



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Tuesday, July 5, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*

SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER

KEVIN MOORE

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician

KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Hopkins, Moore, Tripp and Wittausch (arrived at 3:50).

Members absent: Miller and Cung.

Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **June 20, 2016**, as amended.

Action: Hopkins/Moore, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Hopkins abstained from Item 3, 711 Milpas St., Wittausch/Miller/Cung absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

The June 27, 2016 Consent Review was cancelled.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 5, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Wittausch**.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **June 20, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Miller and Wittausch**.

Action: Hopkins/Moore, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Cung absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- a. Ms. Gantz announced that Board members Miller and Cung would be absent from the meeting.
- b. Board member Moore announced that he would be stepping down from Item two, 325 W. Anapamu St., and Item six, 220 W. Gutierrez St.
- c. Board member Hopkins announced he would be abstain from Item one, 402 S. Hope Ave., and Item five, 711 N Milpas St.

D. Subcommittee Reports: There were no reports made at this time.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 402 S HOPE AVE

E-3/PD/SD-2 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-017
 Application Number: MST2015-00603
 Owner: Santa Barbara Auto Group
 Contractor: Lusardi Construction Company
 Business Name: BMW/Audi

(Proposal for a 4,257 square foot one story addition to an existing 42,551 square foot commercial building for the BMW/Audi dealership. An exterior remodel of the existing one and two story building is also proposed. There will be no grading or parking lot changes on this 4.37 acre parcel. A Community Benefit allocation of nonresidential floor area was approved by City Council on January 12, 2016. Planning Commission approval of two Development Plans is required.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval.)

Actual time: 3:07 p.m.

Present: Mike Ramsey, Agent for Santa Barbara Auto Group; Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect; Jessica Grant, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds that the mass, bulk, and scale are acceptable and mostly in keeping with the architectural design, with the exception of the east elevation.
- 2) Applicant to provide more exposed plaster columns to break up the long span of glass and to adjust the placement of the columns so they create a uniform exposure.
- 3) Study adding more colorful groundcover in the areas where groundcover is proposed for removal.

Action: Gradin/Tripp, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Hopkins abstained, Wittausch/Miller/Cung absent).

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 3:27 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 3:52 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 325 W ANAPAMU ST****R-4 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-212-004
 Application Number: MST2016-00101
 Owner: Cynthia Howard
 Architect: Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description: This is a proposal under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. Proposal to demolish an existing single-family dwelling, detached garage, and shed totaling 4,390 square feet and to construct a 5,646 square foot, two-story residential apartment building housing 10 rental units. Also proposed is a 3,263 square foot carport with 10 parking spaces, 10 covered bicycle parking spaces, and a 129 square foot trash enclosure. No grading is proposed. Under AUD, the average unit size is 565 square feet, with a maximum allowed of 901 square feet. The proposed residential density is 45.4 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 54 units per acre allowed on this 9,585 square foot parcel with a General Plan Designation of High Density Residential in the Priority Housing Overlay.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on April 25, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:52 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:02 p.m.

- 1) Brett Gewirtzman, (neighbor) opposed; spoke of concerns regarding excessive size, mass, scale, and bulk, specifically floor-to-floor heights, balcony privacy issues, and street parking density.
- 2) Geoffrey Ravenhill (neighbor), opposed; spoke of concerns regarding structural issues, alleyway spatial issues, and parking density.
- 3) Bruce Walter Bivans, (neighbor) opposed; spoke of concerns regarding street and guest parking density issues.
- 4) Ed Baum, opposed; spoke of concerns regarding privacy, neighborhood compatibility, traffic, and parking density.
- 5) Cissy Ross, opposed; spoke of concerns regarding traffic and public safety issues.
- 6) Richard Ross, opposed; spoke of concerns regarding previously mentioned traffic and density issues by the Board and public which haven't been addressed yet.

An email of concerns from Amy and Brandon Steets was summarized and acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:14 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Reduce the proposed plate heights from 10 feet to 9-feet.
- 2) Restudy the side yard elevations, particularly the north elevation. The currently proposed are too continuous and monolithic.
- 3) To reduce privacy concerns, pull the decks back from the buildable envelope.
- 4) Provide a circulation plan of the bike room to the stairway.
- 5) Restudy the garage support and provide more massing.
- 6) Provide landscape plan to improve privacy screening for adjacent neighbors and include any proposed tree removals.
- 7) On the east elevation, consider lowering the center parapet to below the eaves of the roof structures.

8) Some board members expressed concerns about the proposed metal siding on the rear elevation.

9) Provide building footprints of adjacent structures off the alley and the west elevation.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore stepped down, Miller/Cung absent).

FINAL REVIEW

3. 915 E ANAPAMU ST

R-3 Zone

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00331
 Owner: Riviera Partners
 Contractor: Vernon Construction

(This is a revised project description using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD] project. The proposal still includes 24 residential apartments comprising 20,275 square feet of living area, 9,170 square feet of subterranean garage area, and 1,504 square feet of private garage space, for a total of 30,949 square feet. The unit mix includes 19, one-bedroom and five, two-bedroom apartments ranging from 649 to 1,411 square feet, with an average unit size of 833 square feet. The revisions to the project include changes to the floor plan, exterior fenestration of Building One, building footprint, and building height. The parking garage size was increased to provide additional parking, including accessible parking spaces and added storage for residents. The building footprints of Buildings Two & Three have not changed. Building Two has a reduced unit count, from three to two. There will be 2,970 cubic yards of grading excavation and 19 trees will be removed, with five trees to be relocated on site, 16 trees to remain, 35 new oak trees [17 on-site and 28 off-site], and 50 new ornamental trees. Under AUD, the proposed residential density is 27 dwelling units per acre, with an average unit size of 833 square feet. A maximum density of 27 dwelling units per acre is allowed on this 40,055 square foot parcel with a Medium-High Density Residential General Plan Land Use Designation.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Project was last reviewed on March 28, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:54 p.m.

Present: Sean Ridenour, Arris Studio Architects; Katie Klein, Concept Architect, and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 5:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Straw vote: How many Board members agree that a properly recessed vinyl clad windows is not appropriate for the project? 3/2 (passed).

Motion 1: Continued one week to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) There should be no visible sheet metal at the parapet caps. Parapet caps shall be plaster wrapped.
- 2) All plaster details shall be at 7/8-inch thickness and clearly called out on the elevations that it is a fine sand steal trowel plaster.
- 3) All gutters, down spouts, and exposed sheet metal flashing should be called out as copper.
- 4) All metal railings, guard rails and balusters shall be of solid wrought iron, black.
- 5) All elevations should to be drawn to match the details; specifically detail D-10, and B.2 on sheet A-6.03.
- 6) Restudy detail F-2 on sheet A-6.03 so that the end tile cap closes to the beam.

- 7) Restudy the end cut of the horizontal members to be more in keeping with the rafter cuts on plan sheet A6.03, detail H-6.
- 8) Provide a cap detail of all stone veneer locations.
- 9) Provide a detail for the exposed window header on the south elevation at the stone wall.
- 10) Correctly show all window types on elevations.
- 11) Provide transformer height and size details.
- 12) Push back the fire backflow preventers at Lowena St. so they can be properly screened
- 13) Conditions of approval dated 7-5-16 were included in the approval of this project.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 6210 - 6290 HOLLISTER AVE

(5:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-042
 Application Number: MST2016-00022
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting
 Architect: Flex Designs

(Proposal to construct two new buildings on a vacant six acre parcel. The project will include a 22,282 square foot, two-story auto dealership building for Chrysler, with 91 parking spaces and 48 inventory spaces. Also proposed is a 21,087 square foot, one-story auto dealership building for Infiniti and another franchise, with 89 parking spaces and 57 inventory spaces. There will also be a sales lot for Airstream trailer sales. Total development on site will be 43,369 square feet. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Development Plan.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval. Project was last reviewed on June 20, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:47 p.m.

Present: Robert Plant, Flex Designs; Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect; Trish Allen, SEPPS; and Andrew Bermond, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 6:03 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An email of concern was received from Bill Shelor regarding City of Goleta's current sign ordinance that does not allow pole sign installations; Goleta prefers monuments signs to meet neighborhood compatibility requirements.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design split into three separate buildings.
- 2) The Board feels the proposed angled canopy as designed is not acceptable and asks the applicant to study other solutions.
- 3) The entry canopy, as designed, needs to recede between two buildings or project forward and be simplified.
- 4) The traditional cap at the stone wall is not acceptable as designed and needs to be modernized and simplified.
- 5) Study how the buildings join, abut, and meet between the elevations.
- 6) The Chrysler building element (traditional arched opening), is at odds with the contemporary design and needs to be restudied.
- 7) Implement green walls at the block elements of the building.

- 8) Restudy the enhanced paving pattern to be more in keeping with contemporary design of the architecture.
- 9) Provide further detail on the glass canopy that's presented in front of the infinity building.
- 10) Study landscaping opportunities for the north side.
- 11) Study the possibility of additional landscaping elements closer to the building facade.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Cung absent).

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 6:37 P.M., AND RECONVENED AT 6:41 P.M. ***

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

5. 711 N MILPAS ST

C-2 Zone

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-121-014
 Application Number: MST2015-00561
 Owner: 711 N Milpas, LLC
 Applicant: RRM Design Group
 Contractor: Scott Schell
 Landscape Architect: Rachel Arriaga

(Proposal for a new four-story, 57,721 square foot mixed-use development to be reviewed under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. Two existing residential units and commercial buildings totaling 33,000 square feet will be demolished. A total of 6,656 square feet of non-residential use is proposed as well as 51,065 square feet of residential use in 73 units. The unit mix will consist of 31 two-bedroom, two-bath units, 31 one-bedroom, one-bath units, and nine two-bedroom, one-bath units. A total of 100 parking spaces are required, with 94 proposed. There would be 77 bicycle parking spaces. The average unit size will be 700 square feet, of which the maximum allowed is 970 square feet. This 69,610 square foot site encompasses eight parcels which will be merged, with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential of 28-36 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay District. Planning Commission review is requested for a zoning modification to provide less than the required parking as well as concept review under AUD.)

(Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 027-16. Project was last reviewed on June 20, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:41 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert and Lisa Plowman, RRM Design Group; and Andrew Bermond, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 6:49 p.m.

- 1) Natalia Govoni, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding size, massing, scale, and design style not in keeping with neighborhood compatibility.
- 2) Naomi Green, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding size, massing, scale, design style not in keeping with neighborhood compatibility, and blocking access to natural light.
- 3) Natasha Todorvic, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding water resources, size, massing, scale, and neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment closed at 6:55 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to In-Progress review with comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan and details.
- 2) Restudy the architecture on the first floor facing Milpas Street and elevation facing Ortega Street. The Board is ok with the elongated deep maroon colored brick.
- 3) Applicant shall provide full color and materials board.
- 4) Study the parapet detail of the northeast corner and make it different from a standard parapet.
- 5) Study to break up the second and third story projection on the north elevation.
- 6) Study removing all the awnings on Milpas Street elevation.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 3/1/0. Motion carried. (Gradin opposed, Hopkins stepped down, Miller/Cung absent).

PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL - CONTINUED ITEM

6. 220 W GUTIERREZ ST

C-2 Zone

(6:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-202-006
 Application Number: MST2015-00047
 Owner: Betty Goldberg
 Architect: Kevin Moore

(This is a revised project description. This project involves two adjacent parcels: 037-202-005 at 223 Cottage Grove Avenue, and 037-202-006 at 220 W. Gutierrez Street. The proposed work on the first parcel includes the demolition of 968 square feet of open storage area, restriping the parking lot, and adding new parking lot perimeter landscape planters. The proposed work on the second parcel includes the partial demolition of 1,078 square feet [under building permit application BLD2014-02591] and the construction of 1,687 square feet of floor area, resulting in a net increase of 609 square feet of new non-residential square footage. This project will result in a total development of 4,797 square feet over two parcels totaling 9,450 square feet in size.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires a Public Works permit. Project was last reviewed on June 20, 2016.)

Actual time: 7:15 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Gantz read the following State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory statement:

The State Fair Political Practices Act (FPPC) regulation 18702.4 (b) (5) states that an official may appear before a design or architectural review committee of which he or she is a member to present, explain, architectural or engineering drawings which the official has prepared for a client. Kevin Moore is a sole practitioner and is using this exception understanding certain limits regarding advocating on behalf of their client.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect; and Robert Richard, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:21 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and indefinite continuance to Consent with the condition that a report be submitted detailing a description of the mitigation measures that will be required, with the following comment:

- 1) Study moving the backflow device closer to the parking space to allow more planting to occur between it and the sidewalk.
- 2) The maker of the motion read the following finding into the record: *"The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under*

CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.”

Action: Tripp/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore stepped down, Miller/Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:31 P.M. ****