



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, September 14, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)
SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Agenda Representative)
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Hopkins, Miller, Poole, and Wittausch.
Members absent: Tripp and Cung.
Staff present: Gantz and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Mr. Constantino Frangos made a general complaint about receiving the Sept. 8th ABR agenda late, and the missed opportunity to submit comment or speak at that meeting in opposition of Item C, 336 N. Milpas St.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **August 31, 2015**, as amended. (*The Aug. 31, 2015 Consent Minutes portion of these minutes were approved and ratified at the previous Full Board meeting, and are now website posted as a separate document.*)
Action: Hopkins/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **Tuesday, September 8, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole**.
Action: Miller/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 14, 2015, with the exception of Item F, 301 S. Hope Street which was referred up to Full Board.** The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller.** *(These ratified Consent Minutes can be found as a separate posted document.)*
- Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
Ms. Gantz announced that Board members Cung and Tripp are absent from the meeting.
- E. Subcommittee Reports.
There were no reports made.

PRESENTATION ITEM

1. AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF ARCHITECTS (ArchitecTours) **(3:15)** Staff: Christopher Mason-Hing (AIA)

The American Institute of Architects – Santa Barbara Chapter announces the annual ArchitecTours held on October 3, 2015, with the theme ‘Architecture with a Story’ featuring nine projects with intriguing personal stories of the design obstacles encountered during the processing and building phases.

Actual time: 3:13 p.m.

Mr. Manson-Hing clarified the available options and projects on the ArchitecTours website, www.aiasb.com.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 121 E MASON ST **OC/SD-3 Zone** **(3:17)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 033-084-005 Application Number: MST2014-00115 Owner: Somo SB, LLC Architect: Dan Weber

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a four-story, mixed-use development with a tentative subdivision map for apartments and commercial condominiums. The residential portion of the project consists of 125 apartments with an average unit size of 617 square feet, including 10 units affordable to low income households. The proposed density is 166% greater than the base density of 47 studios provided by the Variable Density Program. The non-residential portion of the project consists of 13,580 square feet of retail and restaurant uses and 9,144 square feet of light industrial/manufacturing arts-related uses. Proposed public improvements include conversion of Gray Avenue/Mason Street and Santa Barbara Street to one-way circulation, new on-street parking, and valet service on Gray Avenue. A Parking Modification is requested to provide 179 parking spaces rather than the parking required by code. The project includes requests for two concessions/incentives per State Density Bonus Law: (1) to provide 61 additional apartments beyond the 17 required under State Density Bonus Law, and (2) to allow for additional bedrooms. The project also requests the following Development Standard Reductions per State Density Bonus Law: (1) to allow a four story development; (2) to increase the maximum height limit from 45 feet to 56 feet; and (3) to allow the required common outdoor living space to be located above grade. Planning Commission review is required.)

(Second Concept Review. Requires Compatibility Criteria Analysis, Environmental Assessment, and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed April 14, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Dan Weber, Architect; Neal Dipaola and Tony Tomasello, Representing Ownership, Mesa Lane Partners; and Dan Gullett, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m.

- 1) Ben Warner spoke in general support of the proposed project.
- 2) David Snider spoke in general support of the proposed project.
- 3) John Jorgensen, opposition; expressed concern regarding the north elevation overall mass being too large for the neighborhood.
- 4) Philip Jankoski spoke in general support of the proposed project.
- 5) Dudley Michael expressed concerns regarding maintaining the integrity of the artistic community in the neighborhood.
- 6) John Tynan spoke in favor of the project, but expressed concerns regarding the loss of private views, the height of the proposed project, parking density, and traffic.

An emailed letter of expressed concerns from Ms. Karen Kwan regarding traffic, parking density, height variance, housing density, and aesthetics was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comment to provide an area map in a one block radius of the adjacent buildings in relation to the proposed project, including building mass and height in relation to surrounding buildings to determine neighborhood compatibility in terms of the massing; include elevations showing adjacent building outlines and/or photographs.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent for vote, Tripp/Cung absent).

Board comments: One Board member suggested the Applicant show some additional portion of the streetscape on the elevations to determine the relationship of the streetscape to the project, and to restudy the parking design.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

3. 3714 STATE ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-023
 Application Number: MST2012-00443
 Owner: KW Fund V-Sandman, LLC
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
 Architect: Brian Cearnal
 Agent: John Schuck

(Revision to the previously approved mixed-use development at the former Sandman Inn site (MST2007-00591; City Council Resolution No. 10-020). The revised project involves the demolition of the existing, 52,815 square foot, 113-room hotel and restaurant, and construction of 5,110 square feet of office space and 72 residential condominiums.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 008-14. Project was last reviewed on April 13, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:31 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Michael Hutaff and John Schuck, Agents; Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect; and Allison DeBusk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Return with a lighting plan.
- 2) Provide working drawings. Ensure that design details in design-approved plans are included in the working drawings.
- 3) Resolve the landscape plan.
- 4) Study the solid deck rail proportions.
- 5) Resolve the roof mansard detailing.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 5:14 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 5:17 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 525 E YANONALI ST

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

(5:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-540-007
 Application Number: MST2015-00286
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Linda Sumansky

(Proposal for repairs and maintenance required to reactivate the city's desalination facility to provide drinking water in response to the extreme drought. The work on this 64,000 square foot parcel includes replacement of existing seawater reverse osmosis modules, refurbishment of water storage tanks, new landscaping, and access gate relocations.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was found to be in Substantial Conformance with the previously-approved Coastal Development Permit. Project was last reviewed on June 22, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Linda Sumansky, Principal Engineer; and Steven Greer, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:33 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Mr. Greer clarified for the Board that the colors of the project must either match the existing Rescue Mission or the other El Estero Wastewater Treatment Plant buildings, in accordance with previous Coastal Development Permit Conditions of Approval.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with conditions:

- 1) Provide a lighting plan.
- 2) All existing trees are to remain.

Action: Hopkins/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 500 FOWLER RD****A-F/SD-3 Zone****(5:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003
Application Number: MST2015-00324
Owner: City of Santa Barbara Airport
Engineer: Meredith Louden, Development Project Mgr.
Engineer: Anthony Ferreira, Engineering Mgr.

(Proposal for new shade canopies to be constructed over approximately one acre of existing parking and topped with a 677 kilowatt commercial photovoltaic system comprising 2,052 panels. The structure will follow the Airport's color design guidelines and will match similar structures in the vicinity in the "Malaga Green" color. Landscaping under the new carport canopies will be replaced with shade- and drought-tolerant landscaping.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on July 20, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:52 p.m.

Present: Andrew Bermond, Project Engineer; and Hazel Johns, Airport Director as Agent for Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:01 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Remove the scroll element from the design.
- 2) Study a structural design to fill the center of the tube steel with concrete so as to eliminate the need for bollards. The Board does not find the solid tube concrete detail at the base acceptable.
- 3) Study shifting the carports away from center aisle with one stall in each direction to ensure the trees and the landscape elements remain in place.
- 4) In general, the Board finds it acceptable that there will be no gutters or downspouts proposed with this application.
- 5) Provide a lighting plan and photometrics, and the location of any revised signage.

Action: Hopkins/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

Board comment: Ms. Miller requested the Applicant to give precedence to the metrosideros plant species instead of the existing cassia plant species.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:07 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:28 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 130 S ALISOS ST****R-3 Zone**

(6:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-212-015
Application Number: MST2015-00402
Owner: Edward St George
Architect: On Design, LLC
Applicant: On Design, LLC

(Proposal for new dwelling units, addition, and alterations for a new Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD) project which will result in a total of eight dwelling units. The project comprises the demolition of an existing 840 square foot, 4-car carport, paving, and fencing, and the construction of three new dwelling units on a multi-family parcel. Five existing dwelling units located in Buildings A, B, and C (Units 1-5) will remain unaltered, with the exception of a 194 first story addition to Unit 2 in Building B. New Building D (Unit 6) will be a two-story dwelling unit with a 561 square foot, 2-car garage, 318 square feet of living area on the ground floor, 846 square feet on the second floor, and a 30 square foot second floor deck. New Building E (Units 7 & 8) will be a two-story duplex totaling 1,888 square feet with a 97 square foot second floor deck. There will be six covered parking spaces, two uncovered parking spaces, and eight bicycle parking spaces. Site work will include new walkways and landscaping. This project will result in a total of 9,832 square feet of development on a 16,686 square foot parcel. Under the AUD program, the proposed residential density is 21 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of eight dwelling units having an average unit size of 1,040 square feet.)

(Comments only; Requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:28 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, On Design Architects; and Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:39 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the Alisos Street elevation to possibly extend the porch for a more neighborhood-friendly elevation.
- 2) Increase the detailing of the new structures with more craftsmen-style detailing.
- 3) Study the finishes, especially the proposed stucco base.
- 4) Reconsider the use of wood battens in the plaster elevation.
- 5) Restudy the garage door detailing.
- 6) Add landscaping at the existing middle bungalow along the driveway.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**7. 521 CHIQUITA RD****R-2 Zone****(7:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-263-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00191
 Owner: Gayle E. Gover Living Trust
 Architect: Mission Group Architects

(Proposal to add a new residential unit beneath, and to the rear, of an existing two-story single-family dwelling on a 7,174 square foot parcel. The new lower level floor area of 325 square feet will be attached to 483 square feet of remodeled existing basement space, resulting in an 808 square foot attached unit. The existing 1,605 square foot residence at street level will be altered at the rear to add a 185 square foot roof over an existing 153 square foot deck. Also proposed on the existing residence is an expansion of the rear deck by 37 square feet, a new window, new hot tub, and new garage door. The proposal includes two new uncovered parking spaces, permeable turf block paving, fencing, stairs, gate relocation, and minor door and window alterations. There will be 10 cubic yards of grading excavation.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on August 31, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:00 p.m.

Present: Richard E. Johnson, Mission Group Architects.

Public comment opened at 7:02 p.m.

- 1) Bernie Jimenez Jr. (B.J.), opposition; expressed concerns regarding the proposed roof obstructing his private western view, and cautioned against setting future precedent of similar projects in the neighborhood.
- 2) Greg Baker, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility and the proposed scale, proposed rear deck, and the swoop roof. He proposed low-profile, smaller scaled alternatives and was in favor of a trellis and exterior porch of a smaller scale.
- 3) MaryAnn Wymer, opposition; expressed concerns regarding size, mass, and bulk of the proposed building, access to sunlight, parking density, traffic, and the probability that the deck will eventually be enclosed.

Public comment closed at 7:10 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review for details with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the new roof design to be acceptable.
- 2) The length of the cantilever or balcony should be reduced by not more than two feet.
- 3) The Vice Chair read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

THE FOLLOWING ITEM WAS REFERRED TO FULL BOARD FROM THE 1:00 P.M. CONSENT REVIEW MEETING.

ABR - NEW ITEM

F. 301 S HOPE AVE

E-3/P-D/SP-4/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-019

Application Number: MST2015-00448

Owner: Graham Richard A & Nancy J Trustees

Applicant: Andrew Sattley

Business Name: Bunnin Chevrolet

(Proposal to repaint the entry arch of Bunnin Chevrolet in a bright pink color for a period of one month for Breast Cancer Awareness Month. The paint color is Behr "High Maintenance P120-3 and the arch will be repainted back to the original blue color in the beginning of November, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:16 p.m.

Full Board

Motion: The project is not approved. The Board finds the proposal not appropriate for the neighborhood, could be precedent-setting, and could be considered branding.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Tripp/Cung absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:40 P.M. ****