

Tuesday, October 11, 2016, at 5:30 p.m., application deadline

Interviews by the City Council:

Tuesday, October 25, 2016, at approximately 4:00 p.m.;

Tuesday, November 1, 2016, at approximately 4:00 p.m.; and

Tuesday, November 15, 2016, at 6:00 p.m.

Appointments: Tuesday, December 6, 2016.

Members must be a Qualified Elector of the City or the County of Santa Barbara and possess professional experience in related fields, including, but not limited to, landscape architecture, building design, structural engineering, or industrial design. Representatives must be from the following categories: two Qualified Electors of the City and are licensed architects.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. AVERAGE UNIT-SIZE DENSITY (AUD) INCENTIVE PROGRAM**

(3:17)

Staff: Renee Brooke, City Planner, and Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

(Discussion of the objectives of the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program and the role of the Architectural Board of Review.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Renee Brooke, City Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Jaime Limón, Senior Planner II,

City of Santa Barbara.

Discussion held.

Individual Board Members made the following comments:

1. All AUD applications should include the following standard submittal requirements:
 - a. An aerial photo encompassing a minimum 1.5 block radius that highlights (in different colors) where two and three story buildings are located, to establish neighborhood compatibility.
 - b. A thorough photographic survey of the neighborhood to show all the building types in the surrounding area, not just buildings of similar size.
 - c. On elevations, an outline of buildings on adjacent parcels should be sketched over the elevation of the proposed new building. This will provide a general idea of the relationship between the proposed building and any buildings adjacent to it.
 - d. Site sections showing a half block in from each side of the proposed property.
2. Some applicants submitting AUD projects should be required to put up story poles prior to the item being reviewed so that the Board can make educated decisions regarding compatibility, size, bulk, and scale.
3. Requiring more parking for units with two or more bathrooms seems acceptable because of the possibility of a dorm room effect; however, requiring more parking for units with 2-3 bedrooms does not, since it will increase the cost of housing for people with young families that may not need extra parking.
4. The Board suggest reviewing projects based on a VAR (volume-to-area ratio) scale rather than a FAR (floor-to-lot-area ratio) scale. This will encourage taller buildings to be placed on larger lots instead of smaller.
5. One Board Member would like the City to study ways to regulate affordability in the AUD projects to aid in the housing deficit the City faces.
6. One Board Member would like staff to study ways to control the AUD project development rate.

Gradin and Hopkins were appointed as the AUD subcommittee members; Wittausch and Cung were appointed as alternates.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 100 BLK S SOLEDAD STREET

(3:57)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-495
 Application Number: MST2015-00294
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Laura Yanez
 Engineer: Thomas Conti, PE, QSD, Senior Project Manager

(Proposal for the Cacique and Soledad Street Pedestrian and Bicycle Bridges and Corridor Improvements Project which will consist of street improvements on Cacique Street from Salinas to Alisos Streets and along Soledad Street from Cacique to Montecito Streets. Improvements will include the removal of the existing dilapidated wood pedestrian bridge along Cacique Street, construction of two pedestrian bicycle bridges along Cacique and Soledad Streets over Sycamore Creek, construction of sidewalks on Soledad and Cacique Streets, adjustment of intersection controls at certain corridor intersections to favor bicycle boulevard movements along Cacique Street, installation of pedestrian and bicycle-oriented lighting throughout the corridor and bridges, and riparian habitat enhancement.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on January 19,

2016.)

Actual time: 4:02 p.m.

Present: Laura Yanez, Project Engineer I, City of Santa Barbara; Thomas Conti, Senior Project Manager, Bengal Engineering; Josh Monroy, Landscape Architect, David Black & Associates; and Steven Greer, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Return with alternatives that better conceal the proposed utility lines to be attached to the bridge.
2. Provide photographic documents regarding the existing pedestrian and street lighting pole styles adjacent to the project.
3. Show the correct dimension of 12 feet on the lighting pole plan.

Action: Cung/Gradin, 4/1/0. (Wittausch Opposed; Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

3. 1236 SAN ANDRES ST

R-3 Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-151-001
 Application Number: MST2006-00364
 Owner: Byers Family Trust
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct four, two-story residential condominium units. Three of the units would be approximately 1,000 square feet and one unit would be approximately 1,100 square feet. Each unit would have an attached two-car garage for a total of eight parking spaces on the 10,048 square foot parcel. The proposal includes demolition of all existing structures and 140 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprints. The project received Planning Commission approval (Resolution No. 01-08) on January 10, 2008.)

(Comments only. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 01-08. Project was last reviewed on April 21, 2008.)

Actual time: 4:43 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Susan Gantz read the following FPPC statement into the record: "The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4 (b) (5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he is a member to present, explain, architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Kirk Gradin is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of his client."

Public comment opened at 4:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board finds the design attractive and acceptable.
2. The Board is in support of the dome removal and appreciates the grille work that was added to the west elevation.
3. The Board is uncertain of the appropriateness of the paint colors “Mauvalish” and “Nectarine” and requested that the applicant return with larger samples.
4. Removing the pilasters from the fence is acceptable. The Board is not in favor of chain-link material.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. (Gradin stepped down; Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 217 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-3 Zone****(4:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-260-016
 Application Number: MST2016-00291
 Owner: Jon Sarad and Simmons Family Trust
 Architect: Keith Rivera

(Proposal for a pre-application consultation design review hearing with limited plans to be presented. This proposal is for a new multi-family development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). It will include the demolition of an existing 691 square foot one-story dwelling unit, 421 square foot detached garage, and 85 square foot shed, and the construction of a 2,204 square foot two-story duplex and a 2,869 square foot two-story triplex. An existing 1,072 square foot dwelling unit at the front of the site is proposed to remain unchanged. The unit mix will include four, 2-bedroom units and one, 1-bedroom unit. The project will result in six dwelling units totaling 6,145 square feet, with an average unit size of 1,024 square feet. The proposed density on this 12,500 square foot parcel will be 21 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be a total of six parking spaces provided in attached garages totaling 1,088 square feet, and one uncovered space. Two fruit trees will be removed. Grading will be balanced on site. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00485.)

(Comments only; no action shall be taken on this pre-application consultation.)

Actual time: 5:13 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:25 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board felt the front elevation is very charming and overall the project seems to be in scale with the neighborhood.
2. Study implementing some of the detail found in the north elevation to the south elevation.
3. Return with color details.
4. Restudy the shed detail.
5. Study the implementation of a porch or covered area at the street side in an attempt to add visual relief to the building height.

6. Study the north elevation bedroom balconies and consider adding some separation between them.
7. Consider making the wall of the porches above the garage solid up to 30 feet so that the spandrels are plaster rather than wood, introducing the ability to implement a plaster form rather than a craftsman form.
8. Study and return with the window type and style that will be considered for the project.
9. Study consolidating the different materials used in building two, south elevation.
10. Study simplifying the garage doors to be more in keeping with the design of the building.

Action: Gradin/Cung, 5/0/0. (Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:40 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:47 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 321 E MICHELTORENA ST

R-3 Zone

(6:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-251-014
 Application Number: MST2016-00383
 Owner: Hathaway Family Trust
 Architect: ACME Architecture

(Proposal for a new multi-family development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal will include the demolition of 1,408 square feet of impermeable paving and 158 lineal feet of fencing and the construction of a three-story duplex with an attached, 743 square foot, three-car garage at the rear of the site. An existing 1,428 square foot, one-story, three bedroom dwelling unit at the front of the site will remain unaltered. The unit mix will include three, 3-bedroom units (2-bedrooms plus lofts) totaling 3,269 square feet with an average unit size of 1,089 square feet. The proposed density on this 6,664 square foot parcel will be 20 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. The proposal also includes removal of one 47 foot tall palm tree, one 12 foot tall Pittosporum tree, and a 64 foot long hedge encroaching onto the public alley. Grading will be balanced on site.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:47 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:55 p.m.

1. Jenna Berg spoke in opposition and expressed concerns regarding parking.
2. A letter from J.R. Martinez was acknowledged expressing that the project is oversized, out of character, and incompatible with the surrounding neighborhood as designed.

Public comment closed at 6:00 p.m.

Ms. Gantz read into the record a staff memo provided by the City of Santa Barbara Urban Historian, Nicole Hernandez.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Board appreciated the similar use of material and detailing being used to tie the two projects together.
2. The Board found the current iteration of the third floor element unacceptable as shown.
3. The majority of the Board felt the building should step in a more traditional manner, with less mass in the upper levels and greater mass in the lower levels.
4. Study a means of separating the common open space and the trash area.

Action: Hopkins/Moore, 5/0/0. (Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:27 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 6:53 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 1030 CACIQUE ST****R-3 Zone****(6:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-252-006
 Application Number: MST2016-00225
 Owner: Jose Gutierrez
 Designer: Flaviano Ramirez

(Proposal for a 231 square foot addition to an existing 574 square foot single-family dwelling and to convert an existing 697 square foot attached garage to a new one-story dwelling unit, resulting in a duplex. A new 434 square foot two-car carport will be constructed, providing two covered parking spaces, and two uncovered spaces will also be provided. One orange tree is proposed to be removed, and no grading is proposed on this 5,000 square foot parcel.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:53 p.m.

Present: Jose Gutierrez, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:57 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Project is ready for Project Design Approval.
2. The Architect is to consult the video recording of the September 12, 2016 ABR meeting so as to review comments from the Board.
3. Verify that roof plan and crickets are accurately drawn and functional.
4. Revise the covered porch to be more like the existing covered porch.
5. Replicate or provide a new type of water heater that doesn't encroach into the setback.
6. The elevation should accurately represent where wall changes occur and not show extra lines where they don't occur.
7. The small window below the gable on the north elevation should be centered under the gable end.
8. Consider adding a garage door to the carport; verify with Transportation Division that adequate back out is being supplied in the carport area.
9. Consider building the carport three feet from the property line as opposed to six feet

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/0. (Miller and Tripp absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:33 P.M. ***