



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

TUESDAY, January 19, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)
SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)
KEVIN MOORE
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:06 p.m. by Vice-Chair Hopkins.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Hopkins, Miller, Moore (stepped away 4:41 p.m. - 4:43 p.m.), Tripp, and Wittausch.
Members absent: Cung.
Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. 2016 Board Elections and Appointments.

Kirk Gradin was nominated for ABR Chair. Election vote: 6/0 (unanimous). Mr. Gradin accepted the nomination.

Scott Hopkins was nominated for ABR Vice-Chair. Election vote: 6/0 (unanimous). Mr. Hopkins accepted the nomination.

Congratulations were extended to Mr. Gradin as Chair, and Mr. Hopkins as Vice-Chair for the 2016 year.

ABR Consent Landscape Review appointment was made for Courtney Miller to continue her assignment for 2016.

Board member appointments for Consent Agenda Representatives were postponed until the February 1, 2016 meeting. Chair Gradin will continue his appointment for Consent Review until another Board assignment is made.

B. 2016 Subcommittee Appointments.

Subcommittee and Ad-Hoc Appointments were made for the 2016 year.

C. Public Comment: No public comment was made at this time.

D. Approval of Minutes:

Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 4, 2016**, were postponed until the February 1, 2016 meeting.

E. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 11, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin**.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 19, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin**.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1) Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Board Members Cung will be absent from today's meeting.

b) Board member Hopkins will be stepping down from Agenda Item #1 at 813 E. Carrillo Street.

G. Subcommittee Reports: There were no reports made at this time.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1. 813 E CARRILLO ST

R-3 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-251-016

Application Number: MST2015-00602

Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara

Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a project under the Average Unit Density [AUD] Incentive Program. The project includes the demolition of an existing 1,428 square foot two-story house and construction of 16 affordable studio units in 3 two- and three-story buildings totaling 5,112 square feet. The units will be restricted to war veterans. Also proposed is a two- and three-story, 589 square foot community center; 387 square foot, two-story manager's unit with attached one-car carport; a 234 square foot manager's office; 89 square foot laundry facility; and trash enclosure. Seventeen parking spaces are required, with eight proposed. Staff Hearing Officer approval of Zoning Modifications is requested to allow a reduction in the number of required parking spaces, a reduction in the number of required bicycle parking spaces, and to exceed the maximum number of units per acre. The average unit size is 357 square feet, and the proposed residential density is 49 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 27 dwelling units per acre allowed on this 15,005 square foot parcel. The General Plan Land Use Designation is Medium High Density Residential, allowing 15-27 dwelling units per acre.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer Review. Project was last reviewed on January 4, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect, and Lisa Plowman, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with positive comments:

- 1) The Board made findings of no visual impact for both requested modifications as follows: The proposed development will not have a significant adverse visual impact upon the neighborhood's aesthetics or character as the proposed size, mass, bulk, scale, and style of the development is compatible and sensitively integrated into the existing conditions of the neighborhood and is appropriate for the neighborhood.
- 2) Provide a preliminary grading, drainage, and landscape plan.
- 3) Study lowering the apparent plate height at the second floor.
- 4) Provide consistent balcony wood member sizes throughout the project.
- 5) Remove the concrete walkway at the front of the manager's unit facing the street.
- 6) Study a landscape separation between the walkway at the manager's unit and the driveway, as opposed to using a railing.
- 7) Soften the building mass using landscaping at the southeast corner of the building mass as perceived from the street.
- 8) Study putting a hip roof element on the easterly courtyard building to match the west elevation.
- 9) At the front gate, study replacing the proposed stone material with an alternate material or a green hedge.
- 10) **The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
 - a. **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b. **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
 - e. **Public View of the Ocean or Mountains.** The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** (This determination could not be made at this time.) Provided landscaping and buffer zones seem to be appropriate for the project. Applicant is to return with a complete landscape plan.

Action: Miller/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Cung absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 540 W PUEBLO ST****C-O Zone**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-090-046
 Application Number: MST2007-00092
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
 Owner: Cancer Center of Santa Barbara
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP
 Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Previously approved project: the proposal comprised a new comprehensive outpatient cancer treatment facility and rental housing for the Cancer Center of Santa Barbara. The project site includes ten lots located between W. Junipero and W. Pueblo Streets that will be merged into one 3.38-acre lot. The Breast Cancer Resource Center was operating in a 2,392 square foot residential building at 525 W. Junipero Street, which was converted to a non-residential use as part of the approved project. The adjacent vacant parcel at 529 W. Junipero Street was approved for a new residential duplex. The project has now been revised to convert the Breast Cancer Resource Center building back to residential use as a duplex and construct a new non-residential 2,330 square foot Learning Center with an 80-seat auditorium on the vacant lot.)

(Project Design Approval of Learning Center only. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination made on December 11, 2015. Project was last reviewed on September 28, 2015 for the parking structure and grading.)

Actual time: 3:59 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Christine Pierron, Lisa Lyle, Architects; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:16 p.m.

- 1) John Denver, opposition; with concerns regarding the elevation of the building site, and the grading and drainage over the project site that may cause water and flood run-off during the anticipated "100-year storms" on to his neighboring property. (Mr. Cearnal clarified they had met with Mr. Denver several times last year in an attempt to come to a mutual solution to his concerns, including offering to build a 6-foot high stone block wall to divert water run-off.
- 2) Michael Denver, opposition; with concerns regarding grading and drainage, change issues, and believes previously submitted relevant comments from John Denver last year have not been documented in the project records. (Chair Gradin clarified that Substantial Conformance had already been issued on the project, and requested drainage changes require a Civil Engineer to review the grading and drainage plans, which is not the subject of the current review and not within the Board's purview.)

Public comment closed at 4:40 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design quality of the proposed project.
- 2) Combine the two separate landscaping areas on the southside of the building into one, with the walkway pushed tight to the building.
- 3) A majority of the Board had concerns regarding the visibility of the rooftop HVAC unit. One suggestion was to slightly increase the roof slope. Applicant shall provide

further study and return with further details, such as the manufacturer model number, size, curb detail, etc.

- 4) The Board finds the proposed colors acceptable.
- 5) Add varied additional landscaping to the southwest corner of the building.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

3. 926 INDIO MUERTO ST

C-2/SD-3 Zone

(4:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-284-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00415
 Owner: IWF SB Gateway, LP
 Architect: Hochhauser Blatter Architecture & Planning

(Proposal to demolish an existing 12,000 square foot commercial building and construct an approximately 55,000 square foot, 45'-0" tall hotel on a 38,122 square foot parcel. The project will comprise a three-story hotel with 111 rooms and a 115-space, semi-subterranean parking lot with supportive amenities. Planning Commission review is requested for a Development Plan, a Coastal Development Permit, and a Transfer of Existing Development Rights.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission Review. Project was last reviewed on December 7, 2015.)

Note: The Board conducted a 2:00 p.m., site visit for this project.

Actual time: 4:49 p.m.

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Architect; Matt Marquis, Representative for Pacifica Hotels, Inc. and Invest West Financial Corporation; and David Black, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:17 p.m.

- 1) Daniel Hyde spoke in support of the proposed project.
- 2) Robert T. Ludwick spoke in support of the proposed project.
- 3) Edwin P. Clark (had to leave the meeting early, but requested the Chair read his support comments written on his speaker slip).

Public comment closed at 5:22 p.m.

Prior public comment received: One email in opposition was received from Liz Bush, and 13 emails were received in support from: Andrew Van Noy, Blaine McConnaughy, Linda T. Dang, Linda Tran, Paul Weymouth, Santa Barbara Advisors, Inc., John Weymouth, Clifford Wyatt, Timothy Deakyne, John Lund, Ann Haws, Dylan Ward, and Michael Paskin.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission for return to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy both the northeast and northwest corner massing closest to and facing the freeway and off-ramp. Find a way to push the massing back at the upper elements to mitigate the visual impacts.
- 2) Simplify the overall character of the building and make it less "busy."
- 3) Study using taller and more robust landscaping on the freeway facing frontage.

Action: 4) Provide larger scale 3D images of the areas of concern.
Wittausch/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

4. CITYWIDE STREETLIGHTS

ROW Zone

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 000-000-0RW
Application Number: MST2016-00015
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: City of Santa Barbara Public Works

(Proposal to replace the existing "Cobra-head" style City standard streetlight with a new "Slim Line" style LED fixture, which will be more energy efficient and cost effective. In addition, the applicant requests feedback on the idea of using a similar light fixture for pedestrian lighting.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:58 p.m.

Present: John Ewasiuk, Principal Civil Engineer; and Jim Dewey Facilities and Energy Manager for the City Public Works Department.

Public comment opened at 6:03 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval of the proposal to replace the existing "Cobra-head" style City standard streetlight with a new "Slim Line" style LED fixture, and continued indefinitely to Full Board for the pedestrian lighting fixtures.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 100 BLK S SOLEDAD STREET

ROW

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-495
Application Number: MST2015-00294
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Laura Yanez
Engineer: Thomas Conti

(Proposal for the Cacique and Soledad Street Pedestrian and Bicycle Bridges and Corridor Improvements Project, which will consist of street improvements on Cacique Street from Salinas to Alisos Streets and along Soledad Street from Cacique to Montecito Streets. Improvements will include the removal of the existing dilapidated wood pedestrian bridge along Cacique Street, construction of two pedestrian bicycle bridges along Cacique and Soledad Streets over Sycamore Creek, construction of sidewalks on Soledad and Cacique Streets, adjustment of intersection controls at certain corridor intersections to favor bicycle boulevard movements along Cacique Street, installation of pedestrian and bicycle-oriented lighting throughout the corridor and bridges, and riparian habitat enhancement.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on June 22, 2015.)

Actual time: 6:16 p.m.

Present: Laura Yañez, Project Engineer; Tom Conti, Senior Project Manager-Bengal Engineering; and David Black, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:30 p.m.

- 1) Sebastian Aldana, Jr. spoke in support of the proposed project.
- 2) Eve Sanford (left early but was in support of the proposed project).

Public comment closed at 6:32 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Overall the Board favors the project and appreciate the design and effort that went into the project; especially the landscaping, hardscape, and the bridge design.
- 2) Return with lighting fixture and pole styles and sizes.
- 3) Provide an historical story board regarding creeks and bridges in the project area.
- 4) Study the node connecting the bridges with Cacique Street with a more enhanced material, such as concrete, or reduce the size of the node, or tighten up the design in the node area for other alternative transportation uses.
- 5) The Board would be in favor of colored concrete so the bridge surface would integrate with adjoining surfaces.
- 6) At least one Board member found matching the fencing to the bridge color would be an enhancement, and other Board members requested further study of other alternate options to the fencing.
- 7) Clarify the fencing locations on the plans.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

*** THE BOARD WILL RECESS AT APPROX. 6:56 P.M. AND RECOVENE AT APPROX. 7: 23 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 220 GRAY AVE

OC/HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(6:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-054-020
 Application Number: MST2015-00123
 Owner: J.G. Shalhoob, Sr. Family Trust
 Applicant: Sherry & Associates

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a voluntary lot merger of the lots at 220 Gray Avenue [APN 033-054-020] and 224 Gray Avenue [APN 033-054-017]. The proposal also includes the demolition of 2,093 square feet of as-built one-story additions and construction of a 102 square foot addition to the existing 3,755 square foot commercial building. The proposal also includes site improvements comprising 15 parking spaces, four bicycle parking spaces, an as-built outdoor dining area, new site walls and gates, and a trash enclosure. Coastal review is required. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00833.)

(Second Concept Review. Project scope has been greatly reduced. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on May 11, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:23 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) At the front wall, if not lowered, the cable material should match the other metal detailing.
- 2) Restudy and provide samples of other metal roof materials on the project to fill in the open northeast corner asphalt landscaping adjacent to the dumpsters.
- 3) The following finding was read into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Moore/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

7. 2217 OAK PARK LN

R-3 Zone

(6:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-160-009
 Application Number: MST2014-00544
 Owner: Dawn Close Living Trust
 Architect: Native Son Design Studio

(Proposal to construct a new 665 square foot residential unit above a new 1,056 square foot garage/accessory building. The approximately 11,000 square foot parcel is currently developed with two existing one-story residential units [existing Unit 1 is 1,000 square feet and existing Unit 2 is 700 square feet to remain unaltered]. The project will provide two parking spaces for each unit [three covered, three uncovered] for a total of six spaces. A 62 square foot exterior stair and 341 square foot upper level deck is also proposed. Total development on site will be 3,421 square feet. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00959.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on November 24, 2014.)

Actual time: 7:44 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect, Native Son Design Studio; and Dawn Close, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Provide a color and materials board.
- 2) Provide exterior lighting details
- 3) Provide landscape plan details.
- 4) Provide architectural details.
- 5) The following finding was read into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:00 P.M. ****