



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

**Monday, February 1, 2016**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

KIRK GRADIN, *Chair* (Consent Agenda Representative)

SCOTT HOPKINS, *Vice Chair*

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)

KEVIN MOORE

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      FRANK HOTCHKISS

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      JOHN CAMPANELLA

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate):**      SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**      JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor  
                 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician  
                 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos).

**CALL TO ORDER:**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present:      Gradin, Hopkins, Miller, Moore, Tripp and Wittausch.

Members absent:      Cung.

Staff present:      Gantz and Goo.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A.      Public Comment:

No public comment.

B.      Approval of Minutes:

Motion:      Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 4, 2016**, as amended.

Action:      Hopkins/Tripp, 5/0/2. Motion carried. (Wittausch/Moore abstained, Cung absent).

Motion:      Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **Tuesday, January 19, 2016**, as amended.

Action:      Hopkins/Tripp, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Wittausch opposed, Cung absent).

## C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 25, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** (with the exception of Item C reviewed with **Courtney Jane Miller**).

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 1, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Miller/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

## 1) Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Board Member Cung will be absent from today's meeting. Board Member Hopkins will step down on Item 3 at 701 N. Milpas Street, and Board Member Tripp will step down on Item 2 at 116 E. Cota Street.

b) Board Member Miller will represent the ABR at the March 1<sup>st</sup> City Council appeal of the ABR approval of the project at 1818 Castillo Street.

c) A talk sponsored by the Illuminating Engineering Society titled "Light Pollution & the Ecological Consequences of Artificial Night Lighting" will take place on Friday, February 19<sup>th</sup> from noon to 1:30pm at Antioch University, 602 Anacapa Street. The price is \$15. Please contact Trish at 965-4443 to RSVP.

2) Mr. Limon reported a City Council appeal filed for 1818 Castillo Street scheduled for either March 4<sup>th</sup> or March 18<sup>th</sup>, depending on the schedule. Board member Tripp volunteered to attend that hearing and will be notified by staff regarding the appeal hearing date.E. Subcommittee Appointment and Reports: **Airport Public Art Oversight Committee.**

Board member Miller, and Board member Tripp as an alternate, were appointed to the Airport Public Art Oversight Committee.

ABR Consent Review Alternate appointment was tabled.

There were no reports made at this time.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****1. 321 OCEANO AVE****R-2/SD-3 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-071-003

Application Number: MST2015-00347

Owner: Brad and Cynthia Frohling Living Trust

Architect: Acme Architecture

(Proposal to demolish the existing single-family dwelling and garage, and construct three new dwelling units. The project consists of a two-story, 1,113 square foot single dwelling with attached 425 square foot two-car garage at the front of the lot, and a three-story, 2,263 square foot duplex with two attached 425 square foot two-car garages at the rear of the lot. The project includes 350 cubic yards of fill and 50 cubic yards cut grading, new paving, and landscaping on this 7,564 square foot site. Planning Commission review is requested for a Coastal Development Permit and a zoning modification of the required minimum lot area to allow three dwelling units on the site.)

**(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)**

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect; Brad and Cynthia Frohling, Owners; and Tony Boughman,

Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m.

1) John Beardsmore, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding proposed grading and fill for the project.

Public comment closed at 3:41 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to Full Board with positive comments:**

- 1) The Board finds the proposed bulk, mass, and scale are acceptable.
- 2) The proposed architectural style is acceptable.
- 3) The proposed lot area modifications are supportable.
- 4) Provide more details on the storm water retention.
- 5) Study an alternative solution to the proposed double front railings, such as planters.
- 6) Provide demarcation of a pedestrian pathway connection for the rear units.
- 7) Provide roof details.
- 8) Provide corner & siding joining details.
- 9) Provide existing topographic information for adjacent lots where fill is occurring adjacent to the property line.
- 10) The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
  - a. **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
  - b. **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
  - c. **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
  - d. **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
  - e. **Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.** The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
  - f. **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****2. 116 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

**(4:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-003  
 Application Number: MST2015-00627  
 Owner: Cota Street, LLC  
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for a new four-story mixed-use building adjacent to Plaza Vera Cruz. The project includes 15 two-bedroom, two-bathroom residential units and approximately 832 square feet of commercial space. Sixteen covered parking spaces will be provided on the ground level. Residential units will be on the second, third, and fourth floors. A 3,238 square foot roof deck is also proposed. Planning Commission review is required for the building to exceed 45 feet in height and for Community Benefit Housing Project findings. Proposed building height is a maximum of 58 feet. Under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD], the proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with an average size of 827 square feet, and a maximum of 63 units allowed on this 10,865 square foot parcel located in a Medium-High Density Priority Housing overlay.)

**(Comments only: requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)**

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architect; and Ken Vermillion, Project Designer; Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician; and Irma Unzueta, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m.

An email of concerns from Kellam de Forest regarding impacts to mountain views, and the proposed height, bulk, and massing of the building was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:18 p.m.

Public comment re-opened again at 4:31 p.m.

Sheila Lodge, Planning Commissioner, commented that the project, as an AUD and affordable housing project requesting to exceed the normal 45-foot height limit, was found acceptable by the Planning Commission as qualifying as a "significant community benefit" that will provide valuable affordable housing in the City.

Public comment re-closed again at 4:33 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board found the proposed mass, bulk, and scale is not generally acceptable.
- 2) The Board thought the impacts to Cota Street and the park too aggressive and imposing. The Board also thought the shadowing of the adjacent park would be a negative impact.
- 3) The monotonous style and repetitious design is not acceptable.
- 4) Eliminate the vehicle entrance on Cota Street to be more pedestrian friendly and reduce traffic impacts to that street.
- 5) The elevator tower at Cota Street is too imposing.
- 6) Provide an aerial view or a site plan showing other three and four story buildings within a one block radius.
- 7) Provide a thorough photographic survey of the neighborhood. (Study the stylistic direction of the proposed project in the downtown location).

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp stepped down, Cung absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****3. 701 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

**(4:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-121-014  
Application Number: MST2015-00561  
Owner: 711 N Milpas, LLC  
Applicant: RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a new four-story, 57,721 square foot mixed-use development to be reviewed under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. Two existing residential units and commercial buildings totaling 33,000 square feet will be demolished. A total of 6,656 square feet of non-residential use is proposed as well as 51,065 square feet of residential use in 73 units. The unit mix will consist of 32 two-bedroom, two-bath units, 32 one-bedroom, one-bath units, and nine two-bedroom, one-bath units. A total of 100 parking spaces are required, with 94 proposed. There would be 77 bicycle parking spaces. The average unit size will be 700 square feet, of that the maximum allowed is 970 square feet. This 69,610 square foot site encompasses eight parcels which will be merged, with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential of 28-36 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay District. Planning Commission review is requested for a zoning modification to provide less than the required parking as well as concept review under AUD.)

**(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)**

Actual time: 4:56 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert and Lisa Plowman, Architects; and Robert Bleecker, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An email of concerns from Kellam de Forest regarding impacts to mountain views, and the proposed height, bulk, and massing of the building, and an email of concerns from Rachel Arriaga regarding parking density for the neighborhood, were both acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:18 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely Planning Commission for return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board finds the proposed size, mass, bulk, and scale, and orientation toward the street acceptable.
- 2) The Board finds the proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the ABR design guidelines or required findings.
- 3) Two Board members felt that the overall length along Milpas Street could be broken up by providing different stylistic elements to portions of the building.
- 4) **The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
  - a. **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
  - b. **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.

- c. **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
- d. **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts where applicable.
- e. **Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.** The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
- f. **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The project's design includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Cung absent).

## **IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**

### **4. 601 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA**

**R-2 Zone**

**(5:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-261-004  
 Application Number: MST2014-00422  
 Owner: Teri Tuason  
 Architect: Frank Rogue  
 Engineer: Lobana Engineering

**(This is a revised project description:** Proposal for a new 1,326 square foot, three-story affordable dwelling unit and a 523 square foot, two-car attached garage on a 7,405 square foot lot. There is currently an existing two-story, 2,159 square foot dwelling unit and garage on site, which will be altered to remove a fireplace and add a 529 square foot rooftop deck. Total development on site will be 4,008 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a lot area modification and a zoning modification to encroach into the interior setback.)

**(Sixth Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on January 4, 2016.)**

Actual time: 5:47 p.m.

Present: Frank Rogue, Architect; and Teri Tuason, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Raise the tower element 12 inches in height.
- 2) Provide a shed roof at the gable ends of the west and east elevations.
- 3) Replace the existing tree to be removed with a minimum 24 inch box tree in the corner.
- 4) Show the guard rail on the west elevation.
- 5) Show the proposed gable end roof elements on the north elevation.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore stepped down, Cung absent).

**\* THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:11 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:38 P.M. \***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****5. 510 E ORTEGA ST****C-M Zone**

**(6:35)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-171-002  
 Application Number: MST2015-00530  
 Owner: Tom and Monica Curry  
 Applicant: Bildsten Architecture and Planning

(Proposal to demolish an existing 816 square foot single-family residence and detached garage and construct a three-story, five-unit apartment building under the Average Unit Density [AUD] Incentive Program. The project will consist of 2 studio units, 2 two-bedroom units, and 1 three-bedroom unit, all totaling 4,807 square feet, with an average unit size of 961 square feet. A total of five covered parking spaces will be provided in a ground-level garage. All existing trees will be removed, including a 30' tall Jacaranda in the front yard and six 8' to 12' fruit trees in the rear yard. No grading is proposed. The 5,000 square foot parcel is designated medium-high density and is within the priority housing overlay area with a maximum average unit size of 970 square feet. This project addresses violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00421 and Enforcement Case ENF2014-00954.)

**(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on December 7, 2015.)**

Actual time: 6:39 p.m.

Present: Greg Schmandt, Designer; and Ellen Bildsten and Erica Obertelli, Architects.

Public comment opened at 6:50 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with favorable comments:**

- 1) The Board appreciates the changes made so far to the project.
- 2) The proposed front jacaranda plantings and second floor planters are appreciated.
- 3) The Board finds the proposed flat rafters are acceptable.
- 4) The Board prefers upper balcony cable railings rather than the glass railings.
- 5) Study moving the staircase away from the northeast property line to allow for taller landscaping.
- 6) Return with more fully developed plans and details.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****6. 926 INDIO MUERTO ST****C-2/SD-3 Zone**

**(7:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-284-003  
 Application Number: MST2014-00415  
 Owner: IWF SB Gateway, LP  
 Architect: Hochhauser Blatter Architecture & Planning

(Proposal to demolish an existing 12,000 square foot commercial building and construct an approximately 55,000 square foot, 45'-0" tall hotel on a 38,122 square foot parcel. The project will comprise a three-story hotel with 111 rooms and a 115 space, semi-subterranean parking lot with supportive amenities. Planning Commission review is requested for a Development Plan, a Coastal Development Permit, and a Transfer of Existing Development Rights.)

**(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on January 19, 2016.)**

Actual time: 7:09 p.m.

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Architect; Danny Hyde, Agent; and David Black, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:23 p.m.

Leslie Collas (neighbor), opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the loss of mountain views and vistas by the proposed massing and taller height of the project, and the missing Santa Barbara style architecture and details in a very prominent location at the south entrance to Santa Barbara.

Public comment was closed at 7:31 p.m.

An email of concerns from Kellam de Forest regarding impacts to mountain views, and the proposed height, bulk, and massing of the building was acknowledged.

Straw vote: How many Board members find the massing and scale of the building acceptable? 4/2 (passed).

Straw vote: How many Board members find the style and represented architectural character to be acceptable? 1/5 (Tripp, vote failed).

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board appreciates the changes to the massing and scale of the building and finds the changes at the street level and from the freeway to be acceptable.
- 2) Restudy the proposed style and architectural character of the buildings to be more calming and cohesive.
- 3) Simplify the tower element and incorporate it into a more cohesive style with the rest of the building.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

Board comments: Some Board members suggested the removal of the over-articulated and shadow-inducing vertical channels which distract from the overall style of the architecture. Also, the proposed surface grilles over the openings unnecessarily and negatively embellish the buildings.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:10 P.M. \*\***