



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, July 18, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*

SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER

KEVIN MOORE

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
KRYSTAL M. VAUGHN, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Cung (arrived at 3:07 and left at 5:30), Miller, Moore, and Wittausch.

Members absent: Tripp and Hopkins.

Staff present: Gantz (left at 5:10), Mamulski (Arrived at 5:00), and Vaughn.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of July 5, 2016, as amended.

Action: Moore/Wittausch, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller, abstained).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of July 11, 2016. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Howard Wittausch and Philip Suding.

Action: Moore/Wittausch, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller abstained)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of July 18, 2016. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Wm. Howard Wittausch and Courtney Jane Miller.

Action: Miller/Moore, 4/0/0. Motion carried.

- D.** Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- a. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
- i. Board Members Fitzgerald-Tripp and Hopkins will be absent from today's meeting.
 - ii. The project at 325 W. Anapamu Street, which was continued two weeks to today's meeting, has been postponed two weeks due to loss of quorum.
 - iii. The ABR and HLC are invited to attend this Thursday's Planning Commission meeting to discuss the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD) and its objectives in the General Plan and Zoning Ordinance. The Planning Commission will consider whether the stated objectives are being met or if minor amendments should be considered. The meeting will take place in City Council Chambers at 735 Anacapa Street at approximately 1:15pm.
 - iv. There will be a joint ABR / HLC workshop on Thursday, July 28, 2016 at 3pm in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room to discuss and hear a presentation on a proposed draft wireless ordinance. Staff will email the board on the exact location as it may change.
- b. Board member Miller announced that she will be stepping down from Item 1, 6100 Hollister Avenue.

D. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no Subcommittee Reports.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 6100 HOLLISTER AV

A-I-1/SP-6 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065
 Application Number: MST2014-00619
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara - Airport Admin.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting
 Applicant: Direct Relief
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to construct a new facility for Direct Relief, a nonprofit organization, including a new 127,706 square foot warehouse with an attached two-story 27,294 square foot administrative office building, a secure truck yard loading area, and 162 parking spaces on a 7.99 acre parcel to be purchased from the City of Santa Barbara Airport. The existing eight buildings totaling 12,937 square feet would be demolished. A new public road is proposed to be constructed immediately south of the project site, which is located in Sub-area 3 of the Airport Specific Plan [SP-6]. The project received a designation as a Community Benefit project and an allocation of 80,000 square feet [and reservation of 30,000 square feet] of non-residential floor area from the Community Benefit category by the City Council. Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission is required.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 011-16. Project was last reviewed September 28, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:08 p.m.

Ms. Gantz read into the record the FPPC Exception for Board Member Miller as follows: The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4(b)(5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he or she is a member to present, explain architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Courtney Jane Miller is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of her client.

Present: Michael Holiday, Architect; Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect; Mark Linehan, Chairman of the Building Committee for Direct Relief International; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members feel the project as presented is ready for Project Design Approval? 3/1/0 (passed).

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to In-Progress review with the following comments:

1. Provide 1/8 inch scale elevations at the next review and include preliminary conceptual drawings of details, including roof edges, trellises and windows.
2. Study enhancements to the trellis and gate detailing.
3. Study means of adding texture or a varied finish as well as lighter colors for the warehouse field color.
4. Study deepening the canopies by 8-10 inches.
5. Where planting occurs adjacent to the building, study adding shrubs that grow to a minimum of 6 feet, preferably 8-10 feet at maturity.
6. Study judicious placement of altering parapet heights to break up the length of the building.
7. One Board member felt the color selection for the main entrance of the building should be refined.

Action: Wittausch/Moore, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller stepped down, Tripp and Hopkins absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 6210 - 6290 HOLLISTER AVE

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-042
 Application Number: MST2016-00022
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting
 Architect: Flex Designs

(Proposal to construct two new buildings on a vacant six acre parcel. The project will include a 22,282 square foot, two-story auto dealership building for Chrysler, with 91 parking spaces and 48 inventory spaces. Also proposed is a 21,087 square foot, one-story auto dealership building for Infiniti and another franchise, with 89 parking spaces and 57 inventory spaces. There will also be a sales lot for Airstream trailer sales. Total development on site will be 43,369 square feet. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Development Plan.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval. Project was last reviewed on July 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:24 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting; Robert Plant, Architect, Flex Designs; and Andrew Bermond, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:40 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many board members can support sending the project to the Planning Commission with knowing there are still architectural refinements that need to be made? 5/0/0 (passed).

Straw vote: How many board members feel the stone on the Subaru building are acceptable as proposed? 5/0/0 (passed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission and to return to Full Board with comments:

1. Further study the architectural elements of the building to refine them.
2. Provide samples of the different block treatments and photographs of what the proposed opening treatments would look like once completed.
3. Study making the supports at the canopy vertical rather than sloping.
4. On the Chrysler building arched entrance, make the break ups vertical and horizontal rather than radial, and study whether something other than an arch can be used at the entry.
5. Study adding stone at the Subaru columns to match the stone chimney.
6. Return with a roof plan.
7. One Board member would like the applicant to provide a more detailed drawing of the service bay supports and suggested the service bay mirror the left or right side, architecturally.
8. Study the use of glass block.
9. **The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
 - a) **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b) **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c) **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d) **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is not near any Landmarks or Historic Resources that we know of.
 - e) **Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.** The design of the proposed project is not near any public vistas that we know of.
 - f) **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Gradin/Cung 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp and Hopkins absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 810 CASTILLO ST****R-4 Zone**

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-032-020
 Application Number: MST2016-00228
 Owner: Gibraltar Hillside Residence, LLC
 Applicant: Empresa
 Engineer: Gary Frolenko
 Agent: Mark Morando

(Proposal for a new residential development of approximately 4,543 square feet using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The proposal includes the construction of four, four-story condominium units with one attached, covered parking space for each unit. The unit mix will include two, one-bedroom units, and two, two-bedroom units, with an average size of 1,130 square feet. All four units will have either a balcony or deck or both. The proposed density on this 10,737 square foot vacant lot adjacent to Mission Creek is 17 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of High Density Residential, 28-36 dwelling units per acre. No grading excavation is proposed. Two trees are proposed to be removed. This project requires Planning Commission approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map and a modification.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 5:19 p.m.

Present: Sergio Botello, Owner; Ernesto Botello, Owner and Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:40 p.m.

- 1) Gary Mosel, opposition; expressed concerns regarding size, bulk, and scale, and the compatibility issue with the Structure of Merit across the street. He suggested story poles be added to the site.
- 2) Richard Roston, opposition; expressed concerns regarding size, bulk, and scale, and suggested story poles and that the board visit.
- 3) Rick Frikman with Urban Creeks Counsel, opposition; expressed concerns regarding the 20 foot setback from the creek and expressed his wish for the city to implement a required 50 foot setback from the creek.

Public comment closed at 5:48 p.m.

Motion: Continued four weeks with comments:

- 1) On the street elevation provide an outline of the neighboring property and provide a neighborhood photographic survey.
- 2) Provide two site sections through the building from the sidewalk to the creek.
- 3) Provide an aerial photograph or other survey information that shows other three or four story buildings in the neighborhood.
- 4) Provide neighboring outlines on street elevations.
- 5) Provide a grading plan of the proposed driveway, which shows the slope and grades as they occur.
- 6) Report back on approval of parking from the transportation department.
- 7) Check with trash and recycling personnel regarding size and location.
- 8) Show approximate areas and amounts of cut and fill.

Action: Gradin /Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung, Tripp, and Hopkins absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:15 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:38 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 1626 SANTA BARBARA ST

R-3 Zone

(6:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-192-027
Application Number: MST2016-00220
Owner: Fulmer Family Trust
Architect: Acme Architecture

(Proposal to construct a 2,537 square foot, two-story single-family dwelling with an attached 471 square foot two-car garage. The proposal will add a third dwelling unit on a site currently developed with a 3,666 square foot duplex and 719 square feet of garage space. The project includes one additional uncovered parking space, a new driveway, alterations to a sandstone boundary wall, site work, new landscaping, and 10 cubic yards of grading excavation and fill to be balanced on site. The proposal will result in a total of 6,942 square feet of development on a 20,900 square foot parcel, with the three dwelling units proposed to be condominiums. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a Tentative Subdivision Map to create the condominiums. The original 1904 dwelling unit, which was approved to be changed to a duplex under application MST2014-00469, qualifies for designation as a Structure of Merit and is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. The sandstone boundary site walls, a Canary Island date palm, and a ficus tree have also been found to be historically significant. The Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates determined that the proposed project would meet Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and project impacts would be Less than Significant [Class III]. Therefore, the project does not warrant review by the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of a Tentative Subdivision Map for new condominiums. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 018-15).

Actual time: 6:38 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:51 p.m.

- 1) Michael Desmon expressed an observation that the previously approved project is now being presented in a different light and the neighborhood will be keeping an eye on it, especially in the context of parking.

A letter of concerns from Kellam de Forest regarding its close proximity to the recently Landmarked Christian Science Church as well as its size, bulk, and scale was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:54 p.m.

Motion: Indefinite Continuance to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The Board feels the mass, bulk, and scale, are compatible with the neighborhood as presented.
2. The proposed architectural style is different from the existing building on the adjacent property and is acceptable.
3. The manner in which the historic stone wall at the perimeter is being handled, seems to be in accord with the historian's report.
4. Study turning the great room ridge 90 degrees.

5. Study eliminating the step-back or -forward to great room to the study making it a single mass.
6. Study a more traditional and pronounced surround at the front entry as opposed to the proposed canvas awning.
7. Provide details of the wood and plaster.
8. Study the rakes and eaves to be more consistent with the style of architecture.
9. Study the implementation of screening between the two buildings.

Action: Wittausch /Moore, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung, Tripp, and Hopkins absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 103 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

(7:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-020
 Application Number: MST2016-00295
 Owner: American Tradition
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: Mike Niemann
 Architect: R&A Architecture and Design

(Proposal for a revised parking lot and a new three-story, approximately 11,000 square foot administrative support building for back-of-house activities for a proposed hotel located at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard. The hotel is being reviewed under separate development application MST2004-00791 and the hotel design will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. Currently permitted on this 2.42 acre parcel is a parking lot serving the approved Waterfront Hotel at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard; this project would replace the parking lot approved under that application. The amount of grading is unknown at this time.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and a Substantial Conformance Determination at the Planning Commission.)

Actual time: 7:12 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Agent; Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; Mike Niemann, Architect; Ben Anderson, Executive Architect, R&A Architecture and Design; and Allison L. DeBusk, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 7:29 p.m.

- 1) Bryan Vhrig, Representing Channel Investment Company, Opposition; expressed concerns regarding a three story structure in the proposed location as well as drainage issues in the area.

Public comment closed at 7:32 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Provide photo-simulations of the protected view corridors with and without the proposed building massing.
2. Study rotating or altering the location of the proposed footprint of the building to provide a larger setback from the neighbor to the north, at least at the street frontage.
3. Provide any drawings that are available from the hotel site, regardless of their stage, so that the board may gain a better reference of understanding for proposed architecture of the administrative support building under review.

Action: Wittausch/Gradin 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung, Tripp, and Hopkins absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 3344 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(7:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-324-014

Application Number: MST2016-00280

Owner: Everquest Lodge, INC

Architect: AB Design Studio, INC

(Proposal for an addition and alterations to an existing two-story, 8,304 square foot motel on a 27,443 square foot parcel. The proposed improvements include a 985 square foot lobby addition and exterior renovations. The work will comprise new doors, windows, building siding, and roof throughout, and replacement of the following: hardscape elements, walls, fencing, pool equipment enclosure, pool coping, trash enclosure, trellises, planters, and parking lot paving. Also proposed are new walkways, curb cuts, parking lot restriping, bicycle parking, ADA ramp, outdoor fireplace, pool enclosure, spa, and permeable paving. Two 30' tall Queen palm trees will be removed, as well as a four-trunk 15' tall King palm tree. This project will require Staff Hearing Officer approval of zoning modifications to encroach into the required setbacks and to provide less than the required amount of parking. This project addresses zoning violations identified in Enforcement Case ENF2013-01400.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 7:54 p.m.

Present: Josh Bloomer, Architect; Lauralee Boyle, Architect; and Nick Tang, Owner.

Public comment opened at 8:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

- 1. The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
 - a. **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b. **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** There are no adjacent City Landmarks or designated historic resources, historic sites that the board is aware of.
 - e. **Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.** The Board doesn't believe that the design of the proposed project obstructs any established scenic public vistas. However, the board has asked the applicant to provide a view analysis to verify.
 - f. **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
2. The board finds the project to be a vast improvement to the existing property.
3. Provide photos of metal roofs in the upper State Street area.
4. Provide a landscape plan.
5. Study the rafter detailing and extensions.

Action: 6. Simplify the guard rail to be more in keeping with the architectural style proposed.
Miller/ Gradin, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung, Tripp, and Hopkins absent)

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:27 P.M. ****