



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, April 11, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair*
SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER
KEVIN MOORE
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: FRANK HOTCHKISS

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA (PRESENT)

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE (PRESENT UNTIL 4:54 P.M.)

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Hopkins, Moore (present @ 4:34 p.m.), Tripp and Wittausch.
Members absent: Cung and Miller.
Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 28, 2016**, as submitted.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 2/0/2. Motion carried. (Wittausch/Gradin abstained, Cung/Miller/Moore absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 4, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung/Miller/Moore absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 11, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin**.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung/Miller/Moore absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Board Members Cung and Miller will be absent from today's meeting, Board Member Tripp will step down from Item 2 at 116 E. Cota Street, and Board member Moore will step down from Items 1, 15 S. Hope Avenue, Item 5, Various Project in the OC Zone, and Item 6, 226 S. Voluntario St., respectively.
- b) An appeal was received of the ABR's action on March 28, 2016, to approve a new small cell wireless communications facility for Verizon Wireless to be mounted on top of an existing wooden utility pole in the 300 block of Grove Lane. The appeal date has not yet been determined.
- c) Board member Wittausch volunteered to staff Consent Review for three months with Board member Miller.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Board Member Tripp announced that the regularly scheduled Airport Public Art Oversight Committee meeting was rescheduled to a future date.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 15 S HOPE AVE****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-058
 Application Number: MST2015-00010
 Owner: Johnman Holding, LLC
 Architect: R & A Architecture & Design, Inc.
 Agent: Dudek

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish the existing 8,368 square foot non-residential building and construct 41,187 square feet of development, including a 45-foot tall four-story mixed-use building with an underground parking garage and one detached two-story residential unit, on a 33,910 square foot lot. The project consists of 631 net square feet of commercial floor area and 46 residential units [comprised of 13 studio units, 30 one-bedroom units, and 3 two-bedroom units] totaling 36,502 square feet plus ancillary space [lobby, office, storage, community room]. Parking would consist of 11 spaces at-grade and 40 spaces underground for a total of 51 parking spaces; 48 bicycle parking spaces are proposed. Vehicular access would be provided from Hope Avenue, and a four-foot sidewalk dedication would be granted. Approximately 6,900 cubic yards of excavation is anticipated for the underground garage. The project proposes a 45-foot setback from the top-of-bank of Arroyo Burro Creek to the first floor of the development, with the second, third and fourth floors cantilevering out up to 13 feet beyond that [closer to the creek]. The project also includes creek restoration and more than 13,000 square feet of open space. The project is proposed under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay at a density of 60 du/ac, and the average unit size is 794 square feet.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was reviewed by the Planning Commission on October 1, 2015. Project was last reviewed on September 28, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Benjamin Anderson, R & A Architecture & Design, Inc., Darren Embry, Faring Capital; John Cuykendall for Dudek; Lane Goodkind, Landscape Architect; and Allison DeBusk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m.

- 1) Jay Rodrigo Gonzalez, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding height, amount of common area, number of units, compatibility, and parking density issues.
- 2) Lea Callins, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding height, elimination of natural light, notifications.
- 3) Sheila Lodge, Planning Commission liaison, spoke of concerns regarding landscaping and removal and/or elimination of trees on the site.

Public comment closed at 3:38 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support giving Project Design Approval at this point in the project? 3/1 (passed).

- Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**
- 1) Provide detailing showing changes in material (incl. rain screens), outside corners, doors and windows, parapets, transitions to soffits, and railings.
 - 2) Return with eighth-inch scale plans of all elevations.
 - 3) Provide a west elevation of the panhandle and its relationship to the existing adjacent building.
 - 4) Eliminate the tiled eave and balcony edges.
 - 5) Restudy the massing wherever there are 16-inch or less horizontal or vertical tile siding.
 - 6) Restudy the roof screen material to be more solid and sculptural.
 - 7) Provide a setback of the usable common space at the second and third floor terraces on the northwest corner. Landscaping can be one option as a beneficial buffer without allowing pedestrian access.
 - 8) Provide fenestration or other features to break up the blank appearance at the northwest corner.
 - 9) Restudy offset windows and doors within their recesses.
 - 10) Restudy the easterly wall along the panhandle area to be a better experience to the user.
 - 11) Treat the easterly wall along the panhandle and the west facing wall facing neighbors to have less visual impact.
 - 12) Return with wall siting details at all visible locations.
 - 13) Restudy the main entry area off Hope Street to provide a parapet at the first floor level to enhance that entrance.
 - 14) Provide details regarding enhancement of the proposed railings.
 - 15) Provide a detailed landscape plan with clarification of tree removal and replacement. The Board recommends providing a minimum 24-inch size box tree along the north side terraces.
 - 16) Provide elevations of the pedestrian gates.
 - 17) The following finding was read into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore stepped down, Cung/Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 116 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00627
 Owner: Cota Street, LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a new four-story mixed-use building on a 10,865 square foot vacant parcel adjacent to Plaza Vera Cruz. The project includes 15 two-bedroom, two-bathroom residential units and approximately 738 square feet of commercial space. Sixteen covered parking spaces will be provided on the ground level. Residential units will be on the second, third, and fourth floors. The proposed building height is 45 feet, with a 457 square foot rooftop deck. Under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program, the proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with an average unit size of 827 square feet. A maximum density of 63 dwelling units per acre is allowed on this 10,865 square foot parcel designated Medium-High Density and within the Priority Housing Overlay area. Requires courtesy Planning Commission review.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only: requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on March 14, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:34 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell and Eric Behr, AB Design Studio; Sam Demachkie, Agent for Owner; and Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician.

Public comment opened at 5:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Emails of support from Guy Smith at Antioch University of Santa Barbara and Charles Starbuck, Owner of Starbuck Minikin, Inc., were acknowledged.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support sending the proposed project to the Planning Commission? 2/2 (failed).

Motion: Continued four weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the improvements and the changes of the Cota Street façade.
- 2) Study reducing the eyebrow at the fourth floor as it addresses Cota Street.
- 3) Reconfigure or push back further away the stair and elevator plan to reduce the impact to the street.
- 4) Provide some architectural modulation to the south facing wall including vertical openings, etc.
- 5) Study the Cota Street front units to be differentiated from those facing the park elevations.
- 6) Restudy the corner glass configuration at the north east corner.
- 7) Reduce the height of the stair and laundry tower at the rear.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp stepped down, Cung/Miller absent).

Board Comments: The proposed building is a modern building, and not Spanish. The vertical elements of the massing are acceptable in a modern style. A Spanish style would not serve "excellence in architecture" guidelines.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 923 CASTILLO ST****R-3 Zone**

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-301-014
Application Number: MST2015-00468
Owner: Taylor Tatman
Architect: Edwards- Pitman Architects

(Proposal for a three-story, three-unit residential condominium development on an approximately 9,100 square foot vacant lot adjacent to Mission Creek. The three bedroom units will total 4,816 square feet and will comprise the second and third levels, with three covered parking spaces provided in a carport on the ground level. Three uncovered parking spaces are also proposed, as well as rooftop decks. One 20" diameter palm tree will be removed.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 5:38 p.m.

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:46 p.m.

1) Mike Rider, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding creek top of bank and fencing.

Public comment closed at 5:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the planning portion of the design, such as parking, central elevator, entrances to each unit, and delineation of units in the east to west direction to provide more interest and improved design composition for users.
- 2) Study providing either more simplified contemporary Spanish or traditional Spanish design in detailing.
- 3) De-emphasize the modular appearance of the building.
- 4) Visually anchor the building to the site.
- 5) Restudy the cantilevers and their configuration on the north elevation.
- 6) A fence or wall at the neighboring property line is recommended to provide privacy.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung/Miller absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 3780 FOOTHILL RD****COUNTY Zone**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-020-034
 Application Number: MST2016-00108
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Erin Markey, Creeks Restoration Planner
 Applicant: George Johnson, Creeks Supervisor

(Proposal to restore approximately 2,200 linear feet of riparian habitat along upper Arroyo Burro Creek in Barger Canyon. The area of work will comprise 4.95 acres of a 14.19 acre, City-owned parcel located within the County. The proposal includes creek restoration, 8,700 cubic yards of grading excavation to be relocated on-site, creek widening, demolition of structures within the creek, removal of non-native plant species, removal of one native tree, relocation of 24 native trees, and planting 4,600 native plant species. A portion of the project is located at 3742 Foothill Road, an adjacent, privately-owned parcel with a recorded Conservation Easement.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:18 p.m.

Present: Erin Markey, Creeks Restoration Planner; and George Johnson, Creeks Supervisor.

Public comment opened at 6:32 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.
Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung/Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:39 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 7:02 P.M. ***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**5. VARIOUS LOCATIONS IN THE OC ZONE****Ocean-Commercial/SD-3 Zone**

(6:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-022-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00017
 Owner: Various Property Owners
 Owner: Steplemann Community Property Trust
 Applicant: Marcello Ricci, Arts Fund Santa Barbara

(Proposal for a neighborhood-wide art and mural program in the Funk Zone. The approximate project area is bounded by Highway 101, Helena Street, Santa Barbara Street, and E. Cabrillo Boulevard.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved Funk Zone Mural Program including six new mural locations for the approved site at 22 Anacapa Street and a larger mural location for the approved site at 127 Gray Avenue. Project was last reviewed on June 8, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:02 p.m.

Present: Marcello Ricci, Applicant from Arts Fund Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 7:11 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

- 1) Decrease the size of Mural No. 10 to have equal margins to an approximate size of 7' x 12'.
- 2) The Board is willing to accept various sizes, heights, and shapes at the remaining new locations. Applicant shall resubmit revised plans showing the proposed sizes.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore stepped down, Cung/Miller absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 226 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-3 Zone****(7:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-252-013
 Application Number: MST2015-00566
 Owner: Edward St George
 Applicant: On Design, LLC
 Architect: On Design, LLC

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,095 square foot, one story dwelling unit and construct a new 1,441 square foot, two story duplex [Building A] and new 935 square foot, two story dwelling unit [Building B] under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program. Three existing buildings, Building C, an 866 square foot, one-story dwelling unit, Building D, a 2,180 square foot, three story dwelling unit with attached one car garage, and a detached two car garage will remain unchanged. Two new uncovered parking spaces are proposed, resulting in a total of three covered and two uncovered parking spaces. One mature avocado tree will be removed. The average unit size will be 1,084 square feet, with a maximum average unit size allowed of 1,090 square feet. The 11,250 square foot parcel has a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. This project addresses zoning violations identified in enforcement cases ENF2015-00024 and ENF2015-00517.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on December 7, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:24 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, Architect; Shelby Messner, Applicant; and Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:46 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with conditions:

- 1) Study the trash enclosure to incorporate it to either one side of the building or the other and increase the landscaping.
- 2) Align the front porch of Building A with the exterior wall.
- 3) At Building B, add fascia at the bottom of the second story dormer.
- 4) The following finding was read into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore stepped down, Cung/Miller absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:55 P.M. ****