



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

**Monday, January 4, 2016**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)  
SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR  
THIEP CUNG  
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)  
KEVIN MOORE  
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP  
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      DALE FRANCISCO  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      JOHN CAMPANELLA  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate):**      SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**      JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor  
                 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician  
                 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos).

**CALL TO ORDER:**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present:      Gradin, Cung, Hopkins, Miller, and Tripp.  
Members absent:      Moore and Wittausch.  
Staff present:      Gantz and Goo.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

**A.      2016 Board Elections and Appointments.**

Board Elections and Appointments were postponed until Tuesday's, January 19, 2016 meeting.

**B.      2016 Subcommittee Appointments.**

Board Member 2016 Subcommittee and Ad-Hoc Appointments were postponed until Tuesday's, January 19, 2016 Full Board meeting.

**C.      Public Comment:** There was no public comment made at this time.

**D. Approval of Minutes:**

- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **December 21, 2016**, as amended.
- Action: Hopkins/Cung, 2/0/3. Motion carried. (Tripp/Miller/Gradin abstained, Moore/Wittausch absent).

**E. Consent Calendars:**

**The Consent Review of December 28, 2015, was cancelled due to the City holiday closure.**

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 4, 2016**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Gradin and Miller**.
- Action: Miller/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore/Wittausch absent).

**F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.**

- 1) Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
- a) The City and Architectural Board of Review welcomed absent new Board Member Kevin Moore, who will begin his four year term on Tuesday, January 19, 2016.
  - b) Board Member Moore and Wittausch will be absent from today's meeting, and Board Member Hopkins will step down from Items 5 and 6 at 813 E. Carrillo St. and 1818 Castillo St., respectively.
  - c) Because two Board Members will be absent from today's meeting, Items A and B under General Business will be postponed two weeks.

**G. Subcommittee Reports.** There were no reports.**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****1. 133 S SALINAS ST****C-P Zone**

**(3:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-243-009  
 Application Number: MST2014-00639  
 Owner: Julio Lopez  
 Architect: Angeli De Covolo, Inc.

(Proposal for a 672 square foot, one-story addition to an existing 1,122 square foot, one-story, single-family dwelling with a detached two-car garage on an 8,134 square foot parcel. Also proposed is a new 496 square foot attached office building and two new uncovered parking spaces. There will be approximately 45 cubic yards of grading excavation. The project will result in 496 square feet of office floor area and a 1,794 square foot dwelling unit.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan.)**

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Gil Garcia, Architect; and Julio Lopez, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m.

- 1) Marty Ingraham, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding proposed handicap parking locations, access to available parking on site, and on-street parking density issues.
- 2) Nicole Horstin (submitted existing on-street parking photographs), opposition; spoke of concerns regarding available handicap parking and on-street parking density issues.

Public comment closed at 3:21 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) In general, the Board found the proposed project design acceptable and modest in scale. All details should be consistent and convey continuity with the existing structure.
- 2) Provide a longitudinal section through Salinas Street, the house and the addition, so the Board can understand how the residential and office space come together.
- 3) All proposed windows and doors should match existing and each other.
- 4) Provide a landscape plan.
- 5) Provide deck and roof plans.
- 6) Restudy the relationship of the columns supporting the trellis at the house and the top of the wall at the office space. Either project the columns out further, with more definition, or recess them further back.

Action: Cung/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore/Wittausch absent).

**\* THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 3:32 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:03 P.M. \***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**

**2. 601 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA**

**R-2 Zone**

**(4:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-261-004  
 Application Number: MST2014-00422  
 Owner: Teri Tuason  
 Architect: Frank Rogue  
 Engineer: Lobana Engineering

**(This is a revised project description:** Proposal for a new 1,326 square foot, three-story affordable dwelling unit and a 523 square foot, two-car attached garage on a 7,405 square foot lot. There is currently an existing two-story, 2,159 square foot dwelling unit and garage on site, which will be altered to remove a fireplace and add a 529 square foot rooftop deck. Total development on site will be 4,008 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a lot area modification and a zoning modification to encroach into the interior setback.)

**(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only: requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on November 23, 2015.)**

Actual time: 4:03 p.m.

Present: Frank Rogue, Architect; Teri Tuason, Owner; and JoAnne LaConte, Assistant Planner (who provided the Board with Modification Uniformity of Development criteria and General Plan scenic view corridor policy for the APS area).

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

- 1) bj Danetra, ( submitted reformatted email), in opposition; spoke of concerns regarding driveway width, the growing mass, bulk, and scale due to elevation changes, and changes in roof configuration and therefore roof height.

An email of concerns from bj Danetra was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:17 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Restudy the relationships of the roof and/or proposed door and windows on the north elevation as they meet and affect the entrance tower element.
- 2) Develop consistent eave and rake details to be represented on all elevations.
- 3) Develop consistent door and window details to be represented on all elevations.
- 4) Restudy the relationship of the hip roof to the second floor deck element.
- 5) Restudy the proportions of the windows on the south elevation of the addition to be more in keeping with the verticality of the other windows on that elevation.
- 6) Some Board members find the existing tree should be retained, and recommended the City Urban Forest Superintendent Tim Downey assist in exploring methods to retain the tree. Others find that if there sufficient screening provided from the street, then replacing the tree would be acceptable.
- 7) Simplify the roof where the two gables are next to each other.

Action: Cung/Hopkins, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Miller opposed, Moore/Wittausch absent).

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **3. 1118 INDIO MUERTO ST**

**R-3 Zone**

**(4:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-291-003  
 Application Number: MST2015-00537  
 Owner: Edward St. George Revocable Trust  
 Architect: On Design, LLC

(This project has been revised from a proposed 1,539 square foot single-family dwelling previously approved by the Single Family Design Board to a two-unit, 2,046 square foot duplex under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). Unit 1 will comprise two stories with three bedrooms and 1,371 square feet. Unit 2 will comprise a second story above the existing 413 square foot two-car garage, with two bedrooms and 640 square feet. The proposal includes a 35 square foot ground-floor addition to the garage, bringing the garage to 448 square feet, and providing bicycle parking and one covered parking space for each unit. The average unit size will be 1,005 square feet, which is the maximum allowed under the AUD program for this 3,960 square foot parcel with a Medium-High Residential Density of 15-27 dwelling units per acre. The existing 889 square foot single-family dwelling was demolished under separate permit.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan.)**

Actual time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: Jerry Wilhelm, Architect; and Shelby Messner, Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:**

- 1) Enlarge the entrance element to the second floor unit to be more proportionate to the building as a whole.
- 2) The two wood posts (with 18-foot span between) should be beefed up and add a corbel at the main header and posts supporting the deck to be more in keeping with the character of the project.
- 3) Define a clear pathway to the second unit on the site plan.
- 4) Provide details of the rest of the project on the site plan.
- 5) Return with the landscape plan at Consent Review.
- 6) The following finding was read into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****4. 1600 BLK CLIFF DR NEAR PAYERAS**

**(5:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-346  
 Application Number: MST2015-00514  
 Contractor: Verizon Wireless  
 Applicant: Verizon Wireless  
 Business Name: City of Santa Barbara  
 Architect: SAC Wireless

(Proposal for a new small cell wireless communication installation for Verizon Wireless on the south side of Cliff Drive. The proposal includes a new arm-mounted, 24" tall cylindrical antenna to be mounted on an existing 34' tall utility pole and a locked chain link equipment enclosure to be located down the slope of the embankment beyond the sidewalk within the ROW. There will also be wood access stairs. A Public Works encroachment permit is being processed under application PBW2015-01120.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Requires No Visual Impact Findings. Project was last reviewed on November 9, 2015.)**

Actual time: 5:10 p.m.

Present: Vivon Crawford, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m.

- 1) John and Katerina Kingsbury, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the location of one of the proposed poles.

Public comment closed at 5:21 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:**

- 1) The Board made no visual impact findings as follows: The proposed development will not have a significant adverse visual impact upon the neighborhood's aesthetics or

character as the proposed size, bulk, or scale of the development is compatible with the neighborhood.

- 2) Provide a landscape plan showing landscape screening between the sidewalk and the enclosure.
- 3) Study rotating the proposed structure 90 degrees to the south, if possible, to be less visually intrusive to neighbors and the public.

Action: Hopkins/Tripp, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Moore/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\* THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 5:27 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:33 P.M. \***

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **5. 813 E CARRILLO ST**

**R-3 Zone**

**(5:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-251-016  
 Application Number: MST2015-00602  
 Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara  
 Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal for a project under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project includes the demolition of an existing 1,428 square foot two-story house and construction of 16 affordable studio units in 3 two- and three-story buildings, totaling 5,112 square feet. The units will be restricted to war veterans. Also proposed is a two- and three-story, 589 square foot community center; 387 square foot, two-story manager's unit with attached one-car carport; a 234 square foot manager's office; 89 square foot laundry facility; and trash enclosure. Seventeen parking spaces are required, with eight proposed. Staff Hearing Officer approval of zoning modifications is requested to allow a reduction in the number of required parking spaces, a reduction in the number of required bicycle parking spaces, and to exceed the maximum number of units per acre. The average unit size is 357 square feet, and the proposed residential density is 49 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 27 dwelling units per acre allowed on this 15,005 square foot parcel. The General Plan Land Use Designation is Medium-High Density Residential, allowing 15-27 dwelling units per acre.)

**(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer Review.)**

Actual time: 5:24 p.m.

Present: Dale Aazam and Skip Szymansky, Housing Authority; Detlev Peikert, Architect; and Lisa Plowman, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:53 p.m.

- 1) Patricia Lopez, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding existing multiple buildings on site, and parking density issues.
- 2) Christian Bonillo, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the amount of fill and grading; bulk, size, and appearance of the replacement building; available open space; and the preservation of the existing view corridor.
- 3) Ernest Lopez, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding parking density issues for neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 5:59 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members find the proposed mass, bulk, and scale acceptable, and find that it can be forwarded to the Staff Hearing Officer without further changes? 3/1 (Miller opposed, Hopkins

stepped down, Moore/Wittausch absent), passed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) On the site plan, identify other two-story and three-story buildings within a two-block radius of the project, including height details.
- 2) Identify retaining wall locations and heights.
- 3) Study to provide a curvilinear element to the pedestrian walkway.

Action: Miller/Cung, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Moore/Wittausch absent).

## **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

### **6. 1818 CASTILLO ST**

**R-4 Zone**

**(6:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-012-023  
 Application Number: MST2015-00500  
 Owner: DB Partners, LLC  
 Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal to demolish an existing single-family home, studio apartment, detached garage, and two sheds, and construct a two-unit, two-story duplex and a five-unit two- and partial three-story residential apartment building under the Average Unit Size Density Incentive Program. The project will result in seven units comprising 2 two-bedroom units and 5 three-bedroom units, totaling 6,609 square feet. This 12,656 square foot parcel is designated as Medium-High Density with a maximum average density allowed of 945 square feet per unit. The average unit size for this project will be 944 square feet. There will be eight uncovered parking spaces, including one accessible parking space between the two proposed buildings along the southerly property line. The previous project under application MST2015-00092 has been withdrawn.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on November 9, 2015.)**

Actual time: 6:13 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect; and Lisa Plowman, Architects.

Public comment opened at 6:45 p.m.

- 1) Brian Barnwell commented that he prefers craftsman architecture and carport parking instead of a third story, and requested consideration of adding tandem parking.
- 2) Rick Lang, (submitted letter) opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed parking and density issues.
- 3) Kathleen Hoffman (submitted letter & photos), opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the proposed parking and density issues in the neighborhood, and lack neighborhood compatibility and story poles.
- 4) Pamela Lasker, (submitted letter) opposition; spoke of concerns regarding the height of the proposed building, and lack of story poles or Board requested 3D rendering, and neighborhood compatibility.
- 5) Eric Werniche, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding lack of neighborhood compatibility for most AUD projects, and requested a policy or guideline that would incorporate City statistics and data, and requested a beneficial parking survey for the neighborhood. He also encouraged tandem parking as a possible solution to increase available parking and relieve parking density in the area.
- 6) Suzanne Smith, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding blocked natural light, additional noise activity, and garbage, increased on-street parking density, and increased short-term vacation rentals in the area.

Emails of concern from Pam Lasker & John Smith, Kemble White, and Frederick (Rick) Lang were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:00 p.m.

- Motion:**      **Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:**
- 1) **The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
    - a. **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
    - b. **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
    - c. **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
    - d. **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** (This criteria was not applicable to the proposed project).
    - e. **Public View of the Ocean or Mountains.** The design of the proposed project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
    - f. **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
  - 2) The following finding was later read into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action:      Cung/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Moore/Wittausch absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:09 P.M. \*\***