



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, November 23, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)
SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Agenda Representative)
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Cung (present until 6:26 p.m.), Miller, Tripp and Wittausch.
Members absent: Hopkins and Poole.
Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

Staff took a quick poll on Board members who will be in attendance at the Dec. 21st ABR meeting; and staff currently has a quorum for that meeting.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **November 9, 2015**, as submitted.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 3/0/2. Motion carried. (Miller/Cung abstained, Poole/Hopkins absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 16, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Miller/Cung, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Hopkins absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 23, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Cung/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Hopkins absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1) Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Board Members Hopkins and Poole will be absent from today's meeting.

b) There will be two New Zoning Ordinance (called "NZO") Committee meetings on December 7th and December 14th. The Joint Committee is composed of two City Councilmembers and three Planning Commissioners. *NZO Module #2: Development Standards* comprises three components: 1) base zone development standards; 2) overlay zones; and 3) citywide development standards. The Draft Module #2 and NZO Joint Committee staff report are now available for viewing and download on the [NZO Public Meetings webpage](#). Public meetings for this Module will be held over two consecutive Mondays, December 7 and December 14, 2015, from 9:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m. (both days) in the Parks and Recreation Department Conference Room at 620 Laguna Street. Meeting agendas will be released the week of November 16, 2015.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. SELECTION OF ABR MEMBER AND SIGN COMMITTEE MEMBER FOR SIGN ORDINANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

(3:15) Staff: Ariel Calonne, City Attorney

(The new Committee will review the City's sign regulations in order to assure compliance with the First Amendment.)

Actual time: 3:08 p.m.

Chair Gradin nominated Board member Wittausch as Sign Ordinance Review Committee member, who accepted the nomination, and Thiep Cung volunteered as the alternate for the *Ad hoc* Sign Ordinance Review Committee.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 601 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****R-2 Zone**

(3:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-261-004
Application Number: MST2014-00422
Owner: Teri Tuason
Architect: Frank Rogue

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a new 1,326 square foot, 3-story affordable dwelling unit and a 523 square foot, 2-car attached garage on a 7,405 square foot lot. There is currently an existing 2-story, 2,159 square foot dwelling unit and garage on site which will be altered to remove a fireplace and add a 529 square foot rooftop deck. Total development on site will be 4,008 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a lot area modification and a zoning modification to encroach into the interior setback.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only: requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on March 2, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Frank Rogue, Architect; Teri Tuason, Owner; and JoAnne LaConte, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:24 p.m.

- 1) Robert Betancourt, opposition; expressed concern regarding the proposed square footage and building footprint, good neighbor policy (requested but not required), and neighborhood compatibility.
- 2) bj Danetra, (submitted neighborhood photos and some drawings) opposition; expressed concern regarding compatibility of the proposed size, bulk, and scale (which the Board previously approved), that the requested square footage and existing frontage indicates a bulky and too large proposal for the neighborhood.

Emails of concern from Victoria Valente, and Trudi Ramsey were acknowledged.

A late email from Debra Gorackowski was received and added to the project file.

Public comment closed at 3:33 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could support window design as proposed? 0/5 (failed).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support vinyl material on the windows as proposed? 0/5 (failed).

Straw vote: How many Board members could support the flat roof to remain? 5/0 (passed)

Straw vote: How many Board members could support adding tile to the existing roof? 0/5 (failed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer for return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The site plan are to accurately represent all the site walls. The floor plan, the roof plan, and all the elevations shall all be coordinated with each other (i.e., elevations shall coordinate with the roof plan and vice-versa).
- 2) After the Staff Hearing Officer hearing, the Board would like the Applicant to return with an upgraded window design that is consistent with the new and old portions of the house. The vinyl material is unacceptable.
- 3) The flat roof with the small parapet on the existing house shall remain.

- 4) Update the Arborist Report to reflect the accurate distance to the excavation, and provide guidelines for protection.
- 5) The Board carried forward previous Oct. 12, 2015, comments #1 and #2, as stated:
 - a. A majority of the Board finds the project's mass, bulk and scale acceptable.
 - b. Restudy the window proportions, scale, and details, and the eyebrow or awning treatments over the windows to be more consistent in style throughout the whole overall proposed design.
- 6) The roof configuration on the south side of the addition should be a straight shed roof. The two smaller hip roof elements should be removed from the elevation.
- 7) On plan Sheet A.3, eliminate the east elevation small hip roof projection element over the second floor balcony on the north side.
- 8) **The Board has reviewed the proposed project and the Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) were generally met as follows:**
 - a. **Compliance with City Charter and Municipal Code; General Consistency with Design Guidelines:** The Board made the finding that the proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with ABR Design Guidelines.
 - b. **Compatible with Architectural Character of City and Neighborhood.** The proposed design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of the Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. **Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.** The proposed development's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. **Sensitive to Adjacent Landmarks and Historic Resources.** The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
 - e. **Public View of the Ocean and Mountains.** (Could not be determined at this time).
 - f. **Appropriate Amount of Open Space and Landscaping.** (Could not be determined at this time).

Action: Cung/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins/Poole absent).

Board Comments: One Board member would like the Applicant to return with correctly identified and engineered details of the as-built retaining walls in the crawl space under the house (including supports, perimeter wall locations, ventilation, etc.). One Board member will add a condition if the existing tree is removed to replace the tree in-kind.

FINAL REVIEW**3. 3869 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-037
 Application Number: MST2013-00282
 Owner: Housing Authority City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Peikert & RRM Design Group

(Proposal to demolish an existing church and two-story building and construct an affordable senior rental housing development on a 45,195 square foot lot. The project consists of a new 44,029 square foot (gross), three-story residential building with 57 one-bedroom units, a manager's unit, a 1,920 square foot community room, administrative office, and laundry facilities. The project site is located in the Priority Housing Overlay; therefore, under the AUD program a maximum of 63 units per acre is allowed. The average unit size is 489 square feet (net). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow less than the required number of parking spaces.)

(Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 035-15. Project was last reviewed on the Consent Agenda on November 16, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:16 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert and Bonnie Sangster, Architects; Gordon Brewer, Applicant; and Skip Szymanski, Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 4:41 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) On plan sheet 4.1, the proposed roof awning adds a charming element; add a similar awning to the front elevation.
- 2) Provide full thickness plaster at the exposed foundation walls below the weep screed.
- 3) On plan Sheet detail 2/A-8.6, provide a guard rail cap consistent with the building design.
- 4) Restudy use of stepping stones on top of the trench and provide details for compatibility.
- 5) The pole lighting fixtures shall be silver-gray to match the exposed exterior lighting on the building.
- 6) Provide permeable pavers at the handicap parking stalls.
- 7) Restudy the use of stepping stones at the infiltration trench.
- 8) Provide a taller alternative for the proposed crepe myrtle tree.
- 9) Provide clarification for the landscape plantings on the west side between the stepping stones and the fence.
- 10) Board member Tripp read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Miller/Cung, 4/1/0. Motion carried. [Wittausch opposed (would like plan Sheet detail 6A/-8.6, and detail 2/A-8.6, the unfinished visible sheet metal on the underside of the deck painted to match the plaster), Hopkins/Poole absent].

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 5:02 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:05 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. RIGHT-OF-WAY FROM E CABRILLO TO INDIO MUERTO****C-2/SD-3 Zone****(5:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-010-065
 Application Number: MST2015-00550
 Owner: James & Joan Dixon, Trustees
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara/Public Works

(Proposal for right-of-way improvements under the Lower Milpas Pedestrian Improvement Project. The proposal includes the installation of 700 linear feet of sidewalk along the east side of S. Milpas Street beginning at E. Cabrillo Blvd. and continuing to the US 101 on/off-ramp north of the Union Pacific Railroad. The project also includes ten new light poles, a center median island, and curb and gutter improvements. An additional sidewalk infill of 565 linear feet is also proposed along Calle Puerto Vallarta, connecting S. Milpas Street to Dwight Murphy Park and the Santa Barbara Zoo. The project will require the relocation of a private driveway into Tri-County Produce as well as a reconfiguration of their parking lot. Improvements will be made on the following streets: S. Milpas Street, Calle Puerto Vallarta, Por La Mar, and Corona Del Mar. Project requires Coastal Review.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment, compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program, a Waiver for perimeter planters, and Coastal Review.)

Actual time: 5:05 p.m.

Present: Eric Goodall, Project Engineer/City of Santa Barbara; Derrick Bailey, Supervising Transportation Engineer, and Ashley Shue, Supervising Engineer/City of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 5:20 p.m.

- 1) Paul Gifford (owner of adjacent property to the rear, the Blue Sands Motel), opposition; expressed concern regarding proposed landscape plantings along the sidewalk that may block the adjacent motel signage, and that may not match the beach cottage ambiance of the area; and requested the relocation of the proposed crosswalk to Calle Puerto Vallarta.
- 2) Jonathan Robert Gonzales (adjacent neighbor), opposition; with expressed concern regarding negative impacts to quality of life, possible encroachment of sidewalk into property line, safety, and increased negative use by homeless to utilize the residential side of the street.
- 3) Howard Jones (adjacent neighbor), opposition; with expressed concerns regarding negative impacts, safety, and increased negative use by homeless to utilize the residential side of the street, especially on the way to the market.
- 4) Jarrett Gorin, (Representative for Tri-County Produce), support; gave some pending information regarding the parking plan and landscaping for Tri-County Produce that may involve or impact the proposed sidewalk.

Public comment closed at 5:35 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide lighting details.
- 2) Provide landscape plan details.
- 3) Restudy relocating the section of sidewalk from the corner of the Santa Barbara Inn to the corner of Calle Puerto Vallarta and Milpas Street for a more favorable solution to neighboring residents.

Action: Wittausch/Cung, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller abstained, Hopkins/Poole absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 225 E HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-012
 Application Number: MST2015-00418
 Owner: Iglesia Del Dios Vivo
 Architect: Jyl Ratkevich

(Proposal for a minor reduction of floor area and alterations to an existing 1,781 square foot church. The project includes raising the one story roof at the front of the building to align with the second floor roof at the rear, the demolition of 44 square feet of floor area on the west elevation, and the addition of 17 square feet of floor area on the south elevation facing E. Haley Street. Also proposed are alterations to windows and doors, decorative details, and an extension of the stair landing over the forced air unit cabinet at the rear. A project approved under master application MST2011-00310 is currently under construction under building permit application BLD2012-01010.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on November 9, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:51 p.m.

Present: Jyl Ratkevich, Architect; and Pastor Valadez, Church Representative.

Public comment opened at 5:58 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Provide final drawings.
- 2) Study the lighting.
- 3) Study door panel layout.
- 4) Add a molding to the small door on southwest elevation.
- 5) Center the lighting sconces at the rear entry; and study relocating the wall sconces to either the door handle-side of the doors or to each side of the doors; lower the lighting sconces on the wall.

Action: Wittausch/Cung, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Gradin opposed, Hopkins/Poole absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**6. 3714 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-023
 Application Number: MST2012-00443
 Owner: KW Fund V-Sandman, LLC
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
 Architect: Brian Cearnal
 Agent: John Schuck

(Revision to the previously approved mixed-use development at the former Sandman Inn site (MST2007-00591; City Council Resolution No. 10-020). The revised project involves the demolition of the existing, 52,815 square foot, 113-room hotel and restaurant, and construction of 5,110 square feet of office space and 72 residential condominiums.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is received. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 008-14. Project was last reviewed on September 28, 2015.)

Actual time: 6:08 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Michael Hutaff, Agent; Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect; and John Schuck, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:30 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Provide dimensions for the proposed paving elements and patterns (exp. 4'x8' herringbone, etc.).
- 2) Provide sizing for each of the proposed tile paving configurations.
- 3) Provide score patterns for the proposed concrete.
- 4) Add tree screening along the east side.
- 5) Provide details of the corner pillars on the commercial parapet roof.
- 6) Provide railing details.
- 7) Provide chimney shrouds details.
- 8) Update window details to show plaster returning to the windows; provide aluminum-clad wood window details.
- 9) Provide plaster details below the weep screed line.
- 10) Restudy the entry monument details and columns.
- 11) Restudy the details of the vehicle and pedestrian wrought iron railings to slightly raise one or the other in order to differentiate between the two types.
- 12) Provide pathway lighting elements.
- 13) Provide the proposed copper gutter and downspout details on the plans.
- 14) Raise the shed roof at the utility door on Buildings 100, 400, and 600.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, /0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins/Poole/Cung absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:10 P.M. ****