

DRAFT



City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, June 27, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*
BRIAN MILLER, *Vice-Chair*
BERNI BERNSTEIN
LISA JAMES
JOSEPH MOTICHA
JAIME PIERCE
DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: JASON DOMINGUEZ
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
KATIE MAMULSKI, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (present until 6:11 p.m.), Bernstein, James, Moticha, Pierce, and Woolery (present at 3:04 p.m.).
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Limón (present until 3:00 p.m. until 3:33 p.m.), Mamulski, and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

Judith Patterson spoke of concerns regarding 20 Camino Alto, a tea fire rebuild, and the design review progress regarding that previously approved project, particularly the cabana introduced in August 2015. Mr. Limón clarified that although the 10-day appeal period has expired, staff will research whether any non-compliance or violation issues exist which may allow further design review. James Patterson spoke of concerns regarding lack of advance

notification when projects are changed or altered after final design review approval has been granted. Mr. Limón clarified that enforcement immediately ensues after the 10-day appeal period expires once Project Design Approval has been granted on a project.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **June 13, 2016**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **June 13, 2016**, as submitted.
Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller abstained from Item #2, 3427 Sea Ledge Ln.).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **June 13, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Joe Moticha**.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **June 20, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Joe Moticha**.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **June 27, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Joe Moticha**.

Action: Woolery/Moticha, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Limón spoke of potential future amendments for design review guidelines regarding issues potential historic resources districts special design districts (such as the Lower Riviera near the Bungalow Haven district, and the fairly large special Mission Street Design district), regarding issues within the parcel lot or property lines. Staff clarified that the City Clerk's Office will be in charge of scheduling these items for City Council review. Mr. Limon will research whether advance noticing can include the Board.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 1228 MANITOU LN

R-1 Zone

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-010-014
Application Number: MST2016-00052
Designer: Don Swann
Owner: Derek and White

(Proposal to convert an existing 360 square foot attached two-car garage, infill a 124 square foot breezeway, and construct 353 square feet of one-story additions to 1,945 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes the permitting and conversion of an unpermitted detached two-car carport into a new 490 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,909 square feet of development on a 19,165 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 66% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00472.)

(Final Approval is requested; Project was last reviewed March 7, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:33 p.m.

Present: Don Swann, Designer.

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition email of concern from Becky Cordes was acknowledged.

Staff clarified at the Board's request that proper surveys, setting property lines, easements, and setback issues are not within the Board's purview.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with conditions:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and follows good neighbor guidelines.
- 2) Staff to determine and verify accuracies regarding the property lines and the 25-foot easement on the plans, and whether the retention pond is acceptable to be within the easement (Sheet C-101).
- 3) Remove any irrigated plantings from the drip line area of the oak trees.
- 4) The Board finds the proposed color board change of the white trim is acceptable.

Action: Pierce/Woolery, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW

2. 2878 VERDE VISTA DR

E-3 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-362-023
 Application Number: MST2015-00628
 Owner: Perkins Family Trust
 Applicant: Bildsten Architecture & Planning

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for 743 square foot second-story addition to an existing 940 square foot, one-story single-family residence with an "as-built" 25 square foot front porch and a 380 square foot, detached, two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,088 square feet on a 4,193 square foot lot is 86% of the allowable maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. An Administrative Height exception is required for an overheight "as-built" six foot high fence at the property. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications to allow an "as-built" one story addition in the required front setback and to allow a conforming second-story addition that changes the basic characteristics of the existing residence, which is non-conforming to two-front yard setbacks.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 032-16; Project was previously postponed two weeks and was last reviewed on February 22, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:57 p.m.

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Architect; and Erica Obertelli, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:01 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, and follows good neighbor guidelines.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

3. 120 MESA LN

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-341-011
 Application Number: MST2016-00158
 Owner: Patrick Brown
 Architect: Robert Foley

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,101 square foot one story residence and 233 square foot garage and replace with a new two story 2,305 square foot residence and 420 square foot garage; and a new spa and outdoor fireplace. The proposed total of 2,725 square feet on an 8,089 square foot lot is 85% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. A Coastal Exclusion is required.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project was last reviewed on June 13, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:06 p.m.

Board member Bernstein recused herself from review of this item and stepped down from review, but reserved the right to speak on this item as a member of the public.

Present: Robert Foley, Architect; and Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:13 p.m.

1) Berni Bernstein, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility and the proposed tall height of the project, and requested the project be scaled down.

A letter of concern from Gilbert and Joy Robledo was read out and acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 4:17 p.m.

The Chair stated for the public record that the Board is mainly an architectural design and aesthetics Board for mass, bulk, and scale, and neighborhood compatibility within guideline acceptability, and that denials of second story proposals without substantial impact to neighborhood compatibility are not within the Board's purview; however, application to change the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria of the City Municipal Code remains an option.

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, landscaping, and follows good neighbor guidelines, and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board recommends lowering north elevation first floor plate height to 8 feet (specifically in Section C, page A-4.1), and leave the second floor plate height at 8 feet.
- 2) Revise the plate height of the living area of the kitchen to a more appropriate plate height.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Moticha/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein stepped down).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 10 MINUTES AT 4:35 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:45 P.M. ***

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

4. 626 ALSTON RD

A-2 Zone

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-171-020
 Application Number: MST2015-00463
 Owner: Fentisov Living Trust
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(This is a revised project description for a new 3,987 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 487 square foot two-car garage. The project includes 548 gross square feet of covered patios, an 82 square foot covered entry porch, a 215 square foot open patio, a new driveway and driveway gate, walkways, a built-in hot tub, fountains, and new landscaping. It also proposes 609 square feet of cut-and-fill grading, of which 284 cubic yards will occur outside of the building footprint, and 214 cubic yards will be exported off site. The proposed total of 4,474 square feet on a 1.1 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District is 89% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. The revised project omits a previously proposed one-car garage, second story, and roof deck.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided; Project was last reviewed on May 16, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:46 p.m.

Present: Jose Esparza, Architect; and L.R. Gassenwald, Agent for the Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m.

- 1) Patricia Quealy Moore, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding landscaping and water use, neighborhood compatibility issues, and the proposed blocking of the private view corridor.
- 2) Bobby and Susan Shand, (adjacent neighbor, submitted letter) opposition; spoke of concerns regarding landscaping issues, neighborhood compatibility, blocking of private views, and maintaining the current natural appearance and maintaining property values.
- 3) Walter Moore, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding blocking of private views and maintaining current property values.

- 4) Pat Brodie, (landscape designer for Mr. & Mrs. Shand); opposition; spoke of concerns regarding proposed landscaping height issues (east side Calif. Buck Eye tree), grading and fill issues, and requested privacy screening along the driveway and respect for the night sky regarding a proposed lighting plan as a courtesy to adjacent property owners.
- 5) Val Groshed-Lewis (local landscape architect), opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the easement, and proposed drop in slope and plate height from a grading perspective on the appropriate elevations; and also requested posted height story poles and privacy screening along the driveway.

An opposition letter of concern was acknowledged and read into the record from Lindsay G. Shinn (Mullen & Henzell, LLP Attorney for Bobby & Susan Shand and Derek Westen), and an opposition letter from Cindy Steffen was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:06 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the exterior elevation for a more consistent (elliptical) proportion of arches and wall thickness. Address the lack of exterior aesthetic appeal of the architecture to be more symmetrical and proportional, especially on the shape and shadow of the roof eaves which should read to scale.
- 2) Restudy the landscape plan for less terracing, fill, or cut.
- 3) The proposed California Buck-Eye tree species is not appropriate; restudy to provide a more drought tolerant tree at a 24-foot maximum height.
- 4) Restudy with a locally licensed landscape architect for a more consistent and formal symmetric Spanish-Andalusian or Moorish style of architecture. Restudy water calculations.
- 5) Restudy the exterior elevation in relation to the windows and wall thickness surrounding the windows for more consistency.
- 6) Study to reduce the proposed chimney heights; especially the proposed master bedroom chimney.
- 7) Provide plan sections of perspective views from the northeast to the southwest of the property.
- 8) Unify hardscapes to be consistent throughout and restudy the lack of symmetry and proportions of the patio terrace and surround.
- 9) Restudy the apparent disconnect between the architectural design of the structure and the landscape plan.
- 10) Study to provide privacy screening.

Action: Miller/Pierce, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 5 MINUTES AT 5:43 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:48 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**5. 929 ALSTON RD****A-2 Zone**

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-004
Application Number: MST2016-00104
Owner: Tarlow Family Trust
Architect: Warner Young

(Proposal to demolish the 2,217 square foot habitable main level of a two-level, single-family residence with an attached 445 square foot two-car garage located below to remain. The project proposes a new 2,503 square foot main level to be built on a slightly enlarged footprint over the existing foundation, with a new architectural style. The project includes an enlarged and newly covered terrace. No changes are proposed for an existing detached ~~2,217~~ 721 square foot accessory building. The proposed total of 3,669 square feet on a 1-acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 73% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:48 p.m.

Present: Warner Young, Architect.

Mr. Young corrected the proposed accessory building square footage from 2,217 square feet that was posted on the agenda to only 721 square feet.

Public comment opened at 5:56 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the size and locations of the proposed windows and doors, and study the proposed gables and eave elements to improve the transition from old to newer architectural styles.
- 2) Provide surround details.
- 3) Provide a color board.
- 4) Provide a scoped area of the landscaping.

Action: Miller/Bernstein, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Board comments: Applicant to repost or reposition the required yellow posted notice of development; provide Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements; and contact adjacent neighbors to assure no impacts to adjacent private view corridors.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 566 ARROYO AVE****E-1 Zone**

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-241-021
 Application Number: MST2016-00233
 Owner: Hallier Living Trust
 Architect: Thompson Naylor

(Proposal for an addition of 636 square feet of first floor and second floor additions to an existing 1,586 square foot two-story residence. Also proposed is a 72 square foot net addition to two existing one-car garages and 14 square foot addition to lower floor workshop laundry room and convert 75 square feet of garage to workshop. The proposed total of 3,127 of square feet on a 7,926 lot in the Hillside Design District is 99% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Comments Only; Project must address Preliminary Plan Check comments.)

Actual time: 6:11 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board can support the proposed 99% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) since infill and change to the existing footprint are minimal and of minimal impact to adjacent neighbors.
- 2) Provide a roof plan.
- 3) Provide north and south plan section details.
- 4) Provide more window details, a landscape plan, and exterior lighting details(?)<Krystal, please check the video for me! – Thanks!>.

Action: Moticha/Woolery, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed, Miller absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 1418 SHORELINE DR****E-3/SD-3 Zone**

(6:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-184-012
 Application Number: MST2016-00221
 Owner: Paul M. Turner Trust

(Proposal to demolish a single car garage and a bedroom and construct a new 400 square foot two-car garage, 280 square feet of first floor additions, 473 square foot 2nd floor master suite with 83 square foot balcony and 307 square foot detached accessory building. Proposal includes new exterior finishes and interior remodel. The property is located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and the project requires Coastal Review. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for front and interior setback modifications. The proposed total of 2,698 square feet on a 7,030 square foot lot is 92% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR].)

(Comments only; Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for front and interior setback modifications.)

Actual time: 6:33 p.m.

Present: Paul Larosa, Designer; and Paul Turner, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:51 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the Applicant's demonstrated sensitivity to adjacent neighbors.
- 2) Provide accurately scaled drawings.
- 3) Study lowering the 9-10 foot first floor plate heights to 8 feet in height, and lowering the 8-9 foot second floor plate height to 8 feet in height.
- 4) Reduce the 85 % maximum floor-to-area ratio (FAR).

Action: Bernstein/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

The Chair thanked Board member Jaime Pierce on her many years of service to the Single Family Design Board and the City of Santa Barbara.

*** THE FULL BOARD ADJOURNED AT 6:59 P.M. ***

DRAFT